

Manuscript Number: YMIDW-D-15-00462R1

Title: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

Article Type: Original Research

Keywords: Midwives; Indirect trauma; Maternity workforce; Posttraumatic stress

Corresponding Author: Dr. Kayleigh Sheen, BSc PhD

Corresponding Author's Institution: University of Liverpool

First Author: Kayleigh Sheen, BSc PhD

Order of Authors: Kayleigh Sheen, BSc PhD; Helen Spiby, RN RM MPhil; Pauline Slade, BSc MSc PhD

Abstract: **Objective:** There is potential for midwives to indirectly experience events whilst providing clinical care that fulfil criteria for trauma. This research aimed to investigate the characteristics of events perceived as traumatic by UK midwives. **Methods:** As part of a postal questionnaire survey conducted between December 2011 and April 2012, midwives (n= 421) who had witnessed and/or listened to an account of an event and perceived this as traumatic for themselves provided a written description of their experience. A traumatic perinatal event was defined as occurring during labour or shortly after birth where the midwife perceived the mother or her infant to be at risk, and they (the midwife) had experienced fear, helplessness or horror in response. Descriptions of events were analysed using thematic analysis. Witnessed (W; n= 299) and listened to (H; n= 383) events were analysed separately and collated to identify common and distinct themes across both types of exposure. **Findings:** Six themes were identified, each with subthemes. Five themes were identified in both witnessed and listened to accounts and one was salient to witnessed accounts only. Themes indicated that events were characterised as severe, unexpected and complex. They involved aspects relating to the organisational context; typically limited or delayed access to resources or personnel. There were aspects relating to parents, such as having an existing relationship with the parents, and negative perceptions of the conduct of colleagues. Traumatic events had a common theme of generating feelings of responsibility and blame. Finally for witnessed events those that were perceived as traumatic sometimes held personal salience, so resonated in some way with the midwife's own life experience. **Key conclusions:** Midwives are exposed to events as part of their work that they may find traumatic. Understanding the characteristics of the events that may trigger this perception may facilitate prevention of any associated distress and inform the development of supportive interventions.

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

Title: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

SHEEN, Kayleigh^{1*}; SPIBY, Helen²; SLADE, Pauline³;

¹Postdoctoral Research Associate, University of Liverpool, UK;

²Professor in Midwifery, University of Nottingham & Honorary Professor, School of Nursing and Midwifery, University of Queensland;

³Professor of Clinical Psychology & Consultant Clinical Psychologist, University of Liverpool, UK.

*Please address correspondence to: Dr Kayleigh Sheen; Psychological Sciences, Institute of Psychology, Health and Society, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK. Tel: 0151 7944373. Email: Kayleigh.sheen@liverpool.ac.uk

Acknowledgements: The authors would like to thank the midwives involved in the development, piloting and for those completing the postal survey. The authors also thank the Royal College of Midwives for supporting the sampling and distribution strategy.

Conflict of interest: No conflict of interest has been declared by the authors.

Funding: This research was funded by a PhD scholarship from the Department of Psychology, University of Sheffield.

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

HIGHLIGHTS

- Midwives described work-related perinatal events they had perceived as traumatic
- Events experienced as traumatic were unexpected, severe and involved multiple complications
- Difficulty accessing support/resources and other contextual aspects increased difficulty
- Post event factors (investigations, blame) were implicated in midwives' trauma perception
- Awareness that midwives experience trauma through their work is required

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 ABSTRACT (312). **Objective:** There is potential for midwives to indirectly
2 experience events whilst providing clinical care that fulfil criteria for trauma. This
3 research aimed to investigate the characteristics of events perceived as traumatic by
4 UK midwives. **Methods:** As part of a postal questionnaire survey conducted between
5 December 2011 and April 2012, midwives (n= 421) who had witnessed and/or
6 listened to an account of an event and perceived this as traumatic for themselves
7 provided a written description of their experience. A traumatic perinatal event was
8 defined as occurring during labour or shortly after birth where the midwife perceived
9 the mother or her infant to be at risk, and they (the midwife) had experienced fear,
10 helplessness or horror in response. Descriptions of events were analysed using
11 thematic analysis. Witnessed (W; n= 299) and listened to (H; n= 383) events were
12 analysed separately and collated to identify common and distinct themes across both
13 types of exposure. **Findings:** Six themes were identified, each with subthemes. Five
14 themes were identified in both witnessed and listened to accounts and one was
15 salient to witnessed accounts only. Themes indicated that *events were characterised*
16 *as severe, unexpected and complex. They involved aspects relating to the*
17 *organisational context, typically limited or delayed access to resources or personnel.*
18 *There were aspects relating to parents, such as having an existing relationship with*
19 *the parents, and negative perceptions of the conduct of colleagues. Traumatic*
20 *events had a common theme of generating feelings of responsibility and blame*
21 *Finally for witnessed events those that were perceived as traumatic sometimes held*
22 *personal salience, so resonated in some way with the midwife's own life experience*
23 **Key conclusions:** Midwives are exposed to events as part of their work that they
24 may find traumatic. Understanding the characteristics of the events that may trigger

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 this perception may facilitate prevention of any associated distress and inform the
2 development of supportive interventions.

3

4 KEYWORDS: Midwives, indirect trauma, maternity workforce, posttraumatic stress

5

6 MAIN TEXT (4099/ 5000)

7 **Introduction**

8 In the course of either their work or providing clinical care midwives may encounter
9 events at work that they perceive as traumatic, either by witnessing an event as it
10 occurs during or soon after birth, or by listening to an account of an event as it is
11 recounted to them by a woman in their care. **Events where the mother or her infant**
12 **are considered to be at risk of serious injury or death, and where the midwife**
13 **experiences fear, helplessness or horror in responses, have the potential to be**
14 **perceived as traumatic (APA, 2010).** Exposure of this nature has been associated
15 with the development of posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD; APA, 2013). **PTSD**
16 **comprises of distressing and involuntary recollections (e.g., ‘flashbacks’) of an event,**
17 **coupled with the avoidance of reminders, a heightened sense of arousal and a more**
18 **negative emotional state. As PTSD can have a profound, negative impact on**
19 **personal wellbeing, it is important to understand the nature of events that may lead**
20 **to this.**

21

22 Knowledge of the types of obstetric events most frequently reported as traumatic by
23 staff is limited but include fetal demise or neonatal death, shoulder dystocia,
24 maternal death and infant resuscitation (Beck, 2013; Beck & Gable, 2012; Beck,
25 LoGiudice & Gable, 2015). Additional contextual aspects have also been identified

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 as contributing to a perception of trauma. Events where midwives were unable to
2 locate a physician to perform a caesarean section (Beck, LoGiudice & Gable, 2015),
3 or where the care provided by another professional was perceived as overly forceful
4 (Beck & Gable, 2012; Beck, LoGiudice & Gable, 2015) were reported as traumatic,
5 contributing to feelings of helplessness. Fewer years of professional experience has
6 also been implicated (Beck & Gable, 2012). **Being unable to provide the type of**
7 **maternity care deemed necessary for women, or where midwives disagreed with the**
8 **clinical decision making of other members of staff, are also implicated in increasing**
9 **emotional difficulty for midwives** (Rice & Warland, 2013; Wallbank & Robertson,
10 2013). Finally, awareness that the mother was also in distress, or that they too
11 perceived the birth as traumatic, has also been cited as contributing to midwives'
12 negative experiences (Beck & Gable, 2012; Rice & Warland, 2013). However to date
13 the focus has been on the specific obstetric event, rather than identifying thematic
14 commonalities or common features of events experienced as traumatic.

15

16 [Author information omitted for blind review] conducted the first large-scale survey of
17 UK midwives' experiences of work-related trauma. Surveys were distributed to a
18 random sample of midwives (n = 2800), registered with the Royal College of
19 Midwives (RCM). Of the 464 respondents (16%), 421 had experienced a traumatic
20 perinatal event. One third of those with trauma experience reported symptoms of
21 PTSD commensurate with a clinical diagnosis. Conservative estimations drawn from
22 these findings indicated that a minimum of 1 in 6 midwives experience trauma whilst
23 providing care to women, and that a minimum of 1 in 20 midwives were experiencing
24 symptoms of PTSD commensurate with a clinical diagnosis.

25

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 In-depth interviews with a purposive sample of midwives from the [omitted for blind
2 review] survey provided a comparative analysis of experiences between those with
3 high or low **posttraumatic stress (PTS) symptoms** and impairment [omitted for blind
4 review]. Findings indicated that the perceived impact of trauma experience and
5 implications for their personal and professional lives differed between high and low
6 distress group. Midwives with high distress were more likely to report feeling
7 personally upset by their experience, and for the event to have held adverse
8 implications for aspects of both their personal and professional life.

9

10 Despite acknowledgement of the potential for midwives and other maternity
11 professionals to develop PTS symptoms in response to work experiences, there is
12 little research specifically investigating what sort of events midwives themselves find
13 traumatic (Sheen *et al.* 2014). For purposes of generalisability there is a need to
14 specifically consider the large-scale, questionnaire-based descriptions identifying the
15 nature of events that pose difficulty as this will enable detailed exploration of what
16 may influence perception of trauma. Through this, preventative or supportive
17 strategies can be developed on an informed basis.

18

19 **Methods**

20

21 *Aim*

22 To investigate the characteristics of events perceived as traumatic by UK midwives.

23

24 *Ethical Approval*

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 Ethical approval was obtained from the Department of Psychology (University of X)
2 in May 2011. The research was reviewed and approved as suitable by the Royal
3 College of Midwives' Education and Research Committee.

4

5 *Design*

6 Quantitative data from the postal questionnaire survey regarding sample
7 characteristics and psychological impacts after trauma experience has been reported
8 [omitted for blind review]. Information from subsequent in-depth interviews with a
9 smaller subsample of respondents from the questionnaire survey comparing the
10 experience of midwives with high and low resulting distress has been reported
11 elsewhere [omitted for blind review]. This manuscript presents analysis of written
12 event descriptions provided by midwives from this postal questionnaire survey.

13

14 *Sample and recruitment process*

15 Detailed procedure for sampling and postal questionnaire distribution is provided in
16 [omitted for blind review]. The final sample included 421 midwives who had
17 experienced at least one traumatic perinatal event corresponding to the DSM-IV
18 (APA, 2000) criterion A for PTSD; where the midwife perceived the mother or her
19 child to be at risk of serious injury or death, and where they (the midwife)
20 experienced fear, helplessness or horror in response. As part of the questionnaire,
21 demographic characteristics (age, gender, education) and professional experience
22 variables (year's qualified, professional designation and current location of work)
23 were collected and midwives provided a short written description of a traumatic
24 perinatal event they had experienced. These descriptions (3-4 lines) described a

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 perinatal event that had either been witnessed, or had been recounted to them by a
2 woman in their care ('listened to').

3

4 *Process of analysis*

5 Thematic analysis was used to analyse the descriptions of perinatal events
6 perceived as traumatic (Braun & Clarke 2006). The researcher (X) read through
7 each event to familiarise herself with content. Open coding was conducted **by hand**
8 for all data and codes discussed (in reference to extracts from the data) within the
9 supervisory team (X, X). Through discussion and examination of original data, codes
10 were collapsed where appropriate and organised into themes. Themes were
11 reviewed and organised in terms of major overarching themes and minor subthemes.
12 Disconfirmatory evidence was sought in reference to the devised codes and, where
13 identified, retained and presented within the results. Uncertainties regarding
14 categorisation were resolved through discussion within the supervisory team. Twenty
15 percent of extracts, stratified for each code, were randomly selected for second
16 coding by a Master's level student with a Psychology background, who was provided
17 with guidance about perinatal events and descriptions of categories. Cohen's Kappa
18 **(Cohen, 1960)** for agreement between category coding was 0.76, indicative of good
19 inter-rater reliability.

20

21 **Findings**

22 Descriptions of 399 witnessed and 283 listened to events were provided by
23 midwives. Midwives were aged between 22 and 68 years (M= 45.04, SD= 9.85) and
24 had qualified as a midwife between 6 months and 44 years prior to completing the
25 survey (M= 17.28, SD= 10.48). All but one of the midwives were female (n=420,

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 99.8%), and the majority (n= 395, 93.8%) reported that they were currently working
2 in clinical practice. Additional categorical demographic and work-related details of
3 midwives are provided in Table 1.

4

5 [TABLE 1 ABOUT HERE]

6

7 Six main themes emerged, **each with subthemes**: (i) *event characteristics (5*
8 **subthemes)**; (ii) *organisational context (2 subthemes)*; (iii) *aspects relating to parents*
9 **(5 subthemes)**; (iv) *perceived conduct of colleagues (3 subthemes)* and (v) *the*
10 ***perception of blame and culpability (2 subthemes)***. Themes i-v were present in both
11 **witnessed and heard events**. The sixth theme was distinctive to the witnessed
12 accounts only and related to *the personal salience of the event (3 subthemes)* for the
13 midwife. Each category is presented with the common subthemes across witnessed
14 and heard first (indicated by 'W & H'), followed by any unique aspects identified
15 exclusively within witnessed ('W only') or heard ('H only') events. An overview of
16 themes is presented in Table 2.

17

18 [TABLE 2 ABOUT HERE]

19

20 1. Event characteristics

21 **There was a distinct profile to the nature of events perceived as traumatic,**
22 **regardless of the way in which it was experienced, and all five of the identified**
23 **subthemes were** present in witnessed and heard accounts. Events were described
24 as (i) *unexpected and sudden*, (ii) *highly severe* in their nature, (iii) involving *multiple*

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 *complications, (iv) difficult to control, and (v) sometimes, but not always, involving*
2 *adverse or enduring implications.*

3

4 (i) Unexpected and sudden

5 *A sudden IUD [intrauterine death] whilst caring for a woman on labour ward.*

6 *[ID 414 W]*

7

8 (ii) Highly severe

9 *Severe PPH [postpartum haemorrhage] - hearing her blood dripping on the*

10 *floor feeling of dying/fear. [ID 73 H]*

11

12 (iii) Multiple complications

13 *There were 3 obstetric emergencies with the same woman, same shift. 1)*

14 *Shoulder dystocia 2) maternal collapse + haemorrhage 3) further*

15 *haemorrhage. [ID312 W]*

16

17 (iv) Difficult to control

18 *The forceps delivery of baby boy, the horror of the delivery, the futile attempt*

19 *at resuscitation by myself and paedcs [paediatricians], and his death. [ID 257*

20 *W]*

21

22 (v) Sometimes, but not always, involving adverse or enduring implications

23 *Suboptimal CTG [cardiotocography]. Care by myself. Baby born in very poor*

24 *situation - on-going lifelong disability. [ID 342 W]*

25

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 *Severe shoulder dystocia in isolated GP unit without resident medical staff -*
2 *required intensive resuscitation - no heart rate until 3 mins and was*
3 *transferred to consultant unit 20 miles away - good recovery and no long-term*
4 *effects. [ID 22 W]*

5

6 2. Organisational context

7 **Midwives reported events where access to support or additional personnel**
8 **contributed to their perception of trauma. Whilst this was sometimes attributed to the**
9 **physical location of the event, or a busy environment meaning that staff were**
10 **elsewhere when needed, it highlights a degree of helplessness in midwives'**
11 **experiences.** There were two subthemes within this category: events where there
12 was (i) *difficulty accessing resources or personnel* required (W & H) or (ii) where
13 *mothers were left alone* during the event (H only).

14

15 (i) *Difficult accessing resources or personnel*

16 *Ante partum haemorrhage at 42 weeks, transferred her to theatre for LSCS,*
17 *was unable to get an anaesthetist for 30 minutes. [ID 203 W]*

18

19 *Massive PPH at home - woman on own with baby - felt her life ebbing away*
20 *whilst waiting for ambulance. [ID 372 H]*

21

22 (ii) The mother was alone

23 *Maternal collapse due to PPH following delivery. Woman wasn't 'seen to' for 5*
24 *minutes unable to reach call bell and on own in room. [ID 19 H]*

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1

2 3. Aspects relating to the relationship with parents

3 Relationships with women and their partners were an additional aspect reported by
4 midwives, especially where a relationship had been established through prior care.

5 Four subthemes were identified, all relating to aspects of events experienced as
6 traumatic by midwives that related to their relationships or experiences of caring for

7 women and/or parents; (i) presence of *an existing relationship with parents* (W & H),

8 (ii) *supporting or delivering devastating and difficult news* (W & H), (iii) *difficulty*

9 *witnessing mother's distress* (H only), and (iv) *a difficult relationship with parents* (W

10 only). The latter subtheme involved aspects relating to a perception of threat from

11 parents, perception of a mother not following advice increasing difficulty during the

12 event, or difficulty establishing communication through a language barrier.

13

14 (i) Presence of an existing relationship with the mother/ parents

15 *Cared for a woman antenatally who days later subsequently died. I was*

16 *absent at this time but because I had known her I was sickened by the events.*

17 *[ID 245 H]*

18

19 (ii) Supporting or delivering **devastating and difficult** news

20 *Discussing the demise of mother and neonate to the partner and father. The*

21 *loss of your wife and child in the same day - and I am the midwife trying to*

22 *make sense of the event not only to myself but to a partner 'beyond distress.'*

23 *[ID 439 W]*

24

25 (iii) Difficulty witnessing a mother's distress

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 *A patient had a very traumatic birth and then had a shoulder dystocia, the*
 2 *woman was very upset about the whole experience. [ID 386 H]*

3

4 (iv) *Difficult relationships with parents*

5 *Difficult caring for women and families who become unwelcoming. [ID 126 W]*

6

7 *A woman having a VBAC at home against medical advice who developed*
 8 *tachycardia and refused to go into hospital as she considered herself to be at*
 9 *low risk of uterine rupture. [ID 326 W]*

10

11 *Death of a baby at term in labour. Mother spoke no English which was very*
 12 *stressful. [ID 245 W]*

13

14 4. Perceived conduct of colleagues

15 **Another fourth theme related to midwives' relationships with and perceptions of the**
 16 **conduct of their colleagues. Within this**, three subthemes were identified, two of
 17 which were common to both witnessed and heard accounts; the (i) perception of
 18 *overly forceful interventions performed by another practitioner*, and (ii) the *perception*
 19 *that the abilities of colleagues were limited or care was unsatisfactory in relation to*
 20 **the care provided**. The third theme was identified only within witnessed accounts;
 21 where (iii) the *midwife did not feel supported* by colleagues during the event (W
 22 only). **This highlights the essential nature of workplace support, and how an absence**
 23 **of support from other colleagues can influence midwives' distress during an adverse**
 24 **event.**

25 (i) Perception of overly forceful interventions

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 *Brutal mid cavity forceps delivery- obstetrician managed to pull bed across the*
 2 *floor of LW. [ID 410 W]*

3

4 (ii) Perception that the abilities of colleagues were limited or care was
 5 unsatisfactory

6 *A woman treated 'like a piece of meat' in the labour room. Disrespected, not*
 7 *listened to, nothing was explained. Blamed for needing a forceps delivery*
 8 *because wasn't pushing well enough! [ID 206 H]*

9

10 (iii) Not feeling supported by other colleagues

11 *I did a CTG on a high risk mum 15 years ago. There was excessive fetal*
 12 *movement and then a severe bradycardia. All theatres busy and MD on duty*
 13 *queried my findings. Baby died after 2 hours after EMCS [Emergency*
 14 *Caesarean Section]. [ID 236 W]*

15

16 5. Aspects relating to blame and culpability

17 **A further theme related to midwives' experiences of** (i) *involvement in investigatory*
 18 *procedures* taking place, including both internal and professional procedures
 19 following the birthing episode. Midwives also reported aspects relating to (ii)
 20 *attribution of blame*, involving either self-blame, or perceiving that others (colleagues,
 21 family members) blamed them for what had happened. **This finding emphasises how**
 22 **post-event factors contribute to midwives' perceptions of an adverse perinatal event.**

23 (i) Involvement of investigatory procedures

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 *Locum GP implying care inadequate in hospital undermining patient's faith in*
 2 *hospital and interfering with grief process - all totally uninformed - very large,*
 3 *nasty, investigation. [ID 121, H]*

4
 5 *(ii) Attribution of blame*

6 *When performing antenatal check at a lady's home and not being able to find a*
 7 *fetal heart beat. On arrival to the hospital the scan revealed the baby had died.*
 8 *The lady did not believe it and over the next few days blamed me for the loss [ID*
 9 *446 W]*

10
 11 6. Personal salience for the midwife

12 A final theme, identified only in witnessed accounts, highlighted that midwives'
 13 perception of trauma could be influenced by their own personal experiences or
 14 circumstances. This category includes three subthemes relating to the (i) *limited*
 15 *experience in the profession*, (ii) perceptions of *responsibility during the event*, and
 16 (iii) *personal salience*. Perceptions of responsibility in this context included events
 17 where the midwife was the first person to identify a particular circumstance, or where
 18 they were primarily responsible for the care of a woman at that time. Personal
 19 salience included events where midwives could relate to what happened based on
 20 their own personal experiences of childbearing or, as in the excerpt below, *when*
 21 *experiencing an event whilst they themselves were pregnant.*

22
 23 (i) Limited experience in the profession

24 *During 2nd shift as newly qualified midwife (night shift) - catastrophic PPH*
 25 *[postpartum haemorrhage]. L/W [labour ward] coordinator berated me for not*

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 *documenting events contemporaneously, (done in retrospect). Wrote*
2 *resignation after that shift, it took my husband to point out it wasn't my fault.*

3 *[ID 331 W]*

4

5 (ii) Perceptions of responsibility during the event

6 *Cord prolapse. I was midwife number one caring for woman and discovered*
7 *prolapsed cord. [ID 101 W]*

8

9 (iii) Personal salience

10 *Looking after a colleague in labour diagnosed a 'cord prolapse' baby stillborn.*

11 *I was heavily pregnant at time of incident. [ID 36 W]*

12

13 **Discussion**

14 This is one of a series of three papers to report from a large-scale investigation of
15 traumatic responses in UK midwives. All accounts provided by midwives in this
16 analysis fulfilled the DSM-IV Criterion A for a traumatic event that could lead to
17 PTSD (APA, 2010). Findings indicate that there were key aspects central to the
18 event in addition to factors relating to the organisational context, mothers and
19 partners, colleagues, and investigatory procedures and blame. These aspects are
20 integrated within the whole perception of an experience as traumatic, regardless of
21 any resulting psychological impact.

22

23 *Event characteristics*

24 Events occurred suddenly, were severe in their nature and sometimes involved
25 multiple complications occurring in succession during one birthing episode. This

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 reflects trauma in other contexts (Brewin & Holmes, 2003); events that occur
2 suddenly are more likely to be perceived as traumatic, and could elicit PTSD, as they
3 are more difficult to process into existing memories and beliefs (Ehlers & Clark,
4 2000). A perceived loss of control which, in the context of the present study was
5 indicated by events where midwives felt unable to control what was happening, is a
6 strong predictor of trauma perception. This is indicated by findings both in relation to
7 women's experience of birth related trauma (Czarnocka & Slade, 2000; Grekin &
8 O'Hara, 2014; Harris & Ayers, 2012) and in the general trauma literature (Ehlers &
9 Clark, 2000).

10

11 *Organisational context*

12 **Midwives' reports of difficulty accessing resources or personnel during a traumatic**
13 **perinatal event reflect those** from a survey of nurse-midwives, who also **described**
14 feelings of helplessness due to an inability to locate relevant staff during an adverse
15 event (Beck et al., 2015). Similar to perceptions of control, feelings of helplessness
16 are central to the perception of trauma (Ehlers & Clark, 2000). These findings
17 highlight the role of the overall organisational context as contributing to midwives'
18 difficulty.

19

20 *Aspects relating to relationships with parents*

21 Findings from our study, which emphasises relationships with recipients of care as a
22 potential vulnerability factor for midwives, resonates with work amongst midwives
23 and other similar maternity professionals in other settings (Beck & Gable, 2012; Rice
24 & Warland, 2013). Empathic engagement with women is an important determinant of
25 women's positive birth experiences (Moloney & Gair, 2015) and is recognised as an

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 essential aspect of compassionate maternity care (NHS, 2014). However building a
2 bond with a woman in receipt of care requires empathic engagement, which can
3 theoretically facilitate the internalisation of another individual's traumatic event
4 (Figley, 1996).

5

6 *Perceived conduct of colleagues*

7 A central feature of the midwifery role is to advocate for women to ensure that the
8 care provided is sensitive and safe. Responses included in this theme highlight the
9 potential for midwives to experience distress when they perceive the care provided
10 for women deviates from the desired quality of care. In a study by Wallbank and
11 Robertson (2013) perception of inadequate care predicted traumatic stress
12 responses in obstetricians and midwives after an experience of providing care for a
13 woman experiencing loss, miscarriage and neonatal death. Perception of overly
14 forceful interventions has also been reported as traumatic in previous studies with
15 nurse-midwives and labour and delivery nurses in America (Beck & Gable, 2012;
16 Beck et al., 2015), and findings from the present study confirm this as an aspect of
17 an experience that may contribute to UK midwives' difficulty.

18

19 Limited or absent organisational support was identified as an aspect increasing
20 difficulty in midwifery and nursing staff after experiencing miscarriage, stillbirth and
21 neonatal loss (Wallbank & Robertson, 2008). We know from in depth interviews with
22 a subsample of midwives from the present survey, that feeling isolated (physically or
23 psychologically) was reported by midwives with high levels of distress after a
24 traumatic perinatal experience (Sheen *et al.*, 2014). This finding highlights the

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 importance of a supportive working environment for midwives in the event of an
2 adverse birthing episode.

3

4 *Responsibility and blame*

5 The subtheme of midwives blaming themselves for the outcome of an event reflected
6 findings from Rice and Warland (2013) where Australian midwives described feelings
7 of responsibility, regret and guilt after an event they perceived as traumatic.
8 Investigatory procedures following an adverse perinatal event are necessary to
9 determine a cause (NMC, 2011) and can be instrumental for the improvement of
10 future care. However, present findings indicate that the experience of investigatory
11 procedures may further contribute to the perception of trauma after a difficult
12 perinatal event. At the upper end of the spectrum, where clinical negligence claims
13 may be investigated, involvement in litigation has been found to increase midwives'
14 tendency to practice defensively and reduce confidence in practice (Robertson &
15 Thomson, 2015), and can contribute to a perceived workplace 'blame culture'
16 (Robertson & Thomson, 2015).

17

18 *Midwives' personal salience*

19 A final theme, identified only in witnessed accounts, highlighted that midwives
20 reported events early in their midwifery career as difficult. A limited amount of
21 experience to draw on during a traumatic perinatal event could influence midwives'
22 perceived difficulty when an unexpected and unusually severe or complicated birth
23 occurs. This was also identified by Beck and Gable (2012) in their analysis of written
24 descriptions of events perceived as traumatic by US labour and delivery ward
25 nurses.

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1

2 Furthermore, the perception of trauma was also influenced by midwives' personal
3 circumstance (e.g., being pregnant at the time of the incident). Salience of an
4 adverse event due to personal experience or circumstance is likely to increase the
5 extent to which midwives identify with another woman's experience, which can
6 contribute to difficulty (Figley, 1996). This finding indicates a requirement to
7 acknowledge the personal experience of the midwife in identifying those potentially
8 more vulnerable to trauma perception.

9

10 *Strengths and Limitations*

11 Midwifery respondents were similar in age and gender to midwives in the UK
12 midwifery profession (DOH, 2010; NMC, 2008). Traumatic perinatal event exposure
13 was operationalized using an adapted criterion from the DSM-IV-TR (APA 2000).
14 Descriptions of traumatic perinatal events were limited in their length (3-4 lines); it is
15 possible that encouraging longer accounts may provide a greater depth of insight
16 into midwives' experiences. Time since event and completion of questionnaire was
17 not ascertained, which may have led to some degree of bias in recall of events.

18

19 *Implications for midwifery services*

20 Unexpected, severe and complex events are not always avoidable in the maternity
21 setting, but it is important that organisations recognise that these types of events
22 may be perceived as difficult not only for women and their families, but for members
23 of staff as well. Findings from the present study emphasise the importance of
24 services and organisations acknowledging the potential for midwifery staff to
25 perceive some work-related events as traumatic. Understanding the components of

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1 events that are experienced as traumatic may also help midwives to understand and
2 monitor their own responses. Ways of achieving this require development and
3 testing for the pre and post registration midwifery workforce.

4
5 Findings also highlight that the organisational context and investigatory procedures,
6 for example surrounding Serious Adverse Events, may contribute to the perception
7 of trauma for midwives. Whilst internal or professional investigations are necessary
8 after an adverse event, it is important to ensure that these are conducted sensitively
9 to reduce any additional adverse impact upon the midwife involved.

10
11 Given the increasing pressure on UK maternity services from workforce pressures,
12 increasing birth rates and clinical case complexity (RCM, 2015), it is important to
13 support retention and wellbeing of the existing workforce. Strategies to prevent the
14 perception of trauma will provide one way of supporting retention of the existing
15 workforce, and will **also hold beneficial implications for the support of staff to provide**
16 **safe, quality maternity care (National Maternity Review, 2016)**. Findings from this
17 survey add to an emerging evidence base that has international relevance for
18 maternity care professionals in other settings who may experience similar types of
19 traumatic perinatal events.

20

21 *Implications for research*

22 It is essential that methods to prepare midwives for, and to prevent the perception of,
23 trauma are developed and evaluated. Identification of effective methods to increase
24 awareness of trauma are required, in addition to the development of effective
25 supportive strategies for those who encounter an adverse event at work.

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1

2 **Conclusion**

3 This **study** presents the analysis of a large number of traumatic perinatal event
4 descriptions provided by midwives as part of a postal questionnaire survey.

5 Perception of trauma was influenced by aspects intrinsic to the event (severe,
6 complex, unexpected) but also by aspects relating to parents, colleagues, personal
7 salience, organisational context, investigatory procedures and perceptions of blame.

8 Further work is required to develop approaches to preventing midwives from
9 experiencing elements of their work as traumatic.

10

11

12

13

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

1

Table 1. Demographic and work-related characteristics of midwives

	N	%
Education		
Bachelor's/ RM/SCM	264	62.9
Diploma/ Cert.	104	24.6
Master's/ Doctorate	29	6.9
Marital Status		
Married/ Cohabiting	328	77.9
Single	50	11.9
Divorced	35	8.3
Employment		
NHS	397	94.3
University	7	1.7
Multiple	4	1.0
Private	3	.7
Other	10	2.3
NHS Band		
5	9	2.2
6	272	63.6
7	108	25.4
8a-d	16	5.2
Area of practice^a		
Labour ward/ Intrapartum care	253	60.1
Community	146	34.7
Postnatal	128	30.4
Antenatal	132	31.4

Note. Total $n=421$. ^aConcurrent areas of practice reported; % represents proportion of the total sample

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

Table 2. Overview of themes and subthemes from the thematic analysis of event descriptions

	Witnessed accounts only	Both Witnessed and Heard accounts	Heard accounts only
1. Event characteristics		1.1. Unexpected Sudden presentation 1.2. Highly severe 1.3. Multiple complications 1.4. Unable or difficult to control 1.5. Negative, on-going implication*	
2. Organisational Context		2.1. Access to resources or personnel limited or delayed	2.2. The mother was left alone
3. Aspects relating to parents	3.3. A difficult relationship with parents	3.1. Having an existing relationship with parents 3.2. Supporting parents, delivering devastating and difficult news	3.4. Acknowledgement of the mother's experience 3.5. Witnessing parents' distress
4. Conduct of colleagues	4.3. Midwife not feel supported by other colleagues	4.1. Overly forceful interventions 4.2. Perception that the abilities of colleagues were limited or unsatisfactory	
5. Responsibility and Blame		5.1. Involvement of professional investigation 5.2. Attribution of blame	
6. Personal salience (<i>Witnessed events only</i>)	6.1. Limited professional experience 6.2. Feeling 'responsible' for the provision of care 6.3. Personal salience of the event		

* *disconfirming evidence also identified*

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

References

American Psychiatric Association (2000) *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (IV-TR)*. American Psychiatric Association, Washington DC.

American Psychiatric Association (2013) *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (V)*. American Psychiatric Association, Washington DC.

Beck CT. The obstetric nightmare of shoulder dystocia: A tale from two perspectives. *Mcn-the American Journal of Maternal-Child Nursing* 2013; **38**(1): 34-40. doi: 10.1097/NMC.0b013e3182623e71

Beck CT, Gable RK. A Mixed Methods Study of Secondary Traumatic Stress in Labor and Delivery Nurses. *Journal of Obstetric Gynecologic and Neonatal Nursing* 2012; **41**(6): 747-760. doi: 10.1111/j.1552-6909.2012.01386.x

Beck CT, LoGiudice J, Gable RK. A Mixed-Methods Study of Secondary Traumatic Stress in Certified Nurse-Midwives: Shaken Belief in the Birth Process. *Journal of Midwifery & Women's Health* 2015; **60**(1): 16-23. doi: 10.1111/jmwh.12221

Brewin, C. R., & Holmes, E. A. (2003). Psychological theories of posttraumatic stress disorder. *Clinical Psychology Review*, *23*(3), 339-376. doi: 10.1016/s0272-7358(03)00033-3

Braun V & Clark V (2006) Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology* *3*(2), 77- 101.

Cohen J. (1960). A coefficient of agreement for nominal scales. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*. *20*(1), 37- 46.

Czarnocka J, Slade P. (2000). Prevalence and predictors of post-traumatic stress symptoms following childbirth. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, *39*, 35- 51.

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

Department of Health (2010) *Midwifery 2020: Delivering expectations*. Department of Health, London.

Ehlers A, Clark, DM. (2000). A cognitive model of posttraumatic stress disorder. *Behaviour Research and Therapy* 2000; **38**(4): 319-345. doi: 10.1016/s0005-7967(99)00123-0

Figley CR (1995) Compassion fatigue as secondary traumatic stress disorder: An overview. In *Compassion fatigue: Coping with secondary traumatic stress disorder in those who treat the traumatized* (Figley CR ed.), Routledge, New York, pp. 1-20.

Grekin R, O'Hara, MW. (2014). Prevalence and risk factors of postpartum posttraumatic stress disorder: A meta-analysis. *Clinical Psychology Review*, **34**(5), 389- 401.

Harris R, & Ayers S (2012) What makes labour and birth traumatic? A survey of intrapartum 'hotspots.' *Psychology and Health* 27(10), 1166- 1177.

Moloney, S., & Gair, S. (2015). Empathy and spiritual care in midwifery practice: Contributing to women's enhanced birth experiences. *Women and Birth*, 28(4), 323-328.

National Maternity Review (2016). Better births: Improving outcomes of maternity services in England. Accessed March 2016 from <https://www.england.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/national-maternity-review-report.pdf>

Nursing and Midwifery Council. (2008). Statistical analysis of the register 1 April to 31 March 2008. Nursing and Midwifery Council.

Nursing and Midwifery Council (2015). The code for nurses and midwives. Accessed November 2015 from <http://www.nmc.org.uk/standards/code/>

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

Rice H & Warland J (2013) Bearing witness: Midwives experiences of witnessing traumatic birth. *Midwifery* 29(9), 1056-1063. doi: 10.1016/j.midw.2012.12.003

Robertson JH & Thomson AM (2015) An exploration of the effects of clinical negligence litigation on the practice of midwives in England: a phenomenological study. *Midwifery*, 16 doi: 10.1016/j.midw.2015.10.005 [epub ahead of print]

Royal College of Midwives (2015) State of Maternity Services Report 2013. Retrieved from <https://www.rcm.org.uk/download-now-state-of-maternity-services-report-2015#>

Sheen K, Slade P & Spiby H (2014) An integrative review of the impact of indirect trauma exposure in health professionals and potential issues of salience for midwives. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 70(4), 729-743. doi: 10.1111/jan.12274

Wallbank S & Robertson N (2013) Predictors of staff distress in response to professionally experienced miscarriage, stillbirth and neonatal loss: A questionnaire survey. *International Journal of Nursing Studies* 50(8), 1090-1097. doi: 10.1016/j.ijnurstu.2012.11.022

[TWO REFERENCES REMOVED FOR BLIND REVIEW]

RUNNING HEAD: What are the characteristics of perinatal events perceived to be traumatic by midwives?

Acknowledgements: The authors would like to thank the midwives involved in the development, piloting and for those completing the postal survey. The authors also thank the Royal College of Midwives for supporting the sampling and distribution strategy.