**Prescribing trends of inhaler treatments for asthma and COPD within a resource constrained environment in the Scottish National Health System: findings and implications**

Holly McCabe1, \*Brian Godman2,3,4, Amanj Kurdi2,5, Katie Johnston6,Sean MacBride-Stewart7, Janey Lennon7, Simon Hurding8, Marion Bennie2, Alec Morton1

1Department of Management Science, Strathclyde Business School, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, United Kingdom. Email: holly.mccabe@hotmail.co.uk; [alec.morton@strath.ac.uk](mailto:alec.morton@strath.ac.uk)

2Strathclyde Institute of Pharmacy and Biomedicial Sciences, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow, United Kingdom. Email: [Brian.Godman@strath.ac.uk](mailto:Brian.Godman@strath.ac.uk); amanj.baker@strath.ac.uk; [marion.bennie@strath.ac.uk](mailto:marion.bennie@strath.ac.uk)

3Division of Clinical Pharmacology, Karolinska Institutet, Karolinska University Hospital, Huddinge, Stockholm, Sweden. Email: [Brian.Godman@ki.se](mailto:Brian.Godman@ki.se)

4Department of Public Health Pharmacy and Management, School of Pharmacy, Sefako Makgatho Health Sciences University, Garankuwa, South Africa

5Department of pharmacology, College of Pharmacy, Hawler Medical University, Erbil, Iraq

6Prescribing Advisor Primary Care, NHS Scotland, Edinburgh, UK. Email: [Katie.Johnston@nhslothian.scot.nhs.uk](mailto:Katie.Johnston@nhslothian.scot.nhs.uk)

7Pharmacy Service, NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde, Glasgow, UK. Email: [Sean.MacBride-Stewart@ggc.scot.nhs.uk](mailto:Sean.MacBride-Stewart@ggc.scot.nhs.uk); janeylennon@nhs.net

8Therapeutics Branch, Scottish Government, Edinburgh, UK. Email: Simon.Hurding@gov.scot

\*Author for correspondence: Brian Godman, Strathclyde Institute of Pharmacy and Biomedical Sciences, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow G4 0RE, United Kingdom. Email: [brian.godman@strath.ac.uk](mailto:Brian.godman@strath.ac.uk). Telephone: 0141 548 3825. Fax: 0141 552 2562 and Division of Clinical Pharmacology, Karolinska Institute, Karolinska University Hospital Huddinge, SE-141 86, Stockholm, Sweden. Email: Brian.Godman@ki.se. Telephone + 46 8 58581068. Fax + 46 8 59581070

Keywords: Asthma, COPD, inhalers, Scottish NHS, expenditure, reforms, drug utilisation

(Accepted for publication in Expert Review of Respiratory Medicine – please keep Confidential)

**Abstract**

**Background**: There is increasing prevalence of asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) worldwide leading to increased inhaler use. However, there are concerns with inhaler compliance resulting in different patented inhalers and longer acting formulations. As a result, inhalers are now among the highest expenditure items in ambulatory care in Scotland leading to multiple initiatives to keep within budget without compromising care. **Method**: Assess inhaler utilization and expenditure between 2001 and 2017 alongside health authority initiatives. **Results**: 137% increase in inhaler utilisation between 2001 and 2017, and a two fold increase in expenditure, driven by increasing use of patented combination inhalers to address concerns. This is very different to the oral markets where expenditures on proton pump inhibitors, statins and antihypertensives have fallen considerably recently despite appreciably increased volumes with increasing use of low-cost generics. However, inhaler expenditure has started to fall with increasing use of lower cost combinations and initiatives to reduce the steroid burden alongside monitoring patient care. **Conclusion**: Challenges with using and changing inhalers has meant this market has not followed other high-volume drug classes following patent loss. This is starting to change, with the situation being monitored to enhance efficient prescribing alongside continued good quality care.

**1. Introduction**

There is increasing prevalence of asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary diseases (COPD) worldwide, with asthma now one of the most common non-communicable chronic diseases [1]. Globally asthma affects 334 million people and is rising particularly in developing countries [1,2], which negatively impacts on their quality of life and survival [1]. In the UK, 5.4 million people are currently receiving treatment for asthma, and in Scotland one in 14 of the population currently receives treatment for asthma. However, prevalence rates have plateaued in recent years [3]. Globally, it is estimated there were 251 million cases of COPD in 2016, with the number of cases likely to rise with increasing aging populations and more people smoking [4,5]. By 2030, COPD will be one of the top ten causes of death worldwide without improvements in prevention and management [2,6,7]. It is estimated that approximately 3 million people in the UK currently have COPD [8], with prevalence rates increased by 9% between 2008 and 2012 [5].

Concerns with the extent of asthma and COPD among countries, with their associated impact on morbidity and mortality, have resulted in efforts globally, regionally, and nationally to improve patient care, which include guideline production and quality improvement strategies [1,9-13]. In the UK, the Quality and Outcomes Framework (QoF) includes targets to measure, monitor and improve the identification and management of patients with asthma and COPD [14,15]. In Scotland, there has also been the Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (SIGN) guidelines for asthma [16] as well as the publication of the Clinical Standards guidance for patients with COPD, recognising that during the last decade COPD was the only major cause of death increasing in Scotland [17]. There was a further update on best practice guidance for COPD in 2017 with COPD accounting for 122,000 emergency bed days annually in Scotland with an average inpatient stay costing GB£3000 per patient [8].

There have also been national respiratory prescribing strategies in Scotland to promote appropriate, evidence-based, and cost-effective prescribing of treatments for asthma and COPD, predominantly inhalers, as NHS Scotland currently spends over GB£125 million per year on respiratory medicines [18]. Typically, in patients with asthma, inhaled corticosteroids (ICS) are first line treatment followed by combined long acting β-agonists (LABAs)/ICS for more severe asthma, with short acting β-agonists (SABAs) used as rescue ‘reliever’ therapy [1,13,16,19]. Tiotropium is also now being prescribed for patients with asthma. In COPD, both LABAs and long acting muscarinic antagonists (LAMAs) have been used alone or in combination, with LAMA use growing with studies showing a greater effect in reducing exacerbations and hospitalisations [20,21]. The use of LABA/ICS inhalers for COPD has also grown in recent years following a number of studies [22-27]. However, there are now concerns with the increased risk of serious pneumonia [27]. As a result, more recent guidance suggests that combination LABA/ ICS should only principally be prescribed in COPD patients with asthma-like symptoms with exacerbations in view of potential adverse effects [12,21]. It can be difficult though to assess differences in outcomes between the different combination formulations and inhaler types [28-32]; consequently, the choice of inhaler device and ease of use do play an appreciable role in the choice of device prescribed with poor inhaler technique known to compromise care [33-37].

Scrutiny regarding the quality and costs of prescribing for patients with respiratory diseases has grown in recent years with, as mentioned, NHS Scotland currently spending over GB£125 million per year on respiratory medicines [18]. This makes the inhalers the second highest medicine category in Scotland [18]. Increasing expenditure on inhalers has been driven by the availability of new patented devices to address concerns with their effectiveness and adherence despite the patents on many of the active ingredients expiring, with poor inhaler technique and adherence known to considerably increase the costs of asthma and COPD [38]. Concerns with the overall cost of inhalers in Scotland, but mindful of the need to ensure good quality care, has also resulted in a number of initiatives to improve the prescribing of inhalers to patients with asthma and COPD to help ensure the optimal use of available resources [19,20,39-41]. This is because both asthma and COPD can be lifelong conditions once diagnosed, requiring regular monitoring and review of current therapeutic strategies, presenting a considerable challenge in terms of the budget implications with different treatment approaches whilst remaining firmly focused on improving clinical outcomes along with patient safety. This patient focus has meant that inhalers are typically prescribed by their brand name with the potential exception of ABA MDIs. This is because pharmacists in Scotland are not allowed to substitute a branded product with a generic [42].

It is envisaged that the inhaler market will be very different from the typical oral markets where considerable savings can be made following generic availability as seen with the Proton Pump Inhibitors (PPIs), statins, and antihypertensives [42-44]. Firstly, there are known concerns with how well or not patients have used their inhalers in the past resulting in activities including patient education and actively involving patients with inhaler choices to help address this [33,45-50]. As mentioned, concerns with adherence and poor technique have also resulted in new inhaler devices being developed as well as new medicines being developed including LABAs and LAMAs as well as longer acting steroids. Secondly, there are concerns for subsequent patient care if patients are switched between inhaler types without their consent, knowledge or training [49,51,52]. Lastly, there are concerns with switching between different inhalers with the same active ingredients in view of potential issues such as appropriate dosing and adherence [41].

We are also aware that alternatives to Seretide® and Symbicort® are typically priced at a discount of only 20 to 30% below originator prices rather than the 85 to 95% reductions seen for generic PPIs, statins and selective serotonin re-uptake inhibitors (SSRIs) versus pre-patent loss prices [42,53,54]. As a result, expenditure on LABA/ ICS and LAMA inhalers has grown in recent years to become the highest of any medicine type in Scotland. To help address this, new lower cost LABA/ ICS inhalers, e.g. Fostair® (beclomethasone/ formoterol) and Revlar® (fluticasone furoate/vilanterol) have recently been promoted by the Health Boards in Scotland as the preferred first and second line choices [39-41]. There were concerns initially that these new inhalers did not have the same dose range as Seretide® and Symbicort®, which made it difficult to titrate care. In addition at the time of their launch, there were ongoing initiatives with Health Boards to encourage physicians to step down inhaler doses particularly the steroid burden in line with current guidance (BTS/ SIGN). Consequently, it was perceived as challenging to initiate this steroid dose change as well as switch patients between different inhaler types. There was also a need for all key stakeholders to become comfortable with Fostair® or Revlar®, which resulted in a gradual uptake initially as well as acknowledging the resource implications with patient training [50].There have also been concerns with the licensed indications of these alternatives versus Seretide® and Symbicort® when initially available.

Consequently, there is a need to investigate the effects of these multiple national and regional activities on the utilisation and expenditure patterns of the different inhalers used in the management of asthma and COPD in Scotland. The findings will be used as a basis for reviewing and debating potential future policies to improve the quality and efficiency of prescribing for both asthma and COPD given concerns with expenditure within resource constrained environments but mindful of the need to continue to ensure good quality care. We are aware that there have been publications assessing the impact and factors associated with poor inhalation techniques as well as different educational policies to address concerns [34,37,38,49,50]. However, we are not aware of any study that has assessed the influence of multiple international, national and regional policies on inhaler utilisation and expenditure patterns during the past seventeen years to provide future guidance.

**2. Methodology**

Utilisation and prescribing patterns of inhalers in Scotland were assessed using the prescription costs analysis (PCA) data compiled by the Information Services Division (ISD) of NHS Scotland from 2001 to 2017 [55]. This is an open source data set collecting data on the utilization and expenditure of medicines dispensed in community pharmacies in Scotland. NHS Scotland is a universal healthcare system serving the entire Scottish population, with currently no co-payment for medicines in Scotland. The information from the PCA included: the generic (INN) name, commercial name(s), formulation(s), drug strength(s), number of dispensed units, cost per unit and total gross expenditure. All costs are depicted in Great Britain pounds (GB£s). No attempt was made to allow for inflation as typically medicine costs in Scotland appreciably fall once generics become available and prices for originators are typically fixed [42,43].

Data on inhaled medicines from the following classes as defined by the British National Formulary [56] were incorporated into the study: SABAs, SAMAs (short acting muscarinic antagonists), LABAs, LAMAs, mast cell stabilisers, ICS as well as combinations such as SABA/SAMA, LAMA/LABA, ICS/LABA and ICS/SABA. We concentrated on guideline recommended inhalers for patients with asthma and COPD, acknowledging that in patients with asthma a LABA is typically not prescribed without an ICS and in COPD, an ICS is not licensed without a LABA. Consequently, both are typically given in combination.

Between 2001-2017, 144 individual inhalers were included covering both originators, alternatives to originators and generics. In terms of active ingredients, the following were available during the study period although a number of these inhaler types are no longer available: five SABAs (salbutamol, terbutaline sulphate, fenoterol hydrobromide, orciprenaline sulphate and reproterol hydrochloride), two SAMAs (ipratropium bromide and oxitropium bromide), three LABAs (salmeterol, formoterol fumarate and olodaterol), three LAMAs (tiotropium, aclidinium bromide and umeclidinium bromide), two mast cell stabilisers (nedocromil sodium and sodium cromoglicate), five ICS (budesonide, beclometasone dipropionate, ciclesonide, fluticasone propionate and mometasone furoate), one SABA/SAMA (salbutamol with ipratropium), three LAMA/LABA (umeclidinium bromide with vilanterol trifenatate, aclidinium bromide with formoterol fumarate and tiotropium with olodaterol), five ICS/LABA (salmeterol with fluticasone propionate, budesonide with formoterol fumarate, fluticasone furoate with vilanterol, fluticasone propionate with formoterol fumarate and beclometasone dipropionate with formoterol fumarate) and one ICS SABA (beclometasone dipropionate with salbutamol).

From the PCA data, the units dispensed (typically an inhaler) and associated expenditure patterns were calculated for each drug class. When presenting and assessing utilisation data, NHS Scotland regularly uses defined daily doses (DDDs) as well as DIDs (DDDs/ 1000 inhabitants/ day) in line with international guidelines [57-59]. However, for the purpose of this study, items dispensed in community pharmacies, which were typically an inhaler, was used in order to track actual prescriptions to assess the influence of guidelines/legislation e.g. encouraging the prescription of combined LABA/ICS inhalers. In addition, DDDs are not available for combination inhalers [58]. We used a segmented regression analysis to assess the influence of the various initiatives to enhance the prescribing of newer formulations of ICS/ LABAs such as Fostair® or Revlar® as they became increasing endorsed by the Health Boards. We also plotted changes in the utilisation and expenditure patterns for the various inhaler ingredients over time.

These multiple initiatives undertaken by Scottish Health Boards and NHS Scotland to influence physician prescribing were consolidated using the 4E methodology in line with previous studies: Education (guidelines and academic detailing interventions), Engineering (organisational/managerial interventions e.g. prescribing indicators), Economics (financial incentives for prescription) and Enforcement (enforced regulations by health authorities – although not generally applying to Scotland) [42,44,60-63]. Examples of enforcement including compulsory INN prescribing in Lithuania, compulsory generic substitution in Sweden and restrictions on the prescribing of patented statins in Austria and Finland [64-67]. However, such activities are difficult in Scotland [42].

No ethical approval was needed as only publicly sourced aggregated drug utilisation and expenditure data was used for analysis. No patient level data was accessed.

**3. Results**

Table 1A in the Appendix summarises the various drug classes, the name of the first in class, as well as the number of strengths and formulations available during the course of the study.

***3.1 Demand-side initiatives***

Table 1 summarises some of the many NHS Scotland and Health Board activities during the study period to influence the utilisation and expenditure of inhalers for asthma and COPD in Scotland. This includes safety concerns if patients are inappropriately prescribed high dose inhaled steroids as well as concerns with the increasing costs of Seretide® [8,16,17,39,40,57,59,68-79].

Table 1 - Summary of various initiatives, guidelines and policies introduced regionally and nationally in Scotland between 2001-2017

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Measure** | **Year** | **National or Regional** | **Initiative** |
| Education | 2001 | National | MHRA warning of systemic side effects following high dose fluticasone |
|  | 2003 - 2016 | National | SIGN guidance on asthma – first published 2003 and updated 2016 |
|  | 2003 and updated | Regional GGC | Guideline on the management of Asthma |
|  | 2004 and updated | Regional (GGC) | Guideline on the management of COPD |
|  | 2006 | Regional (GGC) | ICS formulary recommendations updated emphazising potency differences of CFC-free beclomatasone inhalers |
|  | 2008 and updated | Regional (Forth Valley) and Lothian | Guideline on the management of COPD as well as a guide to support changes to CFC free inhaled corticosteroid devices |
|  | 2010 | National | Guidance on clinical standards for patients with COPD |
|  | 2009 - 2014 | Regional (Lothian) | Lothian COPD Guidelines, updated in 2010, 2014 and recently. In 2011, Lothian introduce Fostair® onto the formulary and provided guidance when stepping up asthmatic patients from Clenil® or Qvar® (two formulations of beclomethasone with different particle sizes) |
|  | 2013 | Regional (GGC) | Respiratory Inhaler Identification Guide as well as revised COPD Guideline |
|  | 2014 - 2016 | National | Respiratory Prescribing Strategy 2014 to 2016 and updated for 2018 to 2021 |
|  | 2014 | Regional (Tayside) | COPD Guidelines |
|  | 2016 | Regional (Lothian) | * Fostair® and Relvar® as combination ICS/ LABA for asthma and COPD with Seretide and Symbicort no longer recommended * LAMAs: First choice: umeclidinium bromide and second choice: aclidinium bromide. In 2018, this changed to Seebri® (Glycopyrronium) |
|  | 2016 | Regional (GGC) | Prescribing guidance for asthma including Fostair® and Relvar® as preferred ICS/ LABA combination |
|  | 2017 | National | COPD Best Practice Guidance |
|  | 2017/ 2018 | Regional (GGC) | Braltus – (tiotropium) accepted onto the formulary |
|  | 2017/ 2018 | Reginal (Lothian and other Boards) | Following GOLD guidance – Health Boards producting advice on stepping patients with COPD off ICS/LABA combinations |
| Engineering | 2003 | National (Audit Scotland) | Consider substituting salbutamol dry powder automated inhalers with standard inhalers for patients with asthma |
|  | 2009 | National | Better Health, Better Care and HEAT Targets:   * Establish respiratory Managed Clinical / Care Networks including working together to improve the management of asthma in children and young people * Achieve agreed reductions in the rates of hospital admissions and bed days of patients with COPD and Asthma from 2006/7 to 2010/11 |
|  | 2009 | Regional (GGC) | Practice pharmacist medication reviews for patients with COPD |
|  | 2010 | Regional (Tayside) | 2010/11 Seretide® Cost-minimisation initiative |
|  | 2010 | Regional (GGC) | Fluticasone inhalers cost-minimisation initiative |
|  | 2012 | National (Therapeutic Indicators) | The proportion of high dose ICS prescribed of all ICS inhalers prescribed for asthma or chronic obstructive pulmonary disease |
|  | 2013 | National (Audit Scotland) | Consider substituting salbutamol dry powder automated inhalers with standard inhalers for patients with asthma |
|  | 2013 - 2017 | National (Therapeutic indicators - NTIs) | * The proportion of high strength corticosteroid inhalers prescribed compared with the total amount of inhalers, with typically high dose ICS under the care of a paediatrician. This changed in 2016 to:   + High dose corticosteroid inhalers as a percentage of all corticosteroid inhalers.   + Medium and high strength corticosteroid inhalers prescribed to children. * Fostair® excluded from 2016 BTS/ SIGN guidance with Health Boards uncertain whether it should be counted as high strength or not. As a result, the NTIs in Scotland were reported with or without Fostair® as a high strength ICS * It is recommended that patients on high dose ICS carry a steroid card |
|  | 2014 - 2016 | National | Respiratory Prescribing Strategy 2014 to 2016 and updated for 2018 to 2021 |
|  | 2016 | Audit Scotland | Highlighting that inhalers containing salmeterol with fluticasone propionate has the highest total cost in ambulatory care in Scotland (£35.5 million) |
|  | 2016 | National and Regional | Patients receiving ICS to be reviewed every three months to facilitate stepping down and reduce excessive high dose steroid prescribing |
|  | 2014 | Lothian | Lothian respiratory MCN Action Plan 2014 to 2015 launched building on earlier plans |
|  | 2014 | Regional (Fourth Valley) | Respiratory MCN updated the FV formulary choices for Asthma and COPD |
|  | 2017 | Regional (GGC) | Triple therapy inhalers for COPD added to formulary |
|  | 2017/ 2018 | Reginal (Lothian and other Health Boards) | Following GOLD guidance – Advice produced locally including how to consider withdrawing ICS from some COPD patients |
|  | 2018 | Regional (GGC) | Moving patients with COPD to triple therapy |
| Economics | 2002 | National | Tiotropium approved for general use by the Scottish Medicines Consortium |
|  | 2014-2017 | National and Regional | Local Enhanced Service (LES) for prescribing outlined where practices are paid for targets achieved |
|  | 2018-19 | Regional (GGC) | Prescribing Initiative for combination inhalers |
| Enforcement | 2006-9 | National | Withdrawal of CFC containing metered-dose inhalers |

NB: MCN = Managed Clinical Network. Health Authorities in Scotland are called Health Boards

***3.2 Utilisation and Expenditure Patterns***

Both utilisation and expenditure on inhalers steadily increased between 2001 and 2017. Total items dispensed increased from 3.44 million units in 2001 to 4.72 million units in 2017 with expenditure increasing from GB£48.63 million in 2001 to GB£95.16 million in 2017 respectively (Figures 1 and 2). This represents a 136.8% increase in items dispensed and 195.7% increase in total expenditure during the study period.

More specifically, there was a steady increase in dispensed items for LABAs/ ICS during the study period, with the use of SABAs continually increasing each year as well but at a lower rate (Figure 1). Alongside this, there was a steady decline in the use of single-agent ICS inhalers and single-agent LABA inhalers, reflecting recommended treatment approaches (Table 1). There has also been an increase in the prescribing of LAMAs following their availability and more recently LAMA/ LABA combinations but from a low base. Conversely a steady decline in the use of SABAs and SAMAs in combination (Figure 1) and limited use throughout of ICS/ SABA combinations. The decline in the use of ICS/ SABA combinations reflects their withdrawal from the market place.

Figure 1: Utilisation (items dispensed of the different inhaler types in Scotland by drug class between 2001 and 2017 (Source ISD Scotland – [55]

During this period, there was also steady increase in expenditure on combination LABA/ ICS until recently (Figure 2), as well as increased expenditure on LAMAs. Expenditure on these two combinations has driven the increase in expenditure on inhalers in Scotland in recent years. Overall, expenditure on these combination inhalers rose from 8.6% of total inhaler expenditure in 2001, to 32.4% in 2004, to 63% in 2009 soon after the launch of LAMAs, and 78.7% in 2017.

Figure 2: Expenditure (GB£) on different inhaler types in Scotland between 2001 and 2017 (Source ISD Scotland – [55])

There has been a steady decline in the utilisation and expenditure of originator LABAs/ ICS in recent years following the availability and endorsement of alternative inhalers, e.g. Fostair® and Relvar® (Table 1) (Figures 3 and 4). It is envisaged that the utilisation of LABA/ ICS combinations will plateau or even fall following the change in GOLD guidance (Table 1). The change in the prescribing of Seretide® and Symbicort® to alternative inhalers such as Fostair® and Relvar® has been significant, i.e. p<0.001.

Figure 3: Total utilisation of LABA/ICS inhalers in Scotland between 2001 and 2017 (Source ISD Scotland – [55])

As seen (Figure 4), this change in LABA/ ICS utilisation patterns (Figure 3) has resulted in their expenditure falling in recent years with growing use of lower priced alternative inhalers (Fostair® and Relvar®). In addition, initiatives to encourage lower strength steroid inhalers in recent years (Table 1) also facilitated in reduced expenditures. Fostair® and Relvar® now account for 24.5% of total expenditure on LABAs/ ICS (2017) in Scotland and growing rapidly (6.8% in 2015 and 13.2% in 2016). This reduction in expenditure of Seretide® and Symbicort® with a corresponding increase in expenditure of alternative LABA/ ICS inhalers such as Fostair® and Relvar® has also been significant (p<0.001).

Figure 4: Total expenditure (GB£) on LABA/ICS inhalers in Scotland between 2001 and 2017 (Source ISD Scotland – [55])

**4. Discussion**

The utilisation patterns of the different inhaler types for patients with asthma and COPD (Figure 1) is in line with national and regional guidance (Table 1) with inhaled ICS used initially in patients with asthma, with combination ICS/ LABAs used for maintenance and further treatments added when required. In patients with COPD, LAMAs are increasingly recommended alongside LABA/ LAMA combinations as well as triple therapy with increasing fears about using combination LABAs/ ICSs unless patients also have asthmatic features (Table 1). The effect of these guidelines can also be seen with limited utilising of mast cell stabilisers (Figure 1) in line with their exclusion.

The growth in the utilisation of inhalers in Scotland is also in line with increasing prevalence rates especially for COPD [5]. The higher utilisation of Seretide® over Symbicort® (Figure 3) may be due to the preference of clinicians as opposed to any appreciable differences in clinical outcomes. This may have arisen because GSK is a long-standing company in this area in the UK, initially through Allen and Hanburys. However, further research is needed before any definitive statements can be made.

Inhaler expenditure increased from GB£48.63 million in 2001 to GB£85.91 million in 2010 and to GB £95.17 million in 2017 (Figure 2), enhanced by the prescribing of Seretide®, Symbicort® and Spiriva®. Traditionally, as mentioned, the focus of managing patients with asthma and COPD in Scotland has been on educating patients to improve their inhaler technique and adherence rates [33,38]. In addition, making sure optimal doses of ICS are given, which in recent years has meant a reduction in the steroid burden (Table 1). However, the high and growing expenditure on originator ICS/ LABAs up to 2010 resulted in Health Board initiatives to increase the use of alternative inhalers (Table 1 – Figure 3). Concurrent with this, there has been ongoing monitoring of patients to ensure care is not compromised. In addition, regular monitoring of inhaler prices especially when originator companies lower their prices to help retain or slow down their decline in utilisation. The increasing use of alternative inhalers coupled with initiatives to reduce the steroid burden and associated costs appears to have moderates the growth in overall inhaler expenditure (Figures 2 and 4) for now at least.

The usage and expenditure patterns for respiratory inhalers (Figures 1 and 2) did not follow the same patterns as seen with other common classes of medicines prescribed in ambulatory care in Scotland when medicines lose their patent such as antihypertensive medicines, PPIs, SSRIs and statins [42-44,53]. Consequently, we did not see appreciable reductions in inhaler expenditures as the constituent medicines lost their patents with the launch of newer inhalers replacing the older ones (Appendix 1A) and, as mentioned, price reductions with newer inhalers being more modest [42,43]. As a result, expenditure on inhalers increased by 195.7% between 2001 and 2017 with utilisation only increasing by136.8%. This increase in expenditure reflects the promotion of ICS/ LABA combination therapies until recently for patients with COPD (Table 1), the more modest price reductions of Fostair® and Relvar® compared to Symbicort® and Seretide®, as well as the challenges of treating patients with respiratory diseases including concerns with regularly switching patients between inhalers particularly if there are colour changes [80]. This was an issue with Relvar® limiting initially its use in practice. Concerns with switching patients to different inhalers whose condition is relatively controlled has the potential for increasing exacerbations. The extent though of this increased risk is under debate with some authors suggesting that any risk is so high that any switching of inhalers is unwarranted and could be costly [38,52,81]; however, others have suggested there is no real risk and patient care and clinical outcomes are of the same standard when using alternative inhalers [82].

Overall, constant monitoring of patients coupled with education on inhaler techniques as well as other initiatives helps ensure patients in Scotland are treated as well as possible within available resources. Such approaches are facilitated by the fact that community pharmacists cannot substitute branded medicines in the UK [42]. This situation is being closely monitored though in view of the recognised need to continue to offer high standards of care to patients with asthma and COPD in Scotland but mindful of the current high expenditure on inhalers. There are also concerns that the expiry dates of the newer inhalers are being reduced once opened, and this situation will also be closely monitored. One potential approach is that all key stakeholder groups become used to a more limited number of inhalers so adherence and outcomes can be maximised. However, the range has to be sufficient to cover patient needs.

***Limitations***

We are aware it cannot be categorically assumed that all inhalers in this study are being prescribed for the treatment of asthma or COPD. However, it is believed that the prescribing of these inhalers for other indications is currently very limited. There was also an inability to assess adherence to the different inhalers including the newer combination inhalers, or their impact on patient outcomes, using the PCA data. In addition, prescribing and dispensing data are not always equal to each other. Despite these limitations, we believe our findings are robust providing direction for the future.

**5. Conclusion**

We believe this is the first comprehensive study in the UK and across Europe to evaluate the influence of multiple international, national and regional initiatives on the utilisation and expenditure patterns of different inhalers used for the management of asthma and COPD in recent years.

Overall, the utilisation and expenditure patterns for inhalers used for the treatment of asthma and COPD in Scotland have not experienced the same trends as other high volume classes in ambulatory care in terms of decreasing expenditure despite increasing utilisation once standard medicines in the class lose their patent. This is due to a number of factors including the need to have a range of inhalers to choose from, the patent situation associated with new devices and new formulations, concerns with switching, and more modest price reductions with the newer alternative combination inhalers compared to their originators.

For any health service with finite resources, cost is a key consideration as seen recently regarding Scotland’s Health Board advice on Fostair® and Relvar®. However, improved patient care and safety is paramount for patients with asthma and COPD as seen by the various international, national and regional initiatives and guidelines which have appreciably influenced prescribing patterns in Scotland, most notably resulting in the increasing use of LABA/ICS inhalers (until recently) and reduced prescribing of single agent ICS and LABA inhalers. However, further research is need to fully assess the cost-effectiveness of the different approaches in Scotland including educational and other initiatives to enhance patient adherence and improve future care efficiently. Ideally, all key stakeholder groups should work together to rationalise the inhaler choices available and improve familiarity to help conserve costs within a constrained resource environment. These are projects for the future.

**Key issues:**

* There is increasing prevalence of asthma and COPD across countries, with both priority areas in Scotland
* There has been the continual launch of new patented inhalers to help address concerns with adherence to inhalers. This coupled with increased prevalence rates has meant a two fold increase in inhaler expenditure in Scotland between 2001 and 2017
* As a result, NHS Scotland spends over GB£125 million per year on respiratory medicines, with expenditure on LABA/ ICS and LAMA inhalers becoming the highest of any medicine type in Scotland
* However concerns with the availability of the full dose range of alternative combination inhalers to Seretide® over Symbicort®, coupled with the need to be cautious initially as healthcare professionals and patients became more familiar with alternative inhalers and their more modest price reductions, has resulted in total expenditure in inhalers plateauing in recent years compared with the appreciable reductions in expenditure on oral medicines once generics become available. Recent initiatives to reduce the steroid burden have also impacted on expenditures
* There is ongoing monitoring of patients to ensure care is not compromised with the increasing use of alternative combination inhalers, and this will continue
* The utilisation of combination ICS/ LABAs in COPD will be affected by recent concerns with their safety

**Funding**

The production of this paper was facilitated by a grant to Alec Morton by the University of Strathclyde under the university’s New Professors‘ Fund.

**Conflicts of interest**

Marion Bennie, Simon Hurding, Katie Johnston, Sean Macbride Stewart and Janey Lennon are all employed by NHS Scotland. Alec Morton declares consulting fees from Office of Health Economics and AstraZeneca not related to the current work and not on technologies related to the current work. The authors have no other conflicts of interest to declare.

**References**

\* of importance, \*\*of considerable importance

1. Papi A, Brightling C, Pedersen SE, Reddel HK. Asthma. Lancet. 2018;391(10122):783-800.

2. Vos T, Flaxman AD, Naghavi M, Lozano R, Michaud C, Ezzati M, et al. Years lived with disability (YLDs) for 1160 sequelae of 289 diseases and injuries 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet. 2012;380(9859):2163-96.

\*\*Important paper outlining the burden of respiratory diseases including asthma

3. Asthma UK. Asthma facts and statistics. 2017. Available at URL: <https://www.asthma.org.uk/about/media/facts-and-statistics/>.

4. Lopez-Campos JL, Tan W, Soriano JB. Global burden of COPD. Respirology (Carlton, Vic). 2016;21(1):14-23.

5. British Lung Foundation. Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) statistics. 2017. Available at <https://statistics.blf.org.uk/copd>.

6. Burney PG, Patel J, Newson R, Minelli C, Naghavi M. Global and regional trends in COPD mortality, 1990-2010. Eur Respir J. 2015;45(5):1239-47.

7. Ntritsos G, Franek J, Belbasis L, Christou MA, Markozannes G, Altman P, et al. Gender-specific estimates of COPD prevalence: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Int J Chron Obstruct Pulmon Dis. 2018;13:1507-14.

8. Healthier Scotland - Scottish Government - COPD Best Practice Guide. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Downloads/00527135.pdf.

\*\*Important initiative in Scotland to improve the care of patients with COPD given concerns with rising morality rates during the last decade

9. Global Initiative for Chronic Obstructive Lung Disease. POCKET GUIDE TO COPD DIAGNOSIS, MANAGEMENT, AND PREVENTION. A Guide for Health Care Professionals. 2017. Available at URL: <https://goldcopd.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/12/wms-GOLD-2017-Pocket-Guide.pdf>.

10. Miravitlles M, Vogelmeier C, Roche N, Halpin D, Cardoso J, Chuchalin AG, et al. A review of national guidelines for management of COPD in Europe. Eur Respir J. 2016;47(2):625-37.

11. Global Initiative for Asthma. Global Strategy for Asthma Management and Prevention. Updated 2018. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Downloads/wms-GINA-2018-report-V1.3-002.pdf.

12. NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE. Guideline Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in over 16s: diagnosis and management. Draft for consultation, July 2018. Available at URL: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/gid-ng10026/documents/short-version-of-draft-guideline>

\*Important document outling suggested ways to treat patients with COPD especially given recent concerns with the use of combination ICS/ LABAs in this patient group

13. NICE Guideline NG80. Asthma: diagnosis, monitoring and chronic asthma management. November 2017. Available at URL: <https://www.nice.org.uk/guidance/ng80>.

14. Campbell SM, Reeves D, Kontopantelis E, Sibbald B, Roland M. Effects of pay for performance on the quality of primary care in England. N Engl J Med. 2009;361(4):368-78.

15. NICE Quality and Outcomes Framework indicator - Asthma and Chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Available at URL: <https://www.nice.org.uk/standards-and-indicators/qofindicators>.

16. SIGN 153. British guideline on the management of asthma. September 2016. Available at URL: <https://www.sign.ac.uk/assets/sign153.pdf>

\*Key resource for the management of asthma in Scotland

17. NHS Quality Improvement Scotland. Clinical Standards - March 2010. Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease Services. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Downloads/COPD\_STANF\_MAR10.pdf.

18. NHS Scotland, The Scottish Government. Respiratory Prescribing Strategy 2014 to 2016. June 2014. Available at URL: <https://www.sehd.scot.nhs.uk/cmo/CMO(2014)14-Respiratory%20Prescribing%20Strategy%20June%202014.pdf>.

19. Principles of Prescribing in Adult Asthma 2018 March. Available from: <http://foi.nhsgrampian.org/globalassets/foidocument/foi-public-documents1---all-documents/nhsgmcn_asthma.pdf>.

20. NHS Grampian Respiratory MCN - Principles of Prescribing Inhaled Therapies in COPD. March 2018. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Desktop/My%20documents/Ongoing%20papers/Scotland%20Respiratory/nhsgmcn\_copd.pdf.

21. GOLD. Teaching slide set. 2018. Available at URL: <https://goldcopd.org/gold-teaching-slide-set/>.

22. Tricco AC, Strifler L, Veroniki AA, Yazdi F, Khan PA, Scott A, et al. Comparative safety and effectiveness of long-acting inhaled agents for treating chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a systematic review and network meta-analysis. BMJ open. 2015;5(10):e009183.

23. Welsh EJ, Cates CJ, Poole P. Combination inhaled steroid and long-acting beta2-agonist versus tiotropium for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. The Cochrane database of systematic reviews. 2010(5):Cd007891.

24. Nannini L, Cates CJ, Lasserson TJ, Poole P. Combined corticosteroid and long-acting beta-agonist in one inhaler versus placebo for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. The Cochrane database of systematic reviews. 2007(4):Cd003794.

25. Puhan MA, Bachmann LM, Kleijnen J, Ter Riet G, Kessels AG. Inhaled drugs to reduce exacerbations in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a network meta-analysis. BMC medicine. 2009;7:2.

26. Calverley P, Pauwels R, Vestbo J, Jones P, Pride N, Gulsvik A, et al. Combined salmeterol and fluticasone in the treatment of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a randomised controlled trial. Lancet. 2003;361(9356):449-56.

27. Calverley PM, Anderson JA, Celli B, Ferguson GT, Jenkins C, Jones PW, et al. Salmeterol and fluticasone propionate and survival in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. N Engl J Med. 2007;356(8):775-89.

28. Chan R, Sousa AR, Hynds P, Homayoun-Valiani F, Edwards D, Tabberer M. Assessment of the efficacy and safety of fluticasone propionate and salmeterol delivered as a combination dry powder via a capsule-based inhaler versus a multi-dose inhaler in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. Pulmonary pharmacology & therapeutics. 2017;43:12-9.

29. Jones R, Martin J, Thomas V, Skinner D, Marshall J, Stagno d'Alcontres M, et al. The comparative effectiveness of initiating fluticasone/salmeterol combination therapy via pMDI versus DPI in reducing exacerbations and treatment escalation in COPD: a UK database study. Int J Chron Obstruct Pulmon Dis. 2017;12:2445-54.

30. Yatera K YK, Nishida C, Noguchi S, Oda K, Akata K et al. Real-world effects of two inhaled corticosteroid/long-acting b2-agonist combinations in the treatment of asthma. J Asthma, 2014. 2014;51(7):762-68.

31. Altaf M, Zubedi AM, Nazneen F, Kareemulla S, Ali SA, Aleemuddin NM, et al. Cost-effectiveness analysis of three different combinations of inhalers for severe and very severe chronic obstructive pulmonary disease patients at a tertiary care teaching hospital of South India. Perspectives in clinical research. 2015;6(3):150-8.

32. Kern DM, Davis J, Williams SA, Tunceli O, Wu B, Hollis S, et al. Comparative effectiveness of budesonide/formoterol combination and fluticasone/salmeterol combination among chronic obstructive pulmonary disease patients new to controller treatment: a US administrative claims database study. Respir Res. 2015;16:52.

33. Roman-Rodriguez M, Metting E, Gacia-Pardo M, Kocks J, van der Molen T. Wrong inhalation technique is associated to poor asthma clinical outcomes. Is there room for improvement? Current opinion in pulmonary medicine. 2019;25(1):18-26.

34. Chrystyn H, van der Palen J, Sharma R, Barnes N, Delafont B, Mahajan A, et al. Device errors in asthma and COPD: systematic literature review and meta-analysis. NPJ primary care respiratory medicine. 2017;27(1):22.

35. Ozturk C, Aldag Y, Yilmaz Demirci N. Evaluation and importance of different types of inhaler device in patients with chronic obstructive lung disease. Tuberkuloz ve toraks. 2017;65(2):69-79.

36. Virchow JC, Crompton GK, Dal Negro R, Pedersen S, Magnan A, Seidenberg J, et al. Importance of inhaler devices in the management of airway disease. Respir Med. 2008;102(1):10-9.

37. Sanchis J, Gich I, Pedersen S. Systematic Review of Errors in Inhaler Use: Has Patient Technique Improved Over Time? Chest. 2016;150(2):394-406.

38. Lewis A, Torvinen S, Dekhuijzen PN, Chrystyn H, Watson AT, Blackney M, et al. The economic burden of asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease and the impact of poor inhalation technique with commonly prescribed dry powder inhalers in three European countries. BMC health services research. 2016;16:251.

39. NHS Lothian. Lothian Prescribing Bulletin Issue No. 79 May 2016. Formulary changes to improve care: asthma and COPD. Available at URL: <http://www.ljf.scot.nhs.uk/PrescribingBulletins/Prescribing%20Bulletins/Lothian%20Prescribing%20Bulletin%20Issue%2079%20May%202016%20v2%20resp%20amend.pdf>

\*Key document assisting with the management of asthma and COPD in Lothian Health Board

40. NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde. Clinical Guideline. Asthma Preferred list inhaler device guide (Primary and Secondary care). 2016 (updated November 2017). Available at URL: <http://www.nhsggc.org.uk/media/245912/asthma-inhaler-device-preferred-list.pdf>

\*Key document assisting with the management of asthma in GGC Health Board

41. NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde. Greater Glasgow and Clyde Medicines. Medicines Update Asthma / COPD Inhalers of Choice. 2018. Available at URL: <http://www.ggcprescribing.org.uk/blog/asthma-copd-inhalers-choice/>

\*Key document assisting with the management of asthma and COPD in GGC Health Board

42. Leporowski A, Godman B, Kurdi A, MacBride-Stewart S, Ryan M, Hurding S, et al. Ongoing activities to optimize the quality and efficiency of lipid-lowering agents in the Scottish national health service: influence and implications. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2018;18(6):655-66.

43. Godman B, Bishop I, Finlayson AE, Campbell S, Kwon HY, Bennie M. Reforms and initiatives in Scotland in recent years to encourage the prescribing of generic drugs, their influence and implications for other countries. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2013;13(4):469-82.

44. Godman B, Kurdi A, McCabe H, MacBride-Stewart S, Leporowski A, Hurding S et al. Ongoing activities to influence the prescribing of proton pump inhibitors within the Scottish National Health Service: their effect and implications. Generics and Biosimilars Initiative Journal (GaBI Journal). 2018;7(4):142-51.

45. Haughney J, Price D, Barnes NC, Virchow JC, Roche N, Chrystyn H. Choosing inhaler devices for people with asthma: current knowledge and outstanding research needs. Respir Med. 2010;104(9):1237-45.

46. Klijn SL, Hiligsmann M, Evers S, Roman-Rodriguez M, van der Molen T, van Boven JFM. Effectiveness and success factors of educational inhaler technique interventions in asthma & COPD patients: a systematic review. NPJ primary care respiratory medicine. 2017;27(1):24.

47. Normansell R, Kew KM, Mathioudakis AG. Interventions to improve inhaler technique for people with asthma. The Cochrane database of systematic reviews. 2017;3:Cd012286

\*Good paper outlining potential interventions to improve inhaler techniques

48. Lopez-Vina A, Giner J, Molina J, Palicio J, Plaza J, Quintano JA, et al. Multidisciplinary Consensus on the Nonadherence to Clinical Management of Inhaled Therapy in Spanish asthma patients. Clinical therapeutics. 2017;39(8):1730-45.e1.

49. Price D, Keininger DL, Viswanad B, Gasser M, Walda S, Gutzwiller FS. Factors associated with appropriate inhaler use in patients with COPD - lessons from the REAL survey. Int J Chron Obstruct Pulmon Dis. 2018;13:695-702.

50. Dal Negro RW, Povero M. The economic impact of educational training assessed by the Handling Questionnaire with three inhalation devices in asthma and Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease patients. ClinicoEconomics and outcomes research : CEOR. 2016;8:171-6.

51. Bjornsdottir US, Gizurarson S, Sabale U. Potential negative consequences of non-consented switch of inhaled medications and devices in asthma patients. International journal of clinical practice. 2013;67(9):904-10.

52. Lavorini F, Ninane V, Haughney J. Switching from branded to generic inhaled medications: potential impact on asthma and COPD. Expert Opinion on Drug Delivery. 2013;10(12):1597-602.

53. Godman B, Kurdi A, McCabe H, Johnson CF, Barbui C, MacBride-Stewart S et al. Ongoing initiatives within the Scottish National Health Service to affect the prescribing of SSRIs and their influence (In Press - Journal of Comparative Effectiveness Research).

54. Wild C, Grossmann N, Bonanno PV, Bucsics A, Furst J, Garuoliene K, et al. Utilisation of the ESMO-MCBS in practice of HTA. Annals of oncology : official journal of the European Society for Medical Oncology. 2016;27(11):2134-6.

55. Community Dispensing: Prescription Cost Analysis2018 July. Available from: <http://isdscotland.org/Health-Topics/Prescribing-and-Medicines/Community-Dispensing/Prescription-Cost-Analysis/>.

56. BNF. Authoritative and practical. 2018. Available at URL: <https://www.bnf.org/>

57. NHS Scotland. National Therapeutic Indicators. 2012 - Baseline data. Available at URL: <http://www.sehd.scot.nhs.uk/pca/PCA2012(M)08report.pdf>.

58. WHO. WHO Collaborating Centre for Drug Statistics Methodology. ATC/ DDD Index. Available at URL: <https://www.whocc.no/> [

59. NHS Scotland. The Scottish Government. National Therapeutic Indicators 2013 - Baseline Report. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Desktop/My%20documents/Ongoing%20papers/Scotland%20PPIs/National%20Therapeutic%20Indicators%20Scotland%202013.pdf.

60. Wettermark B, Godman B, Jacobsson B, Haaijer-Ruskamp F. Soft regulations in pharmaceutical policy making: an overview of current approaches and their consequences. Applied health economics and health policy. Applied Health Economics and Health Policy 2009;7(3):137-47.

61. Bennie M, Godman B, Bishop I, Campbell S. Multiple initiatives continue to enhance the prescribing efficiency for the proton pump inhibitors and statins in Scotland. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2012;12(1):125-30.

62. Godman B, Shrank W, Andersen M, Berg C, Bishop I, Burkhardt T, et al. Comparing policies to enhance prescribing efficiency in Europe through increasing generic utilization: changes seen and global implications. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2010;10(6):707-22.

63. Moon JC, Godman B, Petzold M, Alvarez-Madrazo S, Bennett K, Bishop I, et al. Different initiatives across Europe to enhance losartan utilization post generics: impact and implications. Frontiers in pharmacology. 2014;5:219.

64. Garuoliene K, Godman B, Gulbinovic J, Wettermark B, Haycox A. European countries with small populations can obtain low prices for drugs: Lithuania as a case history. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2011;11(3):343-9.

65. Godman B, Burkhardt T, Bucsics A, Wettermark B, Wieninger P. Impact of recent reforms in Austria on utilization and expenditure of PPIs and lipid-lowering drugs: implications for the future. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2009;9(5):475-84.

66. Godman B, Wettermark B, Hoffmann M, Andersson K, Haycox A, Gustafsson LL. Multifaceted national and regional drug reforms and initiatives in ambulatory care in Sweden: global relevance. Expert review of pharmacoeconomics & outcomes research. 2009;9(1):65-83.

67. Martikainen JE, Saastamoinen LK, Korhonen MJ, Enlund H, Helin-Salmivaara A. Impact of restricted reimbursement on the use of statins in Finland: a register-based study. Medical care. 2010;48(9):761-6.

68. Audit Scotland. Prescribing in General Practice in Scotland. 2013. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Desktop/My%20documents/Strathclyde/Alec%20and%20high%20price%20medicines/Lipid%20lowering%20paper/Audit%20Scotland%202013.pdf.

69. Audit Scotland. Supporting prescribing in general practice - a progress report. June 2003. Available at URL: <http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/docs/health/2003/nr_030626_supporting_prescribing_km.pdf>.

70. NHS Scotland. National Therapeutic Indicators 2014/ 2015. Available at URL: <http://www.sehd.scot.nhs.uk/publications/DC20141201nti.pdf> [

71. NHS Scotland. National Therapeutic Indicators 2015/ 2016. Available at URL: file:///C:/Users/mail/Desktop/My%20documents/Ongoing%20papers/Scotland%20PPIs/Therapeutic%20indicators%202015%20to%202016.pdf.

72. NHS Scotland Greater Glasgow and Clyde. National Therapeutic Indicators 2017-18. Available at URL: <http://www.ggcmedicines.org.uk/media/uploads/ps_primary_care/mupc__april_2017.pdf>

73. NHS Scotland Greater Glasgow and Clyde. Respiratory Inhalers Identification Guide. September 2013. Available at URL: <http://www.ggcprescribing.org.uk/media/uploads/prescribing_resources/inhaler_indentification_guide_-_1310.pdf>.

74. Audit Scotland. NHS in Scotland 2016. Available at URL: <http://www.audit-scotland.gov.uk/uploads/docs/report/2016/nr_161027_nhs_overview.pdf>.

75. The Scottish Government. IMPROVING HEALTH & WELLBEING OF PEOPLE WITH LONG TERM CONDITIONS IN SCOTLAND: A NATIONAL ACTION PLAN. June 2009. Available at URL: <https://www.sehd.scot.nhs.uk/mels/CEL2009_23.pdf>.

76. NHS Lothian. LOTHIAN CHRONIC OBSTRUCTIVE PULMONARY DISEASE (COPD) GUIDELINES. March 2010. Available at URL: <http://www.lothianrespiratorymcn.scot.nhs.uk/wp-content/uploads/2009/05/Lothian-COPD-Guidelines2.pdf>.

77. NHS Lothian Respiratory Managed Clinical Network 2014 to 2015. Available at URL: <http://www.lothianrespiratorymcn.scot.nhs.uk/>.

78. NHS Tayside. Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease (COPD) Guidelines. 2014. Availabel at URL: <https://www.nhstaysideadtc.scot.nhs.uk/TAPG%20html/Section%203/PDF%20docs/COPD%20guidelines.pdf>.

79. NHS GGC Primary Care COPD Guideline. Revised September 2013. Available at URL: <http://library.nhsggc.org.uk/media/223647/COPD%20guidelines.pdf>.

80. Asthma UK. UK Inhaler Group's joint statement on Duaklir® (aclidinium / formoterol fumarate) Genuair® packaging change. Available at URL: <https://www.asthma.org.uk/about/media/news/uk-inhaler-groups-joint-statement-on-duaklir-aclidinium--formoterol-fumarate-genuair-packaging-change/>.

81. Lavorini F, Braido F, Baiardini I, Blasi F. Asthma and COPD: Interchangeable use of inhalers. A document of Italian Society of Allergy, Asthma and Clinical Immmunology (SIAAIC) & Italian Society of Respiratory Medicine (SIMeR). Pulmonary Pharmacology and Therapeutics. 2015;34:25-30.

82. Bell C, Coutinho A, Farr E. Clinical and economic outcomes associated with the use of fluticasone propionate 250 mcg and salmeterol 50 mcg combination versus tiotropium bromide 18 mcg as initial maintenance treatment for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in managed care. Journal of Medical Economics. 2018;21(6):629-8.

**Appendix**

Table 1A – Summary of different inhaler drug classes (Source ISD Scotland – [55])

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Drug Class** | **Active Ingredient** | **Originator** | **Number of strengths and formulations (2001 vs. 2017)** |
| **SABA** | Salbutamol | Ventolin® | 19 - 15 |
|  | Terbutaline Sulphate | Bricanyl® | 6 - 2 |
|  | Fenoterol Hydrobromide | Duovent® | 6 - 0 |
|  | Orciprenaline Sulphate | Alupent® | 4 - 0 |
|  | Reproterol Hydrochloride | Bronchodil® | 2 - 0 |
| **SAMA** | Ipratropium Bromide | Atrovent® | 6 – 2 |
|  | Oxitropium Bromide | Oxivent® | 4 - 0 |
| **LAMA** | Tiotropium | Spiriva Respimat® | 0 - 2 |
|  | Aclidinium Bromide | Eklira Genuair® | 0 - 2 |
|  | Umeclidinium Bromide | Incruse Ellipta® | 0 - 2 |
| **Mast Cell Stabilisers** | Nedocromil Sodium | Tilade® | 4 - 2 |
|  | Sodium Cromoglicate | Intal® | 8 - 2 |
| **ICS** | Budesonide | Pulmicort® | 10 - 14 |
|  | Beclometasone Dipropionate | Becotide® | 42 - 19 |
|  | Ciclesonide | Alvesco® | 6 |
|  | Fluticasone Propionate | Flixotide® | 22 - 14 |
|  | Mometasone Furoate | Asmanex® | 0 - 8 |
| **SABA/SAMA** | Salbutamol/Ipratropium | Combivent® | 1 - 0 |
| **LAMA/LABA** | Umeclidinium Bromide/ Vilanterol | Anoro® | 0 – 0 |
|  | Tiotropium/Olodaterol | Spiolto Respimat® | 0 – 1 |
| **ICS/LABA** | Salmeterol/Fluticasone Propionate | Seretide® | 0-11 |
|  | Budesonide/Formoterol Fumarate | Symbicort® | 0 - 6 |
|  | Fluticasone Furoate/Vilanterol | Relvar Ellipta® | 0 - 2 |
|  | Fluticasone Propionate/Formoterol Fumarate | Flutiform® | 0 - 3 |
|  | Beclometasone Dipropionate/Formoterol Fumarate | Fostair® | 0 - 4 |
| **ICS/SABA** | Beclometasone Dipropionate/Salbutamol | Ventide® | 1 - 0 |

NB: There have been changes in the availability of different inhaler types during the course of the study as well as CFC and CFC-inhaler types. Some formulations were also never licensed in the UK but may have had limited use.