International Journal of Francophone Studies Volume 21 Numbers 1&2 © 2018 Intellect Ltd Article. English language. doi: 10.1386/ijfs.21.1&2.9\_1

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

# Depicting French Caribbean migration through *bande dessinée*

Antonia Wimbush Université Paul-Valéry

# Abstract

In the post-war era, Europe relied on Caribbean migration to strengthen its work 1. force, and France was no exception. From 1962 to 1983, 160,000 men and 2. 3. women migrated from Guadeloupe and Martinique to mainland France through 4. the BUMIDOM (Bureau pour le développement des migrations dans les départements d'outre-mer). Technically speaking, these people were not immigrants 5. because they remained in France despite undertaking a transatlantic voyage. 6. 7. However, the experiences of French Caribbeans in metropolitan France are almost 8. always described as experiences of immigration. There is a distinct lack of Frenchlanguage literature that discusses this state-organized migration, in contrast to 9. a relatively large corpus of texts by anglophone authors (such as Sam Selvon) 10. that examines Caribbean migration to the United Kingdom. This article argues 11. that bande dessinée fills the gap in representations of migration through an 12. 13. analysis of Péyi an nou, written by Jessica Oublié and illustrated by Marie-Ange 14. Rousseau in 2017. Drawing on semiotic approaches to bande dessinée advocated by Laurence Grove, the article contends that Péyi an nou has successfully raised 15. 16. the visibility of migration from the French Caribbean, despite failing to make full 17. advantage of the ways in which meaning is conveyed through the interaction of 18. textual and visual layers.

19.

#### 20.

#### 21. Résumé

22. Après la guerre, l'Europe a dépendu de la migration antillaise afin de renfor-23. cer sa main-d'œuvre, et la France faisait pareil. De 1962 à 1983, 160,000 24. hommes et femmes se sont déplacés de la Guadeloupe et de la Martinique vers la 25. France métropolitaine à travers le BUMIDOM (le Bureau pour le développement 26. des migrations dans les départements d'outre-mer). À vrai dire, ces personnes 27. n'étaient pas des immigrés, parce qu'ils sont restés en France, bien qu'ils aient 28. traversé l'Atlantique. Cependant, les expériences des Antillais en France métro-29. politaine se définissent presque toujours comme des expériences de l'immi-30. gration. On voit une lacune importante dans la littérature de langue française 31. qui traite de cette migration organisée par l'état, contrairement à un corpus 32. assez large de textes écrits par des auteurs anglophones (tels que Sam Selvon) 33. qui examinent la migration caribéenne envers le Royaume-Uni. Cet article 34. soutient que la bande dessinée remplit cette lacune-là dans les représentations 35. de la migration antillaise en analysant Péyi an nou (2017), écrit par Jessica 36. Oublié et dessiné par Marie-Ange Rousseau. En se référant aux approches 37.

( )

IJFS 21 (1&2) pp. 9–29 © Intellect Ltd 2018

# **Keywords**

French Caribbean bande dessinée migration BUMIDOM overseas departments (post)colonial history

( )

sémiotiques que préconise Laurence Grove, cet article déduit que Péyi an nou a1.réussi à renforcer la visibilité de la migration antillaise, bien qu'il ait négligé de2.profiter entièrement de la façon dont la matière véhicule du sens à travers l'interac-3.tion entre les couches textuelles et visuelles.4.

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

The 70th anniversary of the arrival of the Windrush generation to Britain 6. in June 1948 – which has sadly been eclipsed by the current legal scandal, 7. in which people from the Caribbean Commonwealth (many of whom are 8. 9. ex-servicemen), who had made Britain their home, are now being deported - has shone a spotlight on other instances of Caribbean migra-10. tion to Europe in the twentieth century. In the French case, approximately 11. 160,000 men and women from the French Caribbean islands were actively 12. 13. recruited, trained and brought to metropolitan France between 1963 and 14. 1982 to work in public services (Lucas 1983: 1). Migration through the 15. BUMIDOM (Bureau du développement des migrations dans les départe-16. ments d'outre-mer) occurred considerably later than migration to Britain; Britain sought workers from its Caribbean islands to plug the gaps in its 17. labour force immediately following Second World War. 18.

This time lapse in Caribbean migration helps to explain the relative lack 19. of canonical French-language literary texts that discuss mass migration from 20. Guadeloupe and Martinique, on the one hand, and the considerable œuvre 21. that addresses similar issues in the anglophone context, on the other. Writing 22. for The Guardian on 25 April 2018, the author Colin Grant selects five impor-23. tant novels that chart the trials and tribulations of the Windrush generation. 24. 25. It is unsurprising that Trinidad-born Sam Selvon's The Lonely Londoners (Selvon 1956) is the first text to feature on the list as Selvon's novel is a 26. pioneering work that offers a realistic portrayal of the lives of West Indian 27. immigrants and that raised his profile as an author significantly (Grant 2018: 28. 29. n.pag.). However, there appear to be no equivalent fictional representations 30. of the BUMIDOM by key French-Caribbean writers. As Malachi McIntosh observes, canonical writers from the French Caribbean, such as Aimé Césaire 31. 32. and Edouard Glissant, did indeed write fictional accounts of their individual experiences of migration, but they had arrived in metropolitan France much 33. 34. earlier than their anglophone counterparts, during the 1920s and the 1930s, 35. and had therefore already established themselves as writers and intellectuals 36. before their arrival (McIntosh 2015: 105). Their literary representations of 37. migration are thus not entirely representative of those who arrived through the BUMIDOM scheme. Migration remains a focal point for younger success-38. 39. ful writers from the French Caribbean, such as Gisèle Pineau and Suzanne Dracius. L'Exil selon Julia (Pineau 1996) is an autobiographical account of 40. Pineau's multiple displacements between Guadeloupe, the African continent 41. and metropolitan France during her childhood, while Martinican Suzanne 42. Dracius has also written extensively about migration between Martinique 43. and the metropole in texts such as L'Autre qui danse (Dracius 1989). These 44. writers have experienced a continuous 'va-et-vient' between the Caribbean 45. islands and metropolitan France for both personal and professional commit-46. ments, a migration both enabled and encouraged by the islands' administra-47. tive frameworks. Yet their migration was not instigated by the BUMIDOM 48. either, but rather by their specific family situation: Pineau followed her father 49. (an officer in the French army) on his military endeavours, while Dracius left 50. Martinique to continue her studies in Paris.

۲

Antonia Wimbush

10

8/28/18 2:19 PM

5.

1. The BUMIDOM, then, remains underrepresented in the French imagi-2. nary, specifically in literature. While there has been a growing academic 3. interest in this state-organized migration in recent years,<sup>1</sup> these articles 4. and monographs are framed by historical and sociological studies, and are 5. thus aimed at an academic, rather than a popular, audience. Documentary 6. films, such as L'Avenir est ailleurs (2006), directed by Antoine Léonard-7. Maestrati, and Bumidom: Des français venus d'outre-mer (2009) by the direc-8. tor Jackie Bastide, are attempting to fill this gap in cultural production 9. about the BUMIDOM. It is doubtful, however, that these documentaries 10. have succeeded in reaching a particularly wide audience either. For 11. instance, L'Avenir est ailleurs was broadcast on the television channel 12. France 0 on 19 December 2013 to coincide with the 50th anniversary of 13. the creation of the BUMIDOM (Tray 2013: n.pag.), but this network's 14. audience is 'destinée et consommé principalement par la population ultra-15. marine de métropole', a relatively small proportion of the population of 16. the Hexagon (France TV 2017: n.pag.). France Ö is in fact reputed to be 17. one of the worst-performing television networks in France; it is thus 18. unlikely that the documentary attracted a large audience. In an attempt to 19. redress this imbalance, more popular forms of cultural production have 20. explored migration from the French Caribbean, targeting a younger, more 21. diverse audience in the metropole and on the islands themselves. The film 22. Le Gang des Antillais (2016), directed by Guadeloupean Jean-Claude Barny, 23. is a thriller charting the struggles of a group of young men migrating 24. through the BUMIDOM and who are driven into a life of crime. It is worth 25. noting that Barny's film career has been dominated by a desire to depict key moments in Guadeloupean history: his debut feature film Nèg marron 26. 27. (Barny 2004) portrays youth violence and delinquency in Guadeloupe in the years preceding the 2009 general strikes that brought life on the 28. 29. islands to a halt, while his later television film Rose et le soldat (Barny 30. 2016) confronts the underexplored role of women in the Guadeloupean 31. Resistance during the Vichy era. As film theorist Charles Eidsvik observes, 32. thrillers are aimed at a young, primarily male audience who have a rela-33. tively low social status and limited access to 'high' culture (Eidsvik 2005: 34. 76); Barny's Le Gang des Antillais thus targets a demographic unlikely to be 35. familiar with the historical details of the BUMIDOM, and who would not 36. tend to opt for the documentary films that had already been broadcast. 37. More recently, the television film Le Rêve français, directed by Christian 38. Faure, was shown on the public French television channel France 2 in two 39. subsequent instalments on 21 and 28 March 2018 and was reviewed for 40. the online television section of *L'Obs* by Maryse Condé, one of the French 41. Caribbean literary greats, on 21 March 2018. Such support gave addi-42. tional cultural capital to the film, which has, in turn, helped to catapult 43. the BUMIDOM into the contemporary French public sphere. 44. This article examines the representation of the BUMIDOM in a differ-45. ent, yet arguably equally accessible and successful, medium: bande dessinée. 46. Péyi an nou (2017), written by Jessica Oublié and illustrated by Marie-Ange Rousseau, narrates Oublié's discovery of her family story as one of migra-47.

48. tion as the narrator-protagonist Jessica learns to her surprise that her
49. grandfather migrated from Guadeloupe to Paris in 1974.<sup>2</sup> His migration
50. was not organized by the BUMIDOM as such – he left of his own accord because the famous Darboussier sugar factory where he worked, now the

۲

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

- 1. See Félix Germain (2016), Decolonizing the Republic: African and Caribbean Migrants in Postwar Paris. 1946-1974: and Sylvain Pattieu (2017), 'The **BUMIDOM** in Paris and its Suburbs: Contradictions in a State Migration Policy, 1960s-1970s', African and Black Diaspora: An International Journal.
- 2. Throughout the article I distinguish between Oublié, the author of *Péyi an nou*, and Jessica, the narrator-protagonist who is creating a *bande dessinée* of her grandfather's life and documenting the BUMIDOM.

( )

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3. 1.

5.

5.

3.

).

).

2

3.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

ł.

5.

5.

).

7. 🎔

3. The Centre caribéen d'expressions et de mémoire de la traite et de l'esclavage was inaugurated on 10 May 2015 by François Hollande in the presence of nineteen other heads of state. The museum houses a permanent exhibition which traces the history of the transatlantic slave trade, in addition to temporary exhibitions about slavery in a global context. See http://memorial-acte. fr/. Accessed 11 June 2018.

site of the slavery commemoration centre Memorial ACTe,<sup>3</sup> was about to 1. 2. close down – but many of his contemporaries did indeed make use of this 3. scheme. Arguing that bande dessinée acts as a site of historical commemo-4. ration, the article questions the success of Péyi an nou in bringing recent 5. Caribbean history to a younger, more diverse audience and to write the stories of those overlooked both by current francophone cultural produc-6. tion and by scholarship. Engaging with the considerable research on fran-7. cophone bande dessinée, the central argument of this article is that while 8. 9. *Péyi an nou* should be praised for raising awareness of the BUMIDOM across 10. the Francosphere, it fails to exploit fully the potential of the medium in depicting the entire range of experiences of twentieth-century Caribbean 11. migration. 12.

# 13. 14.

( )

#### BUMIDOM: 'L'instrument de la déportation'?

15. The post-war period was particularly turbulent for France's former colo-16. nies in the Caribbean, where rising birth rates and a growing unemploy-17. ment rate were exerting increasing pressure on resources on the islands. While Alain Anselin refutes the claim that population growth in the 18. Caribbean was becoming uncontrollable – he notes that in Martinique, 19. 20. the birth rate actually declined by 8 per cent between 1954 and 1968 21. (Anselin 1979: 77) – the population was certainly growing at a much faster rate than in mainland France. Furthermore, the islands were experi-22. encing rapid economic decline due to the collapse of the sugar cane indus-23. 24. try, on which the islands were almost exclusively dependent; more modern 25. and efficient machinery on the plantations, coupled with the development of the refinement process in mainland France, 'meant that the capacity of 26. the sugar industry to employ the Caribbean population declined, even as 27. the population increased', as Margaret Byron and Stephanie Condon point 28. 29. out (2008: 26). Poverty, unemployment and a lack of opportunities were 30. all contributing factors to the increasingly tense political situation. 31. Martinique and Guadeloupe had been converted from French colonies to 32. French overseas departments via the loi de la départementalisation, which was passed on 19 March 1946, a law that, in H. Adlai Murdoch's terms, 33. 34. 'paradoxically drew these territories further into the ambit of the metro-35. pole instead of expanding their capacity for self-determination' (Adlai 36. Murdoch 2001: 132). In other words, the islands remained economically 37. and politically dependent on the metropole. Writing the politically charged Le Discours antillais (1981) 35 years later, Glissant perceives departmen-38. 39. talization as a continuation of colonial domination because the islands remain trapped (and many believe this is still the case today) by 'une des 40. formes les plus pernicieuses de colonisation: celle par quoi on assimule une 41. communauté' (original emphasis) (Glissant 1981: 15). Such disenchant-42. ment with the political system in the French Caribbean led to a growing 43. threat of rebellion on the islands, particularly among the youth, and the 44. French government feared that the French Caribbean population would 45. 46. demand outright independence from France. It must be remembered that by the early 1960s, France had already lost many of its African and Asian 47. colonies, and was in the midst of a bloody war to attempt to maintain 48. control over Algeria; it simply could not afford to lose its Caribbean 49. 50. territories too.

( )

12

8/28/18 2:19 PM

( )

1. Meanwhile, metropolitan France was in desperate need of a work force 2. during the economic boom of the *Trente Glorieuses*. In the wake of Second 3. World War, France preferred to encourage European labourers to rebuild 4. the infrastructure that had been damaged or destroyed. As Klaus J. Bade 5. notes, European workers were split into three groups according to how 6. easily it was perceived that they could assimilate into French society. The 7. first group included those from the Benelux countries, Switzerland, 8. Germany, Ireland and Britain; the second from Italy, Spain and Portugal; 9. and the third from Poland, Slovakia and former Czechoslovakia (Bade 10. 2003: 248). Yet by the late 1950s, France had lost many of these workers 11. because the country could no longer compete with the attractive working 12. conditions in Germany and Switzerland. France was then forced to recruit 13. labourers from its former colonies, first from the Maghreb and Sub-Saharan 14. Africa, and then from the Caribbean. On 26 April 1963, Michel Debré, 15. former prime minister under Charles de Gaulle from 1959 to 1962 and 16. elected 'député' in Réunion in May 1963, implemented the BUMIDOM 17.scheme, targeting young people to come to France to work in the public 18. sector. One of the most striking aspects of the project was its gendered 19. nature. While initially ten times as many men arrived through the scheme 20. as women, by the end of the 1960s, men and women were arriving in 21. almost equal numbers (Condon and Ogden 1991: 515). In fact, female 22. migration was actively encouraged for both demographic and moral 23. reasons: it was hoped that women would transmit more 'modern' family 24. values that they had learnt in the metropole once they returned to the Caribbean, in addition to contributing to a decline in the birth rate. As 25. 26. Kristen Stromberg Childers explains, however, such emigration schemes 27. meant splitting up families, which 'undermined the French insistence on 28. family as the cornerstone for social and economic development in the 29. Antilles' (Childers 2016: 177). 30. Before being accepted onto the scheme, aspiring migrants had to 31. undergo a physical examination and were obliged to sit language assess-32. ments and personality tests to verify that they would easily integrate into 33. metropolitan French life. They were then given a one-way plane ticket 34. paid for by the French state; the BUMIDOM office negotiated with Air 35. France to obtain a discounted rate, and so inevitably some made use of 36. the scheme with the sole purpose of benefitting from this discount (Goosen 37. 1976: 48). On their arrival, a small proportion were given a job immedi-

37. 1976: 48). On their arrival, a small proportion were given a job immedi-38. ately in construction, transportation and public services depending on 39. their capabilities and previous employment experience. Others were sent 40. to training centres, where they learnt to become metropolitan French citi-41. zens. In a move eerily reminiscent of the gender division at work in the 42. transatlantic slave trade, men and women were separated – the women 43. were sent to Crouy-sur-Ourcq in Île-de-France, where they learnt how to 44. cook French dishes, how to take public transport and how to run a house-45. hold using 'modern' domestic appliances, while the men were divided 46. between Simandres (Rhône) and Marseille, where they were taught trades 47. such as carpentry and plumbing (Condon 2004: 135). Once their training 48. was complete, many received no further assistance from the BUMIDOM; 49. others (women) were placed in domestic roles working for large house-50. holds, predominantly in the Parisian region. Indeed, Anselin has rather

۲

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

5.

7.

).

).

2.

3. 1.

5.

7

3.

).

).

2.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

4. It is beyond the scope of this article to consider in detail terminological and generic differences between comics. graphic narratives and bandes dessinées. and to trace the history of these media. See Scott McCloud (1993), Understanding Comics: The Invisible Art; and Robert S. Petersen (2011), Comics, Manga, and Graphic Novels: A History of Graphic Narratives.

flippantly defined Paris as 'la troisième île' of the French Caribbean, so1.large was the population arriving through the BUMIDOM and making2.Paris their permanent home (Anselin 1990: 8). By the beginning of the3.1980s, the French economy had begun to stall, due, in large part, to the4.1973 oil crisis. The Agence nationale pour l'insertion et la promotion des5.travailleurs d'outre-mer (ANT) was thus set up, and family reunification6.was favoured over the recruitment of new workers.7.

( )

8. The consequences of this state-organized migration scheme on the 9. French Caribbean population were complex. For some, the BUMIDOM was 10. an opportunity for social promotion: men who had been out of work were 11. suddenly granted greater economic stability and regained their purpose in life, while women who previously had enjoyed little independence were 12. 13. suddenly able to earn a living. Indeed, as Childers remarks, many women 14. 'interpreted the journey in gendered terms that had nothing to do either 15. with "social promotion" or neocolonialist exploitation but was rather a 16. chance to live a life that was less dependent on men' (Childers 2016: 17. 187–88); it must be noted, however, that gender discrimination was as rife in metropolitan France as it was in the overseas departments, and that 18. women's roles continued to revolve around the domestic sphere for the 19. 20. most part. In contrast, for others, migration failed to improve their quality 21. of life. The scheme wrenched them from their families, bringing them to the metropole, where they were frequently considered second-class citi-22. zens because of the colour of their skin - despite the fact that they were 23. French citizens too, and thus had the same right to access French services, 24. 25. training, housing and employment as everyone else. Those who remained in the French Caribbean also took offense at this project, regarding the 26. scheme as a threat to the traditional Antillean way of life. As Goosen 27. remarks, there were strong tensions between the French Caribbean popu-28. 29. lation, who sought to preserve their indigenous culture, and the French 30. who dismissed this culture as 'both primitive and bastardized, and an 31. impediment to "evolution" (Goosen 1976: 50). Such a stance was corrob-32. orated by Césaire, who famously denounced the BUMIDOM as 'l'instrument de la déportation' in an article for Présence Africaine (1961: 110), recalling 33. 34. through this loaded phrase the mass deportations of Jews in the Holocaust 35. and thus drawing parallels between these two historical moments. Despite 36. the state rhetoric promoting the BUMIDOM as a means to elevate the 37. social status of the Caribbean population, then, the lived experience of the participants did not tend to support this claim. For many, migration simply 38. 39. equated to exploitation.

#### Migration and *bande dessinée*: A Caribbean case study

( )

*Péyi an nou* lies within an increasingly dominant literary trend in France: 42. the *bande dessinée* has become a veritable institution in the Hexagon. The 43. term is frequently abbreviated to 'BD' and refers to French-language 44. comics. Mark McKinney notes that the French term is preferable to the 45. English 'comics' because it 'contains no suggestion that the material is 46. comic or funny', while simultaneously drawing attention to the format, 47. style and sequentiality of this medium (2008: xiii).<sup>4</sup> Labelled 'the ninth 48. art' in praise of its innovative and creative aesthetic qualities, its national 49. festival in Angoulême - which began in 1973 - draws hundreds of 50.

14

8/28/18 2:19 PM

40.

41.

( )

1. thousands of bande dessinée fans from across the world each year to cele-2. brate the newest additions of this art form. French state subsidies have 3. helped to cement the international reputation of the medium: in 1982, 4. the socialist president François Mitterand announced the creation of the 5. Centre national de la bande dessinée et de l'image (CNBDI), opened in 6. Angoulême in 1990 and built in Mitterand's trademark style of expansive 7. open glass (like the Louvre's pyramid), to assert 'France's aspirations for 8. the future to the rest of the world' (McQuillan 2005: 11). Becoming the 9. Cité internationale de la bande dessinée et de l'image in 2008, the centre 10. now houses a specialist library, a cinema and the Musée de la Bande 11. Dessinée. The museum has been designated a 'Musée de France', meaning 12. that the *bande dessinée* industry continues to benefit from financial support 13. from the government– importantly, this appellation puts the museum in 14. the same category as other key cultural centres in France, such as the 15. Louvre, further revealing just how greatly *bande dessinée* is revered as an 16. art form in France.<sup>5</sup> 17. The francophone *bande dessinée*, which has long been a focal point of 18. French-language scholarship, is becoming a growing field of interest 19. within the discipline of French Studies in the anglophone academy. Works 20. such as Ann Miller's Reading Bande Dessinée: Critical Approaches to French-21. language Comic Strip (2007) and Laurence Grove's Comics in French: The 22. European Bande Dessinée in Context (2010) provide a general overview and 23. offer possible theoretical frameworks with which to interpret the medium, 24. while McKinney's edited volume History and Politics in French-Language *Comics and Graphic Novels* (2008) interrogates the ways in which traumatic 25. 26. historical events are represented in *bande dessinée*. In addition, *The* 27. Francophone Bande Dessinée (2005), edited by Charles Forsdick, Laurence 28. Grove and Libbie McQuillan, positions bande dessinée history and reception 29. within a broader francophone context. To date, however, there has been 30. very little scholarship regarding the depiction of migration in bande dessi-31. née, despite the proliferation of sources that portray migration both in 32. very personal terms – such as Aurélia Aurita's Je ne verrai pas Okinawa 33. (2008), an autobiographical narrative exploring the French bédéiste's 34. administrative struggles when attempting to settle in Japan, a migration 35. that speaks to an elevated social class but that is important nonetheless – 36. and within a very specific historical context. Amongst many other recent 37. examples of *bandes dessinées* belonging to the latter category, *Les Lính Tho*, 38. immigrés de force: Mémoires de Viet Kieu (2017), written by Pierre Daum

39. and Clément Baloup and prefaced by the prolific scholar of colonial history
40. Benjamin Stora, stands out for its powerful narration of the forced migra41. tion of Vietnamese men who worked in appalling conditions in labour
42. camps in France during the Second World War. The fact that the Musée
43. national de l'histoire de l'immigration in Paris has prepared a touring
44. exhibition entitled 'Bande dessinée et immigrations, un siècle d'histoire(s)',
45. which is touring France between September 2015 and September 2020, is
46. further evidence of this intrinsic connection between the theme of migra47. tion and the *bande dessinée*, but that is yet to be fully explored in franco48. phone scholarship.<sup>6</sup> Furthermore, in the catalogue to 'Albums, des histoires
49. dessinées entre ici et ailleurs: bande dessinée et immigration 1913–2013',
50. a previous exhibition at the museum that ran between 16 October 2013

۲

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

15

)

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2.

3. 1.

5.

5.

3.

).

).

L.

2

3.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

ł.

5.

5.

7.

).

7. 🎔

The website of the Ministère de la Culture details the criteria required to benefit from such state support and offers an interactive map of the 1119 institutions currently sponsored by the French government: http://www. culture.gouv.fr/ Aides-demarches/ Protections-labelset-appellations/ Appellation-Museede-France#carte. Accessed 22 May 2018.

5.

 http://www.histoireimmigration.fr/ la-museographie/lesexpositions-itinerantes/ bande-dessinee-etimmigrations-unsiecle-d-histoires Accessed 22 May 2018.

 http://www.histoireimmigration.fr/ musee-numerique/expositions-temporaires/ albums-bande-dessinee-et-immigration-1913-2013. Accessed 6 June 2018. and 27 April 2014,7 Vincent Marie and Gilles Ollivier attribute the inter-1. 2. action between *bande dessinée* and migration to the 'circulation des artistes' 3. across continents (Marie and Ollivier 2013: 6), and the rest of the cata-4. logue traces the history of migration as represented in graphic narratives 5. in different locations. What is missing, however, is a sustained focus on the relationship between the formal characteristics of bande dessinée and repre-6. sentations of migration. One of the broader aims of this article, then, is to 7. 8. redress this imbalance between contemporary, popular French-language 9. cultural production and the academy.

According to Hillary Shute, *bande dessinée* is the medium par excellence 10. for the transmission of traumatic historical events. As she explains: 11.

the compounding of word and image has led to new possibilities for writing history that combine formal experimentation with an appeal to mass readerships. Graphic narrative suggests that historical accuracy is not the opposite of creative invention; the problematics of what we consider fact and fiction are made apparent by drawing. Comics is a structurally layered and doubled medium that can proliferate historical moments on the page.

(Shute 2008: 459) 19.

12. 13.

14.

15.

16.

17.

18.

20.

✐

In other words, Shute argues that the juxtaposition of text and image 21. 22. highlights the slippery nature of fact and fiction, and while it is an accessible medium for younger and older audiences alike, it conceals a complex-23. 24. ity that is highly appropriate for the depiction of important historical 25. episodes. Extending Shute's argument further, I contend that the formal characteristics of bande dessinée mean that the medium is particularly suit-26. able for the depiction of migration. Its accessibility, coupled with its use of 27. often poignant images, enables a reader to empathize with the struggles of 28. 29. the characters, while the reader's rapid movement through the story 30. mirrors the fictional journey undertaken. Moreover, the spatial and temporal limitations of the medium force the writer and/or illustrator to use 31. 32. effective and realistic methods of story-telling to communicate a theme that is simultaneously a collective, shared experience, and a very personal, 33. 34. individual decision, with its own particularities and idiosyncrasies.

35. So how is Caribbean migration via the BUMIDOM depicted in Péyi an 36. *nou?* Peritextual information on the front and back covers already sets up the stark distinction between Guadeloupe and Paris that will span the 37. œuvre. Miller enumerates five different types of text within the bande dessi-38. 39. *née*, each displaying a greater or a lesser relationship with the image: the peritext; the récitatif, or narrative voice-over; the dialogue itself; sound 40. effects; and text existing in the fictional realm (Miller 2007: 97). While for 41. Miller, the covers and fly leaves remain 'outside the fiction' (Miller 2007: 42. 97), I argue that they nevertheless require detailed analysis because they 43. constitute the first confrontation that the reader has with the text. 44. 45. Significantly, the title 'Péyi an nou' (meaning 'our country') is written in Creole and is never translated into French in the text, despite the numer-46. ous explanations of Creole idioms, food items and culturally specific refer-47. ences added by the author to the text itself to aid comprehension for a 48. 49. metropolitan readership. This choice of language, coupled with the seman-50. tic connotation of the title in terms of ownership of the French Caribbean

( )

8/28/18 2:19 PM

islands (which, of course, are not independent countries but part of 1. 2. France), suggests a desire on the part of the authors for the islands to claim 3. political agency. It also implies a will to give value to the Antillean Creole 4. language and by extension, to foreground the oft-underexplored history 5. and culture of the French Caribbean – a region that politically is included 6. in the idea of the nation-space, but that frequently falls beyond national 7. rhetoric. The title of the book and the names of the authors, written in the 8. same type-setting as the rest of the narrative, appear in relatively small 9. font at the top of the front cover to frame the image as the focal point. The 10. reader's eves are drawn to the sparkling, turquoise sea, in which is reflected 11. a tropical palm tree, depicting an idyllic picture-postcard. Footprints are 12. superimposed on the empty expanse of sand in the foreground, represent-13. ing people leaving the islands; in the background, under a grey, gloomy 14. sky, is an imagined version of Paris. The Eiffel Tower dominates the scene, 15. with other emblematic Parisian monuments also represented, and the 16. tricolour flag flies proudly from the Arc de Triomphe. Such a scene, while 17.attempting to draw attention to the divergences between two locations 18. belonging to the same nation, and thereby highlighting the struggles of 19. those migrating between these spaces, actually reinforces the stereotypes 20. that it seeks to undo. By depicting the French Caribbean as a tropical para-21. dise, and Paris as a historical and cultural metropolis, the image overlooks 22. the nuances and complexities of both locations. As this article will later 23. argue, the tendency to rely on stereotypes and generalizations undermines 24. somewhat the laudable intentions of the authors to bring a range of 25. perspectives and experiences of Caribbean migration to the fore.

26. The contrast in landscape between metropolitan France and the 27. Caribbean spills over onto the back cover, which also provides a synopsis of 28. the text. Interestingly, the term *bande dessinée* is not used to describe the text 29. here, although the choice of artistic medium in which to depict the 30. BUMIDOM is certainly a deliberate one. In an interview in March 2018 for 31. Le Français dans le monde, a bi-monthly magazine aimed at teachers and 32. students of French as a foreign language, Oublié explained that the medium 33. enabled her to tell the stories of migration 'dans une certaine fidélité de 34. propos, d'émotions, de carnation' (in Oublié and Magnier 2018: 64).<sup>8</sup> For 35. Oublié, bande dessinée transmits through the interplay of text and image the 36. raw emotion of those who were frequently excluded from a country that 37. was their own, and is faithful to the range of affective experiences of each 38. migrant. However, the absence of such an explanation on the back cover 39. suggests that the creators seek to place emphasis within the space of the 40. text itself on the historical and sociological content and provide the text 41. with legitimacy, rather than dwelling here on formal techniques. What is 42. also unclear from the back cover is the intended audience of *Péyi an nou*: 43. does the text seek to educate a metropolitan readership about an impor-44. tant, yet misunderstood part of French history, or does it aim to pay 45. homage to those who actually made their journey themselves? Is it prob-46. lematic to even make such a distinction in readership, given the legal status 47. of the French Caribbean population as French citizens? The blurb posits the 48. text as both 'une enquête pour comprendre la politique et le fonctionne-49. ment du BUMIDOM, ses répercussions, son héritage [...] et un hommage à 50. ces Français contraints à l'exil dans un pays qu'ils pensaient être le leur, la

۲

8. The pedagogical aspect of *Péyi an nou* operates here on two levels: the bande dessinée itself is informative and educational, and the interview about the text appears in a resource to teach the French language to foreign learners.

Depicting French Caribbean migration through *bande dessinée* 

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2.

3. 1. 5.

5.

3.

).

).

2.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

ł.

5.

5.

).

7. 🎔

 $( \mathbf{\Phi} )$ 

- http://steinkis.com/ les-editions-steinkis-2. html. Accessed 23 May 2018.
- 10. No information is available on the project blog or on the museum's website that explains why the museum logo appears on the back cover. It is clear, however, that the authors have collaborated with the museum. On 11 February 2018, Oublié participated in 'Littexil'. a literary festival centered around the themes of exile and migration and featuring celebrated contemporary francophone writers. such as Ananda Devi and Linda Lê. See http://www.histoireimmigration.fr/ agenda/2018-01/littexil. Accessed 2 June 2018.
- 11. Françoise Ega was born in 1920 in Martinique and moved to Marseille in 1956. Initially the target of racial discrimination, she set up sports and cultural organizations to help others from the overseas departments to settle in France, L'Amicale des travailleurs antillais et guyanais (AMITAG) was created in 1964. The extract taken from Le Temps des Madras (1966), her only novel published during her lifetime, recounts the young child's amazement at seeing huge boats transporting people across the Atlantic.

France' (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: back cover). This explanation suggests 1. 2. that the primary readership that Oublié and Rousseau target is in fact the 3. population who experienced the BUMIDOM, and their descendants who 4. witnessed its long-lasting consequences first-hand; yet the accessible but 5. highly detailed historical information implies that the text is more likely aimed at a metropolitan audience unfamiliar with the BUMIDOM scheme. 6. While it is habitual for any text to have multiple readerships, the ambiguity 7. created here means that neither audience is left fully satisfied. 8.

9. Oublié and Rousseau's desire to create an accessible text is mirrored in their choice of publisher. Steinkis is not a publishing house that specializes 10. exclusively in the publication of *bande dessinée*; the independent company 11. in fact publishes work in a range of media, including magazines and chil-12. 13. dren's books in addition to cartoons. According to the mission statement 14. on the company's website, the commonality of the works published is that 15. they are all 'livres accessibles et stimulants autour du thème de la relation 16. à l'Autre'.<sup>9</sup> Such a choice of publisher reinforces the argument that despite 17. Oublié and Rousseau's claims, the text is pitched at a readership unfamiliar with the theme of Caribbean migration, which is likely to be a young. 18. metropolitan audience, while the series' focus on 'l'Autre' problematically 19. 20. 'others' the Caribbean community in racial terms from the rest of the 21. French population. The fact that the logo of the Musée national de 22. l'histoire de l'immigration features on the back cover – implying some degree of state endorsement or financial assistance<sup>10</sup> and granting the text 23. 24. greater cultural and political capital – also posits Péyi an nou as a peda-25. gogical tool rather than a testimonial narrative.

Yet Péyi an nou is clearly also a very personal project, particularly for 26. Oublié, who uses the medium of bande dessinée to document her maternal 27. family history. Following an extract from Martinican author and social 28. 29. activist Françoise Ega's récit d'enfance Le Temps des madras (Ega 1966) that 30. operates as the epigraph to the text and positions it, like Ega's writing, as a form of political intervention,<sup>11</sup> Oublié writes a dedication to her grand-31. 32. parents Somène and Paul (Oublié and Rousseau 2008: 2). The narratorprotagonist Jessica is saddened to learn that her grandfather has been 33. 34. diagnosed with prostate cancer; he comes to visit the family in Paris, and 35. they both realize that they know very little about each other. This realiza-36. tion is illustrated pertinently by cartoon maps of Guadeloupe and metro-37. politan France cut out like jigsaw pieces, indicating that the psychological distance between the two characters is much greater than the 6761 kilo-38. 39. metres that separate the two lands (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 5). Jessica 40. proposes that she visits Guadeloupe in the summer to write his story. The rest of the text is thus a *mise en abyme* of the process that Oublié and 41. Rousseau undertake to create Péyi an nou, interspersing personal testimo-42. 43. nies of friends of her grandparents who migrated to mainland France in 44. the 1960s and the 1970s with interviews with historians and academics who specialize in twentieth-century Caribbean migration. In this way, Péyi 45. 46. an nou demonstrates some overlaps with 'bande dessinée de rapportage', an investigative sub-genre that, in Miller's view, 'has come to take a promi-47. nent place in contemporary bande dessinée' (Miller 2008: 97). The histori-48. 49. cal detail is separated from the narrative thread (the creation of *Péyi an* 50. *nou*) by the general colour scheme: images referring to the historical

Antonia Wimbush

(

1. context appear in subdued pink and green tones, whereas the main action 2. is illustrated in a range of brighter colours. 3. Péyi an nou displays many positive qualities in its depiction of French 4. Caribbean migration. For instance, the reader becomes invested in the 5. history of the BUMIDOM through the text's (auto)biographical features. 6. At the beginning of the *bande dessinée*, we meet Jessica's Guadeloupean 7. family and witness an everyday family gathering, through which each 8. individual's perspective on migration becomes clear (Oublié and Rousseau 9. 2017: 10–11). Generational differences are evident in this rather tense 10. argument: Jessica's cousin observes that 'c'était une chance de pouvoir 11. partir' because those who left gained greater economic stability and inde-12. pendence, while her uncle Wali angrily retorts that the islands could have 13. offered the youth of the 1960s a promising future too (Oublié and 14. Rousseau 2017: 10). The symmetrical layout of this particular *planche* is 15. worth noting. The *planche* is composed of three *bandes*, in turn composed 16. of a single horizontal *case*, which is not enclosed by a border, or *cadrage*. It 17.is therefore easy to understand at first glance the progression of the action, 18. and to trace how conversation during the family meal quickly escalates 19. into an argument. In the final image, Jessica is placed in the emphatic 20. position in the right-hand corner of the planche; her confusion and bewil-21. derment are thus particularly noticeable and are further emphasized by 22. the interrogation mark and exclamation mark in the *bulle* above her head. 23. She simply does not understand the conversation because she has no prior knowledge of her family history or of the broader social context of the 24. 25. French Caribbean islands in the years before she was born. 26. A further success of the project is the diverse range of voices and

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

27. perspectives that it features, thus adhering to Miller's definition of investi-28. gative bande dessinée, a genre characterized by its 'plurivocality' through its 29. use of dialogue and gesture alongside the main narrative voice-over (Miller 30. 2008: 111). Evidently, the experiences of those who left Guadeloupe and 31. Martinique through the BUMIDOM between 1963 and 1982 are fore-32. grounded in the bande dessinée. However, Oublié and Rousseau are also 33. keen to narrate other stories of people who were affected by the BUMIDOM 34. in a myriad of ways. Among many others, they interview Oublié's grand-35. mother Somène, who stayed behind in Guadeloupe to bring up her nine 36. children on her own (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 140-57); a lady called 37. Nadia who worked at the training centre in Crouy-sur-Ourcq as a secre-38. tary and later as a French and Mathematics teacher (Oublié and Rousseau 39. 2017: 172–77); and even a woman (who wished to remain anonymous) 40. who employed young girls migrating through the BUMIDOM to work as 41. nannies and cleaners (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 178–79). Such a vari-42. ety of standpoints ensures that the account is both balanced and objective, 43. inciting the reader to trust the historical accuracy of the bande dessinée 44. (even though neither Oublié nor Rousseau have previous academic exper-45. tise in this area). In addition, the intersection between gender and migra-46. tion (an important element of the BUMIDOM project) is taken into account 47. in Chapter 12, which features an interview with Stéphanie Condon, 48. research fellow at the Institut national d'études démographiques in Paris 49. (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 158–63). Condon explains how opportunities 50. for Guadeloupeans and Martinicans were gendered even once they had

۲

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

5.

5.

7.

).

).

2

3. 1.

5.

7

3.

).

).

2.

1. 5.

3.

).

).

2

 $( \mathbf{\Phi} )$ 

arrived in metropolitan France: 'l'orientation des migrants du Bumidom 1. 2. était d'ailleurs organisée de manière sexuée' (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 3. 161). Somewhat problematically, though, the illustration that accompa-4. nies this pertinent comment perpetuates the same gender stereotypes that 5. Condon is criticizing because roles that were aimed at women, represented by an image of a syringe and a baby's nappy, are surrounded by a pink 6. background; in contrast, 'masculine roles', represented by a car tyre, an 7. envelope and a spade, are placed in a blue background (Oublié and 8. 9. Rousseau 2017: 161). Accepting Grove's definition of bande dessinée as 'the 10. interaction of text and image' that together form 'a coherent whole' (Grove 11. 2010: 17), Condon's expertise as demonstrated in the textual layer is undermined by the stereotypical colours used by Oublié and Rousseau to 12. denote the two genders. In this particular case, the authors do not seem to 13. 14. engage fully with the ways in which bande dessinée creates meaning 15. through the composition of both the textual and pictorial layers.

16. A broader criticism of the portrayal of Caribbean migration lies in the structure of the text. Péyi an nou is organized around the creation of the 17. bande dessinée itself. It is therefore a chronological account of the people 18. Oublié and Rousseau meet, whose personal stories and historical knowl-19. 20. edge appear in the text in the order in which Oublié and Rousseau encoun-21. ter them. The narrative time, then, matches the development of Oublié and Rousseau's creative journey. Such a chronological, rather than thematic, 22. 23. approach does mean that at times the text is rather repetitive. Information from scholars and activists, such as Philippe Pierre-Charles, founding 24. 25. member of the Groupe Révolution Socialiste in Martinique (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 76-93) and Ary Broussillon, sociologist and political 26. activist (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 94-109), overlaps considerably, and 27. some of the detail, while useful contextual material about the creation of 28. 29. student associations and trade unions on the islands, is not strictly relevant 30. to the topic under study. In addition, the *mise en abyme* of creating a *bande* 31. dessinée within a bande dessinée poses some problem. On the one hand, this 32. structural device ensures that the text is accessible because the authors are learning about the BUMIDOM alongside the reader. Oublié and Rousseau 33. 34. position themselves at the same level as the reader; they are not experts themselves, and at the point of departure, they possess the same degree of 35. 36. knowledge about French Caribbean migration as their intended audience. 37. The authors and readers thus depart on a quest for knowledge together. On the other hand, though, at times Jessica's ignorance appears rather patron-38. 39. izing and forced. It seems unlikely that, as a young woman of Guadeloupean 40. descent, whose extended family still live in Guadeloupe, she would have no knowledge of why her grandfather migrated to mainland France, or why 41. her family are still divided across the Atlantic. The protagonist's lack of 42. knowledge about her Caribbean heritage seems unrealistic, and it is likely 43. 44. to irritate an adult audience who would expect her to possess a certain 45. degree of prior knowledge about her family heritage.

#### Testimonial narratives and archival sources in *Péyi an nou*

()

While the narrator-protagonist Jessica embarks on the *bande dessinée* 48. project to restore the memory of her family history for her dying grandfather, the author's broader aims lie in the preservation of individual 50.

Antonia Wimbush

46.

47.

 $( \mathbf{\Phi} )$ 

1. testimonies of Caribbean migration. In an interview given by both Oublié 2. and Rousseau for the French overseas television channel La Première on 3. 15 November 2017, Oublié remarks that 'le plus touchant, c'est de pouvoir 4. redonner de la voix à des gens qui pendant longtemps ont vécu dans le 5. silence'. Rousseau makes a similar comment during this television inter-6. view: she explains that the people they encountered during their research 7. are 'des anonymes, mais auxquels on arrive à réinsérer dans une vie, une 8. trajectoire, un patronyme'.12 From this paratextual material, then, it would 9. seem that the individual testimonies of migration from the French 10. Caribbean islands to mainland France take precedence over the narrato-11. rial commentary, and that the ultimate aim of Péyi an nou is to give a voice 12. to those people who have not previously had the opportunity to tell their 13. stories, which are frequently (although not exclusively) tales of racism, 14. exclusion and isolation.

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

15. However, the way in which these personal testimonies are integrated 16. into the *bande dessinée* is highly problematic. It is never clear whether the 17. individuals are telling their own stories themselves, or whether their expe-18. riences are mediated through the voice of the narrator Jessica, and of 19. course through Oublié's own authorial voice. If the latter is true, then the 20. aims of the entire project are undermined because the French Caribbean 21. community is still being denied the means to express their own stories of 22. migration themselves; this, in turn, throws up ethical considerations 23. regarding power and representation.

24. An example of this blurring between the narratorial voice and the voice 25. of the characters occurs in Chapter 5, a chapter dedicated to the story of 26. Edouard. In the *récitatif*, Jessica explains that the creators of the *bande* 27. dessinée had succeeded in contacting Édouard via Facebook after reaching 28. out to potential witnesses on social media (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 66); 29. however, the reader is never told his full name or his personal details, and so 30. is unsure whether Edouard is a pseudonym or not. This lack of personal 31. information means that the case study loses its emotional potency, although 32. it does provide an indication of the huge scale of migration from the 33. Caribbean to the metropole in the mid-twentieth century because the char-34. acter of Édouard is merely a representative of a much larger phenomenon. 35. In this way, the universality of migration is emphasized since Edouard's tale 36. is replicated by thousands of others with different names but similar stories. 37. Just before Jessica speaks to Edouard on the phone, two large, vertical *bandes* 38. of equal size are placed side by side and separated by a thin gutter space: 39. one representing Paris (where Jessica is located) and the other depicting 40. Édouard's home in Rivière Salée, a small rural commune in Martinique 41. (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 65). The two stereotypical images are almost 42. complete opposites of each other. Paris is depicted in subdued tones; a large, 43. modern apartment takes up the majority of the image and cars are parked 44. outside, symbolizing modernity and economic progress. Martinique, mean-45. while, is portrayed in much brighter colours. A small, traditional Antillean 46. house is overshadowed by lush, tropical vegetation, illuminated by the spar-47. kling sun. Such an idealized image of a tropical paradise perpetuates the 48. exoticization of the French Caribbean, while the lack of vehicles implies that 49. the island is less economically advanced than metropolitan France. Edouard 50. then proceeds to explain how he crossed the Atlantic on the famous

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

12. An online article for France TV about this interview can be found here: https:// lalere.francetvinfo. fr/peyi-an-nouroman-graphiquebumidom-532573. html. Accessed 1 June 2018 (my transcript).

ŧ.

5. 5.

7.

3.

).

).

2.

3. 1. 5.

5.

3.

).

).

2. 3.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2.

ł.

5.

5.

).

7. 🏵

21

 $( \mathbf{\Phi} )$ 

13. The Colombie was built in 1931 and was used to transport goods and passengers between Le Havre, Fort-de-France and Point-à-Pitre. During the Second World War, it was used as a hospital ship for the United States. Between 1950 and 1970, the ship continued to carry passengers migrat ing through the BUMIDOM from the French Caribbean to mainland France.

Colombie ocean liner<sup>13</sup> and arrived in Le Havre, how he trained as a builder 1. at the BUMIDOM training centre in Toulon and how he succeeded in inte-2. 3. grating both professionally and socially in mainland France (Oublié and 4. Rousseau 2017: 66–72). Yet there is only one image that depicts Édouard 5. speaking on the phone to Jessica, his words featuring in a speech bubble (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 66); the text for the remainder of this section is 6. not enclosed in individual cases but appears underneath each image. There 7. 8. is no punctuation or reference note that attributes this text to Edouard, and 9. therefore it is unclear whether these are his exact words, or whether, in the process of creating the bande dessinée, Oublié has modified and adapted them 10. to suit the purpose of the text. Furthermore, a note is added in French to 11. explain a specific term that he uses in Creole ('travay an bitasyon', meaning 12. 13. working on the sugar cane plantations) (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 68); 14. has the author added this note or does it belong to Edouard? It is most likely 15. that Oublié incorporated it after the interview, but did the interviewee give 16. permission for his culturally specific speech to be glossed in this way? Jessica 17. only appears in one image in this section, holding a pen and paper and a dictation device (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 68); these recording tools 18. 19. imply that Edouard's story in the text is a faithful representation of his real-20. life experiences, but the reader has no way of knowing whether they have 21. been manipulated in some way by the author. By rendering the accuracy of this personal testimony ambiguous, *Péyi an nou* not only removes the agency 22. 23. of the very people it aims to empower, but also weakens the power of these 24. individual stories that could have the potential to be important tools for the 25. transmission of (traumatic) memory. In Pour un neuvième art: La bande dessinée (1971), Francis Lacassin reflects on the medium's aptitude for providing 26. a space for individuals to offer their own testimonies. Lacassin writes: '[p]lus 27. 28. importante est encore leur aptitude au témoignage. Destinées à la masse et 29. reflétant ses préoccupations, souvent en prise très étroite avec la réalité, [les 30. bandes dessinées] jouent le rôle d'un miroir qui conserverait indéfiniment 31. les images qu'il reflète' (Lacassin 1971: 340). Given that it is unclear in Péyi 32. an nou exactly to whom these personal testimonies belong, the mirrored image of reality that they provide about migration from the French 33. 34. Caribbean islands is somewhat distorted.

35. The most troubling of these personal testimonies is the account of 36. Madame X, the character who employed young women who had been 37. trained at the centre in Crouy-sur-Ourg to work as domestic servants (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 178-79). The récitatif explains that the 38. 39. woman was reluctant to speak openly about her role in the BUMIDOM project on examining the bande dessinée, which the character herself is 40. depicted as describing in a speech bubble as 'très [...] euh [...] politique' 41. (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 178). Due to her embarrassment at actively 42. participating in a scheme that has subsequently been portrayed as exploit-43. 44. ative, she only agreed to testify as an anonymous witness. The narrative voice-over does not explain how Madame X was persuaded to discuss the 45. 46. BUMIDOM, but simply states that 'comprenant [leur] démarche, Madame X accepte finalement que son témoignage soit utilisé de façon anonyme' 47. (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 178). Did this woman want her voice to be 48. 49. heard? Her reluctance to give her real name would suggest otherwise. The 50. ambiguity in the ways in which Oublié and Rousseau succeeded in

✐

 $\bigcirc$ 

persuading the woman to speak renders the inclusion of this testimony
 rather unethical. In addition, the text and images do not give a nuanced
 representation of the context in which the young women were employed,
 nor do they explain in detail how the workers were treated. Such gaps in
 this particular story undermine the authors' desire to represent this
 important, underexplored angle in the BUMIDOM story.

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

7. A further challenge to the historical accuracy of the project can be seen 8. in the slippage between the traditional format of *bande dessinée* and the less 9. rigid forms of graphic narratives that are also employed in *Péyi an nou*. While 10. the inclusion of interviews with historians, sociologists, psychologists and 11. demographers gives the project authority and historical legitimacy, the ways 12. in which the historical detail is incorporated into the narrative poses some 13. problem. When Jessica is speaking to a particular expert in the present 14. narrative time, the typical *bande dessinée* structure is employed – a *planche* is 15. divided into several cases of different shapes and sizes to enable the reader to 16. follow the action in sequence. Yet when the academic is speaking about the 17. past, this format is abandoned: images and text coincide in no clear order, 18. and although the colour scheme changes to indicate a switch in narrative 19. time, the lack of references and speech bubbles means that it is unclear 20. whether this information belongs to the narrator or to the character. In 21. turn, this weakens the overall accuracy of Péyi an nou because the reader is 22. unsure whether the information originates from a reliable source, and the detached nature of investigative bande dessinée as advocated by Miller (2008: 23. 111) is abandoned. The structure of the final chapter, however, goes some 24. way to remedying this problem. Double-page spreads are dedicated to a 25. range of experts: historian Sylvain Pattieu talks about the information that 26. 27. he has discovered from the BUMIDOM archives (in Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 184-87); psychoanalyst Yolande Govindama explains the psychologi-28. 29. cal reasons behind some participants' hesitation at speaking about their 30. experiences of migration (in Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 188-91); 31. researcher Audrey Célestine focuses on the migration schemes that 32. succeeded the BUMIDOM (in Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 192-95) and soci-33. ologist and demographer Claude Valentin Marie traces the demographic 34. consequences of French Caribbean migration (in Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 196-99). Each expert is given one question that is enclosed in a 35. 36. rectangular box (like the *récitatif*), suggesting that the question is posed by 37. the narrator; the interviewee is not interrupted but is free to give his or her 38. own opinions on the BUMIDOM. This structure allows the experts' thoughts 39. to reach the reader directly, rather than via the voice of the narrative 40. persona. The text is broken up into short paragraphs – ensuring that the 41. text remains accessible for a wide audience – and is placed around images of 42. the interviewees to posit them as experts in their field. Pattieu, for example, 43. can be seen working in the archives, surrounded by boxes of files and piles 44. of paper (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 185). The text concludes, then, with a 45. strong indication that the text is steeped in reliable historical research, but 46. this explicit nod to expertise needs to be replicated throughout the text. 47. For Jennifer Howell, bande dessinée is an effective tool with which to

48. write underexplored histories. Focusing specifically on representations of 49. the Algerian War of Independence in *bande dessinées*, Howell argues that 50. such historical taboos 'are more easily addressed in the bande dessinée

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

7.

).

2

3. 1.

5.

7

3

).

).

2.

).

).

2

8/28/18 2:19 PM

- https://la1ere. francetvinfo.fr/ peyi-an-nou-remporte-prix-etudiantbd-politique-franceculture-577201. html. Accessed 3 June 2018.
- 15. https://peyiannou. wordpress.com/. Accessed 3 June 2018.

than in highly codified canonical literatures' because authors feel they 1. 2. have more freedom to tackle difficult subjects in this liminal genre (Howell 3. 2010: 7). Moreover, she claims that 'the hybrid nature and liminal status 4. of the bande dessinée allow artists to engage with various historical 5. sources' to combine a range of interesting archival material and engaging sources that are not typically used in academic historical texts (Howell 6. 2010: 8). The same could be argued for representations of migration, an 7. equally taboo theme, and Péyi an nou is a case in point. On three occasions, 8. 9. the *bande dessinée* is interrupted by a double-page spread featuring newspa-10. per articles, extracts from official records and personal letters document-11. ing individual experiences of the BUMIDOM (Oublié and Rousseau 2017: 60–61, 138–39, 180–81). Such information lends authenticity to the 12. 13. project; a sketched image of Jessica and Marie-Ange in the right-hand 14. corner, collecting information and reading archival material, reminds 15. readers that they are witnessing an authentic research project in which 16. the authors are becoming experts, and therefore can be trusted. In addition, graphs and statistics about the numbers involved in the BUMIDOM 17. scheme add an additional layer of accuracy to the personal accounts 18. included in the bande dessinée. Nevertheless, Oublié and Rousseau do 19. 20. not engage critically or artistically with the information found in the 21. archives - we are not even told which archives have been consulted in their research and when the authors accessed them, nor what the differ-22. ent items reveal about migration from the French Caribbean. The extracts 23. often overlap each other on the page - while this superposition of text 24. 25. perhaps implies the vast quantities of information that the authors were required to sift through to create Péyi an nou, it in fact obscures the histor-26. ical detail of the extracts, overwhelming and confusing the reader. 27. 28. Furthermore, many of the statistics contain no references regarding their 29. origin. This lack of documentation of the historical sources is worrying, 30. given Oublié and Rousseau's overall pedagogical aims. If they seek to 31. educate an uninformed audience about a significant but neglected moment in French history, they must also teach this audience about the ethical 32. considerations of accurate citation practices. 33. 34.

## Beyond the bande dessinée: The afterlife of Péyi an nou

36. The didactic nature of *Péyi an nou* is not limited to the *bande dessinée* but is also apparent in the secondary projects that have stemmed from the book. 37. It is worth noting first, however, that *Péyi an nou* has enjoyed commercial 38. 39. and critical success: it won the Prix Étudiant de la BD Politique France 40. Culture in April 2018, which was presented to Oublié and Rousseau at a grand ceremony at l'Assemblée nationale in Paris on 9 April 2018.<sup>14</sup> The 41. judging panel was chaired by David Amiel, advisor to the president of the 42. Republic; the fact that *Péyi an nou* was awarded this prize by such a prom-43. inent official figure is testimony to its success. This award not only raised 44. the prominence of the bande dessinée and increased awareness of migra-45. 46. tion from the French Caribbean in the mid-twentieth century, but also compounded the status of Oublié and Rousseau as key supporters of the 47. cause of the Antillean community. 48.

In parallel with the *bande dessinée*, Oublié and Rousseau have also set 49. up a blog.<sup>15</sup> While the choice of WordPress platform, rather than a 50.

( )

8/28/18 2:19 PM

35.

1. professional service, gives this side-project a rather amateurish impression, 2. the easy-to-use features and clear layout once again suggests that the 3. primary intended addressee is a relatively young audience. The authors 4. invite their readers to engage directly with the bande dessinée by inviting 5. questions and comments on the 'livre d'or' page, in an attempt to widen 6. discussion of the BUMIDOM beyond the formal constraints of the textual 7. medium that they have employed. Such an idea is commendable, and yet it 8. is debatable how successful the creators have been at reaching out to the 9. general public in this way. To date, no comments have been left on the 10. page since it was created on 22 November 2017.<sup>16</sup> 11. One of the strengths of the blog, however, is the 'carnets de voyage', a

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

12. selection of drawings that were created during Oublié and Rousseau's research trip to the Caribbean.<sup>17</sup> These additional images position the 13. 14. bande dessinée as a part of a larger research venture, reinforcing both the 15. validity and the accuracy of the historical information that appears in the 16. text. If the reader can be sure that the authors did indeed visit the 17. Caribbean, and interview the people they encountered there, s/he is much 18. more likely to believe in the findings. In addition, the blog contains links to 19. a variety of television, radio and press interviews undertaken by Oublié 20. and Rousseau to publicize the text, and a list of events in the Caribbean 21. and in metropolitan France where they have discussed their work, includ-22. ing at the national *bande dessinée* festival in Angoulême, which took place on 25 to 28 January 2018.<sup>18</sup> The diversity of these events reveals the 23. 24. prominence of the project in both local and national spheres, although 25. the fact that Oublié and Rousseau must resort to a WordPress blog to advertise these events themselves, rather than through a literary agent, 26. 27. implies that their work has not yet reached its full potential.

28. A more ambitious output stemming from *Péyi an nou* is the travelling 29. exhibition Memwa, created by Oublié and Rousseau in partnership with the 30. French research groups L'Association pour la connaissance de l'histoire de 31. l'Afrique contemporaine (ACHAC) and L'Institut national d'études 32. démographiques (INED). The exhibition was launched officially at Université 33. des Antilles in Point-à-Pitre, Guadeloupe, during a study day about the 34. BUMIDOM on 17 May 2018.<sup>19</sup> The presence of scholars and historians at 35. the event, such as Jacques Dumont, gave the exhibition its official, academic 36. resonance. The content of this exhibition is unclear in media information – 37. there is a tab on the blog entitled 'Memwa' but at present it is empty - but 38. it can be presumed that the exhibition contains additional information that 39. was not included in *Péui an nou* due to spatial constraints. Oublié and 40. Rousseau have also launched a competition for secondary-school students 41. in Martinique and Guadeloupe to design their own *bande dessinée*, but again 42. the details are ambiguous in media articles that discuss the project (Bocandé 43. 2017: n.p.). While Oublié and Rousseau should be commended, then, for 44. seeking to expand the project beyond the limits of the bande dessinée itself 45. and reach as wide an audience as possible, their success at publicizing these 46. additional resources seems relatively limited.

# 47.

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3. 1.

5.

5.

3.

).

).

L.

2

3.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

5.

5.

).

7. 🏵

## 48. Conclusion

49. A close analysis of *Péyi an nou* has revealed the potential of the medium of 50. *bande dessinée* in depicting complex instances of migration that have been

Depicting French Caribbean migration through bande dessinée

- https://peyiannou. wordpress.com/ temoignez/. Accessed 3 June 2018.
- https://peyiannou. wordpress.com/ presentation/carnetsde-voyages/. Accessed 3 June 2018.
- https://peyiannou. wordpress.com/rencontres/. Accessed
   June 2018.

19. http://www.caraibcreolenews.com/ index.php/cma-actu/ item/13669-guadeloupe-bumidomdes-circonstancesaux-consequences. Accessed 3 June 2018.

 $( \mathbf{\Phi} )$ 

20. https://peyiannou. wordpress.com/ presentation/lesauteures/. Accessed 11 June 2018. overlooked by more traditional forms of cultural production. Oublié and 1. Rousseau skilfully combine emotional textual extracts from first-hand 2. 3. witnesses and poignant sketched images with detailed historical informa-4. tion from a range of experts about migration from Guadeloupe and 5. Martinique to mainland France in the mid-twentieth century. It is true that at times, the authors do not seem to exploit the full potential of *bande* 6. dessinée in its interaction between text and image; furthermore, there are 7. significant problems in the ways in which the archival sources and histor-8. 9. ical information are integrated into the narrative because they risk being 10. perceived as a continuation of the narratorial voice, and thus lose their 11. historical potency. Oublié and Rousseau are not experienced bédéistes indeed, Péyi an nou is their first venture in this medium, although Rousseau 12. 13. did train at the famous bande dessinée college le Cesan in Paris, according to her biography on their project website $^{20}$  – and therefore, it is inevitable 14. 15. that there are occasional omissions in the narrative.

16. Overall, though, the pair should be praised for their sterling efforts at raising awareness of the issues faced by the French Caribbean community today, 17. who frequently still find themselves relegated to the status of second-class 18. 19. citizens, despite the legal implications of the framework of the départements et 20. regions d'outre-mer (DROM). Péyi an nou, then, fits into a recent trend of 21. French-language comics that shed light on marginalized episodes in France's colonial and postcolonial history. In The Colonial Heritage of French Comics 22. 23. (2011), McKinney comments on the popularity of *bande dessinée* precisely because of its willingness to portray 'troubling and controversial topics, 24. 25. including French and Belgian colonial injustices and crimes' (McKinney 2011: 1). Drawing parallels with Deloupy and Swann Meralli's Algériennes 26. 1954–1962 (2018), which focuses on the forgotten role of women in the 27. Algerian War of Independence, and Pat Perna and Nicolas Otero's Morts par 28. 29. *la France: Thiaroye* 1944 (2018), a *bande dessinée* about the infamous massa-30. cre of between 35 and 70 tirailleurs sénégalais killed at Thiaroye, Dakar, in 31. December 1944, Péyi an nou can be seen to make a wider argument about 32. the need for accessible cultural production in the discussion of France's colonial past. While *bande dessinée* is bringing these issues to the fore, the French 33. 34. state is yet to catch up. Given the political scandal currently sweeping the United Kingdom concerning the injustices faced by the Windrush genera-35. 36. tion, it is now more urgent than ever that the French government acknowl-37. edges its own traumatic (post)colonial history, the effects of which continue to resonate across generations of French citizens today. 38. 39.

#### References

- Anselin, Alain (1979), L'Émigration antillaise en France: Du Bantoustan au Ghetto,41.Paris: Éditions Anthropos.42.
- (1990), L'Émigration antillaise en France: La troisième île, Paris: Éditions
   Karthala.
   44.
- Aurita, Aurélia (2008), *Je ne verrai pas Okinawa*, Brussels: Les Impressions Nouvelles.
  Bade, Klaus J. (2003), *Migration in European History* (trans. Allison Brown), Malden, MA and Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
  Barpy, Joon Cloude (2004), Nèg merror, Erenger Mat Filme, Kasse Inc. Broductions 48.
- Barny, Jean-Claude (2004), *Nèg marron*, France: Mat Films, Kasso Inc. Productions and France 2 cinéma. 50.

( )

Antonia Wimbush

8/28/18 2:19 PM

40.

 $(\mathbf{\Phi})$ 

- 1. (2016), *Le Gang des Antillais*, France: Les Films d'ici.
- 2. \_\_\_\_(2016), Rose et le soldat, France: Lizland Films.
- Bastide, Jackie (2009), *Bumidom: Des français venus d'outre-mer*, France: Temps noir productions.

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

- Bocandé, Anne (2017), 'Péyi an nou: Le Bumidom en BD', Africultures, 7 September, http://africultures.com/peyi-an-nou-bumidom-bd/. Accessed 3 June 2018.
- Byron, Margaret and Condon, Stephanie (2008), Migration in Comparative Perspective: Caribbean Communities in Britain and France, New York and Abingdon: Routledge.
- 10.
  11. Césaire, Aimé (1961), 'Crise dans les départements d'outre-mer ou crise de la départementalisation?', *Présence Africaine*, 36:1, pp. 109–12.
- 12.
  13. Childers, Kristen Stromberg (2016), Seeking Imperialism's Embrace: National Identity, Decolonization, and Assimilation in the French Caribbean, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Condé, Maryse (2018), "Le Rêve français" par Maryse Condé', *TéléObs*, 21 March, https://teleobs.nouvelobs.com/actualites/20180321.0BS3988/le-reve-francais-par-maryse-conde.html. Accessed 21 May 2018.
- 18. Condon, Stephanie (2004), 'Gender issues in the study of circulation between the Caribbean and the French Metropole', *Caribbean Studies*, 32:1, pp. 129–59.
- Condon, Stephanie and Ogden, Philip (1991), 'Emigration from the French
  Caribbean: The origins of an organized migration', *International Journal of*Urban and Regional Research, 15:4, pp. 505–23.
- 23. Daum, Pierre and Baloup, Clément (2017), Les Lính Tho, immigrés de force: Mémoires de Viet Kieu, Brussels: La Boîte à bulles.
  25.
- Deluppy and Meralli, Swann (2018), Algériennes 1954–1962, Brussels: Éditions
  Marabout.
- 28. Dracius, Suzanne (1989), L'Autre qui danse, Paris: Seghers.
- 29. Eidsvik, Charles (2005), 'Background tracks in recent cinema', in Joseph D.
  30. Anderson and Barbara Fisher Anderson (eds), *Moving Image Theory: Ecological*31. *Considerations*, Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press, pp. 70–78.
- 32. Faure, Christian (2018), Le Rêve français, France: Eloa Prod.
- 33. France TV (2017), 'Outre-mer', https://www.francetvpub.fr/international-outre34. mer/outre-mer-2/. Accessed 22 May 2018.
- 35. Germain, Félix (2016), *Decolonizing the Republic: African and Caribbean Migrants in* 36. *Postwar Paris*, 1946–1974, East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University Press.
- 37. Glissant, Édouard (1981), Le Discours antillais, Paris: Éditions du Seuil.
- 38. Goosen, Jean (1976), 'The migration of French West Indian women to Metropolitan
  39. France', *Anthropological Quarterly*, 49:1, pp. 45–52.
- 40. Grant, Colin (2018), 'Five books about the Windrush generation', *The Guardian*, 25 41. April https://www.theguardian.com/books/2018/apr/25/colin-grant.books-
- 41. April, https://www.theguardian.com/books/2018/apr/25/colin-grant-books42. windrush-generation\_Accessed 21 May 2018
- 42. windrush-generation. Accessed 21 May 2018. 43. Crown Laurence (2010). Comiss in Evench: The Even
- Grove, Laurence (2010), *Comics in French: The European Bande Dessinée in Context*,
  New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books.
- 45. Howell, Jennifer (2010) 'Popularizing historical taboos, transmitting postmemory:
  46. The French-Algerian War in the Bande Dessinée', Ph.D. thesis, Iowa City, IA:
- 47. University of Iowa.
- 48. Lacassin, Francis (1971), Pour un neuvième art: La bande dessinée, Geneva: Éditions
  49. Slatkine.
- 50.

).

2

3.

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2.

3.

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

L.

2.

3.

ŧ.

5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

5.

5.

7.

).

 $\bigcirc$ 

 $( \mathbf{\Phi} )$ 

| Léonard-Maestrati, Antoine (2006), L'Avenir est ailleurs, France: Cinéma Public Films.   | 1<br>2           |
|--|------------------|
| Lucas, M. (1983), Rapport sur l'insertion des ressortissants des DOM en métropole,<br>Paris: SEDETOM.  | 3<br>4           |
| Marie, Vincent and Ollivier, Gilles (2013), 'Introduction: Bande dessinée et immi-<br>gration: Une histoire de contacts', in Vincent Marie and Gilles Ollivier (eds),<br><i>Albums: Des histoires dessinées entre ici et ailleurs: Bande dessinée et immigration</i><br>1913–2013, Paris: Futuropolis, pp. 6–10. | 5<br>6<br>7<br>8 |
| McCloud, Scott (1993), Understanding Comics: The Invisible Art, New York: Harper.  | 9<br>1           |
| McIntosh, Malachi (2015), <i>Emigration and Caribbean Literature</i> , New York: Palgrave Macmillan.   | 1<br>1           |
| McKinney, Mark (2008), 'French-language comics terminology and referencing',<br>in Mark McKinney (ed.), <i>History and Politics in French-Language Comics and</i><br><i>Graphic Novels</i> , Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, pp. xiii–xv.  | 1<br>1<br>1      |
| —— (2011), <i>The Colonial Heritage of French Comics</i> , Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.  | ]                |
| McQuillan, Libbie (2005), 'The Francophone Bande Dessinée: An introduction', in<br>Charles Forsdick, Laurence Grove and Libbie McQuillan (eds), <i>The Francophone</i><br><i>Bande Dessinée</i> , Amsterdam: Éditions Rodopi, pp. 7–14.  | 1                |
| Miller, Ann (2007), Reading Bande Dessinée: Critical Approaches to French-language<br>Comic Strip, Bristol: Intellect Books.   |                  |
| — (2008), 'Citizenship and city spaces: Bande dessinée as reportage', in Mark<br>McKinney (ed.), History and Politics in French-Language Comics and Graphic<br>Novels, Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, pp. 97–115.   |                  |
| Murdoch, H. A. (2001), 'Negotiating the Metropole: Patterns of exile and cultural survival in Gisèle Pineau and Suzanne Dracius-Pinalie', in Susan Ireland and Patrice Proulx (eds), <i>Immigrant Narratives in Contemporary France</i> , Westport, CT and London: Greenwood Press, pp. 129–39.                  |                  |
| Oublié, Jessica and Magnier, Bernard (2018), "Un pan méconnu de notre récit national": Trois questions à Jessica Oublié', <i>Le Français dans le monde</i> , no. 416, March–April 2018, p. 64.   | 0,00,00          |
| Oublié, Jessica and Rousseau, Marie-Ange (2017), Péyi an nou, Paris: Steinkis Éditions.  | (1) (1)          |
| Pattieu, Sylvain (2017), 'The BUMIDOM in Paris and its suburbs: Contradictions in a state migration policy, 1960s–1970s', <i>African and Black Diaspora: An International Journal</i> , 10:1, pp. 12–24.   |                  |
| Perna, Pat and Otero, Nicolas (2018), <i>Morts par la France: Thiaraye</i> 1944, Paris: Les Arènes.  | 01.01            |
| Petersen, Robert S. (2011), <i>Comics, Manga, and Graphic Novels: A History of Graphic Narratives</i> , Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger.  | 4                |
| Pineau, Gisèle (1996), L'Exil selon Julia, Paris: Éditions Stock.  | 4                |
| Selvon, Sam (1956), <i>The Lonely Londoners</i> , Harlow: Longman.   | 4                |
| Shute, Hillary (2008), 'Comics as literature? Reading graphic narrative', <i>Publications of the Modern Language Association</i> , 123:2, pp. 452–65.  | 4                |
| <ul> <li>Tray, Philippe (2013), 'BUMIDOM: "L'Avenir est ailleurs", un film sur l'exil et le malaise ultramarin', 19 December, https://lalere.francetvinfo.fr/2013/12/19/</li> </ul>  | 4                |
| bumidom-l-avenir-est-ailleurs-un-film-sur-l-exil-et-le-malaise-ultrama-<br>rin-95471.html. Accessed 21 May 2018.   | 4                |

۲

Antonia Wimbush

۲

8/28/18 2:19 PM

\_\_\_\_

L

### 1. Suggested citation

Wimbush, A. (2018), 'Depicting French Caribbean migration through *bande dessinée*', *International Journal of Francophone Studies*, 21:1&2, pp. 9–29, doi: 10.1386/ijfs.21.1&2.9\_1

 $(\mathbf{0})$ 

5.

#### 6. Contributors details

7. Antonia Wimbush completed her Ph.D. at the University of Birmingham in 8. February 2018, fully funded by the AHRC Midlands3Cities Doctoral Training 9. Partnership. Her thesis, entitled 'Exile in Francophone Women's Autobiographical Writing', analysed themes of exile and migration in life writing by women from 10. Algeria, Guadeloupe, Côte d'Ivoire and Vietnam. She has written articles on exile, 11. memory and trauma for the Bulletin of Francophone Postcolonial Studies and Memory 12. and Postcolonial Studies: Synergies and New Directions, edited by Dirk Göttsche and 13. forthcoming in 2018. She is currently Conference Secretary for the Society for 14. Francophone Postcolonial Studies and is working as a Teaching Fellow in French 15. at the University of Birmingham. 16.

## 17. Contact: Department of Modern Languages, University of Birmingham, Ashley

- 18. Building, Edgbaston, Birmingham, B15 2TT.
- 19. E-mail: antoniawimbush@googlemail.com
- 20. https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9689-5328

21.

25.

ŧ.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

ł.

5.

7

3.

).

).

L.

2.

1. 5.

5.

7.

3.

).

).

2

3.

5.

5.

7.

).

Antonia Wimbush has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and
Patents Act, 1988, to be identified as the author of this work in the format that
was submitted to Intellect Ltd.

26. 27. 28.29. 30. 31. 32. 33. 34. 35. 36. 37. 38. 39. 40. 41. 42. 43. 44. 45. 46. 47. 48.49. 50.

۲

