Assessing uncertainty in the dynamical ice response to ocean warming in the Amundsen Sea Embayment, 2 West Antarctica 3

I. J. Nias^{1,2,3}, S. L. Cornford⁴, T. L. Edwards⁵, N. Gourmelen⁶, A. J. Payne¹

¹Centre of Polar Observation and Modelling, School of Geographical Sciences, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK Bristol, UK ²Cryospheric Sciences Laboratory, NASA Goddard Space Flight Center, Greenbelt, MD, USA ³Earth System Science Interdisciplinary Center, University of Maryland, College Park, MD, USA ⁴Department of Geography, Swansea University, Swansea, UK ⁵Department of Geography, Kings College London, UK ⁶School of Geosciences, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK

Key Points:

1

4

5

6

12

18

13	• We calibrate an ensemble of high-resolution ice-flow simulations of the Amund	l-
14	sen Sea Embayment, using surface elevation change observations.	
15	• The upper tail of the distribution of sea level contribution produced by the ca	l-
16	ibrated ensemble becomes more exaggerated over time.	
17	• Process-based modeling is essential for projecting the contribution of ice sheet	\mathbf{s}
16 17	ibrated ensemble becomes more exaggerated over time.Process-based modeling is essential for projecting the contribution of ice shee	t

to sea level.

Corresponding author: I. J. Nias, isabel.j.nias@nasa.gov

19 Abstract

Ice mass loss from the Amundsen Sea Embayment ice streams in West Antarctica is a 20 major source of uncertainty in projections of future sea-level rise. Physically-based ice-21 flow models rely on a number of parameters that represent unobservable quantities and 22 processes, and accounting for uncertainty in these parameters can lead to a wide range 23 of dynamic responses. Here we perform a Bayesian calibration of a perturbed-parameter 24 ensemble, in which we score each ensemble member on its ability to match the magni-25 tude and broad spatial pattern of present-day observations of ice sheet surface elevation 26 change. We apply an idealized melt-rate forcing to extend the most likely simulations 27 forward to 2200. We find that diverging grounding-line response between ensemble mem-28 bers drives an exaggeration in the upper tail of the distribution of sea level rise by 2200, 29 demonstrating that extreme future outcomes cannot be excluded. 30

31 **1** Introduction

Despite considerable advances in physically-based models of ice dynamics over the 32 last decade (Pattyn et al., 2017), there are still large uncertainties in the projections of 33 future sea-level rise from the Antarctic ice sheets. One major focus of uncertainty is the 34 dynamic response of fast-flowing ice streams in regions that are grounded well below sea 35 level, in particular the Amundsen Sea Embayment (ASE). Specifically, there is uncer-36 tainty regarding the onset, speed and extent of large-scale grounding line retreat given 37 the Marine Ice Sheet Instability theory (Favier et al., 2014; Joughin et al., 2014; Seroussi 38 et al., 2014). Quantifying likely sea-level rise over the coming centuries is critical to the 39 adequate provision of coastal defences. 40

The aim of this work is to demonstrate how spatial data of present-day observa-41 tions can be used to calibrate an ensemble of ice-flow model simulations, in order to con-42 struct a probability distribution of future sea-level rise from the ASE. Quantification of 43 uncertainty has been an integral part of global climate model projection for a number 44 of years and features heavily in the IPCC assessment reports (Collins et al., 2013). How-45 ever, only in the last few years has the ice-sheet-modelling community begun to formally 46 consider uncertainty when estimating future contributions to sea-level (Applegate et al., 47 2012; Gladstone et al., 2012; Little et al., 2013; Levermann et al., 2014; Edwards et al., 48 2014a, 2014b, 2019; Chang et al., 2014; Ritz et al., 2015; Ruckert et al., 2017; Tsai et 49 al., 2017; Schlegel et al., 2018). This delay is due, in part, to computational issues mak-50 ing it difficult to produce sufficiently large ensembles of simulations to investigate pa-51 rameter uncertainty with available computational resources (Chang et al., 2014). 52

Several of the previous studies that do consider uncertainty focus on Greenland, 53 where the fate of the ice sheet tends to be dependent on the modelled relationship be-54 tween surface mass balance and surface elevation (Applegate et al., 2012; Edwards et al., 55 2014a, 2014b); ocean-driven dynamics, while under-resolved, play a less important role 56 in the ice sheet's behavior (Fürst et al., 2015; Goelzer et al., 2018), compared with the 57 ASE. Studies that focus on Antarctica vary in model resolution, complexity and spatial 58 extent. Many Antarctic-wide studies use low-resolution models, which has consequences 59 for the treatment of grounding line migration, often relying on parameterization (Levermann 60 et al., 2014; Ritz et al., 2015; DeConto & Pollard, 2016; Edwards et al., 2019). 61

Depending on the magnitude of the step change in basal sliding and melt rate at 62 the grounding line (Gladstone et al., 2017), explicitly simulating fine-scale grounding line 63 dynamics (i.e. without relying on parameterization), requires sub-kilometer grid reso-64 lution at the grounding line (Cornford et al., 2016), which is computationally expensive. 65 We use the BISICLES ice-flow model, which relies on adaptive mesh refinement, where 66 the vicinity of the grounding line is modelled at a considerably higher resolution (250 m)67 than the interior of the ice sheet (4 km). We focus on a smaller area – the ASE, rather 68 than the whole of Antarctica – as this region is likely to dominate the Antarctic mass 69

loss signal in the next one to two centuries (Levermann et al., 2014; Ritz et al., 2015; De Conto & Pollard, 2016). These decisions allow us to perform a sufficient number of sim-

⁷¹ Conto & Pollard, 2016). These decisions allow us to perform a sufficient number of sin ⁷² ulations using a sophisticated, high-resolution model to explore the likely range of dy-

⁷³ namic response of the ASE to an idealized increase in sub-ice-shelf melting.

Firstly, we perform a Bayesian calibration of a perturbed-parameter ensemble of
ice-sheet model simulations, by comparing the model results with observations of surface elevation change. We then extend the calibrated ensemble to 2200 using an idealized melt-rate forcing, and explore the uncertainty in the ice-sheet response given this
forcing scenario.

79 2 Perturbed-parameter Ensemble Calibration

2.1 Model and Observation Data

80

The perturbed-parameter ensemble is described in Nias et al. (2016); here we will 81 outline the relevant details. The BISICLES ice flow model is initialised to present-day 82 conditions by performing an iterative procedure to find unknown quantities such as the 83 basal traction coefficient (C), the ice viscosity stiffening factor (φ) and the sub-ice-shelf 84 melt rate (M_b) (Nias et al., 2016). C and φ are found by solving an inverse problem given 85 observations of velocity (Rignot et al., 2011). M_b is determined from the flux divergence 86 over floating ice, but is parameterized to be spatially smooth and to have the highest rates 87 close to the grounding line. Two alternative initial states are created; one that uses the 88 Bedmap2 geometry (Fretwell et al., 2013), and one that modifies the bed topography and 89 grounded ice thickness to smooth spurious thickening signals in the flux divergence, which 90 have been attributed to incorrect thickness measurements (Morlighem et al., 2011; Nias 91 et al., 2018). 92

In total there are four optimal parameter sets, for all combinations of the two bedrock geometries and two Weertman sliding laws (m = 1 and m = 1/3), which form the basis of the ensemble. Nias et al. (2016) use Latin hypercube sampling to create 64 distinct parameter vectors in which C, φ and M_b vary between a halving and a doubling of the optimised values, which, with the addition of the optimal member and six end members, produces a 284-member ensemble. The 50-year simulations are run under present conditions, i.e. there is no time-dependent climate forcing.

Observed rates of surface elevation change (dh/dt) over grounded ice are obtained from swath processing of CryoSat-2 radar altimetry measurements from 2010 to 2015 (Gourmelen et al., 2017). This processing technique is able to capture thinning rates in the swath rather than just the Point Of Closest Approach (POCA). In doing so it provides a greater spatial coverage of dh/dt measurements compared to traditional POCA technique (Foresta et al., 2016). The spatial resolution of the data is approximately 500 m.

106 2.2 Bayesian Calibration

Bayes' theorem states that the posterior probability distribution $(P(\theta|Y) - \text{the prob-}$ ability of θ given Y) is proportional to the prior probability distribution $(P(\theta) - \text{the prob-}$ ability of θ) multiplied by a likelihood function $(P(Y|\theta) - \text{probability of } Y \text{ given } \theta)$:

$$P(\theta|Y) \propto P(\theta)P(Y|\theta).$$
(1)

In other words, we are trying to find the probability of an event (e.g. a magnitude of sea level rise) produced by a particular parameter vector θ (e.g. the scaling factors used to vary C, φ and M_b), given observations Y (e.g. dh/dt). We are not trying to find a single estimate of θ , rather a distribution.

Each ensemble member is assigned a likelihood score based on discrepancies between the model output and observed dh/dt, assuming Gaussian, independent errors (Edwards et al., 2014b). The likelihood score s_j for the j^{th} simulation in the ensemble is

$$s_j = \exp\left[-\frac{1}{2}\sum_i \frac{(f_i^j - z_i^j)^2}{(\sigma_i^j)^2}\right],$$
 (2)

where f is the modelled dh/dt and z is the observed dh/dt, and i is a spatial index.

 σ^2 is the discrepancy variance, which is a combination of observational error and 118 structural error, and represents the mismatch between the model, given the optimum pa-119 rameter set, and the real world (Murphy et al., 2009; Edwards et al., 2019). Observa-120 tional error is found from the covariance matrix of the parameters used to derive the swath-121 processed dh/dt (Foresta et al., 2016). Structural error has numerous sources related to 122 the structural properties of the model; for example missed physical processes, spatial res-123 olution of the grid and the numerical representation. Structural error is poorly constrained 124 and so we conservatively assign it a value of double the observational error (Fig. S4). 125

Often in model-data evaluation, spatial comparisons are made at every available 126 location. While this is appealing in terms of maximising the number of data points, the 127 spatial correlation inherent in most environmental variables means that this tends to overly 128 penalise models in regions of coherent spatial patterns. The model error is 'double-counted' 129 for each neighbouring grid cell, even though they arise from a common source. One ap-130 proach is to model this spatial correlation explicitly, but this is challenging and requires 131 assumptions about the precise features of grid cell-to-cell correlations everywhere. A more 132 common approach is to remove the spatial correlation by averaging or sub-sampling the 133 data at a spatial scale at which they are reduced so the model-data discrepancies are suf-134 ficiently independent. 135

Using semi-variograms, we empirically investigate the length scales at which the covariance is reduced to an acceptable value, and use this to decide upon an appropriate spatial scale on which to sample the discrepancies. We find this to be approximately 100 km, both in the x- and y-directions (see the Supporting Information).

The score for each simulation is normalised to create a weight w,

140

$$w_j = \frac{s_j}{\sum_j s_j},\tag{3}$$

where the simulation with the lowest discrepancy with observations has the largest weight. These weights, which are akin to $P(Y|\theta)$ in Equation 1, are used to weight the prior distribution, $P(\theta)$, to produce a calibrated (posterior) distribution of sea level contribution, $P(\theta|Y)$ (Fig. 1a).

The most likely (modal) sea-level rise estimate according to the prior distribution 145 is 0.26 mm yr⁻¹ (50-year mean), which shifts to 0.30 mm yr⁻¹ in the posterior distri-146 bution (Table 1). The similarity between these estimates and observed rates of mass loss 147 from the ASE (Fig. 1a), indicates that these independent methods for quantifying present-148 day mass loss are in good agreement; whether it is BISICLES tuned using velocity ob-149 servations (the prior); the observed spatial field of surface elevation change (the poste-150 rior); or the methods used to estimate total mass loss from the ice sheet (vertical lines, 151 Fig. 1a). The spread of the posterior distribution is reduced from the prior distribution, 152 indicating that the calibration process is useful for reducing uncertainty in sea level rise 153 projections. Future work could test the impact of using different types of observational 154 data in the calibration process. For example, maps of observed velocity change could be 155 a good candidate, as the dynamic signal is not influenced by changes in surface mass bal-156 ance. 157

Table 1. Quantiles and modes for the prior and posterior distributions of the 50-year mean rate of sea-level contribution (mm yr^{-1}); and cumulative sea level total (mm) after 100 and 200 years with increased melt forcing.

		5%	25%	50%	75%	95%	Mode
$\frac{1}{(\rm mm~yr^{-1})}$	Prior Posterior	-0.08 0.02	$\begin{array}{c} 0.14 \\ 0.19 \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} 0.35 \\ 0.33 \end{array}$	$0.67 \\ 0.46$	$1.35 \\ 0.72$	$0.26 \\ 0.30$
Total (mm)	100 years 200 years	$20.6 \\ 56.2$	$38.3 \\ 106.9$	$55.7 \\ 139.7$	$72.2 \\ 239.9$	$123.1 \\ 424.3$	$53.7 \\ 119.6$

3 Extended Simulations

Of the 284-member ensemble, 187 members were within the 5–95% probability in-159 terval of the 50-year mean rate of sea-level contribution (0.02-0.72 mm yr⁻¹, Table 1). 160 We exclude the extremes because their implied rates of elevation change perform poorly 161 in the comparison with present-day observations (at the 10% probability level). Satel-162 lite observations have consistently shown that the ASE has been losing mass (Mouginot 163 et al., 2014; McMillan et al., 2014), and so it is particularly appropriate to discard those 164 members with mass gain. In addition, previous regional modelling has suggested that 165 a linear-viscous law is not suitable for describing sliding over bedrock and is prone to un-166 derestimate the sensitivity to changes in basal traction at the grounding line (Joughin 167 et al., 2009, 2010). Therefore, given limited computational resources, we chose to extend 168 to 2200 only the 71 ensemble members that fall within the 5-95% probability interval 169 of sea-level contribution and use the non-linear (m = 1/3) Weertman sliding law. 170

The sub-ice-shelf melt-rate is perturbed within the perturbed-parameter ensem-171 ble described above. In addition, we apply a simplified melt-rate forcing anomaly to en-172 sure the direction of change is consistent with the expected behaviour. In the Amund-173 sen Sea, we expect there to be an increase in sub-ice-shelf melt-rates over the coming cen-174 turies due to increasing Circumpolar Deep Water (CDW) intrusions onto the continen-175 tal shelf, as well as potentially direct warming (Timmermann & Hellmer, 2013; Holland 176 et al., 2019). Therefore, we apply an idealized melt-rate forcing, based loosely on regional 177 ocean modelling, given a 'business-as-usual' emissions scenario (Timmermann et al., 2002). 178 The ice-shelf averaged melt-rate anomaly increases linearly to 15 m yr⁻¹ by the end of 179 the 21^{st} century – as ice shelf contact with the CDW increases – and remains constantly 180 elevated in the 22^{nd} century – representing continued CDW intrusion. The mean melt-181 rate anomaly is in addition to the melt rates of the perturbed-parameter ensemble (~ 5 -182 20 m yr^{-1} mean), and is distributed to be highest near to the grounding line. Further 183 details about the melt-rate forcing can be found in the Supporting Information. 184

All the extended simulations continued to lose mass from the ASE, and by the end 185 of the two centuries the modal contribution is 12 cm sea level equivalent (Table 1). The 186 probability distributions of cumulative sea-level contribution (Fig. 1b) broaden over time, 187 particularly in the upper tail of the distribution where the contribution in the second 188 century is larger than in the first. This super-linear response persists, even when the melt 189 rate remains constant in the second century. However, other simulations maintain an ap-190 proximately linear response at a lower rate throughout the 200-year simulations. These 191 two response types can be seen in Figure 2c; approximately 40% of the simulations ex-192 hibit a super-linear trend (blue lines). 193

By the end of the 21st century, all ensemble members have experienced a reduction in the total ASE grounded area (Fig. 2a). However, retreat is not ubiquitous across all ice streams: some members result in grounding line advance, albeit limited, in Pine



Figure 1. Distributions of sea level change. a) Histogram (grey boxes) and associated prior probability density function (prior PDF, black curve) of present-day sea-level contribution rate (50 year mean) from the original model ensemble, and calibrated posterior PDF (red curve). Observed rates from 2010 using the input-output method ($0.27 \pm 0.04 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$, short dashes) (Medley et al., 2014) and 2010–2013 derived from Cryosat-2 altimetry ($0.33 \pm 0.05 \text{ mm yr}^{-1}$, long dashes) (McMillan et al., 2014) are represented by vertical lines. b) PDFs of the total sea-level contribution from the calibrated 50-year ensemble (red curve); and from the extended ensemble after 100 years (grey curve) and 200 years (black curve).

Island and Thwaites glaciers. The group of smaller ice streams to the west of Thwaites
 (Pope, Smith, Kohler glaciers – PSK) do show grounding line retreat in all ensemble mem bers.

$_{200}$ 4 Discussion

During the 200-year simulations, the high-end ensemble members diverge from the modal behavior, creating a skewed distribution towards higher values of sea level contribution (Fig. 1b). This is despite the high-end tail of the original ensemble being downweighted (Fig. 1a), resulting in the most extreme simulations being removed from the longer century-scale simulations. Non-normal distributions, characterized by a long tail at the high end, are also found in other studies (Levermann et al., 2014; DeConto & Pollard, 2016; Kopp et al., 2017; Edwards et al., 2019; Robel et al., 2019).

The super-linear response of the high-end members means that while the mode of 208 the distribution increases linearly – the total sea level contribution after 200 years is ap-209 proximately double the total after 100 years – the 95th percentile increases dispropor-210 tionately (Table 1). Given our idealized melt-rate forcing, there is 5% probability that 211 the ASE will contribute more than 12 cm of sea level rise by ~ 2100 and 42 cm by ~ 2200 . 212 This is in contrast to a study by Ritz et al. (2015), in which the response at the 95th per-213 centile is quasi-linear, with 25 cm of sea level rise from the ASE in the 21st century and 214 48 cm by 2200. In their model, the representation of ice dynamics is simpler and at a 215 lower resolution (15 km) than the model used here. In particular, the grounding line re-216 treat is imposed rather than computed, which may dampen non-linear behaviour. 217

We find that the grounding line behavior regulates the linearity of the sea-level response. Indeed, the long tail at the high end of the sea-level rise distribution is mirrored in the grounding line retreat: some simulations achieve extreme retreat, whereas many simulations experience more modest retreat and advance is limited (Fig. 2). As the ice stream grounding lines retreat further into the deep basins they inhabit, the flux across them increases with ice thickness and with the lengthening of the flux-gate. The rela-



Figure 2. Grounding line position after a) 100 years and b) 200 years. Each coloured line represents an individual ensemble member: yellow represents a more linear sea-level response and blue represents a super-linear response (based on the second derivative of the sea level trend shown in c) the 8-year running-mean of the rate of sea-level contribution from the ASE during the 200-year simulations). The initial grounding line position is delineated by the thick black line. Grey scale background indicates initial velocity.

tionship between grounding line retreat and the non-linearity of the sea level response over time is illustrated by the colored lines in Figure 2.

As alluded to above, the non-linearity in the rate of grounding line retreat is re-226 lated to the bedrock topography, as demonstrated for Pine Island Glacier in Figure 3. 227 Approximately 18% of our simulations maintain their initial grounding line position (in 228 the case of the Bedmap2 simulations), or close to it (in the case of the modified bedrock, 229 which has a topographic rise ~ 15 km upstream) for much, if not all, of the simulations. 230 Others experience only limited retreat, with a number of topographic rises, most notably 231 at ~ 25 km upstream of the initial grounding line position, producing a step-like pattern 232 in retreat (Fig. 3). These modest responses are similar to the first mode of retreat de-233 scribed by Gladstone et al. (2012), in which retreat is gradual on the order of 0.1 km yr⁻¹. 234

Gladstone et al. (2012) find a second mode of grounding line behavior character-235 ized by rapid accelerating retreat. In their flow-line model simulations the initial ground-236 ing line retreat off the bedrock high occurs quickly and, once it reaches an uninterrupted 237 retrograde slope, the rate of retreat can reach up to 10 km yr^{-1} and be sustained for up 238 to ~ 10 years, which is similar to our most extreme results (Fig. 3). The similarities be-239 tween our results and those shown in Figure 3 of Gladstone et al. (2012), despite the sig-240 nificant differences in model physics, indicates that topography, as well as the forcing, 241 exerts a strong control on the temporal form of Pine Island Glacier grounding line re-242 treat. 243

Robel et al. (2019) demonstrate that an ensemble becomes progressively more skewed towards greater retreat when the grounding line is located on a predominantly retrograde bedrock slope, because the rate of retreat in the extreme ensemble members diverges further away from the more moderate members – which is seen here in Figure 3. The skew-



Figure 3. Pine Island Glacier a) grounding line retreat over time, relative to the initial position (0 km), with each curve representing one simulation. Dashed lines act as a guide for linear retreat rates. b) cross-section of the two geometries: Bedmap2 (Fretwell et al., 2013) (orange) and the modified bed (Nias et al., 2016) (grey). The top lines represent the initial ice surface, and the bottom lines gives the bed topography. To the right of 0 km (initial grounding line – black line), the bed topography diverges from the ice base (i.e. the ice shelf). The colored vertical lines are at the position of the grounding line of the central ensemble members after 200 years, for the two geometries.

ness in the distribution towards the high-end of sea level rise is fundamentally linked to
the non-linearity in the rate of grounding line retreat (Robel et al., 2019).

Missed processes in the model contribute to its structural error. For example, we 250 do not include calving in our model – the ice front is fixed and we impose a minimum 251 ice thickness of 10 m. This could have implications for stability as ice shelves can pro-252 vide a buttressing effect on the grounded ice sheet (Gudmundsson, 2013); although in 253 many cases here the simulated ice shelf, across the vast majority of the area, is close to 254 or at the minimum thickness constraint of 10 m, the buttressing effect of which is neg-255 ligible. The lack of calving and ice shelf collapse, precludes any potential loss through 256 marine ice cliff instability (DeConto & Pollard, 2016), although on the timescales of this 257 study, it is unlikely that sufficient surface melt will occur to cause ice shelf collapse in 258 the ASE (Trusel et al., 2015; Kuipers Munneke et al., 2014). Another source of model 259 uncertainty is the sliding law used to determine basal shear stress – the choice of which 260 can lead to different ice sheet responses (Brondex et al., 2017, 2019; Nias et al., 2018). 261 Given the amount of grounding line retreat experienced by the extreme simulations, we 262 would expect interactions with neighboring West Antarctic drainage basins (Feldmann 263 & Levermann, 2015; Cornford et al., 2016). However our model configuration has a fixed 264 boundary so these dynamics have not been explored here. 265

Ocean-driven melt is likely to be a major source of uncertainty in future projec tions of sea level rise (Schlegel et al., 2018; Nowicki & Seroussi, 2018), for example there
 is uncertainty in the future ocean temperature projection, and its relationship to melt

rate, and how this is parameterized in BISICLES. Here, we have tested the impact of 269 uncertainty in the melt rate obtained during the initialization of BISICLES: halving and 270 doubling the optimal melt-rate field results in a 4 cm difference in sea level contribution 271 by 2200, when all other parameters are held at their optimal values. This is an order of 272 magnitude less than the total spread of the distribution given in Table 1. However, we 273 have not investigated the impact of uncertainty in the melt-rate forcing anomaly added 274 during the extended simulations. Accounting for different ocean temperature projections 275 is likely to add considerable spread to the distribution of future sea level contribution 276 (Holland et al., 2019), whereas the precise form of the ocean melt parameterization is 277 likely to be less influential (Favier et al., 2019). 278

For the PSK group of ice streams, retreat occurs in all ensemble members and there 279 is less ambiguity in the future outlook, compared with Pine Island and Thwaites glaciers 280 (Fig. 2). Smith Glacier in particular has seen rapid retreat over the last two decades, 281 and although there has been a recent slow-down in the retreat, Scheuchl et al. (2016)282 predict that it will continue unabated in the coming years, and they have attributed the 283 recent stabilization to a locally prograde slope. The uncertainty in future sea-level rise 284 from the ASE lies in the vast range of responses exhibited in Pine Island and Thwaites 285 glaciers, not the PSK group, which are relatively consistent with one another and where 286 the potential for retreat is much more limited by the topographic constraints. 287

Simulations that behave similarly at the beginning of the 200 year simulations do not necessarily follow a similar trajectory (Fig. S5). This demonstrates that it is essential to use process-based models, which can predict the changing evolution of the ice sheet, instead of extrapolation methods when making projections; as also found by others (Ritz et al., 2015; Kopp et al., 2017).

²⁹³ 5 Conclusion

Here we have attempted to constrain and quantify the uncertainty in sea level rise 294 from the ASE using BISICLES, a high-resolution ice-flow model capable of capturing 295 grounding line dynamics. Using present-day (2010–2015) observations we calibrated the perturbed-parameter ensemble of Nias et al. (2016), by scoring each member on its abil-297 ity to match the magnitude and spatial pattern of surface elevation change. Based on 298 the resulting posterior distribution of sea-level change rates, the extreme ensemble mem-299 bers, which matched poorly with observations, were discarded. Simulations that start 300 out in agreement with the present day can end up contributing more than 42 cm (5%) 301 probability) by 2200, although the modal estimate is 12 cm. The long high-end tail of 302 the sea-level distribution becomes more exaggerated over time due to extreme members 303 exhibiting a super-linear sea-level response, and is mirrored in the divergence in groundingline response between ensemble members. Our results only reflect uncertainty in the ice 305 dynamics, and the range of potential outcomes would be greater if the uncertainty in the 306 projected forcing is also included. Overall the uncertainty in the response of this par-307 ticularly dynamic region of Antarctica is a major challenge in provisions for mitigating 308 the impact of sea-level rise, and at this time extreme future outcomes cannot be excluded. 309

310 Acknowledgments

This work was supported by funding from the UK Natural Environment Research Coun-

 $_{312}$ cil (NERC) through the iSTAR-C programme (NE/J005738/1). NG was supported by

European Space Agency contract CryoTop Evolution 4000116874/16/I-NB. BISICLES

simulations were performed on the University of Bristol's Blue Crystal Phase 3 super-

computer. Code used to configure the BISICLES ensemble is available at https://github.com/ijnias/nias-

et-al-2019-grl. The model output is in long-term storage in the University of Bristol Re-

search Data Storage Facility and is available on request. We thank the editor, Mathieu

318 Morlighem, and reviewers for their comments on the manuscript.

319 **References**

339

- Applegate, P. J., Kirchner, N., Stone, E. J., Keller, K., & Greve, R. (2012). An assessment of key model parametric uncertainties in projections of Greenland Ice
 Sheet behavior. *The Cryosphere*, 6(3), 589–606. doi: 10.5194/tc-6-589-2012
- Brondex, J., Gagliardini, O., Gillet-Chaulet, F., & Durand, G. (2017). Sensitivity
 of grounding line dynamics to the choice of the friction law. Journal of Glaciol ogy, 63(241), 854–866. doi: 10.1017/jog.2017.51
- Brondex, J., Gillet-Chaulet, F., & Gagliardini, O. (2019). Sensitivity of centen nial mass loss projections of the Amundsen basin to the friction law. The
 Cryosphere, 13(1), 177–195. doi: 10.5194/tc-13-177-2019
- Chang, W., Applegate, P. J., Haran, M., & Keller, K. (2014). Probabilistic calibration of a Greenland Ice Sheet model using spatially resolved synthetic observations: toward projections of ice mass loss with uncertainties. *Geoscientific Model Development*, 7(5), 1933–1943. doi: 10.5194/gmd-7-1933-2014
- Collins, M., Knutti, R., Arblaster, J., Dufresne, J.-L., Fichefet, T., Friedlingstein, P.,
 Wehner, M. (2013). Long-term Climate Change: Projections, Commitments and Irreversibility. In T. Stocker et al. (Eds.), Climate Change 2013:
 The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth
 Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (pp.
 1029–1136). Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA: Cam-
 - 1029–1136). Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press. Retrieved from www.climatechange2013.org
- Cornford, S. L., Martin, D. F., Lee, V., Payne, A. J., & Ng, E. G. (2016). Adaptive mesh refinement versus subgrid friction interpolation in simulations of
 Antarctic ice dynamics. Annals of Glaciology, 1–9. doi: 10.1017/aog.2016.13
- DeConto, R. M., & Pollard, D. (2016). Contribution of Antarctica to past and future sea-level rise. *Nature*, 531(7596), 591–597. doi: 10.1038/nature17145
- Edwards, T. L., Brandon, M. A., Durand, G., Edwards, N. R., Golledge, N. R.,
 Holden, P. B., ... Wernecke, A. (2019). Revisiting Antarctic ice loss due
 to marine ice-cliff instability. *Nature*, 566(7742), 58–64. doi: 10.1038/
 s41586-019-0901-4
- Edwards, T. L., Fettweis, X., Gagliardini, O., Gillet-Chaulet, F., Goelzer, H.,
 Gregory, J. M., ... Ritz, C. (2014a). Effect of uncertainty in surface
 mass balanceelevation feedback on projections of the future sea level contribution of the Greenland ice sheet. The Cryosphere, 8(1), 195–208. doi:
 10.5194/tc-8-195-2014
- Edwards, T. L., Fettweis, X., Gagliardini, O., Gillet-Chaulet, F., Goelzer, H.,
 Gregory, J. M., ... Ritz, C. (2014b). Probabilistic parameterisation of
 the surface mass balanceelevation feedback in regional climate model simulations of the Greenland ice sheet. *The Cryosphere*, 8(1), 181–194. doi:
 10.5194/tc-8-181-2014
- Favier, L., Durand, G., Cornford, S. L., Gudmundsson, G. H., Gagliardini, O.,
 Gillet-Chaulet, F., ... Le Brocq, A. M. (2014). Retreat of Pine Island Glacier
 controlled by marine ice-sheet instability. *Nature Climate Change*, 1758–6798.
 doi: 10.1038/nclimate2094
- Favier, L., Jourdain, N. C., Jenkins, A., Merino, N., Durand, G., Gagliardini, O., ...
 Mathiot, P. (2019). Assessment of sub-shelf melting parameterisations using
 the oceanice-sheet coupled model NEMO(v3.6)Elmer/Ice(v8.3). Geoscientific
 Model Development, 12(6), 2255–2283. doi: 10.5194/gmd-12-2255-2019
- Feldmann, J., & Levermann, A. (2015). Interaction of marine ice-sheet instabilities in two drainage basins: simple scaling of geometry and transition time. The Cryosphere, 9(2), 631-645. doi: 10.5194/tc-9-631-2015
- Foresta, L., Gourmelen, N., Plsson, F., Nienow, P., Bjrnsson, H., & Shepherd, A.
 (2016). Surface elevation change and mass balance of Icelandic ice caps derived from swath mode CryoSat-2 altimetry. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 43(23), 12,138–12,145. doi: 10.1002/2016GL071485

374	Fretwell, P., Pritchard, H. D., Vaughan, D. G., Bamber, J. L., Barrand, N. E.,
375	Bell, R., Zirizzotti, A. (2013). Bedmap2: improved ice bed, surface
376	and thickness datasets for Antarctica. The Cryosphere, 7, 375–393. doi:
377	10.5194/tc-7-375-2013
378	Fürst, J. J., Goelzer, H., & Huybrechts, P. (2015). Ice-dynamic projections of the
379	Greenland ice sheet in response to atmospheric and oceanic warming. The
380	Cryosphere, $9(3)$, 1039–1062. doi: 10.5194/tc-9-1039-2015
381	Gladstone, R. M., Lee, V., Rougier, J., Payne, A. J., Hellmer, H., Le Broca, A.,
382	Cornford, S. L. (2012). Calibrated prediction of Pine Island Glacier retreat
383	during the 21st and 22nd centuries with a coupled flowline model. Earth and
384	Planetary Science Letters, 333-334, 191–199, doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2012.04.022
385	Gladstone, R. M., Warner, R. C., Galton-Fenzi, B. K., Gagliardini, O., Zwinger, T.,
386	& Greve, R. (2017). Marine ice sheet model performance depends on basal
387	sliding physics and sub-shelf melting. The Cruosphere, 11(1), 319–329. doi:
388	10.5194/tc-11-319-2017
380	Goelzer H Nowicki S Edwards T Beckley M Abe-Ouchi A Aschwanden
200	A Ziemen F A (2018) Design and results of the ice sheet model ini-
201	tialisation experiments initMIP-Greenland: an ISMIP6 intercomparison The
302	Cruosphere $12(4)$ 1433–1460 doi: 10.5194/tc-12-1433-2018
302	Courmelen N Escoribuela M Shepherd A Foresta L Muir A Garcia-
393	Mondeiar A Drinkwater M (2017) CryoSat-2 swath interferometric
394	altimetry for mapping ice elevation and elevation change Advances in Space
395	Research doi: 10.1016/j.asr.2017.11.014
390	Cudmundsson C H (2013) Ice-shelf buttressing and the stability of marine ice
397	sheets The Cruosphere $7(2)$ 647–655 doi: 10.5194/tc.7-647-2013
390	Holland P. B. Bracogirdle T. I. Dutrioux P. Jonking A. & Stoig F. J.
399	(2010) West Antarctic ice loss influenced by internal climate variabil-
400	(2013). West Antarctic ice ioss influenced by internal children variable ity and anthropogenic forcing Nature Geoscience $12(0)$ 718–724 doi:
401	$10 1038 /_{e} / 1561 - 0.020 - 0$
402	Loughin I Smith B & Holland D (2010) Sonsitivity of 21st contury son lovel
403	to accorn induced thinning of Pino Island Clacior Antarctica Coonhesical Re-
404	search Letters 37 L20502 doi: 10.1029/2010/04/819
405	Joughin I. Smith B. F. & Modley, B. (2014) Marine Ice Sheet Collapse Poten
400	tially Under Way for the Thwaites Clacier Basin West Antarctica Science
407	3/4 735-738 doi: 10.1126/science 12/9055
408	Joughin I Tulaczyk S Bamber I L Blankanshin D Holt I W Scambos
409	T & Vaughan D G (2009) Basal conditions for Pine Island and Thwaites
410	Claciers West Antarctica determined using satellite and airborne data Lour-
411	nal of Glaciology 55 245–257 doi: 10.3189/002214309788608705
412	Kopp B E DeConto B M Bader D A Hay C C Horton B M Kulp S
414	Strauss, B. H. (2017). Evolving Understanding of Antarctic Ice-Sheet Physics
414	and Ambiguity in Probabilistic Sea-Level Projections Earth's Future 5(12)
415	1217–1233 doi: 10.1002/2017EF000663
417	Kuiners Munneke P. Ligtenherg S. R. M. Van Den Broeke M. R. & Vaughan
417	D = G = (2014) Firm air depletion as a precursor of Antarctic ice-shelf collapse
410	Journal of Glaciology 60, 205–214 doi: 10.3189/2014.JoG13.I183
420	Levermann A Winkelmann B Nowicki S Fastook I L Frieler K Creve R
420	Bindschadler B A (2014) Projecting Antarctic ice discharge using re-
421	sponse functions from SeaRISE ice-sheet models Earth System Dunamics
422	5(2) 271–293 doi: 10.5194/esd-5-271-2014
424	Little C M Oppenheimer M & Urban N M (2013) Upper bounds on twonty
424	first-century Antarctic ice loss assessed using a probabilistic framework Nature
425	Climate Change 3(7) 654–659 doi: 10.1038/nclimate1845
427	McMillan M Shenherd A Sundal A Briggs K Muir A Bidout A Wing-
428	ham, D. (2014). Increased ice losses from Antarctica detected by CrvoSat-2.
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,

429	Geophysical Research Letters, 41, 3899–3905. doi: 10.1002/2014GL060111
430	Medley, B., Joughin, I., Smith, B. E., Das, S. B., Steig, E. J., Conway, H.,
431	Leuschen, C. (2014). Constraining the recent mass balance of Pine Island
432	and Thwaites glaciers, West Antarctica, with airborne observations of snow
433	accumulation. The Cryosphere, 8(4), 1375–1392. doi: 10.5194/tc-8-1375-2014
434	Morlighem, M., Rignot, E., Seroussi, H., Larour, E., Dhia, H. B., & Aubry, D.
435	(2011). A mass conservation approach for mapping glacier ice thickness.
436	Geophysical Research Letters, 38. doi: 10.1029/2011GL048659
437	Mouginot, J., Rignot, E., & Scheuchl, B. (2014). Sustained increase in ice discharge
438	from the Amundsen Sea Embayment, West Antarctica, from 1973 to 2013.
439	Geophysical Research Letters, 41, 1576–1584. doi: 10.1002/2013gl059069
440	Murphy, J., Sexton, D., Jenkins, G., Boorman, P., Booth, B., Brown, C., Wood,
441	R. (2009). UK Climate Projections Science Report: Climate change projec-
442	tions. Exeter: Met Office Hadley Centre. Retrieved 2017-05-29, from http://
443	ukclimateprojections.defra.gov.uk/content/view/824/517/index.html
444	Nias, I. J., Cornford, S. L., & Payne, A. J. (2016). Contrasting the modelled sen-
445	sitivity of the Amundsen Sea Embayment ice streams. <i>Journal of Glaciology</i> .
446	62(233), $552-562$, doi: 10.1017/jog.2016.40
447	Nias, I. J., Cornford, S. L., & Payne, A. J. (2018). New mass-conserving bedrock to-
448	pography for Pine Island Glacier impacts simulated decadal rates of mass loss.
449	Geophysical Research Letters, $45(7)$, 3173–3181, doi: 10.1002/2017GL076493
450	Nowicki S & Seroussi H (2018) Projections of Future Sea Level Contributions
450	from the Greenland and Antarctic Ice Sheets: Challenges Beyond Dynamical
452	Ice Sheet Modeling <i>Oceanography</i> 31(2) doi: 10.5670/oceanog.2018.216
452	Pattyn F Favier I. Sun S & Durand G (2017) Progress in Numerical Mod-
455	eling of Antarctic Ice-Sheet Dynamics Current Climate Change Reports 3(3)
455	174–184 doi: 10.1007/s40641-017-0069-7
455	Bignot E Mouginot I & Scheuch B (2011) Ice flow of the Antarctic ice sheet
450	Science 333 1427–1430 doi: 10.1126/science 1208336
457	Bitz C Edwards T L Durand G Payne A I Peyaud V & Hindmarsh
450	B C A (2015) Potential sea-level rise from Antarctic ice-sheet insta-
460	bility constrained by observations Nature 528(7580) 115–118 doi:
461	10.1038/nature16147
462	Robel A A Seroussi H & Roe G H (2019) Marine ice sheet instability am-
463	plifies and skews uncertainty in projections of future sea-level rise. <i>Proceedings</i>
464	of the National Academy of Sciences, 116(30), 14887–14892, doi: 10.1073/pnas
465	.1904822116
466	Ruckert, K. L., Shaffer, G., Pollard, D., Guan, Y., Wong, T. E., Forest, C. E., &
467	Keller, K. (2017). Assessing the Impact of Retreat Mechanisms in a Simple
468	Antarctic Ice Sheet Model Using Bayesian Calibration. PLOS ONE, 12(1).
469	e0170052. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0170052
470	Scheuchl, B., Mouginot, J., Rignot, E., Morlighem, M., & Khazendar, A. (2016).
471	Grounding line retreat of Pope, Smith, and Kohler Glaciers, West Antarctica,
472	measured with Sentinel-1a radar interferometry data. Geophysical Research
473	Letters, 43(16), 2016GL069287. doi: 10.1002/2016GL069287
474	Schlegel, NJ., Seroussi, H., Schodlok, M. P., Larour, E. Y., Boening, C., Limonadi,
475	D., van den Broeke, M. R. (2018). Exploration of Antarctic Ice Sheet
476	100-year contribution to sea level rise and associated model uncertainties
477	using the ISSM framework. The Cryosphere, $12(11)$, $3511-3534$. doi:
478	10.5194/tc-12-3511-2018
479	Seroussi, H., Morlighem, M., Rignot, E., Mouginot, J., Larour, E., Schodlok, M., &
480	Khazendar, A. (2014). Sensitivity of the dynamics of Pine Island Glacier. West
481	Antarctica, to climate forcing for the next 50 years. The Cryosphere, $8(5)$,
482	1699–1710. doi: 10.5194/tc-8-1699-2014
483	Timmermann, R., Beckmann, A., & Hellmer, H. H. (2002). Simulations of ice-ocean

484	dynamics in the Weddell Sea 1. Model configuration and validation. Journal of
485	Geophysical Research, 107(C3). doi: 10.1029/2000JC000741
486	Timmermann, R., & Hellmer, H. H. (2013). Southern Ocean warming and increased
487	ice shelf basal melting in the twenty-first and twenty-second centuries based
488	on coupled ice-ocean finite-element modelling. Ocean Dynamics, 63(9-10),
489	1011–1026. doi: 10.1007/s10236-013-0642-0
490	Trusel, L. D., Frey, K. E., Das, S. B., Karnauskas, K. B., Kuipers Munneke, P., van
491	Meijgaard, E., & van den Broeke, M. R. (2015). Divergent trajectories of
492	Antarctic surface melt under two twenty-first-century climate scenarios. Nature
493	Geoscience, 8(12), 927–932. doi: 10.1038/ngeo2563
494	Tsai, CY., Forest, C. E., & Pollard, D. (2017). Assessing the contribution of inter-
495	nal climate variability to anthropogenic changes in ice sheet volume. Geophysi-
496	cal Research Letters, 44(12), 6261–6268. doi: 10.1002/2017GL073443