#### 1 Topical Application of Adult Caecal Contents to Eggs Transplants Spore-Forming Microbiota but Not Other

#### 2 Members of the Microbiota to Chicks

# Peter Richards<sup>\* 1</sup>, Gail Leeming <sup>1,2</sup>, Jo Fothergill <sup>1</sup>, Marion Bernardeau <sup>3</sup> and Paul Wigley <sup>1</sup>

1. Institute of Infection and Global Health, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, United Kingdom

6 7 2. Department of Veterinary Pathology, Infection and Public Health, Institute of Veterinary Science, 8 University of Liverpool

10 3. DuPont Industrial Biosciences, Genencor International BV, Leiden, The Netherlands

<u>11</u>

3

4 5

9

13 Correspondence\*:

14 Peter Richards

15 pr8448@liverpool.ac.uk

16 Running Title: Egg Treatment Transplants the Caecal Microbiota

#### 17 ABSTRACT

18 The intestinal microbiota plays an essential role in the metabolism and immune competence of 19 chickens from the first day of hatch. In modern production systems, chicks are isolated from adult 20 chickens, instead hatching in a clean environment. As a result, chicks are colonised by environmental bacteria including potential pathogens. There is a need to investigate methods by which chicks can be 21 22 exposed to the a more appropriate microbial community at hatch. Such methods must be easy to apply 23 in a hatchery and produce consistent results. The development of the intestinal microbiota of chicks hatched from eggs sprayed with dilute adult caecal content during incubation was observed at 0, 3, 7 24 25 and 14 days post hatch (d.p.h) across two experiments. High-throughput Illumina sequencing was 26 performed for the V4 hypervariable region of the 16S rRNA gene. A topical treatment of dilute adult 27 caecal content was sufficient to transplant spore-forming bacteria such as Lachnospiraceae and 28 Ruminococcaceae. However, this treatment was not able to transplant other taxa that are considered to

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

be core elements of the chicken caecal microbiota such as *Bacteroidaceae*, *Lactobacillaceae*, *Bifidobacteriaceae* and *Burkholderiaceae*. The topical treatment significantly altered the microbiota of chicks immediately post-hatch and accelerated the normal development of the microbiota with earlier colonisation by *Ruminococcaceae* in the caecum and Candidatus *Arthromitus* in the ileum. The effect of the treatment on caecal microbiota was maximal at 3 d.p.h but diminished over time.

### **34 IMPORTANCE**

35 Over the last 60 years poultry production has intensified in response to increased demand for meat. In 36 modern systems, chicks hatch without contacting chickens and their gut bacteria. Consequently, they 37 are colonised by environmental bacteria that may cause disease. The normal bacteria that live in the 38 gut, or intestinal microbiota, play an important role in the development of the immune system. 39 Therefore, it's essential to find easy ways to expose chicks to the more appropriate bacteria at hatch. 40 This experiment investigated whether spraying eggs with adult caecal contents was sufficient to transfer an adult microbiota to chicks. Our findings show that spore-forming bacteria were 41 42 transplanted but other members of the microbiota were not. In this respect, the spray application was 43 partially successful but the timing of the spray needs to be modified to ensure that more bacteria are transferred. 44

# 45 Introduction

Between 1961 and 2001, global average annual meat consumption per capita nearly doubled from 23.1kg to 42.20kg (1). Much of this increase has been provided by a growing poultry industry which has intensified and industrialised to meet demand. The broiler industry in the UK produced approximately 82 million broilers per month in 2018 (2). The industrialisation of poultry production has led to separation of mature adults, eggs and immature chickens at independent sites. Breeder

Applied and Environmental Microhiology

51 flocks, constituting the genetic elite of the national chicken population, are kept exclusively to provide 52 fertile eggs. Eggs are transported to hatcheries, which may be on the same site, where they are incubated in batches until hatch. After hatch, chicks are sold as 'day-old chicks' to finishers where they 53 54 remain until slaughter at around 42 days old. This separation of chicks from maternal contact delays 55 colonisation of the gut by normal commensals (3). Instead, chicks are first colonised by environmental 56 bacteria in hatcheries and during transport which may include possible pathogens such as Clostridium 57 *perfringens* or *Escherichia coli* (4-6). Poultry flocks are exquisitely sensitive to the presence of enteric pathogens (7,8). While many can be controlled using vaccination and biosecurity, pathogens such as 58 59 *Campylobacter* remain rife within the UK chicken population (9). Prophylactic use of antibiotics in the 60 poultry industry was widely adopted as a growth promoter with a secondary effect of facilitating 61 enteric pathogen control and reducing production losses (10). However, the indiscriminate use of 62 antibiotics has led to a rise in antimicrobial resistance. In order to combat this threat to public health, 63 the European Union enacted a ban on the use of antibiotics as growth promoters in 2006 (11). As a result, this tool of the poultry industry must be replaced with alternatives. 64

65

Manipulation of the intestinal microbiota provides one such alternative. Many efforts to alter the 66 67 microbiota have focused on the introduction of probiotics via feed or water to growing and adult chick (12). However, a growing body of evidence suggests that the ability to influence microbiota 68 69 composition decreases with age as a stable microbial community is established (13). Questions remain 70 over the optimal timing and delivery mechanism for microbiota interventions. Until recently, the 71 embryonic gut was thought to be sterile. With the advent of molecular techniques, this assumption of 72 sterility has been challenged with some evidence showing the presence of bacteria in the embryonic 73 gut. Molecular techniques have been used to visualise and detect bacteria in embryonic chick tissue.

74 For example, viable bacteria were detected in the caecal tissue from embryos at 18 and 20 d.i using 75 fluoresence in situ hybridisation (14). Bacterial DNA from Enterobacteriaceae, Actinomycetales, Bifidobacteriales and Lachnospiraceae was detected using T-RFLP of the entire gastrointestinal tract of 76 77 chicken embryos (15) raising the possibility that *in ovo* microbial colonisation occurs in proximal parts 78 of the gastrointestinal tract as well as the caecum. However, scepticism of such results is not 79 unwarranted as low microbial biomass samples are known to be prone to contamination leading to 80 false positive results and inflated microbial diversity (16). The presence of bacteria within embryos and eggs would pose a question as to their origin. Vertical transmission is one possibility but 81 82 considered unlikely (17). Germ-free chicks can be derived by sterilising the eggshell immediately after 83 lay and rearing in an isolator indicating that vertical transmission would be an uncommon route of 84 colonisation for normal microbiota (18, 19). This suggests that the principal entry route for bacteria 85 would be penetration of the eggshell and subsequent egg defences. Most studies focus on the ability of 86 Salmonella and other bacteria of public health importance to translocate from the eggshell to the 87 embryo although one study does demonstrate that other bacterial taxa are able to penetrate the 88 eggshell (20). While these findings demonstrated that penetration of the eggshell is possible by certain 89 bacterial taxa, it cannot be taken as evidence that microbes on the egg surface are able to traverse the 90 albumen and successfully colonise the embryonic gut. An aim of this study was to detect bacteria 91 within the embryonic gut and to resolve whether a selection of commensal bacteria applied to the egg 92 surface during incubation would be detected in the embryonic gut.

This study also aimed to investigate the effect of a topical application of adult caecal content on the development of the chicken intestinal microbiota and identify which bacterial taxa can be transplanted to chicks. Altering the microbiota of chicks after hatch is not a new idea. Since the 1970s, research has been conducted into the effectiveness of competitive exclusion cultures (CEC), usually anaerobically cultured bacteria from adult caecal contents, in reducing *Salmonella* infection in chicks (21). With the

Microbiology

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

98 observation that competitive exclusion was effective only when administered before Salmonella 99 challenge (22) the aim became to administer the probiotic as close to hatch as possible. The first report 100 of in ovo administration of a probiotic came from Cox et al. (23) who injected an undefined CEC into the 101 air cell of 17 d.i eggs. This treatment conferred a greater resistance to *Salmonella* Typhimurium (23). 102 Despite this early success, further results from injecting CECs into eggs have been variable with 103 reports of reduced hatchability and early mortality with increased disease resistance falling short of 104 antibiotic controls (14, 24-26). As such, it is worth questioning whether injection is the best delivery 105 method for CEC products. Prior to disinfection at hatcheries, which aims to reduce the abundance of 106 pathogenic bacteria which can reduce hatchability and chick performance, the egg has a surface 107 microbiota similar to the composition of the caecal microbiota (27). A topical application of adult 108 caecal bacteria may more accurately replicate the environment in which chickens and their 109 commensals co-evolved where a sitting hen would regularly replenish the surface bacteria of the egg. 110 Additionally, a spray application would remove the issue of hatchability caused by injecting probiotics into eggs. A previous experiment has explored the ability of a topical application of diluted adult caecal 111 112 content to affect microbiota development but little analysis was conducted to determine which 113 amplicon sequence variants (ASVs) were successfully transplanted from the donor material to 114 recipient chicks (28). This is an important question in terms of developing interventions for 115 commercial use. Regulators are unlikely to approve a treatment of unclassified bacteria sourced 116 directly from adult chicken caecal content. Identifying bacterial taxa that are likely to be successfully 117 transplanted by topical application is the first step towards creating an effective topical probiotic which is acceptable to regulators. 118

# 119 Results

Two separate experiments, a pilot experiment and a repeat experiment, were conducted to observe the effect of the topical application of adult caecal contents to eggs. Results from both experiments are presented together. A summary of sampling time points and abbreviations can be found in Figure 1. Briefly, sample groups are identified using abbreviations in which the first letter corresponds to the experiment (P = pilot, R = repeat), the second letter corresponds to treatment (C = control, T = treated) and the numbers correspond to the time point (0, 3, 7 or 14 d.p.h). Transplant material is identified by the abbrevition TRPL.

# 127 Sequencing Effort

A total of 22,103,523 reads were obtained from 182 experimental samples submitted for sequencing. After filtering, merging of paired reads and chimera removal, a total of 15,022,950 reads remained (68% of the original total) giving a mean of 82,544 reads per sample. The median number of reads per sample was 92,218.

# 132 Bacterial 16S rDNA was not detected in embryonic samples

Amplification of standard dilutions revealed that the PCR assay was able to clearly detect 10<sup>3</sup> bacterial cells in a sample (Supplementary Figure 1). No positive amplification of bacterial 16S rRNA genes was detected in any embryonic or egg sample at either 0 or 18 d.i. Amplicons were detected in positive control samples and all spiked samples indicating that the absence of amplicons in other samples was not due to PCR failure. This result indicates that no significant population of bacteria was present in the embryonic gut at 18 d.i.

Microbiology

### 139 Treatment had no consistent effect on body weight

The mean body weight of treated and control chicks in the repeat experiment was compared using
Student's t-test. No significant differences between groups were found at 0 (treated: M = 46g, SD =
5.83; control: M = 48.4g, SD = 6.65; conditions: t = -0.5, p = 0.6), 7 (treated: M = 135g, SD = 19.0;
control: M = 132g, SD = 17.1; conditions: t = 0.35, p = 0.7) and 14 (treated: M = 358.5g, SD = 44.8;
control: M = 322.5g, SD = 39.8; conditions: t = 1.8, p = 0.13) d.p.h. However, there was a significant
difference in body weight between groups at 3 d.p.h (treated: M = 77g, SD = 7.48; control: M = 65g, SD
= 5.0; conditions: t = 4.0, p = 0.002).

# 147 Treated chicks had higher alpha diversity at early time points

The alpha diversity of each sample group is displayed in Figure 2 with the significance of pairwise Kruskal-Wallis tests comparing alpha diversity between sample groups displayed in Figure S2. Across all experimental groups alpha diversity increased significantly with age with two exceptions. There was no significant increase in alpha diversity in treated or control chicks between 0 and 3 d.p.h (treated: H = 1.91, p = 0.19; control: H = 2.38, p = 0.15) or in treated chicks between 3 and 7 d.p.h during the repeat experiment (H = 2.16, p = 0.17).

In general, treatment with an adult-derived microbiota resulted in a significantly higher alpha diversity when compared to control chicks at 0 d.p.h (repeat: H = 6.82, p = 0.017) and 3 d.p.h (pilot: H = 9.02, p = 0.009; repeat: H = 9.8, p = 0.006) but not 7 and 14 d.p.h. There were significant differences in alpha diversity between transplant material (TRPL) samples and samples taken at 0 and 3 d.p.h as well as PT07 samples. Control chicks at 3 d.p.h had significantly higher alpha diversity in the repeat experiment compared to
the pilot experiment (H = 8.27, p = 0.01). There were no further significant differences in alpha
diversity between equivalent groups from the pilot and repeat experiments.

# 162 Treatment significantly affected beta diversity

163 When measured with an unweighted UniFrac metric, the factor 'Age' had the largest effect on beta diversity (ANOSIM test statistic = 0.78, p = 0.001), followed by 'Treatment' (ANOSIM test statistic = 164 0.13, p = 0.001) and 'Experiment' (ANOSIM test statistic = 0.10, p = 0.012). The average unweighted 165 166 UniFrac distance between groups is displayed in Figure S3. A PCoA analysis showed clustering of 167 samples by group (Figure 3A). When measured with a weighted UniFrac metric, the factor 'Age' had 168 the largest effect on beta diversity (ANOSIM test statistic = 0.40, p = 0.001), followed by 'Experiment' (ANOSIM test statistic = 0.16, p = 0.002) and 'Treatment' (ANOSIM test statistic = 0.13, p = 0.001). A 169 PCoA analysis showed clustering of samples by group (Figure 3B). 170

171 In plots of unweighted UniFrac distance RC0 and RT0 tend to cluster together in the PCoA plot with the exception of one RT0 sample. PC3 and RC3 samples clustered together along with three PT3 samples. 172 173 The remaining PT3 samples and all RT3 samples clustered togther and were closer to samples from 174 later time points that PC3 and RC3 samples. At 7 d.p.h, PC7, PT7, RC7 and RT7 samples cluster together 175 although there is a tendency for treated samples from both experiments to cluster closer to samples 176 from 14 d.p.h. RC14 and RT14 samples formed separate clusters to each other. A similar pattern of 177 clustering was present in plots of weighted UniFrac distance although there was no separate clustering of RC14 and RT14 samples. Instead, all samples from 7 and 14 d.p.h tended to cluster together along 178 179 with RT3 samples and one PT3 sample. Additionally, PC3 and RC3 samples formed distinct clusters 180 compared to the unweighted UniFrac distance plot.

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

181 Distance between sample groups and TRPL samples gives some indication of transplant success as the 182 unweighted UniFrac distance between similar samples is lower reflecting closer clustering of samples. At 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h treated samples were significantly closer to TRPL samples than controls (3 d.p.h: t 183 = 16.6, p < 0.001 ; 7 d.p.h: t = 7.2, p < 0.001 and 14 d.p.h: t = 4.8 , p < 0.001). This pattern of increased 184 185 similarity of treated samples to TRPL samples in both experiments suggests that bacteria from adult 186 caecal content successfully colonised chicks by those time points. However, the success of the 187 treatment was not uniform between experiments. PT3 samples are further from TRPL samples than RT3 samples (0.76 c.f. 0.66). 188

# 189 ASVs were differentially abundant between treated and control chicks

190 For ease of interpretation, results from the pilot and repeat experiments were interpreted separately. 191 Gneiss analysis was used to identify differentially abundant ASVs between treated and control chicks 192 since it accounts for the compositional nature of microbiome data. Firstly, a dendrogram of ASVs is 193 prepared. Each node is termed a 'balance' with taxa on one side of the balance designated as 194 numerators and on the other, denominators. The log ratio of abundances between numerator and 195 denominator taxa for each balance is calculated. This value can be compared between sample groups 196 to determine differences in microbiome composition. A significant difference between samples indicates that one of five hypotheses is true: i) The numerator taxa are increased in the group with a 197 198 higher log ratio; ii) The denominator taxa are decreased; iii) A combination of hypotheses i) and ii); iv) 199 Both numerator and denominator taxa are increased but numerator taxa have increased more; v) Both 200 numerator and denominator taxa are decreased but denominator taxa have decreased more. 201 Quantitative PCR is required to discern which hypothesis is correct as changes in relative abundance 202 are not always reflective of absolute abundance (29).

### 203 Pilot Experiment

Gneiss analysis revealed differential ASV abundance between treated and control chicks at 3 and 7 204 d.p.h. The ASV table was filtered to exclude ASVs with a total frequency of less than 39 (a justification 205 206 for filtering thresholds is provided in the Materials and Methods section) reducing the number of ASVs 207 in the analysis from 408 to 306. The overall linear regression model fit was R2 = 0.34 with covariate 208 "Treatment" accounting for 17.1% of variance. Log ratio balances y0 ( $\beta$  = -19.8, p < 0.001), y2 ( $\beta$  = 9.62, 209 p < 0.001), y5 ( $\beta$  = -3.97, p = 0.003), y12 ( $\beta$  = -5.42, p < 0.001), y14 ( $\beta$  = 6.56, p < 0.001) and y27 ( $\beta$  = 210 7.20, p = 0.006) were significant predictors for the covariate of "Treatment". On review of the heatmap, 211 balance y6 was considered to describe ASVs differentially present in treated chicks at 3 d.p.h. Figure 4 212 show the log abundance of ASVs at 3 and 7 d.p.h between treated and control chicks along with a summary of balances created by Gneiss analysis. Individual log ratios by group for significant balances 213 214 and balance taxonomy are available in Figure S4. The taxonomy of ASVs identified as differentially 215 abundant between treated and control samples is presented in Table 1A with relative abundance of bacterial families in each sample displayed in Figure S5. A higher number of ASVs assigned to 216 Lachnospiraceae, Bacillaceae, Ruminococcaceae, and Lactobacillaceae were found to have a higher 217 218 relative abundance in treated samples compared to control samples. Some ASVs were found to have a 219 higher abundance in control compared to treated samples and were assigned to Enterobacteriaceae, 220 Erysipelotrichaceae and Peptostreptococcaceae.

21 Repeat Experiment

Gneiss analysis revealed differential ASV abundance between treated and control chicks at 0, 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h. The ASV table was filtered to exclude ASVs with a total frequency of less than 30 reducing the number of ASVs in the analysis from 633 to 475. The overall linear regression model fit was R2 = 0.31 with covariated "Treatment" accounting for 9.65% of variance. Log ratio balances y0 ( $\beta$  = 14.2, p < Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

Microbiology

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

0.001), y5 ( $\beta$  = -6.0, p = 0.001), y10 ( $\beta$  = -5.7, p = 0.009), y14 ( $\beta$  = -7.8, p < 0.001), y27 ( $\beta$  = 4.1, p = 0.01) 227 and y28 ( $\beta$  = 2.9, p < 0.001) were significant predictors for the covariate of "Treatment". On review of 228 the heatmap, balance y4 was considered to describe ASVs differentially present in control chicks at 3 229 d.p.h and balance y1<sub>denominator</sub> ASVs were considered to be equally abundant between treated and control samples. Balances y5, y14, y27 and y28 contained ASVs already identified as differentially 230 231 abundant in treated or control samples by other balances. Figure 5 shows the log abundance of ASVs at 232 0, 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h between treated and control chicks along with a summary of balances created by 233 Gneiss analysis. Individual log ratios for significant balances and balance taxonomy are available in 234 Figure S6. The taxonomy of ASVs identified as differentially abundant between treated and control 235 samples is presented in Table 1B with relative abundance of bacterial families in each sample 236 displayed in Figure S5. A higher number of ASVs assigned to Lachnospiraceae, Ruminococcaceae, 237 *Clostridiales* vadin BB60 group, *Bacillaceae*, *Peptostreptococcaceae* and *Mollicutes* RF39 were found to 238 have a higher relative abundance in treated samples compared to control samples. Some ASVs were 239 found to have a higher abundance in control compared to treated samples and were assigned to 240 Clostridiaceae 1, Enterobacteriaceae and Enterococcaceae.

241 12% of ASVs present in the transplant material were identified as successfully transplanted in the Pilot 242 **Experiment and 20% in the Repeat** 

243 445 ASVs were defined as present in the transplant. ASVs present in the transplant material that were not 244 subsequently identified in any samples from the pilot and repeat experiments were removed from the analysis (n =245 274). Most of these ASVs were assigned to *Ruminococcaceae* (n = 125), *Clostridiales* vadin BB60 group 246 (n = 38), Lachnospiraceae (n = 33), Christensenellaceae (n = 12) and Peptococcaceae (n = 9). ASVs 247 assigned to Bacteroidaceae, Lactobacillaceae, Coriobacteriaceae, Bifidobacteriaceae, Burkholderiaceae

Microbiology

and *Eggerthellaceae* had a high relative abundance in the transplant material (Figure S5). However,
none of these ASVs were successfully transplanted in either the pilot or repeat experiments.

### 250 Pilot Experiment

251 A total of 56 ASVs were categorised as successfully transplanted (Table 2 and Figure S7). The 252 taxonomy assignment of ASVs is shown in Table 3A. Only ASVs assigned to Lachnospiraceae, 253 Ruminococcaceae, Erysipelotrichaceae and Mollicutes RF39 (uncultured rumen bacteria) were defined 254 as successfully transplanted. A further 49 ASVs were categorised as possibly transplanted of which the 255 majority were assigned to the families Ruminococcaceae and Lachnospiraceae. Other ASVs categorised 256 as possibly transplanted were assigned to Clostridiaceae 1, Erysipelotrichaceae, Bacillaceae, 257 Peptostreptococcaceae, Enterobacteriaceae, Enterococcaceae and Christensenellaceae. At the genus 258 level, the two ASVs assigned to Clostridiaceae 1 were identified as Candidatus Arthromitus. The 259 remaining 201 ASVs were categorised as environmental. Some taxa were almost exclusively categorised as environmental including Clostridiaceae 1, Enterobacteriaceae, Peptostreptococcaceae, 260 261 Bacillaceae, Clostridiales vadin BB60 group, Enterococcaceae, Paenibacillaceae and Lactobacillaceae. A 262 Hybrid Sankey diagram showed how the taxonomy of transplanted and environmental ASVs relates to 263 that of ASVs identified as differentially abundant between treated and control samples (Figure S8A).

### 264 Repeat Experiment

A total of 89 ASVs were categorised as successfully transplanted (Table 2 and Figure S7B). The taxonomy assignment of ASVs is shown in Table 3B. The majority were assigned to the families *Lachnospiraceae* and *Ruminococcaceae*. One ASV that was categorised as successfully transplanted and assigned to *Clostridiaceae* 1 was identified at the genus level as Candidatus *Arthromitus*. A further 37 ASVs were categorised as possibly transplanted of which the majority were assigned to the family *Ruminococcaceae*. The remaining 349 ASVs were categorised as environmental. As for the pilot

AEN

Microbiology

271 experiment, some taxa were mainly categorised as environmental including *Clostridiaceae* 1, 272 *Clostridiales* vadin BB60 group, *Erysipelotrichaceae*, *Peptostreptococcaceae*, *Enterobacteriaceae*, 273 *Bacillaceae*, *Enterococcaceae*, *Paenibacillaceae* and *Lactobacillaceae*. A Hybrid Sankey diagram showed 274 how the taxonomy of transplanted and environmental ASVs relates to that of ASVs identified as 275 differentially abundant between treated and control samples. A Hybrid Sankey diagram showed how 276 the taxonomy of transplanted and environmental ASVs relates to that of ASVs identified as 277 differentially abundant between treated and control samples. A Hybrid Sankey diagram showed how

A contingency table (Table 2) shows the overlap between ASVs identified as differentially abundant and their classification in terms of transplant success in Experiments One and Two. The relationship between group assignment was significant in the pilot,  $\chi^2$  (4) = 29.2, p < 0.001, and repeat,  $\chi^2$  (4) = 72.8, p < 0.001, experiments. ASVs identified as differentially abundant in treated chicks were more likely to be defined as successfully transplanted or possibly transplanted.

283 Quantitative PCR confirmed differentially abundant taxa between treated and control samples

### 284 Caecum

Genera within *Lachnospiraceae* have generally been placed in *Clostridium* Cluster XIVa while genera within *Ruminococcaceae* have generally been placed in *Clostridium* Cluster IV (30, 31). As such, primers for *Clostridium* Cluster XIV were used to estimate the abundance of *Lachnospiraceae* and primers for *Clostridium* Cluster IV were used to estimate the abundance of *Ruminococcaceae*. Results are presented in Figure 6.

The abundance of *Clostridium* Cluster XIV was significantly different in RT0 samples (t = 22.14, p < 0.001) as no DNA was amplified using this primer in RC0 samples. In both experiments, treated chicks had significantly more *Clostridium* Cluster XIV at 3 d.p.h (pilot: t = 7.24, p < 0.001; repeat: t = 11.3, p <

Microbiology

0.001). The difference between treated and control chicks continued to be significant in the repeat
experiment at 7 d.p.h (t = 4.0, p < 0.001) but not in the pilot experiment. There was no significant</li>
difference in *Clostridium* Cluster XIV abundance between groups at 14 d.p.h.

There was no significant difference in *Clostridium* Cluster IV abundance between RC0 and RT0 samples, as DNA from this taxa was amplified in only one RT0 sample. The abundance of *Clostridium* Cluster IV was significantly higher in RT3 samples compared to RC3 samples (t = 4.9, p < 0.001) but the result was not quite significant when comparing PT3 and PC3 samples (t = 1.95, p = 0.07). By 7 and 14 d.p.h there was no significant difference in *Clostridium* Cluster IV abundance between treated and control chicks.

There were differences in abundance of *Clostridium* Cluster IV between treated chicks from the pilot and repeat experiments. RT3 samples had a higher abundance of *Clostridium* Cluster IV compared to PT3 samples (t = 3.63, p = 0.002).

305 No Enterobacteriaceae were detected in either RT0 or RC0 samples. There was a significantly lower abundance of Enterobacteriaceae RT3 samples compared to RC3 samples (t = -5.42, p < 0.001). 306 However, in the pilot experiment, the opposite result was obtained with a significantly higher 307 308 abundance of Enterobacteriaceae in PT3 samples compared to PC3 samples (t = 3.54, p = 0.005). At 7 309 d.p.h, there was a significantly lower abundance of Enterobacteriaceae in treated chicks in both 310 experiments (pilot: t = -5.24, p < 0.001; repeat: t = -2.85, p = 0.01). On average, the abundance of 311 Enterobacteriaceae was lower in RT14 samples compared to RC14 samples but the difference was not 312 significant (t = -1.95, p = 0.07). There was a large inter-experiment variation in *Enterobacteriaceae* 313 abundance with higher abundance detected at 3 d.p.h in the repeat experiment.

High levels of *Clostridium* were detected in RT0 and RC0 samples were no significant difference
between the groups. The abundance of *Clostridium* was significantly lower in RT3 samples compared

Microbiology

to RC3 samples (t = -7.78, p < 0.001) but was significantly higher in RT7 samples compared to RC7</li>
samples (t = 3.5, p = 0.002). There were no significant differences in *Clostridium* abundance between
treated and control chicks in the pilot experiment or in the repeat experiment at 14 d.p.h.

319 Ileum

No *Enterobacteriaceae* were detected in treated or control chicks in the repeat experiment at 0 d.p.h (Figure 7). There was a significantly lower abundance of *Enterobacteriaceae* in treated chicks compared to control chicks at 3 d.p.h in the repeat experiment (t = -4.78, p < 0.001) and 7 d.p.h in the pilot experiment (t = -9.27, p < 0.001). There were no significant differences between treated and control chicks at other time points.

There was no significant difference in *Clostridium* abundance between treated and control chicks at any time point except at 3 d.p.h in the repeat experiment where the abundance was lower in treated chicks (t = -4.33, p < 0.001).

In both experiments, no Candidatus *Arthromitus* was present in the ileum until 7 d.p.h. At 7 d.p.h, the abundance of Candidatus *Arthromitus* was significantly higher in treated chicks in the pilot and repeat experiments (t = 4.35, p < 0.001 and t = 2.97, p = 0.008 respectively). Although the average abundance of Candidatus *Arthromitus* was higher in treated chicks from the repeat experiment at 14 d.p.h the difference was not significant (t = 1.88, p = 0.08).

# 333 Treatment did not alter intestinal morphology

Histological examination of ileal and caecal tonsil tissues from the repeat experiment at 0, 3, 7 and 14
d.p.h was conducted to observe morphological parameters associated with intestinal development
such as villus height and width, epithelial cell height and crypt mitotic figure counts.

Microbiology

Significantly more mitotic figures (Figures S9A and S9B) were recorded in the crypts of control chicks 337 338 than treated chicks at 3 d.p.h in the ileum (t = 3.53, p = 0.008) and caecal tonsil (t = 2.81, p = 0.03). 339 There was no statistically significant difference in mitotic figure counts between age groups in the ileum (F = 3.1, p = 0.09) and caecal tonsil (F = 0.18, p = 0.94). 340

There were no significant differences in epithelial cell height, villus height or villus width between 341 342 treated and control chicks at 0, 3, 7 or 14 d.p.h (Figures S9C, S9D and S9E). There was a statistically 343 significant difference in villus height (F = 41.6, p < 0.001), villus width (F = 18.1, p < 0.001) and 344 epithelial cell height (F = 58.9, p < 0.001) between age groups. Post hoc comparisons revealed that villus height was significantly different between 0 and 3 d.p.h (p = 0.001), 3 and 7 d.p.h (p = 0.001) and 345 7 and 14 d.p.h (p = 0.001). Villus width was significantly different between 0 and 3 d.p.h (p = 0.01) and 346 7 and 14 d.p.h (p = 0.001) but not between 3 and 7 d.p.h (p = 0.75). Epithelial cell height was 347 significantly different between 0 and 3 d.p.h (p = 0.001) and 3 and 7 d.p.h (p = 0.001) but not between 348 349 7 and 14 d.p.h (p = 0.66).

350 Segmented filamentous bacteria, were observed in the ileum from 7 d.p.h with presence on ileal 351 histology correlating with presence of Canidadatus Arthromitus detected by qPCR. In the repeat 352 experiment, segmented filamentous bacteria were also seen in the caecal tonsil in close approximation 353 to epithelial cells and in the lumen (Figure S10A).

No bacteria were found in the caecal crypts of any chicks at 0 d.p.h or control chicks at 3 d.p.h, 354 355 however, bacteria were identified in the caecal crypts of four treated chicks (Figure S10B). At 7 d.p.h, 356 four treated chicks and six control chicks were positive. At 14 d.p.h, no treated or control chicks were 357 positive, although occasional bacteria were noted in caecal crypts.

Microbiology

### 358 Treatment did not affect immune cell populations in the caecal tonsil

Tissue from chicks at 3 d.p.h was examined as this was the time point when most differences were found between the microbiota of treated and control chicks. No significant differences in counts of CD4, CD8 $\alpha$ , CD8 $\beta$ ,  $\gamma\delta$  TCR and Bu1 cells were found between treated and control caecal tonsils at 3 d.p.h.

### 362 Discussion

This study demonstrated that there were no detectable bacteria present in the embryonic gut at 18 d.i. It could be argued that detection of PCR amplicons using gel electrophoresis was not sensitive enough to detect small numbers of bacteria within the embryonic gut. It could be expected that a bacterial population too small to be detected using PCR would also be too small to have an impact in the face of overwhelming colonisation by other bacterial taxa at hatch. It is likely that the chicken gut remains sterile until hatch when bacteria present on the egg surface are the first to colonise.

369 Inoculation of the egg surface with an adult-derived microbiota was sufficient to transfer elements of 370 the microbiota to chicks with the result of accelerating caecal microbiota development. In treatment 371 and control groups across both experiments, microbial succession followed the same pattern. The microbiota of day-old chicks was poorly diverse and composed of environmental bacteria, a pattern 372 373 well described in current literature (13, 28, 32). The order of succession whereby environmental 374 bacteria were replaced first by Lachnospiraceae and then Ruminococcaceae and other Clostridiales was 375 common across treated and control chicks. However, the speed of succession was faster in treated 376 chicks in both experiments with an initial strong colonisation by *Lachnospiraceae* followed by an 377 increase in Ruminococcaceae. Many Ruminococcaceae ASVs were classified as successfully or possibly 378 transplanted suggesting that these ASVs were present at 0 and 3 d.p.h but were unable to colonise the 379 caecum initially. This suggests that alterations to caecal conditions by Lachnospiraceae or some other

380 unknown host factor are a prerequisite for colonisation by *Ruminococcaceae*. These results are in 381 contrast to those of Donaldson et al. (28) who did not observe significant differences in alpha diversity or the pattern of bacterial colonisation between treated and control birds. These differing results can 382 383 be explained by different techniques used to apply the transplant material. Donaldson et al. (28) 384 swabbed the egg surface with diluted adult caecal content once during incubation which may have 385 resulted in the application of lower numbers of spores and vegetative cells to the eggshell than a spray. 386 Additionally, multiple treatments may have allowed for an accumulation of viable bacterial spores 387 more akin to the effect of close contact with the hen during incubation.

388 The presence of ASVs common to the transplant material from as early as a few hours post hatch 389 shows that the caecal microbiota can be successfully transplanted to chicks by topical application to 390 the egg surface. Most of the successfully transplanted ASVs were assigned to Lachnospiraceae and 391 Ruminococcaceae which differs from previously published results. Pedroso et al. (14) found only one 392 operational taxonomic unit assigned to Lachnospiraceae was transferred to treated chicks after 393 inoculating eggs with an *in ovo* injection of a commercial probiotic competitive exclusion (CPCE) 394 product. In contrast, we found that the majority of transferred features were assigned to 395 Lachnospiraceae, Ruminococcaceae and other Clostridiales. CPCE products are collections of culturable 396 bacteria but the results of our study show that the ASVs most likely to successfully colonise and persist 397 within the chicken caecum belonged to taxa that are challenging to culture in the laboratory such as 398 Lachnsopiraceae, Ruminococcaceae and, to a lesser degree, Clostridiales vadin BB60 and Mollicutes 399 RF39. It's unlikely that current CPCE products have an optimal bacterial composition for long term 400 colonisation of chicks. Development of CPCE products should focus on including the aforementioned 401 bacterial taxa as these have been shown to readily colonise newly hatched chicks and persist within the caecum. However, topical application of caecal contents was unable to transplant several 402 403 important taxa such as Bacteroidaceae, Lactobacillaceae and Bifidobacteriaceae. A recent study of

Applied and Environmental

Microbiology

404

405

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

420

421

422

423

exception of Lactobacillaceae (33). No Bacteroidetes isolates were spore-forming, however, 73% of Bacteroidetes isolates were microaerotolerant and able to survive air exposures of 24 hours (33). Similarly, the Bifidobacteria isolated from the chicken gut are non-spore forming (34). This difference in environmental survival strategy explains the pattern of transplanted features observed in this study. Spores would be able to survive on the egg surface and colonise the chick at hatch whereas non-spore

forming members of the caecal microbiota would not survive the 72 hours from the last treatment to hatch. Alternatively, since bacterial viability was not assessed in the transplant material, the storage and handling of the caecal content may have negatively impacted the survival of taxa that were not transplanted. The inability of a topical treatment of diluted adult caecal content at 18 days of incubation to transfer Bacteroidaceae, Lactobacillaceae and Bifidobacteriaceae exposes a major weakness of the technique whether that is due to oxygen exposure during treatment or reduced viability due to storage. Bacteroidaceae is considered a core member of the chicken caecal microbiota (12, 35, 36) while members of *Bifidobacteriaceae* have been positively correlated with increased bird weight (35). Any future experiments aiming to transplant an adult caecal microbiota would need to take these taxa into account by delivering treatments immediately after hatch, either directly to the chick or into the environment. Exploring different methods of bacterial preservation by using more appropriate storage media to improve bacterial viability provides another avenue for future investigation.

whole genome sequences from caecal bacteria revealed that genes enabling sporulation were found

within most Gram-positive Firmicutes, such as Lachnospiraceae and Ruminococcaceae, with the

The abundance of Candidatus Arthromitus, also known as Candidatus Savagella or segmented 424 425 filamentous bacteria was studied in the ileum due to its importance as an immunostimulatory bacterium (37-39). Consistent with previous experiments, Candidatus Arthromitus was absent from 426 427 the ileum until 7 d.p.h (40) after which a higher abundance was present in treated chicks. The

environmental factors influencing Candidatus Arthromitus colonisation have not been explored although increased abundance was noted in the ilea of chicks housed on reused litter (41). The transplant material may have contained Candidatus Arthromitus spores that transferred to treated chicks resulting in a higher abundance once ileal conditions were suitable for colonisation. Alternatively, the presence of transplanted bacteria in treated chicks may have created favourable metabolic or immunological conditions allowing earlier and greater colonisation by Candidatus Arthromitus. Treatments which result in early colonisation by Candidatus Arthromitus should be of interest to poultry producers as earlier colonisation by Candidatus Arthromitus has been positively 435 436 correlated with body weight (35). Segmented filamentous bacteria were found in the caecal tonsil on 437 histology. The presence of segmented filamentous bacteria in close approximation to the caecal tonsil 438 epithelium was previously reported in 1978 (42). While previous studies have been conducted to 439 investigate the role of segmented filamentous bacteria on immune development in the ileum of mice 440 (38,43), no studies focus on similar effects in either the ileum or caecal tonsil of chicken.

The transplant was more successful in the repeat experiment as evidenced by improved early transplant uptake and presistence of significant differences in alpha diversity until 7 d.p.h. The reason for this variability is hard to assess. Since the storage and application of transplant material was uniform across both experiments, uncontrolled variables such as the initial microbiota or other environmental bacteria may have affected transplant success.

A potential use for caecal microbiota transplants in chicks is the competitive exclusion of potential pathogens such as *Enterobacteriaceae* and *Clostridium* during the first week post-hatch. In the repeat experiment there was a significant difference in the colonisation of *Enterobacteriaceae* with a consistently lower abundance in treated chicks. The role of some *Enterobacteriaceae* in the chicken caecal microbiota is unclear. While *Escherichia coli* has the potential for pathogenicity, it is often found

in the caeca of healthy chickens. As such, the higher abundance of *Enterobacteriaceae* in control chicks 451 452 may not be a cause for concern. However, large blooms of *Enterobacteriaceae* unopposed by other taxa, such as that in control chicks from the repeat experiment, are unlikely to be beneficial to the host. In 453 454 this regard, the transplant was successful as a similar overgrowth of *Enterobacteriaceae* was avoided 455 in treated chicks. The lower abundance of *Enterobacteriaceae* in treated chicks is likely due to the 456 presence of short chain fatty acid (SCFA) producing bacteria such as Lachnospiraceae and 457 Ruminococcaceae. Previous studies have found an inhibitory effect of SCFAs on Enterobacteriaceae growth both in vitro and in vivo (44). The treatment had less of an impact on the abundance of 458 459 Clostridium. The most significant species of Clostridium in terms of chicken health is Clostridium 460 perfringens which has been linked to necrotic enteritis in chicks. Direct challenges using this species 461 and other more significant pathogens such as *Campylobacter* and *Salmonella* are required to further 462 explore how caecal microbiota transplants can affect pathogen abundance in the caecum.

463 This study did not find statistically significant differences in intestinal morphology between treated and control chicks, except that the mitotic figure count was higher in both the ileum and the caecum of 464 465 control chicks at 3 d.p.h. The caecal microbiota of treated and control chicks at this time point was markedly different with control chicks mainly colonised by Enterobacteriaceae. If mitotic figure count 466 467 is reflective of epithelial cell replacement rates, this could imply that the presence of Enterobacteriaceae increased epithelial cell replacement. Equally, it could be argued that the lack of 468 Lachnospiraceae and Ruminococcaceae may have induced higher epithelial cell turnover in control 469 470 chicks since the bacterial metabolite butyrate decreases apoptosis of normal enterocytes (45). Body 471 weight was also significantly different between treated and control chicks at 3 d.p.h. As with ileal 472 epithelial turnover, if this difference were attributable to the microbiota it is not possible to distinguish 473 if the cause was a negative effect of Enterobacteriaceae or positive effect of Lachnospiraceae and 474 Ruminococcaceae.

lied and Environmental Microbiology 475 No significant differences in immune cell populations were found between treated and control chicks 476 at 3 d.p.h despite large differences in caecal microbiota. While these differences did not have an impact on the number of immune cells in the caecal tonsil, it remains possible that the presence of different 477 478 bacterial species stimulates differential gene expression in immune cells since a role of SCFA 479 producing bacteria in immune development has been studied in other species (46,47).

480 The presence of bacteria in caecal tonsil crypts has not previously been reported in chickens. This 481 observation was age dependent with sparse bacteria observed at 14 d.p.h compared to 3 and 7 d.p.h. 482 This raises the prospect that the presence of bacteria in the caecal tonsil crypts has some role in 483 immune development which subsequently excludes them from this niche. It was not possible to determine the taxonomy of these bacteria, however, it's likely that they were Lachnospiraceae or 484 485 *Ruminococcaceae* due to the absence of bacteria in the caecal tonsil crypts of all chicks at 0 d.p.h and 486 control chicks at 3 d.p.h. Additionally, a previous study found that these taxa have a higher relative 487 abundance in caecal mucus compared to lumen contents (48).

488 In summary, three topical applications of dilute adult caecal content to the eggshell was sufficient to 489 transplant elements of the caecal microbiota to newly hatched chicks resulting in accelerated 490 development of the caecal microbiota. However, while important members of the caecal microbiota 491 such as Lachnospiraceae and Ruminococcaceae were successfully transplanted, topical application 492 failed to transplant Bacteroidaceae or Lactobacillaceae. Topical application of characterised bacterial 493 communities to the eggshell during incubation provides a mechanism to transfer a desirable 494 intetestinal microbiota to chicks and reduce colonisation by possible pathogens. However, treatment 495 ending at 18 d.i only successfully transferred spore-forming bacteria with further experiments 496 required to determine whether non spore-forming microbiota can be transplanted by topical 497 treatments in the hours before or after hatch.

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

Microbiology

### 498 Materials and Methods

### 499 Animals and Housing

# 500 Pilot Experiment

501 61 Ross 308 eggs were purchased from a local hatchery (Annyalla Chicks, Wrexham). Hatchery eggs 502 were disinfected daily during storage using a fog application of Virocid<sup>®</sup> (Cid Lines), a disinfectant 503 based on quaternary ammonium, glutaraldehyde and isopropanol. Eggs at the hatchery are disinfected 504 further using formaldehyde fumigation before being set. On arrival at the experimental housing, 5 eggs 505 were selected for sampling at 0 d.i. The remaining 56 eggs were divided into a treatment group and a 506 control group of 28 eggs each. Each group was housed in different incubators in different rooms. A 507 biosecurity protocol was implemented whereby the control group was handled first to avoid transfer 508 of environmental bacteria from the treatment to the control group. Eggs were incubated at 37.5°C for 509 21 days. The eggs were candled at 7 d.i to assess viability. In both groups, 8 eggs were removed as no 510 embryonic development had occurred. 5 eggs from each group were removed for sampling at 18 d.i. 511 The remaining 15 eggs in each group were left to hatch. 15 and 14 chicks hatched from the treatment 512 and control groups respectively. Chicks were left in the incubators until dry before being transferred to 513 brooder pens with a wood shaving substrate. Water and feed were provided *ad libitum* by a drinker 514 and feeder present in each brooder. Chicks were fed a vegetable protein based starter diet for the duration of the experiment (Table 4). Seven chicks from each group were sampled at 3 days post hatch 515 516 (d.p.h) with the remaining 8 treated and 7 control chicks sampled at 7 d.p.h. No unexpected deaths 517 occurred in either group over the course of the experiment.

#### **Repeat Experiment** 518

56 Ross 308 eggs were purchased from a local hatchery (Annyalla Chicks, Wrexham). Eggs underwent 519 520 the same disinfection procedure at the hatchery as described for the Pilot Experiment. On arrival at the 521 experimental housing, the 56 eggs were divided between two incubators of 28 eggs each. The day that 522 incubation started was defined as 0 d.i. Both incubators were housed in the same room. Eggs were 523 incubated at 37.5°C for 22 days. The eggs were candled at 7 d.i to assess viability. Eggs began to hatch 524 at 20 d.i with 6 chicks hatching on 20 d.i, 21 on 21 d.i and 17 on 22 d.i giving a total of 44 chicks. After 525 hatch, chicks were left in the incubators until dry before being transferred to brooder pens with a 526 wood shaving substrate. On the 22 d.i, 40 day old chicks were purchased from the same hatchery. 527 These chicks were the control group and were housed separately from treated chicks. Water and feed 528 were provided *ad libitum* by a drinker and feeder present in each brooder. Chicks were fed a vegetable 529 protein based starter diet for the duration of the experiment. Five chicks from each group were 530 sampled on the same day the control chicks were brought to the housing (defined as 0 d.p.h). Ten chicks from each group were sampled at 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h. Two chicks from the treatment group died 531 532 unexpectedly during the experiment, one at 1 d.p.h and another at 6 d.p.h. The cause of death was not 533 determined although a preliminary gross post mortem examination revealed peritonitis and 534 perihepatitis consistent with early opportunistic bacterial infection.

#### 535 Treatment

536 Entire caecal contents were collected from healthy 42 day old chickens from three different breeds 537 (Ross 308, Hubbard JA87 and Cobb 500) as part of an experiment to observe the normal development 538 of the caecal microbiota (48). 200mg of caecal contents from five individuals of each breed were 539 pooled and DNA extracted for sequencing. The remaining caecal contents were stored at -20°C for 14 540 months. Before experimental work began, caecal contents from Ross, Cobb and Hubbard birds were

Microbiology

defrosted, mixed and diluted 1:20 in sterile phosphate buffered saline. Aliquots of 5ml of diluted caecal 541 542 content were prepared and frozen at -20°C for use as treatments. Treatment group eggs were sprayed at 2, 7, 14 and 18 d.i in both trials. The diluted caecal contents was defrosted at room temperature and 543 544 loaded into a 10ml spray bottle. Eggs were sprayed evenly at a distance of 10cm ensuring all eggs 545 received at least two sprays until the 5ml of diluted caecal content had been used.

> 546 **Sample Collection**

#### 547 **Pilot Experiment**

548 Samples were taken from eggs at 0 d.i. To minimise the risk of contamination, eggs were sprayed with 549 70% ethanol and left for 10 minutes before being wiped clean. Samples were taken in as sterile an 550 environment as possible. All samples were taken inside an exclusion cabinet and sterile gloves were worn and changed between eggs. An electric rotary tool (Dremel 3000) was used to cut through the 551 egg shell without penetrating the shell membranes. A sterile scalpel was used to cut the shell 552 553 membrane to remove the top of the egg shell and reveal the yolk. Sterile needles and syringes were 554 used to sample from the albumen and the yolk.

555 At 18 d.i, samples were taken from five embryos from each group. Embryos were killed by 556 refrigerating the egg at 3°C for four hours. The egg shell was opened as previously described. A sample 557 of amniotic fluid was taken using a sterile needle and syringe. The embryo was removed from the egg, placed in a sterile petri dish and placed under a stereomicroscope for dissection. Using a sterile scalpel 558 559 and forceps, the coelom was opened to reveal the gastrointestinal tract which was removed. The 560 duodenum, jejunum and ileum were stored together with both caeca stored in a separate container. 561 Finally, the brain was removed using a new sterile scalpel to be used as a control for contamination 562 should bacterial DNA be recovered from the gastrointestinal tract.

Microbiology

Further samples were taken at 3 and 7 d.p.h. Chicks were euthanased by cervical dislocation. To sample chicks, the abdomen was sprayed with 70% ethanol. Skin incisions were made to expose the sternum which was then reflected to give good access to the coelom. The gastrointestinal tract was removed carefully to avoid external contamination. The ileum, defined as the intestinal segment from Meckel's diverticulum to the ileocaecocolic junction; and both caeca were removed and stored in separate containers. Samples for DNA extraction were snap frozen in liquid nitrogen and stored at -20°C.

# 570 Repeat Experiment

The same sampling protocol was used as for the pilot experiment with chicks sampled at 0, 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h. After euthanasia chicks were weighed and their body weight recorded in grams. Additionally, tissue samples from the caecal tonsils, identified as the proximal section of the caecum, and the ileum were taken. One caecal tonsil and a section of ileum were fixed in 4% paraformaldehyde solution for histological examination. The other caecal tonsil was fixed in OCT (CellPath, UK) on a cork plate and snap frozen in liquid nitrogen. Samples fixed in paraformaldehyde were stored at 4°C, samples for DNA extraction were stored at -20°C and samples fixed in OCT were stored at -80°C.

# 578 **DNA Extraction**

579 DNA was extracted from each sample using Zymobiomics DNA MiniKits (Cambridge Bioscience, UK) 580 according to the manufacturer's instructions. DNA was extracted from 250µl of liquid samples 581 (albumen and yolk). For tissue samples (ileum and caecum), a 200mg section of intestinal tissue along 582 with content was used for DNA extraction. This section was cut longitudinally and transversely using a 583 sterile scalpel blade to expose the mucosa and luminal contents to beat-beating. Both liquid and tissue 584 samples underwent a bead-beating step using a Qiagen TissueLyser at 30Hz for 10 minutes. At each 585 extraction, two controls were included: a blank extraction kit to control for contamination and 75µl of Zymobiomics Standard Bacterial Community (Cambridge Bioscience, UK) to control for variations in
DNA extraction efficacy. Extracted DNA was quantified using a NanoDrop 2000 spectrophotometer
(NanoDrop Technologies).

# 589 PCR to Detect Bacterial DNA

590 The detection of bacterial DNA in egg and embryonic samples was performed by PCR detection of 591 bacterial 16S rRNA gene. Purified DNA from egg and embryonic samples from the pilot experiment was used as the template in a PCR mixture composed of 5µl of 5x FIREPol Master Mix Ready to Load 592 593 (Solis BioDyne, Estonia), 1µl of each primer, 17µl of purified water and 1µl of DNA template. A primer 594 pair spanning the V4 region of the 16S rRNA gene (515F: TGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA, R806: 595 GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT) was used (49). DNA extracted from the Zymobiomics Standard Bacterial Community (ZSBC), which contains approximately  $1.4 \times 10^{10}$  cells/ml, was used as a positive control. 596 Thermal cycling consisted of an initial cycle of 95°C for 5 min, 30 cycles of 95°C for 30 s, 55°C for 45 s 597 598 and 72°C for 40 s followed by a final cycle of 72°C for 40 s. The presence of PCR products was 599 confirmed by electrophoresis using a 1.0% agarose gel containing ethidium bromide. To exclude the 600 possibility that negative results were due to PCR inhibitors present within samples, 9µl of each sample 601 was spiked with 1µl of DNA extracted from the ZSBC and submitted for PCR amplification. To determine the sensitivity of the PCR assay, DNA extracted from the ZSBC was diluted to include the 602 603 equivalent of DNA extracted from 10<sup>6</sup>, 10<sup>5</sup>, 10<sup>4</sup>, 10<sup>3</sup>, 10<sup>2</sup> and 10<sup>1</sup> bacterial cells.

# 604 Illumina MiSeq Sequencing

Extracted DNA from between five and eight caecal samples in each treatment group at each time point was sent for paired-end sequencing of the 16S rRNA gene at the Centre for Genomic Research (University of Liverpool) using an Illumina MiSeq run. The V4 hypervariable region (515F/R806) was amplified for 25 cycles to yield an amplicon of 254 base pairs (50). Library preparation was performed using a universal tailed tag design with subsequent amplification performed using a two-step PCR with
a HiFi Hot Start polymerase (Kapa) (51). The first round of PCR was performed using the primers 5'ACACTCTTTCCCTACACGACGCTCTTCCGATCTNNNNNGTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA-3' (forward)
and 5' GTGACTGGAGTTCAGACGTGTGCTCTTCCGATCTGGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT-3' (47). The raw

Fastq files were trimmed for the presence of Illumina adapter sequences using Cutadapt version 1.2.1.
The reads were further trimmed using Sickle version 1.200 with a minimum window quality score of
20. Reads shorter than 10 base pairs after trimming were removed. Raw sequence reads are available
in the NCBI Sequence Repository Archive under BioProject PRJNA517619.

### 617 Data Analysis

618 QIIME2 version 2019.1.0 was used for analysis of the Illumina data (52). Amplicon sequence variant 619 (ASV) assignment was completed using the dada2 plugin (53) and an ASV table produced using the 620 ASV-table plugin (https://github.com/qiime2/q2-ASV-table) to produce a BIOM format table (54). The 621 resulting ASV table was divided into three individual tables: one containing all samples including 622 transplant samples for use in diversity analyses and one each for samples from the pilot and repeat 623 experiments to identify differentially abundant ASVs between control and treatment groups. 624 Taxonomy was assigned using the q2-feature-classifier plugin (55) with a pre-trained NaiveBayes 625 classifier based on the SILVA 132 database of the 515F/R806 region of the 16S rRNA gene (56) 626 available for download at https://docs.giime2.org/2018.11/data-resources/.

Alpha and beta diversity analyses were performed at a sampling depth of 5,000 using the alignment
(57), phylogeny (58) and diversity (https://github.com/qiime2/q2-diversity) plugins. Alpha diversity,
a metric used to assess species richness and evenness, was measured using a Shannon diversity index.
Taxa plots were produced using the q2-taxa plugin (https://github.com/qiime2/q2-taxa). Beta

diversity, a metric used to compare species diversity and abundance between samples, was calculatedwith an unweighted and weighted UniFrac metric

633

# 634 Statistics

635 For statistical analysis, samples were grouped according to age, treatment group and experiment 636 creating 13 different groups for comparison: samples from the pilot experiment from control (C) and treated (T) chicks at 3 and 7 d.p.h (PC3, n=7; PT3, n=7; PC7, n=7; PT7, n=8), samples from the repeat 637 638 experiment from control (C) and treated (T) chicks at 0, 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h (RC0, n=5; RT0, n=5; RC3, 639 n=7; RT3, n=7; RC7, n=7; RT7, n=7; RC14, n=7; RT14, n=7) and transplant material (TRPL, n=3). Alpha 640 diversity was compared between groups using a pairwise Kruskal-Wallis test with a False Discovery 641 Rate correction. An ANOSIM test was used to identify metadata categories which significantly affected 642 beta diversity. The average distance from samples in each group to TRPL samples was compared using 643 an independent Student's t-test to find which group was closest to TRPL samples. Gneiss analysis (29) 644 was used to identify taxa which were differentially abundant between treatment and control groups in 645 the pilot and repeat experiments separately. First, the ASV table was filtered to exclude transplant 646 samples and low abundance ASVs. The count threshold for exclusion of ASVs was set at the first 647 quartile to exclude the lowest 25% of ASVs by total frequency across all samples. Principal balances for 648 use in Gneiss were obtained via Ward's hierarchical clustering using the correlation-clustering 649 command. Log ratios for each balance were calculated using the ilr-transform command. A 650 multivariate response linear regression model of log ratios balances was constructed with treatment 651 and days post hatch as covariates using the ols-regression command. Results were visualised through a 652 regression summary, dendrogram heatmaps and balance taxonomies to identify ASVs which were 653 differentially abundant in treated and control groups. Based on this analysis ASVs were divided into

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

Microbiology

three groups: ASVs with a higher relative abundance in treated samples, ASVs with a higher relative 654 abundance in control samples and ASVs with no differential abundance between groups. The results of 655 this analysis were used to select taxa for further analysis using quantitative PCR. 656

#### 657 **Identifying ASVs Transplanted from the Treatment**

658 ASVs present in an unfiltered ASV table of TRPL samples were defined as being present in the 659 transplant material. The same ASV table used for Gneiss analysis was used to compile a list of ASVs present in each sample group. Once lists of ASVs were compiled for the transplant and sample groups, 660 intersections between sets of ASVs were visualised using UpSet (59). ASVs which were present only in 661 662 the transplant were removed to facilitate visualisation of other intersections. Based on their presence 663 in intersections ASVs were classified as 'successfully transplanted', 'possibly transplanted' or 664 environmental . ASVs were classified as successfully transplanted if they were present in the transplant and in treated chicks at least one time point before control chicks. ASVs were classified as 665 possibly transplanted if they were present in the transplant and in both treated and control chicks at 666 the same time point. ASVs were classified as environmental if they were present in the transplant and 667 668 present in only control chicks or present in control chicks before treated chicks. Any ASV not present 669 in the transplant was classified as environmental.

670 A chi-square test of independence was performed to examine the relationship between ASVs identified 671 as differentially abundant between treatment groups and those defined as successfully transplanted, 672 possibly transplanted or environmental using Python's scipy module. The taxonomy of ASVs classified as successfully transplanted, possibly transplanted and environmental was compared to that of ASVs 673 674 identified as more abundant in treated chicks, more abundant in control chicks and not differentially 675 abundant with a Hybrid Sankey diagram created using sankeyview (version 1.7.7) (60).

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

# 676 Quantitative PCR

Taxa were selected for further testing using quantitative PCR based on results from Gneiss analysis. A 677 678 literature search was conducted to find suitable primers. Where suitable primers were not available, 679 the sequences retrieved from Illumina sequencing were used to produce taxa specific primers. The 680 sequence was input into Primer-BLAST and a suitable primer pair was chosen. To test specificity of 681 primers, each primer pair was input into TestPrime for comparison against the SILVA database SSU-682 r132. Further testing of primers was conducted using PCR. The primers were tested against known 683 positive and negative samples to check for the correct amplicon size and non-specific amplification. A 684 gradient PCR was conducted to establish the correct annealing temperature for quantitative PCR. 685 Primers used are displayed in Table 5.

686 The real-time quantitative PCR assay was conducted on a 1:10 solution of extracted DNA using a Rotor-687 Gene Q PCR machine (Qiagen) and PrecisionPLUS qPCR master mix (Primer Design, UK). The V4 region 688 of the 16S rRNA gene was used as a reference gene. Rotor-Gene Q software (version 2.3.1.49) was used 689 to produce melting curves and identify the cycle threshold (Ct), the point at which fluorescence above 690 the background level is detectable. Each sample was run in triplicate with an averaged Ct used in 691 further analysis. The  $\Delta$ Ct, defined as the difference between the Ct value for taxa specific primers and 692 the Ct value for the reference gene, was calculated for each sample. Results were expressed as 40 -693  $\Delta$ Ct. Amplification of DNA in one PC3 sample failed in all reactions. As a result, this sample was 694 excluded from quantitative PCR analysis.

# 695 Haematoxylin and eosin staining

Tissue fixed in 4% paraformaldehyde solution was examined histologically to identify differences in morphological development of the ileum and caecal tonsil between treated and control chicks. Four sections of ileum and four sections of caecal tonsil from each chick each chick underwent tissue

Applied and Environmental

Microbiology

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

processing using a Tissue-Tek VIP (vacuum infiltration processor) overnight before being 699 700 embedded in paraffin (Ultraplast premium embedding medium, Solmedia). 4µm paraffin sections were cut on a Leica RM2125 RT microtome, floated on a waterbath and placed on 701 colour slides (Solmedia, MSS54511YW). For H&E staining slides were dewaxed in xylene 702 and rehydrated through descending grades of ethanol (100%, 96%, 85%, 70%) to distilled 703 water before being stained in haematoxylin (5mins), "blued" in tap water for 5 mins and 704 stained in eosin (2mins). Slides were then dehydrated through 96% and 100% ethanol to 705 706 xylene and cover slipped using DPX (Thermo Scientific, Lamb/DPX). Haematoxylin (Atom Scientific, RRBD61-X) and Eosin (TCS, HS250) solutions made up in house. 707

Haematoxylin and eosin stained tissue sections were examined by light microscopy (Nikon Eclipse 80i)
with a Leica DMC 4500 digital camera attachment (Leica Microsystems, Switzerland). Images were
viewed and measurements taken using Leica Application Suite X software.

Sections were assessed for suitability based on orientation of tissue samples. Villus height, villus width and epithelial cell height were recorded in transverse ileal sections where entire villi could be visualised to the lamina propria. In such sections, the height and width of five villi with an intact lamina propria was measured. Villus height was defined as the distance from the villus tip to the villuscrypt junction. Villus width was measured at the widest section of the villus. Epithelial cell height was measured at the villus tip and was defined as the distance from the distal point of the microvilli to the basement membrane. Measurements were expressed as a mean for each bird.

718 Mitotic figure counts in the ileum and caecal tonsil were used as an indication of intestinal villus 719 development (65, 66). All orientations of tissue were included for mitotic counts where crypts were 720 visible adjacent to the lamina propria and muscular layers. Mitotic figures in crypts within one high power field (400x) of the lamina propria were counted. Cells were identified as mitotic if their nuclei were strongly basophilic and homogenous with care taken to count cells in the late stages of division as a single mitotic figure. The length of lamina propria over which mitotic figures were counted was measured and results expressed as number of mitotic figures per 100µm. Results were expressed as a mean for each bird.

Results were compared between treatment groups using Student's t-test implemented in the scipy (version 1.1.0) Python module (67). A Benjamini-Hochberg false discovery rate correction implemented in the statsmodels (version 0.9.0) Python module (68) was applied to account for multiple tests. Results were compared between age groups using a one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) test with a post-hoc Tukey HSD test when significant differences were identified.

During the analysis, it was noted that some samples had large aggregates of bacterial cells within the crypts of the caecal tonsil. In order to ascertain whether the presence of bacteria in the caecal tonsil crypts was associated with age or treatment group, slides were re-examined. Samples were classified as positive if bacteria were observed in more than one crypt and in at least two sections.

# 735 Immunostaining

736 Serial 7.5µm thick sections of caecal tonsil tissue frozen in OCT were cut using a cryostatic microtome. 737 Four sections of caecal tonsil from each bird were mounted on poly-l-lysine coated slides (VWR 738 International, UK) and fixed in acetone for 10 min. Immunostaining was performed on a Dako 739 Autostainer Link 48 using Envision<sup>™</sup> FLEX reagents. Following a buffer rinse tissue sections underwent a peroxidase block for 5mins (Agilent, SM801) before being incubated for 20mins with 740 mouse monoclonal antibodies against chicken CD4, CD8 $\alpha$ , CD8 $\beta$ ,  $\gamma\delta$  TCR and Bu1 (B cells and subsets 741 742 of monocytes and macrophages), antigens (Cambridge Bioscience Ltd, 8210-01, 8220-01, 8280-01, 743 8230-01 and 8395-01 respectively). The antibodies CD4 (1:200), CD8α (1:200), CD8β (1:1000), γδ TCR

(1:100) and Bu1 (1:400) were diluted in Envision<sup>™</sup> FLEX Antibody Diluent (Agilent, K8006). Antibody
binding was detected using the labelled polymer Envision<sup>™</sup> FLEX/HRP (Agilent, SM802) for 20mins
and the reaction visualised using the substrate-chromogen FLEX DAB+Sub Chromo (Agilent, DM827 &
SM802). Tissue sections were counterstained for 5mins in Envision<sup>™</sup> FLEX Haematoxylin (Agilent,
K8008), washed in deionized water and dehydrated through increasing grades of ethanol (85%, 96%,
3x 100%) before clearing in xylene and mounted as per H&E staining above. All intermediate buffer
washes between reagents used Envision<sup>™</sup> FLEX Wash Buffer (K8007).

Stained tissue sections were examined using the same apparatus as described for haematoxylin and eosin stained tissue. Quantification of cell abundance between treated and control chicks was performed by counting cells in photographs taken at a magnification of ×200 with each field of view representing an area of 142,000 $\mu$ m<sup>2</sup>. Five photographs for each bird taken randomly from serial sections were used. Results were expressed as a mean for each bird. Student's t test was used to identify significant differences in cell abundance between treatment groups.

# 757 Acknowledgements

Amplicon generation was performed by Richie Eccles and amplicon sequencing by Anita Lucaci at the Centre for Genomic Research (CGR) at The University of Liverpool. Processing and staining of histology samples and staining of immunohistochemistry samples was performed by Valerie Tilston, Department of Veterinary Pathology and Public Health, Institute of Veterinary Science, University of Liverpool.

This research was funded by Danisco Animal Nutrition of DuPont Industrial Biosciences in partnership
with the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council (BBSRC Project Reference
BB/M011186/1/1843513).

# 766 Conflict of Interest Statement

767 The authors declare that this study received funding from DuPont Industrial Biosciences. The funder 768 advised on the study design and approved the final manuscript for publication but did not have a role 769 in the data collection and analysis or decision to publish. Author Marion Bernardeau was employed by 770 DuPont Industrial Biosciences. All other authors declare no competing interests.

# 771 References

1. Sans P and Combris P. 2015. World meat consumption patterns: An overview of the last fifty years.
Meat Sci, 109:106–111.

2. Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. 2019. United Kingdom poultry and poultry
meat statistics – November and December 2018.

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

776 3. Kubasova T, Kollarcikova M, Crhanova M, Karasova D, Cejkova D, Sebkova A,

777 Matiasovicova J, Faldynova M, Pokorna A, Cizek A and Rychlik I. 2019. Contact

778 with adult hen affects development of caecal microbiota in newly hatched chicks. PloS

779 One, 14(:e0212446.

4. Stanley D, Hughes RJ and Moore RJ. 2014. Microbiota of the chicken gastrointestinal tract: influence
on health, productivity and disease. Appl Microbiol Biot, 98:4301-4310.

5. Craven SE, Cox NA, Bailey JS and Cosby DE. 2003. Incidence and tracking of *Clostridium perfringens*through an integrated broiler chicken operation. Avian Dis, 47:707-711.

6. Jurburg SD, Brouwer MSM, Ceccarelli D, Goot J, Jansman AJM and Bossers A. 2019. Patterns of
community assembly in the developing chicken microbiome reveal rapid primary succession.
Microbiologyopen, 8:e00821.

Microbiology

787 7. Yegani M and Korver DR. 2008. Factors affecting intestinal health in poultry. Poult Sci, 87:2052-2063.

789 8. Porter RE. 1998. Bacterial enteritides of poultry. Poult Sci, 77:1159-1165.

790 9. FSA welcomes retailers' efforts to reduce *Campylobacter* on chickens. 2015. Vet

791 Record, 176:639–639.

792 10. Dibner JJ and Richards JD. 2005. Antibiotic growth promoters in agriculture: history and mode of
793 action. Poult Sci, 84:634–643.

11. Castanon JIR. 2007. History of the use of antibiotic as growth promoters in European poultry feeds.
Poult Sci, 86:2466–2471.

12. Oakley BB, Lillehoj HS, Kogut MH, Kim WK, Maurer JJ, Pedroso A, Lee MD, Collett SR, Johnson TJ,
Cox NA. 2014. The chicken gastrointestinal microbiome. FEMS Microbiol Lett 360:100–112.

13. Ballou AL, Ali RA, Mendoza MA, Ellis JC, Hassan HM, Croom WJ, Koci MD. 2016. Development of the
chick microbiome: how early exposure influences future microbial diversity. Front Vet Sci 3:2.

14. Pedroso AA, Batal AB, Lee MD. 2016. Effect of *in ovo* administration of an adult-derived microbiota
on establishment of the intestinal microbiome in chickens. Am J Vet Res 77:514–526.

802 15. Ilina LA, Yildirim EA, Nikonov IN, Filippova VA, Laptev GY, Novikova NI, Grozina AA, Lenkova TN,
803 Manukyan VA, Egorov IA, Fisinin VI. 2016. Metagenomic bacterial community profiles of chicken
804 embryo gastrointestinal tract by using T-RFLP analysis. Dokl Biochem Biophys 466:47–51.

16. Karstens L, Asquith M, Davin S, Fair D, Gregory T, Wolfe AJ, Braun J, McWeeney S. 2019. Controlling
contaminants in low-biomass 16S rRNA gene sequencing experiments. MSystems 4:
10.1128/msystems.00290-19.

808 17. Barrow PA. 1994. The microflora of the alimentary tract and avian pathogens: translocation and
809 vertical transmission, p 117–38. *In* Board RG, Fuller R (ed), Microbiology of the avian egg, 1st ed.
810 Chapman & Hall, London.

811 18. Drew MD, Kessel AGV, Maenz DD. 2003. Absorption of methionine and 2-hydroxy-4812 methylhiobutoanic acid in conventional and germ-free chickens. Poult Sci 82:1149–1153.

813 19. Sylte MJ, Chandra LC, Looft T. 2017. Evaluation of disinfectants and antiseptics to eliminate bacteria
814 from the surface of turkey eggs and hatch gnotobiotic poults. Poult Sci 96;2412–2420.

20. De Reu K, Grijspeerdt K, Messens W, Heyndrickx M, Uyttendaele M, Debevere J, Herman L. 2006.
Eggshell factors influencing eggshell penetration and whole egg contamination by different bacteria
including *Salmonella* Enteritidis. Int J Food Microbiol 112:253–260.

21. Rantala M, Nurmi E. 1973. Prevention of the growth of *Salmonella* Infantis in chicks by the flora of
the alimentary tract of chickens. Br Pooult Sci 14:627–630.

820 22. Seuna E. 1979. Sensitivity of young chickens to Salmonella typhimurium var copenhagen and S

821 Infantis infection and the preventive effect of cultured intestinal microflora. Avian Dis 23:392–400.

23. Cox NA, Bailey JS, Blankenship LC, Gildersleeve RP. 1992. Research note: *in ovo* administration of a
competitive exclusion culture treatment to broiler embryos. Poult Sci 71:1781-4.

824 24. Meijerhof R, Hulet RM. 1997. *In ovo* injection of competitive exclusion culture in broiler hatching
825 eggs. J Appl Poult Res 6:260–266.

826 25. Oliveira JE, van der Hoeven-Hangoor E, van de Linde IB, Montijn RC, van der Vossen JMBM. 2014. *In*827 *ovo* inoculation of chicken embryos with probiotic bacteria and its effect on posthatch *Salmonella*828 susceptibility. Poult Sci 93:818–29.

Microbiology

26. Yamawaki R, Milbradt EL, Coppola MP, Rodrigues JC, Andreatti Filho RL, Padovani CR, Okamoto AS.
2013. Effect of immersion and inoculation *in ovo* of *Lactobacillus* spp in embryonated chicken eggs in
the prevention of *Salmonella* Enteritidis after hatch. Poult Sci 92:1560–3.

27. Olsen R, Kudirkiene E, Thøfner I, Pors S, Karlskov-Mortensen P, Li L, Papasolomontos S,
Angastiniotou C, Christensen J. 2017. Impact of egg disinfection of hatching eggs on the eggshell
microbiome and bacterial load. Poult Sci 91:208–214.

28. Donaldson EE, Stanley D, Thomas V, Hughes RJ, Moore RJ. 2017. The time-course of broiler
intestinal microbiota development after administration of cecal contents to incubating eggs. PeerJ
5:e3587.

29. Morton JT, Sanders J, Quinn RA, McDonald D, Gonzalez A, Vázquez-Caeza Y, Navas-Molina JA, Song
SJ, Metcalf JL, Hyde ER, Lladser M, Dorrestein PC, Knight R. 2017. Balance trees reveal microbial niche
differentiation. MSystems 2:e00162-16.

30. Lopetuso LR, Scaldaferri F, Petito V, Gasbarrini A. 2013. Commensal clostridia: leading players in
the maintenance of gut homeostasis. Gut Pathog 5:23.

31. Onrust L, Ducatelle R, Van Driessche K, De Maesschalck C, Vermeulen K, Haesebrouck F, Eeckhaut
V, Van Immerseel F. 2015. Steering endogenous butyrate production in the intestinal tract of broilers
as a tool to improve gut health. Front Vet Sci 2:75.

32. Pedroso AA, Menten JFM, Lambais MR. 2005. The structure of bacterial community in the intestines
of newly hatched chicks. J Appl Poult Res 14:232–237.

33. Medvecky M, Cejkova D, Polansky O, Karasova D, Kubasova T, Cizek A, Rychlik I. 2018. Whole
genome sequencing and function prediction of 133 gut anaerobes isolated from chicken caecum in
pure cultures. BMC Genomics 19:561.

Microbiology

34. Petr J, Rada V. 2001. Bifidobacteria are obligate inhabitants of the crop of adult laying hens. J Vet
Med B Infect Dis Vet Public Health 48:227–233.

853 35. Johnson TJ, Youmans BP, Noll S, Cardona C, Evans NP, Karnezos TP, Ngunjiri JM, Abundo MC, Lee

854 CW. 2018. A consistent and predictable commercial broiler chicken bacterial microbiota in antibiotic-

855 free production displays strong correlations with performance. Appl Environ Microbiol 84:e00362–18

36. Wei S, Morrison M, Yu Z. 2013. Bacterial census of poultry intestinal microbiome. Poult Sci 92:671–
683.

37. Klaasen HL, van der Heijden PJ, Stok W, Poelma FG, Koopman JP, van den Brink ME, Bakker MH,
Eling WM, Beynen AC. 1993. Apathogenic intestinal segmented filamentous bacteria stimulate the
mucosal immune system of mice. Infect Immun 61:303–6.

38. Umesaki Y, Setoyama H, Matsumoto S, Imaoka A. 1999. Differential roles of segmented filamentous
bacteria and *Clostridia* in development of the intestinal immune system. Infect Immun 67:3504–3511.

39. Ivanov II, Littman DR. 2010. Segmented filamentous bacteria take the stage.Mucosal Immunol
3:209–212.

40. Liao N, Yin Y, Sun G, Xiang C, Liu D, Yu HD, Wang X. 2012. Colonization and distribution of
segmented filamentous bacteria (SFB) in chicken gastrointestinal tract and their relationship with host
immunity. FEMS Microbiol Ecol 81:395–406.

41. Cressman MD, Yu Z, Nelson MC, Moeller SJ, Lilburn MS, Zerby HN. 2010. Interrelations between the
microbiotas in the litter and in the intestines of commercial broiler chickens Appl Environ Microbiol
76:6572–6582.

42. Glick B, Holbrook KA, Olah I, Perkins WD, Stinson R. 1978. A scanning-electron microscope study of
the caecal tonsil: the identification of a bacterial attachment to the villi of the caecal tonsil and the
possible presence of lymphatics in the caecal tonsil. Poult Sci 57:1408–1416.

43. Ivanov II, Atarashi K, Manel N, Brodie EL, Shima T, Karaoz U, Wei D, Goldfarb KC, Santee CA, Lynch
SV, Tanoue T, Imaoka A, Itoh K, Takeda K, Umesaki Y, Honda K, Littman DR. 2009. Induction of
intestinal Th17 cells by segmented filamentous bacteria. Cell 139:485–498.

44. van der Wielen PWJJ, Biesterveld S, Notermans S, Hofstra H, Urlings BAP, van Knapen F. 2000. Role
of volatile fatty acids in development of the cecal microflora in broiler chickens during growth. Appl
Environ Microbiol 66:2536–40.

45. Guilloteau P, Martin L, Eeckhaut V, Ducatelle R, Zabielski R, Van Immerseel F. 2010. From the gut to
the peripheral tissues: the multiple effects of butyrate. Nutr Res Rev 23:366–384.

46. Oliveira Corrêa R, Fachi JL, Vieira A, Sato FT, Vinolo MAR. 2016. Regulation of immune cell funtion
by short-chain fatty acids. Clin Transl Immunology 5:e73.

47. Meijer K, de Vos P, Priebe MG. 2010. Butyrate and other short-chain fatty acids as modulators of
immunity: what relevance for health? Curr Opin Clin Nutr Metab Care 13:715–721.

48. Richards PR, Fothergill J, Bernardeau M, Wigley P. 2019. Development of the caecal microbiota in
three broiler breeds. Front Vet Sci 6:201.

49. Caporaso JG, Lauber CL, Walters WA, Berg-Lyons D, Huntley J, Fierer N, Owens SM, Betley J, Fraser
L, Bauer M, Gormley N, Gilbert JA, Smith G, Knight R. 2012. Ultra-high-throughput microbial
community analysis on the Illumina HiSeq and MiSeq platforms. ISME J 6:1621–4.

Microbiology

50. Caporaso JG, Lauber CL, Walters WA, Berg-Lyons D, Lozupone CA, Turnbaugh PJ, Fierer N, Knight R.
2011. Global patterns of 16S rRNA diversity at a depth of millions of sequences per sample. Proc Natl
Acad Sci 108:4516–4522.

51. D'Amore R, Ijaz UZ, Schirmer M, Kenny JG, Gregory R, Darby AC, Shakya M, Podar M, Quince C, Hall
N. 2016. A comprehensive benchmarking study of protocols and sequencing platforms for 16S rRNA
community profiling. BMC Genomics 17:55.

897 52. Bolyen E, Rideout JR, Dillon MR, Bokulich NA, Abnet C, Al-Ghalith GA, Alexander H, Alm EJ, 898 Arumugam M, Asnicar F, Bai Y, Bisanz JE, Bittinger K, Brejnrod A, Brislawn CJ, Brown CT, Callahan BJ, 899 Carballo-Rodriguez AM, Chase J, Cope E, Da Silva R, Dorrestein PC, Douglas GM, Durall DM, Duvallet C, 900 Edwardson CF, Ernst M, Estaki M, Fouquier J, Gauglitz JM, Gibson DL, Gonzalez A, Gorlick K, Guo J, 901 Hillmann B, Holmes S, Holste H, Huttenhower C, Huttley G, Janssen S, Jarmusch AK, Jiang L, Kaehler B, Bin Kang K, Keefe CR, Keim P, Kelley ST, Knights D, Koester I, Kosciolek T, Kreps J, Langille MGI, Lee J, 902 903 Ley R, Liu Y-X, Loftfield E, Lozupone C, Maher M, Marotz C, Martin BD, McDonald D, McIver LJ, Melnik 904 AV, Metcalf JL, Morgan SC, Morton J, Naimey AT, Navas-Molina JA, Nothias LF, Orchanian SB, Pearson 905 Talima, People SL, Petras D, Preuss ML, Pruesse E, Rasmussen LB, Rivers A, Robeson MS II, Rosenthal P, 906 Segata N, Shaffer M, Shiffer A, Sinha R, Song SJ, Spear JR, Swafford AD, Thompson, LR, Torres PJ, Trinh 907 P, Tripathi A, Turnbaugh PJ, Ul-Hasan S, van der Hooft JJJ, Vargas F, Vazquez-Baeza Y, Vogtmann E, von 908 Hippel M, Walters W, Wan Y, Wang M, Warren J, Weber, KC, Williamson CHD, Willis AD, Xu ZZ, 909 ZaneveldJR, Zhang Y, Zhu Q, Knight R, Caporaso JG. 2018. Qiime 2: Reproducible interactive scalable 910 and extensible microbiome data science PeerJ Preprints 6:e27295v2.

53. Callahan BJ, McMurdie PJ, Holmes SP. 2017. Exact sequence variants should replace operational
taxonomic units in marker-gene data analysis. ISME J 11:2639–2643.

Microbiology

54. Mcdonald D, Clemente JC, Kuczynski J, Rideout JR, Stombaugh J, Wendel D, Wilke A, Huse S,
Hufnagle J, Meyer F, Knight R, Caporaso JG. 2012. The biological observation matrix (BIOM) format or:
how I learned to stop worrying and love the ome. GigaScience 1:7.

55. Bokulich NA, Kaehler BD, Rideout JR, Dillon MR, Bolyen E, Knight R, Huttley GA, Caporaso JG. 2018.
Optimizing taxonomic classification of marker-gene amplicon sequences with QIIME 2's q2-ASVclassifier plugin. Microbiome 6:90.

919 56. Yilmaz P, Parfrey LW, Yarza P, Gerken J, Pruesse E, Quast C, Schweer T, Peplies J, Ludwig W,
920 Glöckner FO. 2014. The SILVA and "all-species Living Tree Project (LTP)" taxonomic frameworks.
921 Nucleic Acids Res 42:643–648.

922 57. Katoh K, Standley DM. 2013. MAFFT multiple sequence alignment software version 7:
923 improvements in performance and usability. Mol Biol Evol 30:772–780.

58. Price MN, Dehal PS, Arkin AP. 2010. FastTree 2 – approximately maximum-likelihood trees for
large alignments. PLoS ONE 5:e9490.

59. Lex A, Gehlenborg N, Strobelt H, Vuillemot R, Pfister H. 2014. UpSet: visualization of intersecting
sets. IEEE Trans Vis Comput Graph 20:1983–1992.

60. Lupton RC, Allwood JM. 2017. Hybrid Sankey diagrams: visual analysis of multidimensional data for
understanding resource use. Resour Conserv Recycl 124:141–151.

930 61. Amit-Romach E, Sklan D, Uni Z. 2004. Microflora ecology of the chicken intestine using 16S
931 ribosomal DNA primers. Poult Sci 83:1093-1098.

Microbiology

62. Smith CJ, Emge JR, Berzins K, Lung L, Khamishon R, Shah P, Rodrigues DM, Sousa AJ, Reardon C, 932 933 Sherman PM, Barret KE, Gareau MG. 2014. Probiotics normalize the gut-brain-microbiota axis in 934 immunodeficient mice. Am J Physiol Gastrointest Liver Physiol 307:G793-G802.

935 63. Van Dyke MI, McCarthy AJ. 2002. Molecular biological detection and characterization of Clostridium 936 populations in municipal landfill sites. Appl Envron Microbiol 68:2049–53.

937 64. Matsuki T, Watanabe K, Fujimoto J, Miyamoto Y, Takada T, Matsumoto K, Oyaizu H, Tanaka R. 2002. 938 Development of 16S rRNA-gene-targeted group-specific primers for the detections and identification 939 of predominant bacteria in human feces. Appl Environ Microbiol 68:5445–51.

940 65. Yamauchi K, Nakamura E, Isshki Y. 1993. Development of the intestinal villi associated with the increased epithelial cell mitosis in chickens. Poult Sci 64:340-350. 941

942 66. Yamauchi K. 2007. Review of a histological intestinal approach to assessing the intestinal function in chickens and pigs. Anim Sci J 78:356-370. 943

944 67. Jones E, Oliphant E, Peterson P. 2001. SciPy: Open Source Scientific Tools for Python. http://www.scipy.org/ [Online; accessed 2019-06-19] 945

946 68. Seabold S, Perktold J. 2010. Statsmodels: econometric and statistical modeling with Python, p 57-

947 61. In van der Walt S, Millman J (ed), Proceedings of the 9th Python in Science Conference.

AEN

948 Tables

AEM

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

**Table 1.** A taxonomy summary at the family level of ASVs identified as higher abundance in treated and control samples from the pilot (A) and repeat experiments (B) by Gneiss analysis. ASVs identified as NDA were not differentially abundant between treatment groups.

		A) Pilot Experiment					
Taxonomy	Total	Number Abundan	of Higher ice ASVs	NDA			
		Treated	Control				
Lachnospiraceae	119	80	18	21			
Ruminococcaceae	104	46	7	51			
Clostridiaceae 1	21	10	10	1			
Ervsipelotrichaceae	16	4	9	3			
Enterobacteriaceae	10	3	3	4			
Peptostreptococcaceae	9	4	5	0			
Bacillaceae	7	5	0	2			
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	6	2	0	4			
Paenibacillaceae	4	3	1	0			
Enterococcaceae	3	1	0	2			
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	2	0	0			
Lactobacillaceae	2	2	0	0			
Christensenellaceae	1	0	0	1			
Bacillales	1	1	0	0			
Microbacteriaceae	1	1	0	0			

B) Repeat Experiment	Experiment	Repeat	B)
----------------------	------------	--------	----

Taxonomy	Total	Number of Higher Total Abundance ASVs		
		Treated	Control	
Lachnospiraceae	193	90	20	83
Ruminococcaceae	155	79	17	59
Clostridiaceae 1	39	1	5	33
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	15	7	1	7
Ervsipelotrichaceae	12	2	0	10
Peptostreptococcaceae	11	3	0	8
Enterobacteriaceae	8	0	4	4
Enterococcaceae	7	0	3	4
Bacillaceae	7	4	0	3
Lactobacillaceae	5	2	1	2
Christensenellaceae	3	1	Ō	2
Paenibacillaceae	3	0	0	3
Microbacteriaceae	2	0	0	2
Staphylococcaceae	2	0	0	2
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	2	0	0
Thermaceae	1	0	0	1
Sanguibacteraceae	1	0	0	1
Streptococcaceae	1	1	0	0
Hydrogenophilaceae	1	0	0	1
Burkholderiaceae	1	0	0	1
Propionibacteriaceae	1	0	0	1
Leuconostocaceae	1	0	0	1
Nocardiaceae	1	0	0	1
Peptococcaceae	1	0	0	1
Moraxellaceae	1	0	0	1
Alicyclobacillaceae	1	0	0	1

949

AEM

Applied and Environmental Microbiology **Table 2.** A contingency table showing observed frequencies of ASV classification by differential abundance and transplant success in the pilot (A) and repeat experiments (B). Expected frequencies calculated using a chi squared test of independence are displayed in brackets.

A) Pilot Experiment							
	Hihger Abundance in Control	Not Differentially Abundant	Higher Abundance in Treated	Total			
Environmental	40 (31)	63 (58)	98 (112)	201			
Possibly Transplanted	3 (8)	21 (14)	25 (27)	49			
Successfully Transplanted	4 (9)	5 (16)	47 (31)	56			
Total	47	89	170				

B) Repeat Experiment						
	Higher Abundance in Control	Not Differentially Abundant	Higher Abundance in Treated	Total		
Environmental	41 (37)	206 (171)	102 (141)	349		
Possibly Transplanted	5 (4)	9 (18)	23 (15)	37		
Successfully Transplanted	5 (10)	17 (43)	67 (36)	89		
Total	51	232	192			

950

Applied and Environmental Microbiology

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

# 951

952

953

954

955

 Table 3. The taxonomy at the family level of ASVs defined as "Successfully Transplanted", "Possibly Transplanted" and "Environmental" in pilot (A) and repeat experiments (B).

	Number of ASVs					
Taxonomy	Total	Successfully Transplanted	Possibly Transplanted	Environmental		
Lachnospiraceae	119	37	20	62		
Ruminococcaceae	104	13	21	70		
Clostridiaceae 1	21	0	2	19		
Erysipelotrichaceae	16	4	1	11		
Enterobacteriaceae	10	0	1	9		
Peptostreptococcaceae	9	0	1	8		
Bacillaceae	7	0	1	6		
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	6	0	0	6		
Paenibacillaceae	4	0	0	4		
Enterococcaceae	3	0	1	2		
Lactobacillaceae	2	0	0	2		
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	2	0	0		
Bacillales	1	0	0	1		
Christensenellaceae	1	0	1	0		
Microbacteriaceae	1	0	0	1		

# A) Pilot Experiment

# **B)** Repeat Experiment

	Number of ASVs				
Taxonomy	Total	Successfully Transplanted	Possibly Transplanted	Environmental	
Lachnospiraceae	193	45	8	140	
Ruminococcaceae	155	36	22	97	
Clostridiaceae 1	39	1	1	37	
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	15	1	2	12	
Erysipelotrichaceae	12	3	0	9	
Peptostreptococcaceae	11	1	0	10	
Enterobacteriaceae	8	1	0	7	
Bacillaceae	7	1	0	6	
Enterococcaceae	7	0	0	7	
Lactobacillaceae	5	0	0	5	
Christensenellaceae	3	0	2	1	
Paenibacillaceae	3	0	0	3	
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	0	2	0	
Staphylococcaceae	2	0	0	2	
Microbacteriaceae	2	0	0	2	
Alicvclobacillaceae	1	0	0	1	
Propionibacteriaceae	1	0	0	1	
Hydrogenophilaceae	1	0	0	1	
Thermaceae	1	Ō	Ō	1	
Peptococcaceae	1	0	0	1	
Moraxellaceae	1	Ő	Õ	1	
Streptococcaceae	î	ŏ	ŏ	î	
Leuconostocaceae	ĩ	ŏ	ŏ	î	
Burkholderiaceae	î	ŏ	ŏ	î	
Nocardiaceae	1	ŏ	ŏ	1	
Sanguibacteraceae	1	ŏ	ŏ	1	

051

# Table 4. Composition of starter and grower diets

Analytical Constituents (%)	Diet		
	Starter	Grower	
Crude Fat	2.7	2.4	
Crude Protein	18.9	15.6	
Crude Fibre	3.8	4.1	
Crude Ash	6.6	5.6	
Lysine	0.99	0.69	
Methionine	0.44	0.27	
Calcium	1.05	0.89	
Phosphorus	0.7	0.62	
Sodium	0.15	0.15	
Magnesium	0.17	0.22	
Copper	15mg/kg	16 mg/kg	

# 959

# Table 5. Primer pairs used for quantitative PCR

Target Taxa	Primers	Amplicon Size (b.p.)	Reference
Domain Bacteria (targets V4 region)	F: TGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA R: GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT	254	(49)
Clostridium	F: TGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA R: GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT	131	(61)
Enterobacteriaceae	F: GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA R: GCCTCAAGGGCACAACCTCCAAG	429	(62)
Candidatus Savagella	F: GATGCGTAGGCGGTTGAGTA R: GGGTTTCTAATCCTGTTTGCTCC	90	This study
Clostridium cluster IV	F: TTACTGGGTGTA AAGGG R: TAGAGTGCTCTTGCGTA	580	(63)
Clostridium cluster XIV a&b	F: AAATGACGGTACCTGACTAA R: CTTTGAGTTTCATTCTTGCGAA	438-441	(64)

960

# 961 **Figures**

962 Figure 1



963

Sampling regimes for the Pilot (A) and Repeat (B) Experiments including abbreviations for samplegroups used when discussing the results.





974	Alpha diversity measured by a Shannon index at a sequencing depth of 5000.Sample groups divided by
975	experiment (P = pilot, R = repeat), treatment (C = control, T = treated) and age. Shannon diversity of
976	transplant material (TRPL) is also shown. The alpha diversity of treated chicks was significantly higher
977	than that of control chicks at 3 d.p.h (both experiments) and 0 d.p.h (repeat experiment). $* p < 0.05$ .

978

# 979 Figure 3



1002 treatment groups in pilot (triangle), repeat experiments (circle) and transplant samples (square). Each 1003 point represents an individual sample with distance between points representative of differences in 1004 microbiota composition.

1005

# 1006





1008

1009

A dendrogram heatmap of ASV log abundance in the caecal microbiota of control and treated chicks at

1010 3 and 7 d.p.h in the pilot experiment. The dendrogram represents the organisation of ASVs within the 1011 system of balances created by hierarchical clustering. Each node on the dendrogram is a balance with 1012 the first node designated balance y0. Each terminal branch represents a ASV present within the 1013 analysis. The bar charts visualise which ASVs are denominator (dark red) and which are numerator 1014 (light red) ASVs for each balance. The heatmap shows log abundance of each ASV in samples organised

# 1015 by group. Low abundance ASVs are represented by blue while higher abundance ASVs are represented

1016 by red.

Applied and Environmental Microbiology

# 1017 Figure 5



# 1018

Applied and Environmental Microbiology

> 1019 A dendrogram heatmap showing log abundance of ASVs in the caecal microbiota of control and treated chicks at 0, 3, 7 and 14 d.p.h in the repeat experiment. The dendrogram represents the organisation of 1020 1021 ASVs within the system of balances created by hierarchical clustering. Each node on the dendrogram is 1022 a balance with the first node designated balance y0. Each terminal branch represents a ASV present 1023 within the analysis. The bar charts visualise which ASVs are denominator (dark red) and which are 1024 numerator (light red) ASVs for each balance. The heatmap shows log abundance of each ASV in 1025 samples organised by group. Low abundance ASVs are represented by blue while higher abundance 1026 ASVs are represented by red.

1027

# 1028 Figure 6



Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

Relative abundance of *Enterobacteriaceae* (A), *Clostridium* (B), *Clostridium* Cluster IV (C) and *Clostridium* Cluster XIVa&b (D) in the caeca of treated and control chicks between 0 and 14 d.p.h.
Significant differences between treated and control chicks in the pilot (+) and repeat (\*) experiments
are indicated.



6

Days Post Hatch

8

10

12

14

#### 1033 Figure 7

0 ò

Ż

4

1034

1035 Relative abundance of Candidatus Arthromitus (A), Enterobacteriaceae (B) and Clostridium (C) in the 1036 ilea of treated and control chicks between 0 and 14 d.p.h. Significant differences between treated and 1037 control chicks in the pilot (+) and repeat (\*) experiments are indicated.

Pilot Experiment - Control

Pilot Experiment - Treated

10

6

8

Repeat Experiment - Control

Repeat Experiment - Treated

12

14

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library







A)

40







Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

8

6

2

0

-2

-4

-6

Description







AEM



Alpha\_Div

Downloaded from http://aem.asm.org/ on January 7, 2020 at University of Liverpool Library

A)

# 5 eggs sampled. 56 Eggs divided into treated and control groups (28 eggs each) Control group did not receive any treatment Eggs candled at 7 d.i. and eight removed 18 d.i: Five eggs sampled 18 d.i: Five eggs sampled 14 eggs successfully hatch by 22 d.i. Caeca (**PC3**) and ilea from seven chicks sampled Caeca (**PC7**) and ilea from seven chicks sampled



Table 4.	Primer	pairs	used	for	quantitative PCR
----------	--------	-------	------	-----	------------------

Target Taxa	Primers	Amplicon Size (b.p.)	Reference
Domain <i>Bacteria</i> (targets V4 region)	F: TGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA R: GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT	254	(57)
Clostridium	F: TGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA R: GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT	131	(58)
Enterobacteriaceae	F: GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA R: GCCTCAAGGGCACAACCTCCAAG	429	(59)
Candidatus Savagella	F: GATGCGTAGGCGGTTGAGTA R: GGGTTTCTAATCCTGTTTGCTCC	90	This study
Clostridium cluster IV	F: TTACTGGGTGTAAAGGG R: TAGAGTGCTCTTGCGTA	580	(60)
Clostridium cluster XIV a&b	F: AAATGACGGTACCTGACTAA R: CTTTGAGTTTCATTCTTGCGAA	438-441	(61)

AEM

**Table 3.** The taxonomy of features defined as "Successfully Transplanted", "Possibly Transplanted" and "Environmental" in pilot (A) and repeat experiments (B).

	Number of ASVs				
Taxonomy	Total	Successfully Transplanted	Possibly Transplanted	Environmental	
Lachnospiraceae	119	37	20	62	
Ruminococcaceae	104	13	21	70	
Clostridiaceae 1	21	0	2	19	
Erysipelotrichaceae	16	4	1	11	
Enterobacteriaceae	10	0	1	9	
Peptostreptococcaceae	9	0	1	8	
Bacillaceae	7	0	1	6	
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	6	0	0	6	
Paenibacillaceae	4	0	0	4	
Enterococcaceae	3	0	1	2	
Lactobacillaceae	2	0	0	2	
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	2	0	0	
Bacillales	1	0	0	1	
Christensenellaceae	1	0	1	0	
Microbacteriaceae	1	0	0	1	

# A) Pilot Experiment

# **B)** Repeat Experiment

	Number of ASVs				
Taxonomy	Total	Successfully Transplanted	Possibly Transplanted	Environmental	
Lachnospiraceae	193	45	8	140	
Ruminococcaceae	155	36	22	97	
Clostridiaceae 1	39	1	1	37	
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	15	1	2	12	
Erysipelotrichaceae	12	3	0	9	
Peptostreptococcaceae	11	1	0	10	
Enterobacteriaceae	8	1	0	7	
Bacillaceae	7	1	0	6	
Enterococcaceae	7	0	0	7	
Lactobacillaceae	5	0	0	5	
Christensenellaceae	3	0	2	1	
Paenibacillaceae	3	0	0	3	
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	0	2	0	
Staphylococcaceae	2	0	0	2	
Microbacteriaceae	2	0	0	2	
Alicyclobacillaceae	1	0	0	1	
Propionibacteriaceae	1	0	0	1	
Hydrogenophilaceae	1	0	0	1	
Thermaceae	1	0	0	1	
Peptococcaceae	1	0	0	1	
Moraxellaceae	1	0	0	1	
Streptococcaceae	1	0	0	1	
Leuconostocaceae	1	0	0	1	
Burkholderiaceae	1	0	0	1	
Nocardiaceae	1	0	0	1	
Sanguibacteraceae	1	0	0	1	

<sup>2</sup> osted Online	
Manuscript F	
Accepted	

**Table 2.** A contingency table showing observed frequencies of feature classification by differential abundance and transplant success in the pilot (A) and repeat experiments (B). Expected frequencies calculated using a chi squared test of independence are displayed in brackets.

A) Pilot Experiment

		-		
	Differentially Abundant in Control	Not Differentially Abundant	Differentially Abundant in Treated	Total
Environmental	40 (31)	63 (58)	98 (112)	201
Possibly Transplanted	3 (8)	21 (14)	25 (27)	49
Successfully Transplanted	4 (9)	5 (16)	47 (31)	56
Total	47	89	170	

b) Repeat Experiment						
	Differentially Abundant in Control	Not Differentially Abundant	Differentially Abundant in Treated	Total		
Environmental	41 (37)	206 (171)	102 (141)	349		
Possibly Transplanted	5 (4)	9 (18)	23 (15)	37		
Successfully Transplanted	5 (10)	17 (43)	67 (36)	89		
Total	51	232	192			

# **B)** Repeat Experiment

**Table 1.** A taxonomy summary of ASVs identified as differentially abundant in treated and control samples from the pilot (A) and repeat experiments (B) by Gneiss analysis. ASVs identified as NDA were not differentially abundant between treatment groups.

	Name	an of Diffe		hundant ACVa
	Number of Differentially Abundant ASVs			
Taxonomy	Total	Treated	Control	NDA
Lachnospiraceae	119	80	18	21
Ruminococcaceae	104	46	7	51
Clostridiaceae 1	21	10	10	1
Erysipelotrichaceae	16	4	9	3
Enterobacteriaceae	10	3	3	4
Peptostreptococcaceae	9	4	5	0
Bacillaceae	7	5	0	2
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	6	2	0	4
Paenibacillaceae	4	3	1	0
Enterococcaceae	3	1	0	2
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	2	0	0
Lactobacillaceae	2	2	0	0
Christensenellaceae	1	0	0	1
Bacillales	1	1	0	0
Microbacteriaceae	1	1	0	0

# A) Pilot Experiment

# **B)** Repeat Experiment

	Number of Differentially Abundant ASVs			
Taxonomy	Total	Treated	Control	NDA
Lachnospiraceae	193	90	20	83
Ruminococcaceae	155	79	17	59
Clostridiaceae 1	39	1	5	33
Clostridiales vadinBB60 group	15	7	1	7
Erysipelotrichaceae	12	2	0	10
Peptostreptococcaceae	11	3	0	8
Enterobacteriaceae	8	0	4	4
Enterococcaceae	7	0	3	4
Bacillaceae	7	4	0	3
Lactobacillaceae	5	2	1	2
Christensenellaceae	3	1	0	2
Paenibacillaceae	3	0	0	3
Microbacteriaceae	2	0	0	2
Staphylococcaceae	2	0	0	2
uncultured rumen bacterium	2	2	0	0
Thermaceae	1	0	0	1
Sanguibacteraceae	1	0	0	1
Streptococcaceae	1	1	0	0
Hydrogenophilaceae	1	0	0	1
Burkholderiaceae	1	0	0	1
Propionibacteriaceae	1	0	0	1
Leuconostocaceae	1	0	0	1
Nocardiaceae	1	0	0	1
Peptococcaceae	1	0	0	1
Moraxellaceae	1	0	0	1
Alicyclobacillaceae	1	0	0	1