

J.R.R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* and
Appropriation

Thesis submitted in accordance with the requirements of
the University of Liverpool for the degree of
Doctor in Philosophy by Emma Louise Dollard

November 2008

Abstract

This thesis rejects conventional critical work on appropriation, using *The Lord of the Rings* to illustrate a theory of appropriation as being an integral part of the creative process. Current researchers, exemplified by Sanders, argue that appropriation is characterised by a political agenda, and intention. The thesis argues that appropriation can be both deliberate and unconscious and demonstrates the difficulty of distinguishing between these states.

Chapter one connects modern fantasy to imperial ideology by identifying the links between Tolkien and empire adventure writers. Tolkien's appropriations of northern European myths and medieval literatures have been extensively investigated; the few studies of his appropriation of more contemporary texts focus on *The Hobbit*. The thesis argues that acknowledging the influence of imperial adventure narratives – specifically Haggard's *She* and *King Solomon's Mines* – offers an enhanced understanding of *The Lord of the Rings*, and significantly strengthens research in the area. Thematic and textual links are identified between Haggard and Tolkien, previously overlooked by Green, Lobdell and Nelson contributors of the most critical work in this field. A section on Tolkien's landscape links the first and second chapters and shows how the colonial gaze is replicated from Haggard to *The Lord of the Rings*. The chapter concludes that appropriation has helped to sustain a subtextual imperial ideology in *The Lord of the Rings* unidentified by critics such as Kutzer who argue for Tolkien's having held anti-imperialist views.

Chapter two takes an original interdisciplinary approach to the cinematic *The Lord of the Rings* by contextualising Jackson's use of the New Zealand landscape. The chapter uses the work of art critics Andrews, Mitchell and Pound to interrogate the relationship between the colonial and postcolonial in the cinematic landscape and the subsequent implications for a 'reading' of New Zealand. Scenes from each film are analysed to investigate the relationship between the visual representation of Middle-earth and New Zealand and to determine whether Jackson's appropriations are evidence of a colonial or postcolonial position, or of a complex negotiation between these apparently exclusive positions.

Chapter three examines fanfiction and its inspiring narratives. Unlike previous work rooting fanfiction in the late twentieth century, the thesis analyses the evolution of the 'Grail' narrative to argue that appropriation is an established tradition critical for the dissemination of popular narratives. The chapter interrogates the relationship between the internet and fanfiction and argues for a radical re-evaluation of fanfiction. The chapter analyses *The Lord of the Rings* fanfiction in a number of genres, 'Mary-Sue', 'slash' and 'alternate universe' (AU), to investigate the multiplicity of responses to Tolkien's novel and Jackson's films. Unlike previous work, the chapter uses *The Lord of the Rings* to connect radically different works of fanfiction and concludes that theoretical work on the multiplicity of the text is visible in fanfiction.

The thesis re-defines appropriation and identifies its role in literature, using *The Lord of the Rings* to argue that appropriation facilitates the carrying of cultural tropes while leaving space for the subverting of cultural norms.

Acknowledgements

I would like to extend my thanks to my supervisors, Dr. Brian Baker, Dr. William Stephenson and Professor Chris Walsh, and my examiners, Professor Brian Rosebury and Dr. Melissa Fegan. I would also like to thank my family and friends for their support over the last four years. Special thanks have to go to my parents, to whom this thesis is dedicated. I could not have done it without them.

Contents

Introduction	
Appropriation and the Text	1
Chapter One	
With Frodo in Middle-earth	52
Chapter Two	
A Cartographic Fantasy: Peter Jackson, New Zealand and <i>The Lord of the Rings</i>	126
Chapter Three	
<i>The Lord of the Rings</i> and Mythmaking for a Digital Age	201
Conclusion	
There and Back Again	291
Appendix A	
Glossary of 'Fannish' Terms	311
Bibliography	315

Introduction
Appropriation and the Text

Introduction: Appropriation and the Text

This thesis deals with J.R.R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*, Peter Jackson's cinematic adaptations and *The Lord of the Rings* fanfiction. The relationship between these texts is never quite as clear as it may seem; Tolkien did not just draw upon medieval Arthurian legends and Nordic myths; Jackson did not produce a direct translation of Tolkien's text to the screen; *The Lord of the Rings* fanfiction does not just comment on and write back to *The Lord of the Rings*. What links Tolkien, Jackson and the fanfiction writers is the range of highly similar processes by which texts are used and changed. This thesis will focus on the nature and strength of the relationship between Tolkien and other authors. Rewriting, appropriation and reworking are responses to core cultural narratives which can be seen in modern appropriations of *The Lord of the Rings* as well as in the multiple and more familiar appropriations of the King Arthur and Grail myths which were disseminated across Europe and the Middle East. Julie Sanders argues convincingly that:

The discipline of English literature, while it cannot easily be reduced to a detective-like mode of cracking ciphers and recognizing allusions, nevertheless thrives on the practices of reading 'alongside', of comparison and contrast, and of identifying intertexts and analogues, that are central to the studies undertaken here. Adaptation and appropriation need to be brought out of the shadows in this respect. They are not merely belated practices and processes; they are creative and influential in their own right. And they acknowledge something fundamental about literature: that its impulse is to spark related thoughts, responses, and readings.¹

In chapter one, an examination will be made of Tolkien's work as a typical product of an imperialist culture, and the extent to which *The Lord of the Rings* is

¹ Julie Sanders, *Adaptation and Appropriation* (London and New York: Routledge, 2006), p. 160

typical of the era. Peter Jackson's cinematic adaptations of *The Lord of the Rings* will be discussed in chapter two as part of an extended exploration of the relationship between colonial landscape viewing and postcolonial nation-building. Finally, in chapter three, the links between the construction of core cultural narratives such as the Grail myth and the (re)writing of *The Lord of the Rings* by fanfiction writers will demonstrate that such rewritings are not a product of new technologies or new ways of reading texts. The appropriative practices of Tolkien, Jackson, and fanfiction writers are drawn from the same set of cultural processes. In practice, it can be seen that *The Lord of the Rings* is in a constant state of re-making, through adaptations such as Peter Jackson's and fanfiction appropriations. Appropriation works as a critical component of the production and dissemination of cultural products.

Intertextuality and Appropriation

Jonathan Culler notes of intertextuality that 'In its broadest sense, it had been used to describe a free-floating body of knowledge'² and that 'In its most restricted sense, it has been used to examine the explicit presence of other texts within a given work by focusing on the processes of citation, reference, etc.'³ The definition of intertextuality employed in this thesis is closer to Culler's first definition of intertextuality. Intertextuality, in this theory, is the broad base of knowledge – history, the sciences, the arts – which make up local and global cultures. The varying different kinds of appropriation take place within this model of intertextuality. A model of intertextuality can be seen in the critical work of T.S.

² Jonathan Culler, *The Pursuit of Signs* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1981), p. 44

³ Ibid. p. 44

Eliot who identified a praxis of creativity which works to draw attention to the significant links between texts. Eliot pointed out in particular that: 'No poet, no artist of any art, has his complete meaning alone. His significance, his appreciation is the appreciation of his relation to the dead poets and artists.'⁴ He suggested that the connections between texts are evidence of a negotiation between the writer and the tradition of literature into which he is born. (Julie Sanders notes that Eliot's essay 'Tradition and the Individual Talent' is explicitly sexist as it refers solely to a male tradition and a male writer).⁵ For Julia Kristeva, this negotiation forms the basis of her concept of intertextuality: 'any text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations; any text is the absorption and transformation of another'.⁶ Both Eliot's and Kristeva's descriptions suggest a specific and intentional engagement with previous texts which is simultaneously part of the creation of new texts. For Sanders, appropriation and adaptation function as part of intertextuality. She suggests that adaptation and appropriation 'tend on the whole to operate within the parameters of an established canon' which would correspond with Eliot's notion of the literary tradition.⁷ For Sanders, Eliot and Kristeva, the appropriated texts must be well known for the appropriation to indicate successfully a link with the originating text. Sanders cites Adrian Poole's 'extensive list of terms to represent the Victorian era's interest in reworking the artistic past' and adds a significant number of terms to a theoretical area which already suffers from an abundance of

⁴ T.S. Eliot, 'Tradition and the Individual Talent', <<http://www.bartleby.com/200/sw4.html>> [accessed 15 October 2008]

⁵ See Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 8

⁶ Julia Kristeva, 'Word, Dialogue and Novel', in *The Kristeva Reader*, ed. by Toril Moi (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993), pp. 34-61 (p. 37)

⁷ Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 97

such terms and terminological uncertainty.⁸ Sanders suggests that this is typical of the nature of the terms and concepts being discussed:

I make no apologies for the profusion rather than fixity of terms offered: the idiom in which adaptation and appropriation functions is rich and various; that is part of its essence and importance, and any study of the same should surely reflect this fact.⁹

Sanders makes the excellent point that there are currently large numbers of terms being used, often interchangeably. However, when all these terms reflect aspects of appropriation as a central cultural practice, it seems practical to draw them together and to recognise that there is not a 'profusion' of artistic processes, each with its own theoretical background and distinct presence but one central, general practice which gives rise to different products depending on the degree and nature of the author's intentions. Intertextuality is the general cultural background from which creators draw, while appropriation is the act of knowingly or unknowingly making reference to a specific text. In contrast, adaptation is the conscious appropriation of material into a new medium.

In the light of this definition, and in an attempt to simplify some of the terminology, 'appropriation' will be used to cover all intertextual relationships. Appropriation is conventionally seen as a conscious process of referencing, citing or otherwise indicating another text. This appropriation may be intentional (conscious) or unintentional (unconscious) and it can be impossible to determine with certainty the author's intention; as Roberta Ricci points out, an 'author's meaning or intended meaning, whether they coincide or not, may ultimately differ

⁸ Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 3

⁹ Ibid.

from the reader's own interpretation'.¹⁰ A variety of terms such as 'cultural intertextuality' or 'cultural absorption' could be used to indicate appropriation from widely known or 'core' cultural narratives and institutions, but in this thesis, appropriation is the term used for all references to other texts which have an influence on the text whether intentional or not.¹¹ This has the added benefit of being consistent with current legislation which holds that copyright infringement through appropriation does not have to be conscious in order to be considered an infringement.

Is There a Cheese in this Text?¹²

It is appropriate at this point to briefly refine appropriation further and to distinguish between appropriation which has an intentional quality and unconscious appropriation. The former depends upon the reader recognising and appreciating deliberate textual links between one text and another as, for example, humorous or parodic, such as Terry Pratchett's references to *The Lord of the Rings* in the Discworld series, which 'involve the imitation or, better still, the mimicry of other styles and particularly of the mannerisms and stylistic twitches of other styles'.¹³ According to Gabriel Robinson, parody 'provides a sense of distance and alienation that is or becomes a basic mode of experiencing, controlling, and

¹⁰ Roberta Ricci, 'Morphologies and Functions of Self-Criticism in Modern Times: Has the Author Come Back?', *MLN*, 118.1 (2003) 116-146 (p.120)

¹¹ 'Cultural intertextuality' is too vague and generalised a term to be useful in a field which is already bloated with terminology and 'cultural absorption' has been tainted by associations with ethnocide - see Anthony D. Smith, *National Identity* (London: Penguin Books, 1991)

¹² Academic appropriation in action. Many of the section headings in the thesis are appropriated from academia, film and literature. This section title is adapted from Stanley Fish, *Is There A Text In This Class?* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1980)

¹³ Fredric Jameson, *The Cultural Turn: Selected Writings on the Postmodern, 1983-1998* (London, New York: Verso, 1998), p. 4

expressing reality'.¹⁴ Intertextual references assume a level of knowledge on the part of the reader; for example, *Moving Pictures* evokes *Gone With The Wind* without actually specifically naming it:

A Man and A Woman Aflame With Passione in A Citie Riven by Sivil War! [...] Trolls! Battles! Romance! People with thin moustaches! Soldiers of fortune! And one woman's fight to keep the – Dibbler hesitated – something-or-other she loves, we'll think about this later, in a world gone mad!¹⁵

Dibbler's film epic is eventually titled 'Blown Away' and the humour – and the overall conceit of ideas from the real world filtering into Discworld – is sustained and increased by an awareness of the basic storyline of *Gone With The Wind*.¹⁶ Equally, the implicit suggestion that the story of *Gone With The Wind* exists apart from its author and medium works to support one of the Discworld's thematic subtexts – that of the independent nature of narrative which is elevated to natural laws in the Discworld novels: 'It is now *impossible* for the third and youngest son of any king, if he should embark on a quest which has so far claimed his older brothers, *not* to succeed'.¹⁷ Similarly, Walter Moers's inclusion of 'Gone with the Tornado' in a list of books in *The City of Dreaming Books* suggests that the other titles in the list – 'offerings included *The House of a Hundred Feet*, *Whispers and Shadows*, *Gone with the Tornado*, *A Pig for Two Pyras* and *The Unhilarious Sight Gag*' – are intertextual puzzles.¹⁸

¹⁴ Gabriel Robinson, 'Nothing Left but Parody: Friedrich Dürrenmatt and Tom Stoppard', *Theatre Journal*, 32:1 (1980), 85-94 (p. 86)

¹⁵ Terry Pratchett, *Moving Pictures* (London: Corgi Books, 1995), p. 189. This appropriation demonstrates that the process may be creative and imaginative and that it relies on ideas inspired by the original, rather than being a lifeless copy derived from another's template.

¹⁶ Pratchett revisits this motif in several Discworld books including *Soul Music*.

¹⁷ Terry Pratchett, *Witches Abroad* (London: Corgi Books, 1992), p. 9

¹⁸ Walter Moers, *The City of Dreaming Books* (London: Vintage Books, 2007), p. 110

By comparison, unconscious appropriation may be explained as artists, writers or directors drawing upon a common source without intending the resultant intertextual links and without, for example, the overt satirical or critical intent which characterises parody. Although perhaps unintentional on the part of the writer, it is still a form of appropriation and indicates the communication of, negotiation with, and the creation of cultural texts within a culture. William Irwin calls such textual links ‘accidental associations’ and argues against the concept of intertextuality as he believes it posits an artificial textual independence from the author.¹⁹ Intertextual links can often be made between texts without an intentional appropriation having taken place:

1. Tiffany knew that Lancre Blue cheeses were always a bit on the lively side, and sometimes had to be nailed down, but... well, she was highly skilled at cheese-making, even though she said herself, and Horace was definitely a champion. The famous blue streaks that gave the variety its wonderful colour were really pretty, although Tiffany wasn’t sure they should glow in the dark.²⁰

2. ‘Mynachlog-ddu Old Contemptible,’ said Pryce, showing me a whitish, crumbly cheese. ‘It’s kept in a glass jar because it will eat through cardboard or steel. Don’t leave it in the air too long as it will start dogs howling.’²¹

3. A heavy table, covered in scorch marks, sat in the centre of the room. On top of it was a thick glass bell jar, firmly bolted to the table. Through the translucent green of the glass could be seen... the cheese. Chained down, it occasionally hurled itself ineffectually at the glass. Mr. George handed a spanner to the lad. ‘Release the bolts.’ He tentatively approached the table. The cheese, sensing his fear, redoubled its efforts on the glass.²²

¹⁹ William Irwin, ‘Against Intertextuality’, *Philosophy and Literature*, 28:2 (2004), 227-242 (p.240)

²⁰ Terry Pratchett, *Wintersmith* (London: Doubleday, 2006), p. 91

²¹ Jasper Fforde, *First Among Sequels* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 2007), p. 142

²² Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Dream-Fridge*,

<<http://www.stormpages.com/bagenders/episodes/2ep3.html>> (currently not online at the main *Bagenders* website 10 September 2007 or on 23 February 2008)

There is a startling and obvious similarity to these three extracts. The first is from Terry Pratchett's 2006 Discworld juvenile *Wintersmith*, the second from Jasper Fforde's 2007 *First Among Sequels* and the third from Lady Alyssa and Random Dent's roughly 2003 'The Dream-Fridge' from their Tolkien fanfiction series *The Bagenders*. Without suggesting that Pratchett or Fforde appropriated or plagiarised Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, it must be acknowledged that 'The Dream-Fridge' seems to herald both *Wintersmith* and *First Among Sequels*. Like Tiffany Aching's cheese in *Wintersmith* which is adopted by the Nac Mac Feegles, the quarter-pound of Old Cordwangler that Aragorn buys in 'The Dream-Fridge' is used as a weapon against Boromir's ghost who has possessed the fridge: 'it growled in response and shuffled closer'.²³ The codenamed X-14 in *First Among Sequels* is altogether more potent than either Old Cordwangler or Lancre Blue:

'We managed to procure a half-ounce. A technician dropped it by mistake and this was the result.' He showed me a photograph of a smoking ruin. 'The remains of our central cheese-testing facility.' He put the photograph away and stared at me. Of course, I *had* seen some X-14. It had been chained up in the back of Pryce's truck the night of the cheese buy.²⁴

It seems likely that Pratchett, Fforde, and Lady Alyssa and Random Dent have drawn on a shared British cultural heritage. This is exemplified by J.R. Daeschner in his examination of the dangers of cheese rolling:

Surprisingly, cheese chasers aren't the only ones at risk. Bystanders have also been hurt – by out-of-control runners [...] and bouncing cheeses [...] By the time they hit the bottom, the cheese wheels are spiralling unpredictably at top speed.²⁵

²³ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Dream-Fridge*,

²⁴ Jasper Fforde, p. 260

²⁵ J.R. Daeschner, *True Brits: A Tour of 21st Century Britain in all its Bog-Snorkelling, Gurning and Cheese-Rolling Glory* (London: Arrow Books Ltd, 2004), p. 48-49

However, Jerome K. Jerome's *Three Men in a Boat* certainly stands out as a possible 'Ur-cheese' text:

Splendid cheeses they were, ripe and mellow, and with a two hundred horse-power scent about them that might have been warranted to carry three miles, and knock a man over at two hundred yards.²⁶

The reality presumably lies somewhere between a shared cultural heritage on the part of the writers and the appropriation of an original text. Tolkien alludes to this issue in 'On Fairy-Stories' where he discusses the development of fairy stories:

Related things appear in very early records; and they are found universally, wherever there is language. We are therefore obviously confronted with a variant of the problem that the archaeologist encounters, or the comparative philologist: with the debate between *independent evolution* (or rather *invention*) of the similar; *inheritance* from a common ancestry; and *diffusion* at various times from one or more centres.²⁷

The idea behind a common cultural source – where texts are multi-referential without deliberate authorial intention, where the reader's creation of the text is as important as the writer's – falls well within the description of text-to-text relationship as described by Pratchett, Fforde and the hypertextual operations of electronic literature. In the mid 1990s, Jim Collins noted that it 'has by now become commonplace to argue that appropriationism signals a fundamental shift in the conception of artistic production in which creativity is no longer conceived of in terms of pure invention but rather as re-articulation of pre-existing codes.'²⁸

Collins distances his theoretical model of appropriation from Michel de Certeau's

²⁶ Jerome K. Jerome, *Three Men in a Boat*, ed. by Geoffrey Harvey (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), p. 26

²⁷ J.R.R. Tolkien, 'On Fairy-Stories', *Tree and Leaf, Smith of Wootton Major, The Homecoming of Beorhtnoth Beorhthelm's Son* (London: Unwin Books, 1975), pp. 11-79 (p. 26)

²⁸ Jim Collins, *Architectures of Excess: Cultural Life in the Information Age* (New York and London: Routledge, 1995), p. 92

‘cultural poaching’ by arguing that the practical aspects of appropriation in postmodern culture are far from being ‘small acts of defiance which, for the most part, go unnoticed’.²⁹ Instead, he suggests that:

Appropriation depends on two interdependent contentions: 1) acknowledging the limits of specific discursive/institutional enclosures that previously restricted the significance and circulation of a particular image or iconography; 2) defying the legitimacy of those limits by taking possession of those images. This determination to take possession, then, does not signify the denial of cultural authority but, rather, the refusal to grant cultural *sovereignty* to any institution, as it counters one sort of authority with another.³⁰

For Collins, appropriation is still a political act. The appropriating artist acknowledges the copyright owner and the issues surrounding the protection of copyrighted material and intellectual property while appropriating this same material and not allowing the copyright owner to influence multitudinous new cultural products by restricting access. This ties in to Fischlin and Fortier’s argument that the word appropriation ‘suggests a hostile takeover, a seizure of authority over the original in a way that appeals to contemporary sensibilities steeped in a politicized understanding of culture.’³¹ Julie Sanders also argues for a political aspect to appropriation: ‘In appropriations, the intertextual relationship may be less explicit, more embedded, but what is often inescapable is the fact that a political commitment shapes a writer’s, director’s, or performer’s decision to re-interpret a source text.’³² While many appropriations may have a specific political intention, the appropriations considered in this thesis, while reflecting the socio-

²⁹ Ibid. p. 93

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Daniel Fischlin and Mark Fortier, *Adaptations of Shakespeare: A Critical Anthology of Plays from the Seventeenth Century to the Present* (London and New York: Routledge, 2000), p. 3

³² Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 2

political and cultural changes around them, do not have a specific political *intention*.

The argument that Tolkien uses *The Lord of the Rings* as a vehicle to comment on mortality, morality and war is unlikely to be questioned. The argument that *The Lord of the Rings* is an intentional carrier for a political construction of masculinity and a subtextual approach to imperialism which has been sustained through continual appropriations of *The Lord of the Rings* is not so easily made. Similarly, although there is certainly a political interpretation of Jackson's use of New Zealand, it was unlikely to be the sole reason for *The Lord of the Rings* being filmed there. Finally, although earlier work on fanfiction has stressed the political agendas of certain genres of fanfiction such as slash (homosexual fanfiction), due to the vast spread of fanfiction written and posted on the internet, it seems likely that, although there are those who still write from specifically political agenda, these fans are now in the minority. It seems likely that, although there are political interpretations of these appropriations, they were not intentionally political. Not all appropriations have this explicit political or ethical agenda and this thesis focuses on appropriations which do not have an *explicit* intentional political schema. Tolkien's appropriation of imperial adventure writers – especially the work of H. Rider Haggard – demonstrates the link between modern fantasy and a tradition of adventure literature which is contemporary with the expansion of the British Empire and tends to be explicitly pro-imperial. Through Tolkien's appropriations, the subtextual themes of imperial masculinity and a colonial approach to the description of landscape, have been sustained in modern literature. Tolkien's appropriations of imperial literature are more

embedded than his appropriations and reworkings of northern mythology and have consequently received considerably less attention and critical analysis which this thesis aims to change.

Jackson's appropriation of New Zealand through his adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings* was not driven from a political agenda but from financial practicalities. However, the treatment of the New Zealand landscape has resulted in a complex political scheme which situates Jackson between neo-colonial and post-colonial perspectives. Fanfiction appropriations for the most part do not have any kind of political agenda. It is easy to read what appears to be an explicitly political agenda into some genres of fanfiction – this is especially true of slash (homosexual) and 'Mary-Sue' (authorial insert) fanfiction – even when it has been written without a specifically political intention. This thesis demonstrates that appropriation may be unintentional and that to draw from a multitude of sources is a natural part of the creative process.

Hypertext → Intertext → Internet

The internet works as a literal hypertext but also as a helpful metaphor for intertextuality. The links between texts as diverse as, for example, London weather reports and football transfer gossip are enabled by the medium of the internet (or in this case, the medium of a large diverse website such as BBCi). Far from having its origins in postmodern theory, Brad Myers points out that: 'The idea for hypertext (where documents are linked to related documents) is credited to Vannevar Bush's famous MEMEX idea from 1945 [...] Ted Nelson coined the

term "hypertext" in 1965'.³³ The importance of the hypertext – both as concept and practice – cannot be underestimated; Myers goes on to note that the hypertext concept predates the internet: 'Tim Berners-Lee used the hypertext idea to create the World Wide Web in 1990 at the government-funded European Particle Physics Laboratory (CERN).'³⁴

In a very real sense, the internet as it works today is a vast hypertext, a 'real' version of intertextual theory, a text that 'can only ever exist through, inside, and across other texts, and through its readers'.³⁵ Users surf from one webpage to another using embedded links and websites such as Amazon.com to create intertextual links by explicitly linking texts through the company marketing strategy. Bruce Lionel Mason argues that with 'hypertextual links on the World Wide Web, the concept of a single, fixed text is exploded as readers "hot-link" themselves around the electronic world, bouncing from idea to idea'.³⁶ This intertextual map can only suggest the intertextual world; it is a simulacrum of an intertextual web which both creates and signifies culture. The internet-as-metaphor for intertextuality allows the theorist to illustrate intertextuality through a mapping of users' movement through the internet.

The suggested effect that one book has on another is illustrated in the way that the University Library works in Terry Pratchett's *Discworld* series. Books in Pratchett's Unseen University Library 'read each other,' and concealed within the Library is a connection to every other library or book shop in the multi-verse, and

³³ Brad A. Myers. "A Brief History of Human Computer Interaction Technology." *ACM Interactions*, 5:2 (1998) 44-54 <<http://www.cs.cmu.edu/~amulet/papers/uihistory.tr.html>> [accessed 17 December 2007]

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Jonathan Gray, *Watching With the Simpsons* (New York and London: Routledge, 2006), p. 3

³⁶ Bruce Lionel Mason, 'E-Texts: The Orality and Literacy Issue Revealed', *Oral Tradition*, 13:2 (1998), 306-329 (p. 323)

the contents of books-of-the-future can be extrapolated by analysing existing books.³⁷ What Pratchett terms 'multi-dimensional L-space' becomes as much an analogy for intertextuality as the internet, just as within Fforde's 'book-verse', the text has a life which is quite independent of its creator. In fact, L-space or the book-verse work as 'a multi-dimensional space in which a variety of writings, none of them original, blend and clash'.³⁸ Despite Foucault's desire for 'a culture in which the fictive would operate in an absolutely free state, in which fiction would be put at the disposal of everyone',³⁹ both L-space and the book-verse feature in texts which use the author's name to indicate that 'this discourse is not ordinary everyday speech [...] it is a speech that must be received in a certain mode and that, in a given culture, must receive a certain status'.⁴⁰ The textually-orientated worlds of Pratchett and Fforde, while appearing to champion Foucault's free state of fiction, actually reinforce the political and ideological power of the concept of the author through their popularity; as published writers they operate within what Foucault calls 'the system of property that characterizes our society', simultaneously reinforcing and transgressing against the ownership of texts.⁴¹ As Joel Rickett of *The Bookseller* notes, 'the author as brand has become ever more important'.⁴² The concept of 'the author' as Foucault described it, was a specific intertext reading: 'Such a name permits one to group together a certain number of

³⁷ Terry Pratchett, *The Last Continent* (London: Doubleday, 1998), p. 24

³⁸ Roland Barthes, 'The Death of the Author' in *The Death and Resurrection of the Author?* ed. by William Irwin (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2002), pp. 3-7 (p. 6)

³⁹ Michel Foucault, 'What Is An Author?' in *The Death and Resurrection of the Author?* (see Barthes, above) pp. 9-22 (p. 22)

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 13

⁴¹ Foucault, p. 14

⁴² Joel Rickett, deputy editor of *The Bookseller*, interviewed by BBC News, '10 Ways to Get You to Read a Book', <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/magazine/7046677.stml>> [accessed 18 October 2007]

texts, define them, differentiate them from and contrast them to others. In addition, it establishes a relationship among the texts.’⁴³

The irony of Pratchett, for example, illustrating Kristeva’s notion of an ‘irreducible plurality of texts within and behind any given text’ is not to be underestimated.⁴⁴ This is demonstrated through the description of the Unseen University Library and is especially stressed in *Sourcery* where the Librarian and the books take shelter from destruction in the Tower of Art that perhaps ‘had been there before the Disc itself [...] raised uncomfortable questions about who had built it and what for’.⁴⁵ This is a common conceit in fantasy literature: an awareness of the texts that have been deliberately appropriated or unconsciously absorbed. Such texts are ‘common discursive “property”’ but their appropriative power is restricted and bound within the manufactured walls of ancient Gondor or the Restricted Section of Hogwarts’s library in order to bolster the ‘originality’ of the text.⁴⁶ The Restricted Section in J.K. Rowling’s *Harry Potter* novels frequently features texts which are essential to the narrative – accessible but just out of reach unless the teenage protagonists obtain them through deceptive appropriations – which could arguably suggest Rowling’s own uncertain relationship with the fantasy canon. Jim Collins, writing on Umberto Eco’s *The Name of the Rose*, suggests that the ‘library becomes here the perfect visualisation of intertextuality, the actual site where texts intersect’.⁴⁷ Equally, the library becomes a place for

⁴³ Foucault, p. 13

⁴⁴ Linda Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction* (London: Routledge, 1996), p. 126

⁴⁵ Terry Pratchett, *Sourcery* (London: Corgi, 1993), p. 213

⁴⁶ Linda Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism*, p. 124.

⁴⁷ Jim Collins, *Uncommon Cultures: Popular Culture and Post-Modernism* (London and NY: Routledge, 1989), p. 63

action, with the narrative symbolically within the space of previous texts. In *The Last Continent*, Pratchett explains that:

all books are tenuously connected through L-space and, therefore, the content of any book ever written *or yet to be written* may, in the right circumstances, be deduced from a sufficiently close study of books already in existence. Future books exist *in potential* [...] ancient spells [...] had meant it took years to put together even the ghost of a page of an unwritten book [...] he was now assembling whole paragraphs in a matter of hours.⁴⁸

For Pratchett, the author's ownership of the text is far less important than the text itself; wizard Ponder Stibbons can assemble fragments of texts but there is no suggestion that he makes any attempt to assign authorship. As on the internet, the text is more important than the author. A text existing *in potentia* as fragments or appearing as a tissue of quotations in another text, naturally undermines the ideal of textual originality, but as Fischlin and Fortier point out: 'the idea of originality [...] posits an independence where none exists – or where only a limited invention is possible'.⁴⁹

In some fantasy texts, the canon is not just alluded to through the use of the 'library' or other collection of texts, but is explicitly quoted or invoked in the appropriating text. Diana Wynne Jones set her 1997 novel *Deep Secret* inside science fiction and fantasy fandom; the majority of the action takes place at PhantasmaCon. Significantly, the heroes Marce and Nick, who are revealed to be the heirs to the Empire of Koryfos in a parallel world, seem to have far fewer problems understanding and coming to terms with the revelations of the narrative. This is in marked contrast to Rupert Venables, the Magrid or wizard-guardian on Earth, who reads through a programme for the convention which is filled with

⁴⁸ Terry Pratchett, *The Last Continent*, p. 18-19

⁴⁹ Fischlin and Fortier, p. 4

events from writers' groups to tarot readings and contains instructions for people intending to bring swords, with growing confusion until he asks his incorporal mentor: 'Stan, who *are* these people?'⁵⁰

Later in the narrative, Marce comments that 'believe it or not, he hasn't even read *I, Robot* or *The Lord of the Rings!*'⁵¹ The implicit subtext is that Marce and Nick, by virtue of their interest in fantasy literature – they have invented their own alternative Bristol called Bristolia – have equipped themselves with the necessary schema in order to survive the fantasy narrative within which they are a part. It is Marce and Nick who undertake the quest to Babylon at the narrative's climax, not Rupert, and it is they who invent the 'witchy dance' which enables them to keep Nick's mother's malevolent goddess at bay.⁵² The implication is that the function of *The Lord of the Rings* within *Deep Secret* – and other texts which signal a relationship with *The Lord of the Rings* – is to work as a cultural shorthand for the reader; the quest in *Deep Secret*, for example, features a difficult and dangerous landscape, has a small number of companions and requires a sacrifice from Nick. *Deep Secret* is not the only Diana Wynne Jones novel to explicitly reference *The Lord of the Rings*. In her 1993 novel *Hexwood*, library clerk Harrison Scudamore turns on the Bannus machine which uses theta space in order to play through different scenarios.⁵³ Nothing quite goes as planned, however:

"You there!" he shouted. "Yes, *you!* You just stop this! All I did was ask you for a role-playing game. You never warned me I'd be pitched into it

⁵⁰ Diana Wynne Jones, *Deep Secret*, p. 72.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, p. 155

⁵² *Ibid.*, p. 328

⁵³ The theta space paratypical field is significantly bigger on the inside than the outside and 'Theta' is rumoured to be the Doctor's real name in *Doctor Who*. An intertextual reference or just coincidence?

for real! *And I asked you for hobbits on a Grail quest, and not one hobbit have I seen! Do you hear me?*"⁵⁴

Like *Deep Secret*'s Maree and Nick, Harrison has been thrown into a fantasy narrative, but his frustration stems from the fact that the narrative within which he finds himself is not behaving according to the rules which he understands; expecting *The Lord of the Rings*, he instead finds himself in *Hexwood*, which is not only the name of the narrative but also the site of the action. In this way, Diana Wynne Jones works against the assumptions made by Harrison who stands in for the reader. The appropriation in *Hexwood*, despite more clearly referencing *The Lord of the Rings*, is, therefore, in line with Jonathan Culler's observation that: 'Regardless of the degree of presence, the fact remains that a specific text has activated specific relations with another text or set of texts instead of other equally available texts.'⁵⁵ In *The Lord of the Rings*, Tolkien's appropriations are more concealed, but the intertextual appropriations from *Beowulf* and the *Elder Edda*, for example, lie on a framework appropriated from empire adventure literature. This is not as obvious as an explicit reference to a text – for example, the subtle references to *The Lord of the Rings* in Diana Wynne Jones's *Deep Secret* or the rewriting of *The Lord of the Rings* in fanfiction appropriations.

We Invented the Remix: Appropriation and the Law

While theorists such as Foucault, Hutcheon and Margaret Rose can debate and discuss the different meanings and scope of the word 'parody', for example, it is crucial to remember that parody – unlike postmodernism – is not just a word

⁵⁴ Diana Wynne Jones, *Hexwood* (London: Collins, 2000), p. 340

⁵⁵ Culler, p. 49

indicating a broad range of appropriative practices, but has a specific meaning in English and American copyright law. In the United States, ‘constitutionally based arguments have given the defence of parody a strong position in copyright and other intellectual property litigation.’⁵⁶ In a similar sense, the word ‘adaptation’ in law has a specific meaning which is distinct from the way adaptation is culturally understood. For example, as Gerald Dworkin and Richard D. Taylor point out, ‘a *literary work* used in a film does not fall within the scope of “adaptation” but it could still be “copying”, that is “reproducing the work in any material form”’.⁵⁷

However, as Jennifer Davis discusses, the Court of Appeal has identified ‘a potential for conflict between copyright law and freedom of expression.’⁵⁸ She draws attention to Lord Phillips MR who ‘pointed out that copyright is “antithetical” to freedom of expression, since it prevents all save the copyright owner from expressing information in the form of the literary work protected by copyright.’⁵⁹ However, while Lord Phillips acknowledged that these situations were unlikely to occur frequently, he noted that current copyright legislation would, in some circumstances, be unable to cover such exemptions:

while freedom of expression does not confer the freedom routinely to use a form of expression devised by someone else, there were circumstances when the freedom to do so was important. These circumstances may be rare, but, where they did occur, freedom of expression would come into conflict with copyright, *despite the exceptions provided in the Act*.⁶⁰

Copyright law is a highly complex and ever-evolving part of legislation which is becoming increasingly out-paced by new technologies. Recent

⁵⁶ Jeremy Phillips and Alison Firth, *Introduction to Intellectual Property Law*, 4th edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), p. 181

⁵⁷ Dworkin and Taylor, p. 65

⁵⁸ Jennifer Davis, *Intellectual Property Law*, 3rd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 63

⁵⁹ Davis, p. 63

⁶⁰ *Ibid.* Italics added.

controversies over peer-to-peer networks and DRM (digital rights management) software embedded on CDs and DVDs, and the legal battle between Novell and Sco (Santa Cruz Operation) over ownership of open source code have only heightened an awareness of the pervasive nature of copyright in the postmodern world.⁶¹ The internet and the current lack of a cohesive international legislation for copyright has led to an increasing awareness that current copyright law is not capable of dealing with new technologies and is perceived as being weighted unfairly towards large corporations. Rosemary J. Coombe and Andrew Herman note that:

Legislation introduced in the United States and the new Internet Committee for the Assignment of Names and Numbers (ICANN) policy have made it fairly simple for corporate trademark owners to prevent the use of their trademarks when these are being used commercially and in bad faith. The perceived tendency of domain-name dispute-resolution arbitrators to favor corporate trademark holders regardless of the intentions or practices of those using the domains, and thus to see in any use of a trademark evidence of bad faith, is the subject of much hostile comment on the Web.⁶²

They go on to observe that the ability of corporations to control their intellectual property is being steadily eroded by new technological advances: 'corporate capacity to maintain a monopoly over the flow of their symbols or to control the meanings given to their signs is severely compromised in digital environments'.⁶³ In addition, copyright law in the United Kingdom and the United States is increasingly seen as protecting the rights of the copyright owner – who may not be the creator – to 'exploit a work economically.'⁶⁴ Lawrence Lessig notes that in the

⁶¹ See the website Groklaw.net for explanations of this case.

⁶² Rosemary J. Coombe and Andrew Herman, 'Culture Wars on the Net: Intellectual Property and Corporate Propriety in Digital Environments', *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 100:4 (2001), 919-947 (p. 923)

⁶³ *Ibid.*, p. 933

⁶⁴ Davis, p. 64

United States, not only has society moved from a legislative code where only a small proportion of creative products were subject to copyright laws but:

in the last forty years, Congress has extended the term of copyright retrospectively eleven times. Each time, it is said, with only a bit of exaggeration, that Mickey Mouse is about to fall into the public domain, the term of copyright for Mickey Mouse is extended.⁶⁵

Even more crucially for artists, writers and the writers of fanfiction, Dworkin and Taylor warn that:

the general laws of copyright may still enable a court to decide, for example, that a person who uses a sufficient number of ideas, incidents and characters from a protected literary work *may be* infringing because he is taking a substantial part of the work notwithstanding the limited amount of copying of the exact wording of the copyright work.⁶⁶

However, as Lesley Ellen Harris explains, ideas are not protected by copyright, only the presentation of the ideas: 'Where plagiarism is an appropriation of ideas, without the appropriation of the actual expression of those ideas, it is not a violation of copyright since copyright does not protect ideas.'⁶⁷ In addition, as the ruling of *Francis, Day and Hunter v Bron* (1968) demonstrates, 'the court held that copying need not be a conscious act; it was possible in law to copy subconsciously'.⁶⁸ The CDPA 1988 asserts the moral right of authors to 'object to derogatory treatment of the work, where derogatory treatment amounts to distortion or mutilation of the work, or is otherwise prejudicial to the honour or reputation of the author or director.'⁶⁹ However, Jennifer Davis notes that: 'Moral rights may be expensive to enforce, and the outcome of such an action may be

⁶⁵ Davis, p. 107

⁶⁶ Dworkin and Taylor, p. 65. Italics added.

⁶⁷ Lesley Ellen Harris, *Digital Property: Currency of the 21st Century* (Ontario: McGraw Hill Ryerson Ltd, 1998), p. 161

⁶⁸ Dworkin and Taylor, p. 58

⁶⁹ Davis, p. 65

uncertain.’⁷⁰ This goes some way to demonstrating the complexity of copyright legislation and its practical application.

This makes problematic a practical application of a theory of appropriation which states that, not only is any artefact in society open for appropriation, but also that this is a perfectly legitimate human expression of creativity and does indeed thrive in particular areas of the creative arts; for example, Matt Mason makes the point that in the fashion industry, rather than appropriation stifling creativity, there is significant evidence that ‘appropriation speeds diffusion.’⁷¹ He goes on to conclude that:

The success of the fashion industry makes it clear that strict copyright laws aren’t always necessary to protect the incentive to innovate. In fact, it turns this notion on its head. Without the freedom to copy, fashion trends would occur very slowly.⁷²

Rather than ‘appropriation’, Matt Mason uses ‘remix’ which might, through his definition of re-mixing as ‘taking something that already exists and redefining it in your own personal creative space, reinterpreting someone else’s work your way’ work as another form of appropriation.⁷³ This would overlap with the parody, because although Margaret Rose argues persuasively that ‘parody can be used in a variety of different ways and for both meta-fictional and non-meta-fictional comic purposes’, I believe that the reclamation of the term ‘appropriation’ allows

⁷⁰ Davis, p. 65

⁷¹ Matt Mason, *The Pirate’s Dilemma: How Hackers, Punk Capitalists, Graffiti Millionaires and Other Youth Movements Are Remixing Our Culture and Changing Our World* (London: Penguin Books, 2008), p. 95

⁷² Matt Mason, p. 97

⁷³ *Ibid.*, p. 71

parody's unwieldy extensions to be removed in favour of clarity within theoretical and colloquial understandings of the term.⁷⁴

The Shaping of *The Lord of the Rings*

The appeal of repetition – and through it, nostalgia – is perhaps more obvious in fantasy literature and this is certainly a strong criticism of the genre but, I would argue, it is also one of its greatest strengths.⁷⁵ John Garth argues that:

Nostalgia, a word that had hitherto always meant homesickness, began to appear in its now prevalent sense – regretful or wistful yearning for the past – straight after the Great War. To Tolkien's generation, nostalgia was a constant companion: they were looking over their shoulders, like the survivors of Gondolin, at an old home that seemed now to embody everything beautiful and doomed.⁷⁶

The nostalgic appeal of the textual landscape of *The Lord of the Rings* is one of the most telling features of its time. John Garth suggests that it could only have been written *after* the First World War for precisely these reasons. *The Lord of the Rings* is not a static narrative; there is little sense of disconnection between 'adventure time' and 'real time' in the novel. The strength of *The Lord of the Rings* is that unlike H. Rider Haggard and G.A. Henty, the destruction and change occurs throughout Middle-earth and into the Shire: 'the life of the Shire is represented as a fantasy that cannot last. The novel's depiction of the old life in the Shire makes it tempting to mourn its passing, but it was only ever a delusion'.⁷⁷ Tolkien's

⁷⁴ Margaret A. Rose, *Parody: Ancient, Modern, and Post-Modern* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), p. 278

⁷⁵ The irony in criticism of fantasy for a predominance of formulaic narratives is that critics seem to assume that this is only the case for fantasy; romantic comedies and crime fiction are rarely examined with the same negative criticism.

⁷⁶ John Garth, *Tolkien and the Great War: The Threshold of Middle-earth* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2004), p. 297-8

⁷⁷ John C. Hunter, 'The Evidence of Things Not Seen: Critical Mythology and *The Lord of the Rings*', *Journal of Modern Literature*, 29:2 (2006), 129-147 (p. 141)

mythology evolved from the earliest poetry and fragments of stories which he began to write as a young man, but really began to take form during and after the Great War. John Garth draws attention to Tolkien's sonnet entitled 'Kôr' (dated 30 April 1915), which draws directly on the city of the same name in Haggard's *She*. Garth suggests that although there are marked differences between the presentation of the city of Kôr, Tolkien's 'use of the name "Kôr" now, instead of "Tanagui", may be seen as a direct challenge to Haggard's despairing view of mortality, memory, and meaning.'⁷⁸ In composing *The Lord of the Rings*, he did not just draw on his extended mythology but also on his earlier work, *The Hobbit*.

Tom Shippey's continual use of words such as 're-creation'⁷⁹, 'reconstruction'⁸⁰ and his description of the 'master-text'⁸¹ of Northern European poetry and myth that Tolkien accessed serves to both legitimise and obfuscate Tolkien's own literary appropriation. There is something particularly appropriate in the story of a professor of Anglo-Saxon literature who reworks ancient northern literature to create a mythology for England; rather than these poems becoming more accessible through Tolkien, the academic esotericism of Anglo-Saxon literature is still reserved for university students – the 2007 film *Beowulf*, despite a number of high profile actors and cutting edge special effects seems unlikely to reverse this trend. As Jared Lobdell argues persuasively, such texts are 'part of the influence of Tolkien's professional life on his imaginative life'.⁸² Lobdell's distinction between Tolkien's professional influences, such as 'Beowulf', 'Sir

⁷⁸ Garth, p. 80

⁷⁹ T.A. Shippey, *The Road to Middle-earth: How J.R.R. Tolkien Created a New Mythology* (London: Grafton, 1992), p. 53

⁸⁰ Ibid., p. 60

⁸¹ T.A. Shippey, *The Road to Middle-earth*, p. 57

⁸² Jared Lobdell, 'Defining *The Lord of the Rings*: An Adventure Story in the Edwardian Mode', in *J.R.R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2000), pp.107-124 (p. 116)

Gawain and the Green Knight' and the *Elder Edda*, and the other imaginative writers he was likely to have come into contact with – an assertion which is supported by the astonishing spread and popularity of Robert Louis Stevenson, G.A. Henty, G.K. Chesterton, and H. Rider Haggard – is not to be underestimated. Historically, Tolkien scholarship has concentrated on elucidating the links between medieval literature, northern European myth and the First World War and *The Lord of the Rings* rather than examining Tolkien's contextual status as a late Edwardian writer. William H. Green notes that Tolkien's 'self-reporting of literary influence is obscure and contradictory, not because he plagiarised, but because his creative method involved impulsive inattention, deliberate ignoring of analogues as he cultivated an autonomous fantasy world'.⁸³

Martin Simonson observes of the representation of the Shire as pre-World War One rural England that: 'the literary traditions that Tolkien uses to portray this world belong fundamentally to the realm of the [...] Victorian novel'.⁸⁴ It is equally significant that Tolkien's nostalgic view of English rural life as presented through the Shire is, of necessity, a fictional one. Flora Thompson's fictionalised autobiography of her early life in rural Oxfordshire at the turn of the century, for example, portrays a much grimmer – and more accurate - view of rural life than is glimpsed through *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*.⁸⁵

The most obvious source of Tolkien's appropriation comes from his earlier work, *The Hobbit*. That both *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* have suffered with the inaccurate appellations 'prequel' or 'sequel' is not in question; the texts

⁸³ William H. Green, 'King Thorin's Mines: *The Hobbit* as Victorian Adventure Novel', *Extrapolation: A Journal of Science Fiction and Fantasy*, 42 (2001), 53-64 (p. 54)

⁸⁴ Martin Simonson, 'Three Is Company: Novel, Fairytale, and Romance on the Journey Through the Shire', *Tolkien Studies*, 3 (2006), 81-100 (p. 81)

⁸⁵ See Flora Thompson, *Lark Rise to Candleford* (London: Penguin Classics, 2000)

have much in common but probably no more than *The Lord of the Rings* has with *The Silmarillion*. It is more accurate to refer to *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* as narratives which happen to take place in the same world; there is significantly less relationship between *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* than there is between David Eddings's *The Belgariad* series and *The Mallorean* series. Opinion is markedly different when the relationship between *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* is evaluated. For example, Paul Kocher argues that despite 'its surface connection with *The Lord of the Rings* the two works are so unlike fundamentally as to be different in kind'.⁸⁶ Randel Helms, in comparison, suggests that 'in *The Hobbit* and its sequel we have what is in fact the same story told twice, first very simply, and then very intricately.'⁸⁷

Tolkien noted that only one 'liberty, if such it is, has been to make Bilbo's Ring the One Ring: all rings had the same source, before ever he put his hand on it in the dark,'⁸⁸ and this is supported by *The Hobbit*: 'who knows how Gollum came by that present, ages ago in the old days when such rings were still at large in the world? Perhaps even the Master who ruled them could not have said.'⁸⁹ Randel Helms argues that 'one could almost say that as soon as Gollum and the Ring appear *The Lord of the Rings* was inevitable,' but this interpretation supposes that *The Lord of the Rings* is essentially the story of the Ring, when it is more accurate to argue that the Ring is the means by which the narrative progresses without

⁸⁶ Paul Kocher, *Master of Middle-earth: The Achievement of J.R.R. Tolkien* (London: Pimlico, 2002), p. 19

⁸⁷ Randel Helms, *Tolkien's World* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975), p. 29

⁸⁸ J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, ed. by Humphrey Carpenter (London: George Allan and Unwin, 1981), p. 122

⁸⁹ J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Hobbit*, 4th edn (London: Unwin Hyman Ltd, 1981) p. 85

actually being the centre of the narrative itself.⁹⁰ *The Lord of the Rings* is a quest story, but it is not *merely* a quest story – it is the effect of the Ring on those who are closest to it which is far closer to the heart of the narrative, just as the Grail stories concentrate more on the journey and the effect of the journey on the Knights of the Round Table than on accomplishing their goal. Gollum’s significance to the plot of *The Hobbit* rests solely on Bilbo’s efforts to escape from the Misty Mountains and the fortuitous use of a magic ring which renders the wearer invisible. Gollum’s significance to *The Lord of the Rings* is far greater; he alerts Sauron to the presence of the Ring in the Shire and, as Gandalf tells Frodo, ‘may even think that the long-unnoticed name of *Baggins* has become important’.⁹¹ His presence in *The Hobbit* has been rewritten with greater significance following the events of *The Lord of the Rings*. The novel seems to almost change emphasis following a reading of *The Lord of the Rings*; the most significant event in *The Hobbit* becomes not the recovery of the Arkenstone or the killing of Smaug but the recovery of the Ring.

The Hobbit is often considered the prequel to *The Lord of the Rings*. This is a questionable classification, not least because prequels are written and published *after* the original text and *The Hobbit* precedes *The Lord of the Rings* by some twenty years. In some respects it is a lesser text; the cosy, patronising narrative voice dates it far more than the more formal language used in *The Lord of the Rings*. The world of *The Hobbit* ‘is not called Middle-earth, its vegetation and creatures are not yet visualised in patient detail and it has no larger geographical or

⁹⁰ Helms, p. 41

⁹¹ J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Lord of the Rings* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2005), p. 59

historical context whatever'.⁹² Gandalf, Elrond and the Necromancer are mere shadows of their eventual forms in *The Lord of the Rings*; the Battle of the Five Armies seems a skirmish compared to the Battle of Helms Deep and Pelennor Fields. Only Gollum seems thoroughly consistent from his brief appearance in *The Hobbit* to *The Lord of the Rings*. Despite the narrator's assertion that 'I don't know where he came from, nor who or what he was'⁹³ when Bilbo first enters Gollum's cave, there is some indication that Gollum's origins were less abstract:

Riddles were all he could think of. Asking them, and sometimes guessing them, had been the only game he had ever played with other funny creatures sitting in their holes in the long, long ago, before he lost all his friends and was driven away, alone, and crept down, down, into the dark under the mountains.⁹⁴

Gollum also remembers 'when he lived with his grandmother in a hole in a bank by a river,'⁹⁵ and *The Fellowship of the Ring* expands this, reinforcing Gollum's hobbit-like origin and nature:

Long after, but still very long ago, there lived by the banks of the Great River on the edge of Wilderland a clever-handed and quiet-footed little people. I guess they were of hobbit-kind; akin to the fathers of the Stoors, for they loved the River, and often swam in it, or made little boats of reeds. There was among them a family of high repute, for it was large and wealthier than most, and it was ruled by a grandmother of the folk, stern and wise in old lore, such as they had. The most inquisitive and curious-minded of that family was called Sméagol.⁹⁶

The significance of Tolkien's adherence to his earlier conception of Gollum is not to be underestimated. Gollum's brief – but highly memorable – appearance in *The*

⁹² Paul Kocher, 'Middle-earth: An Imaginary World?' in *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism*, ed. by Rose A. Zimbardo and Neil D. Isaacs (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 2004), pp. 146-162 (p. 161)

⁹³ *The Hobbit*, p. 77

⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 78

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 80

⁹⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 52-53

Hobbit allows for as much expansion and reinvention as the Necromancer of whom a brief explanation suffices to allow for connection between the mysterious Necromancer and Morgoth's servant: 'I myself dared to pass the doors of the Necromancer in Dol Guldur, and secretly explored his ways, and found thus that our fears were true: he was none other than Sauron, our Enemy of old'.⁹⁷ Not only does Tolkien choose to stay consistent to his earlier description of Gollum, but his extension of Gollum's origins are part of chapter two, 'The Shadow of the Past', which follows from a description of Frodo's origins and family in chapter one: 'Baggins is his name, but he's more than half a Brandybuck, they say [...] they're a queer breed, seemingly. They fool about with boats on that big river – and that isn't natural.'⁹⁸

Like Gollum, Frodo is part of a wealthy family of 'high repute', related as he is to the Tooks and the Brandybucks as well as becoming Bilbo's heir. Like Gollum, Frodo will carry the Ring and suffer its effects. Like Gollum, Frodo will make 'his slow, sneaking way, step by step, mile by mile, south, down at last to the Land of Mordor'.⁹⁹ Gollum is linked not only to Frodo through the Brandybuck connection but also to Merry who deduces that Bilbo's Ring, with its strange properties, is linked to Frodo wishing to leave Hobbiton:

My dear old hobbit, you don't allow for the inquisitiveness of friends. I have known about the existence of the Ring for years – before Bilbo went away, in fact; but since he obviously regarded it as secret, I kept the knowledge in my head, until we formed our conspiracy.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁷ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 250

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 22

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 58

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 104

However, from 1951 onwards, *The Hobbit* reflected Tolkien's changes to the text to bring it into line with *The Lord of the Rings*. Originally, Gollum's ring was to be the prize in the riddle contest and upon losing the contest, Gollum reluctantly went back to his island to find the ring to give to Bilbo. However, Bilbo already had the ring and, therefore, Gollum was unable to find it. As the recently published and annotated manuscript of the original version of *The Hobbit* shows, Bilbo's possession of the ring necessitated his deception of Gollum:

I don't know how many times Gollum begged Bilbo's pardon. And he offered him fish caught fresh to eat instead (Bilbo shuddered at the thought of it) [...] but he said 'no thank you' quite politely. He was thinking, thinking hard – and the idea came to him that he must have found that ring, that he had that very ring in his pocket. But he had the wits not to tell Gollum. 'Finding's keeping' he said to himself; and being in a very tight place I think he was right, and anyway the ring belonged to him now. But to Gollum he said, 'Never mind, the ring would have been mine now if you could have found it, so you haven't lost it. And I will forgive you on one condition.

'Yes what is it, what does it wish us to do, my precious.'

'Help me get out of these places', said Bilbo.

To this Gollum agreed, as he had to if he wasn't to cheat, though he would very much have liked to have just tasted what Bilbo was like.¹⁰¹

Paul Kocher notes that by 'this new element prefacing *The Lord of the Rings*, as well as by some textual modifications in the later editions of *The Hobbit*, Tolkien provides for the necessary transition from the latter's mere ring of invisibility to the epic's great Ring of Power.'¹⁰²

Peter Jackson and the Fellowship of New Zealand

The Lord of the Rings is a fantasy novel. In some respects, it is *the* fantasy novel; as Brian Attebery suggested, 'one way to characterise the genre of fantasy is the

¹⁰¹ J.R.R. Tolkien, *The History of the Hobbit, Part One: Mr Baggins*, ed. by John D. Rateliff (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2007), p. 160-161

¹⁰² Paul Kocher, *Master of Middle-earth*, p. 29

set of texts that in some way or other resemble *Lord of the Rings*.¹⁰³ As a result of the huge influence *The Lord of the Rings* has had over the genre as a whole, fantasy literature now demands a quasi-real geography; whether it is an extended archipelago as in Ursula K. Le Guin's *Earthsea* or a post-apocalyptic idyll in the *Shannara* series by Terry Brooks. Fantasy demands further that the plot take the characters all over this fantasy landscape. *The Lord of the Rings* films provide a space for the historic rewriting of New Zealand – and the United Kingdom – as sites of heroic action; a site of retrieval of 'religious, historic and personal memories'.¹⁰⁴

Anthony Burgess argues that 'every best-selling novel *has* to be turned into a film, the assumption being that the book itself whets an appetite for the true fulfilment – the verbal shadow turned into light, the word made flesh.'¹⁰⁵

Adaptations have always made up a significant proportion of the cinematic offerings every year and in particular, adaptations have dominated cinema for the last few years across a wide variety of genres.¹⁰⁶ But the process of adaptation is not without its problems and it is difficult to imagine a live-action version of *The Lord of the Rings* without the use of helicopters for aerial shots or the computer generated imagery which saturates the film without overwhelming it.

Morris Beja noted that 'in one respect, the quality of the experience in watching a serial television version of a novel will undeniably be closer to reading

¹⁰³ Brian Attebery, *Strategies of Fantasy* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1992), p. 14

¹⁰⁴ Allen Abramson, 'Mythical Land, Legal Boundaries: Wonderings About Landscape and Other Tracts', in *Land, Law and Environment: Mythical Land, Legal Boundaries*, ed. by Allen Abramson and Dimitrios Theodossopoulos (London: Pluto Press Ltd, 2000), pp. 1-30 (p. 5)

¹⁰⁵ Brian McFarlane, *Novel to Film* (London: Clarendon Press, 1996), p. 7

¹⁰⁶ For example, *Memoirs of a Geisha*, *The Bourne Identity*, *The Da Vinci Code*

most novels than a feature film can be.¹⁰⁷ Beja, one feels, would be greatly in favour of the DVD extended versions of *The Lord of the Rings*. Looking at the sheer breadth and scale of *The Lord of the Rings*, it becomes difficult to envisage it as a two-and-a-half-hour long film; it is simply too big a novel to be condensed into so short a time.¹⁰⁸ Despite Ralph Bakshi's efforts, trying to sell *The Lord of the Rings* as a children's feature was not successful either. Bakshi's animation is something of a footnote in the success of *The Lord of the Rings*: neither the images nor the adaptation itself have carved out a place in cinematic history.

There are several different kinds of appropriation present in Jackson's cinematic *The Lord of the Rings*. These range from his appropriation of New Zealand, intertextual references between the cinematic *The Lord of the Rings* and other genre films such as *Star Wars* and his translation of Tolkien's text from page to screen. Adaptation becomes a tool by which the comprehensive appropriation of source texts such as novels, films and non-fiction is realised. Sanders's book, *Adaptation and Appropriation*, clearly signals the importance of these two practices to the production of new creative products from music to the arts and literature, and is essential reading for anyone interested in the theory of appropriation or adaptation theory. Her definition of adaptation is both broad and widely applicable as she argues that it entails a 'transition from one genre to another: novels into film; drama into musical; the dramatization of prose narrative and prose fiction; or the inverse movement of making drama into prose narrative.'¹⁰⁹ Adaptation, for Sanders, is a broad but restrictive translational

¹⁰⁷ Morris Beja in Robert Giddings, Keith Selby and Chris Wensley, *Screening the Novel: The Theory and Practice of Literary Dramatization* (London: Palgrave Macmillan 1990), p. 4

¹⁰⁸ Actually, six novels published as a trilogy.

¹⁰⁹ Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 19

process which is characterised *by* the transformational aspects of the process.

Adaptation may therefore be regarded as an extensive reworking or translation of a source text into another medium. In contrast, appropriation ‘borrows’ from one or more source texts to create a new product which has a relationship with the originating text in a more or less significant fashion. Sanders explains this as:

An adaptation signals a relationship with an informing source text or original [...] appropriation frequently affects a more decisive journey away from the informing source into a wholly new cultural product and domain [...] the appropriated text or texts are not always as clearly signalled or acknowledged as in the adaptive process.¹¹⁰

The cinematic *The Two Towers* is an adaptation or translation of the source text *The Two Towers*. However, Jackson excluded two of the most significant elements from *The Two Towers* when he moved the death of Boromir to the film *The Fellowship of the Ring* and Frodo’s encounter with Shelob to *The Return of the King*.¹¹¹ Diana Paxson suggests that such reorganising is indicative of the practical demands of modern film making. She states that: ‘Jackson felt that to maintain viewer interest he needed to intercut [the Dead Marshes, Rohan and Fangorn] storylines.’¹¹² This in turn led to the problem of the emotional impact and narrative power of scenes in each storyline being cancelled out. The Battle at Helm’s Deep in contrast, which takes place over only a few pages in Tolkien’s text is conflated to an extended battle sequence which lasts for nearly half the film – this change in

¹¹⁰ Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 27

¹¹¹ See Brian Rosebury, ‘The Cultural Phenomenon: Relabelling, Assimilation, Imitation, Adaptation’ in *Tolkien, A Cultural Phenomenon* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003) pp. 193-220 for an interesting elucidation of the strengths and weakness of the BBC Radio adaptation, Ralph Bakshi’s 1978 animation and Jackson’s films.

¹¹² Diana Paxson, *Re-vision: The Lord of the Rings in Print and On Screen*, in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson’s The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press), pp. 81-99 (p. 87)

particular is perhaps indicative of studio demands that the film should attract non-Tolkien fans.

It is worth considering that *The Lord of the Rings* may exist as a narrative *apart* from Tolkien's written text, as a core cultural narrative which forms part of the cultural backdrop of Europe and America. For example, many fantasy writers evoke *The Lord of the Rings* either explicitly as in the novels of Diana Wynne Jones, or implicitly in the Discworld series by Terry Pratchett. Post 2003 and the cinema release of *The Return of the King*, fantasy writers are beginning to distinguish between Tolkien's text and Jackson's when citing *The Lord of the Rings*. This is particularly apparent in Garry Kilworth's *Attica* which takes place in the attic of step-siblings Jordy, Chloe and Alex where they intend to search for an antique watch:

'A quest!' cried Chloc. '*Lord of the Rings*.'
'I hope not,' Jordy said to her. 'Those Hobbits had a hell of a time getting to where they wanted to go, didn't they? Oh, I know, I only saw the movie and didn't read the book, but I know the story.'¹¹³

Kilworth seems to be suggesting here that *The Lord of the Rings* is in some way independent of either Tolkien or Jackson; Jordy says 'I know the story' as if the story of *The Lord of the Rings* is a separate entity from its (re)presentation in literature or on film. Here, the 'knowing' of *The Lord of the Rings* becomes comparable with 'knowing' other cultural narratives such as Robin Hood.

Craig Hight suggest that the extended (and DVD only) version of Jackson's films were intended to be the 'definitive versions of narratives that could not be

¹¹³ Garry Kilworth, *Attica* (London: Atom, 2007) p. 35

fully realized within the time constraints of a theatrical release'.¹¹⁴ This interpretation is somewhat contested by Cara Lane's discussion of the cinematic and DVD releases of Jackson's adaptations: 'No one version of the "ring" trilogy does rule them all; instead, there are multiple "rings," each offering a different version of the tale'.¹¹⁵ The multiplicity of *The Lord of the Rings* and the different mediums in which it exists – paintings by Alan Lee, John Howe and many others, the music of the Tolkien Ensemble, *The Lord of the Rings* musical, Electronic Arts (EA) computer games, animation, live action film and dozens of editions of the printed novel – complicate the assumption that there is a clear linear relationship between originating text and subsequent adaptations. Sarah Cardwell illustrates this when she describes adaptation as 'having a base or centre, from which all subsequent adaptations (versions) arise.'¹¹⁶ The relationship between the original text and adaptation, particularly when the translation is from printed text to visual image stresses the reciprocal impact that a film can potentially have on a printed text. David Bratman, for example, points out that:

The book is being drowned out and substituted for by the films in any number of ways. *It will eventually take over from Tolkien's book as the predominant public image of Middle-earth.* This may seem unlikely, but it is already happening.¹¹⁷

Bratman argues that while Tolkien-the-author will outlast Jackson-the-director and individual readers will be enjoying Tolkien long after Jackson's films are regarded as dated and the special effects as archaic, *the public image* of Middle-earth will

¹¹⁴ Craig Hight, 'Making-of Documentaries on DVD: *The Lord of the Rings* Trilogy and Special Editions', *The Velvet Light Trap*, 56 (Fall 2005), 4-17 (p. 6)

¹¹⁵ Cara Lane, 'The Ring Returns: Adaptation and the Trilogy', *Film & History: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Film and Television Studies*, 35:1 (2005), 67-69 (p. 67)

¹¹⁶ Sarah Cardwell, *Adaptation Revisited: Television and the Classic Novel* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2002), p. 13

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 40. Italics added.

continue to be that of Jackson's films. In one sense, Bratman is absolutely correct; the images generated by the films are likely to remain as the dominant visual reference for *The Lord of the Rings* because the images in the film have been so widely spread and have themselves become part of visual culture in the same way that the 1931 *Frankenstein* film, and in particular Boris Karloff's appearance and performance as the Monster, has come to stand in for Mary Shelley's novel. Bratman seems to suggest that Jackson's visual conception of *The Lord of the Rings* – and he may well have intended to comment merely on the plot alterations but by referring to the 'image' of Middle-earth, Bratman has of necessity included the visual representation of the films – exists independently of Tolkien. Bratman notes of Alan Lee and John Howe that 'their concepts and set design are the best thing about Jackson's films.'¹¹⁸ What Bratman does not consider – or perhaps has discarded as unimportant to what appears to be a literary critic's analysis of a film adaptation – is the *impact* of John Howe and Alan Lee's art on the public imagination and conception of the visual representation of *The Lord of the Rings* prior to Jackson's adaptations. Jim Smith and J. Clive Matthews argue that:

The decision by Peter Jackson to enlist the aid of respected Tolkien artists Alan Lee and John Howe to produce concept sketches and initial character, costume and set designs, was therefore one of his most sensible moves. By basing the look of his Middle-earth on the style of Lee and Howe, whose illustrations have adorned the pages of innumerable editions of the author's works, in one fell swoop Jackson was able to bring *his* Middle-earth's visual style in line with that of a huge number of fans whose impressions of Tolkien's work had been shaped by the work of those artists.¹¹⁹

¹¹⁸ David Bratman, 'Summa Jacksonica: A Reply to Defenses of Peter Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* films, After St. Thomas Aquinas', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings**, (see Paxson, above) pp. 27-62 (p. 51)

¹¹⁹ Jim Smith and J. Clive Matthews, *The Lord of the Rings: The Films, the Books, the Radio Series* (London: Virgin Books Ltd, 2004), p. 212.

Brian Rosebury also draws attention to this, noting that ‘the imagery is often mediated through earlier book illustrations’.¹²⁰ The work of Howe and Lee can be seen clearly in *The Fellowship of the Ring* where several of their paintings have been turned into sets in the film. Indeed, Dan Hennah, the Supervising Art Director and Set Decorator for Jackson’s *The Lord of the Rings*, notes that ‘we were forever going back to the book: we’d read the script to find out *what* was happening, but we’d always consult the book to find out *why*’ and Brian Sibley reports that the Art Department on *The Lord of the Rings* set had copies of not only Alan Lee and John Howe’s art but also Tolkien’s illustrations.¹²¹ Even more crucially, ‘Our aim [...] has been to stay true to Tolkien’s vision and to the accepted versions of that vision’ – the ‘accepted versions’ by implication are those commissioned or licensed by the publishing company and the owners of the copyright.¹²² Arguably, the authenticity and success of Jackson’s vision is sustained by its relationship to other ‘official’ visions of Middle-earth.

Jackson’s adaptations have perhaps also led to a recognition from film studio executives that fantasy does not have to be shallow, that it can be relevant, and that as a genre it is just as worthy as any other. Considering the science fiction and fantasy films of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries alone, it becomes difficult to accept without critical comment J.E. Smyth’s argument that it took cinema ‘nearly fifty years to transform narratives that seem ideal for the classical cinematic epic’.¹²³ Just because films such as *Star Wars* and *Stargate* feature the

¹²⁰ Brian Rosebury, *Tolkien: A Cultural Phenomenon* (Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003) p. 213

¹²¹ Dan Hennah quoted in Brian Sibley, *The Lord of the Rings: The Making of the Movie Trilogy* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2002) p. 44

¹²² Hennah quoted in Sibley, p. 45

¹²³ J.E. Smyth, ‘The Three Ages of Imperial Cinema from the Death of Gordon to

overthrow of an 'evil' empire, does not mean that such narratives are not highly influenced by imperial rhetoric; Floyd D. Cheung saw *Stargate* as representing 'the late twentieth-century American Janus: one face looking backwards toward the history of revolution and its rhetoric of resistance, and the other looking forward at horizons of neocolonial advancement'.¹²⁴ Kristin Thompson makes a similar point concerning Jackson's films as M. Daphne Kutzer does for Tolkien's novel, that it is anti-imperialist because '*The Lord of the Rings* shows imperialism from the viewpoint of peoples who unite to defend themselves'.¹²⁵ As Barbara Bush notes, 'empire is one but not the only form of imperialism' and this is an excellent example of why investigation into colonial/imperial and postcolonial/neo-colonial theory needs to be broadened to draw attention to the imperial subtext to modern life.¹²⁶ Though the 'traditional' European empires have disintegrated or been surrendered back, their place may have been taken by the large multi-national corporations with huge resources, considerable power and extensive control over intellectual property rights, including published fiction in all its forms. Inevitably, this brings the corporations into conflict with the individuals who would re-write these stories for their own reasons.

A Natural History of Fandom

What is recognised as modern fandom – literally a community of enthusiasts of one or more media or written texts – is commonly thought to have begun in the

The Lord of the Rings', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's*

The Lord of the Rings, (see Paxson, above), pp. 3-23 (p. 20)

¹²⁴ Floyd D. Cheung, 'Imagining Danger, Imagining Nation: Postcolonial Discourse in *Rising Sun* and *Stargate*', *Jouvert*, <<http://social.chass.ncsu.edu/Jouvert/v2i2/cheung.htm>>[accessed 14 September 2006]

¹²⁵ Kristin Thompson, 'Review: *Tolkien on Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's "The Lord of the Rings"*', *Tolkien Studies*, 3 (2006), 222-228 (p. 223)

¹²⁶ Barbara Bush, *Imperialism and Postcolonialisms* (Harlow: Pearson Education Ltd, 2006), p. 43

mid to late sixties and early seventies with *Star Trek*. It is from this proto-fandom that some of the unwritten conventions of fandom have descended; 'fanfiction' became the word to designate stories written by fans for each other; 'fan art' comes from the same root as 'fanfiction'; words such as 'slash' indicate a homosexual relationship within a text, and so on. Although Henry Jenkins argues that 1920s and 1930s science fiction fandom set the model for later fandoms, in that the reciprocal relationship 'between readers, writers, and editors set expectations as science fiction spread into film and television,'¹²⁷ he concedes that 'fans' in this sense are only a small part of the viewing public: 'fans were the primary readers for literary science fiction, they were only a small fraction of the audience for network television'.¹²⁸ This fandom was proactive, hierarchical, organised and more importantly, 'interracial, includes people of all ages, has a fair number of disabled members, is sexually balanced, and has a strong cross-class representation.'¹²⁹ Both Henry Jenkins and Constance Penley chose to study *Star Trek* fans when considering fannish modes of reception and consumption, although both also selected a specific and underground sub-set of fandom, slash readers and writers as they operated outside the legitimate fandom.

Fandom is a term which is used by academics and fans alike to indicate the community of consumers of media texts who interact socially to produce fanfiction, fan art and other forms of artistic expression. Jennifer Brayton's differentiation between the audience and the fan is particularly appropriate: 'If the

¹²⁷ Henry Jenkins, 'Interactive Audiences: The 'Collective Intelligence' of Media Fans' <<http://web.mit.edu/cms/People/henry3/collective%20intelligence.html>> [accessed 13 May 2005]

¹²⁸ Ibid.

¹²⁹ Constance Penley, *NASA/Trek: Popular Science and Sex in America* (London: Verso, 1997), p. 99

audience consists of general consumers of mass media and popular culture, fans are emotionally focused towards one specific topic or interest.’¹³⁰ She goes on to define Tolkien fandom by suggesting that: ‘Simply watching the films does not make one a fan; it is the expanded interest in all things Middle Earth that defines fandom.’¹³¹ Fandom is a term used widely and often inaccurately, especially by those who are not familiar with the language or landscape of fannish activities – for one thing, common usage of ‘fandom’ by non-participants often neglects the plurality of the word. Use of the word fandom can be on the local scale – as for example *The Lord of the Rings* fans – or on the global scale to indicate all those engaged in fandom. Within this social network of complex and hierarchical relationships, fandoms devolve into their component parts – for example, in *The Lord of the Rings* fandom there are distinct and discrete groups of book fans, movie fans, slashers (fans of slash fiction) among many others.¹³² Navigating one specific fandom can be a difficult and complicated endeavour, especially given the fact that many fans from apparently differing sides of any one debate can coexist quite happily over another debate. An added complication is that the impact of the internet on fandom and fannish activities could never have been predicted and prompted the biggest revolution in fandom since the photocopier came into everyday use and allowed for the easy production of fanzines.¹³³ The most significant changes in the organisation of fandom seem to have been brought about by technological advances. Although Penley draws attention to *Star Trek*’s

¹³⁰ Jennifer Brayton, ‘Fic Frodo Slash Frodo’, in *From Hobbits to Hollywood: Essays on Peter Jackson’s Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Ernest Mathijs and Murray Pomerance (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 137-153 (p. 138)

¹³¹ Brayton, p. 148

¹³² See Appendix A.

¹³³ *Star Trek* fans used photocopiers to distribute fanfiction. See Camille Bacon-Smith, *Enterprising Women: Television Fandom and the Creation of the Popular Myth* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1992)

contextual reception as a positive post-war text, she also notes briefly that the advent of the video recorder in the late sixties and early seventies facilitated the spread of *Star Trek* fandom as fans were able to exchange tapes and increase the collective and specific knowledge of the community as a whole.¹³⁴ The photocopier enabled fanfiction to be widely distributed through fanzines, and modern technologies such as the internet, DVD and CD rewriters, digital hardware, file sharing and sophisticated open source software underpin modern fandom. Ross Smith points out that ‘the advent of the Internet [...] has enabled fans of Tolkienian linguistics to share material and ideas with a speed and efficiency previously unthinkable.’¹³⁵

Anthony Burdge and Jessica Burke provide a succinct summary of the development of Tolkien fandom from the 1960s onwards, although there are a number of factual errors concerning their definition of slash or homosexual fiction which seem to indicate that they are not fandom scholars. Despite this, they make some interesting points about the impact that American Tolkien fans had on getting the unauthorized version of *The Lord of the Rings* published by Ace Books banned:

Tolkien’s American readers not only defended him but also forced booksellers to remove all copies of the Ace editions from the market. With the efforts of the established Science Fiction Writers of America, combined with those of the newly formed Tolkien Society of America, Ace contacted Tolkien, promising not only that it would pay royalties to him for every Ace edition sold but also that it would cease printing once stock was depleted.¹³⁶

¹³⁴ Penley, p.115-116

¹³⁵ Ross Smith, ‘Timeless Tolkien Part 2: The Enduring Popularity of a Philological Fantasist’, *English Today*, 21:4 (October 2005), 13-20 (p. 18)

¹³⁶ Anthony Burdge and Jessica Burke, ‘Fandom’, *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London and New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 191-6 (pp. 193-4)

Newsgroups, bulletin boards, mailing lists, message boards, web archives, internet search engines and, most recently, weblogs have turned fandom into a global rather than local phenomenon. Henry Jenkins casts doubt on the continuing relevance of the old hierarchical model of the fandom relationship with the text: 'I don't think late eighties, early nineties audience research that posits resistance as the dominant way of understanding how audiences relate to texts makes any sense at the current moment of media production and consumption'.¹³⁷ This suggests that the old hierarchical model of the fandom relationship with the text has ceased to be useful when dealing with modern media such as the internet. The fanfiction writer is no longer reaching an audience of perhaps a couple of hundred readers, but potentially millions of fans worldwide; indeed, as Anna Smol points out:

It would be unusual for a reader to experience *The Lord of the Rings* only as a printed text at the current time. The films by Peter Jackson, the extended DVD versions of the films, the DVD commentaries and other publicity, and a prolific amount of fanfiction, art, and discussion on the Internet comprise the complex intertextuality of the story for many people.¹³⁸

Inevitably, the whole landscape of fanfiction has been changed so completely by the influence of the internet that previous studies have barely begun to scratch the surface of fannish activities. For example, fandom is being increasingly used as a platform to reach consumers with many smaller websites offering links to cut price DVDs and electronic equipment as a way to offset their costs. This hyper linking encourages members of fandom to 'read' the Internet as a series of inter-texts with multiple levels of inquiry and criticism. The internet

¹³⁷ Henry Jenkins, 'Intensities interviews Henry Jenkins @Console-ing Passions, University of Bristol, July 7th, 2001', *Intensities: The Journal of Cult Media*.

<<http://intensities.org/Essays/Jenkins.pdf>> [accessed 9 May 2005]

¹³⁸ Anna Smol, "'Oh ... Oh... Frodo!": Readings Of Male Intimacy In *The Lord Of The Rings*', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (Winter 2004), 949-979 (p. 967)

works as a site of appropriation in fandom, one which offers multiple models of fan appropriation stretching from consumer-appropriation of the media text to the writing and producing of fanfiction and fan art based on the media text.

The internet has also changed the way fans move between fandoms. For example, twenty years ago, a fan would probably have to have personal contacts to get him or her into a new fandom and to have access to the fanfiction, fan art and meta discussions. Now, all a fan has to do is to type the appropriate search terms into Google, AltaVista or MSN Search to come up with hundreds of thousands of hits. Weblog providers such as JournalFen and LiveJournal go one further and enable users to run online communities. Not only this, but as Bruno Giussani points out, the medium of the internet has a strong impact not only on how information is accessed but how narratives are told:

Online content on the other hand is fluid, moving. It doesn't know deadlines - actually, every moment is a potential deadline. There is no set chronological order, you can change original content, update it, correct it, complete it and re-use it, anytime. An article becomes a *story in progress*, enriched by other stories thanks to hypertext, and allowing for constant re-composition. It is important to understand that, just because this never-ending restructuring is possible, it becomes necessary. Melinda McAdams remarked that *Information in the online service must be looked after, not merely put there and forgotten*. The fluid media cannot stand immobility.¹³⁹

The very rigid controls over the reading and writing of fanfiction – especially for the writers of slash, which Camille Bacon-Smith elucidates – seem archaic to the twenty-first century fanfiction writer who operates in an environment where there are no such boundaries and where intertextual movement is encouraged rather than repressed.¹⁴⁰ As Esther Saxey notes: ‘One need not look

¹³⁹ Bruno Giussani, ‘A New Media Tells Different Stories’, *First Monday*, <http://www.firstmonday.dk/issues/issue2_4/giussani/> [accessed 16 June 2008]

¹⁴⁰ See Camille Bacon-Smith, *Enterprising Women*,

within a fandom, and then within fan-fiction, for slash (the route suggested by Bacon-Smith); one can stumble over slash through a search engine while looking for other material on a particular TV series.¹⁴¹ Instead of a model of fandom as a closed, homogenous community, the modern fandom operates under a model of migration where moving from fandom to fandom is relatively simple and fanfiction writers are multi- rather than mono-fandom orientated.

To date the most well known researchers in the area of fandom and fanfiction have rested uneasily between fan and academic, endeavouring both to penetrate the community and to retain academic authority and remain outside it. Henry Jenkins notes that: 'Writing as a fan about fan culture poses certain potential risks for the academic critic, yet it also facilitates certain understandings and forms of access impossible through other positionings.'¹⁴² Indeed, as Susan Booker comments: 'Some colleagues cringe when they find out that I study fanfiction, and few ever learn I write it as well.'¹⁴³ Jenkins, Bacon-Smith and Sheenaugh Pugh all assert their authority as members of the community *above* their academic credentials, perhaps indicating the current market for such texts is currently not institutions of higher education. The underlying assumption that the methods employed by fans and academics in evaluating fandom and fanfiction are *different* is one of the fundamental problems with research in the field. Sheenaugh Pugh, in the introduction to her book *The Democratic Genre* states that her point is

¹⁴¹ Esther Saxey, 'Staking a Claim: The Series and its Slash Fan-Fiction', in *Reading the Vampire Slayer: An Unofficial Critical Companion to Buffy and Angel*, ed. by Roz Kaveney (London and New York: Tauris Parke Paperbacks, 2002), pp. 187-210 (p. 189)

¹⁴² Henry Jenkins, *Textual Poachers: Television Fans and Participatory Culture* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992), p. 6

¹⁴³ Susan Booker, 'Tales Around the Internet Campfire: Fanfiction in Tolkien's Universe', in *Tolkien On Film* (see Paxson, above), pp. 259-282 (p. 261) One of the sections of Chapter Three is entitled 'A Digital Campfire: Fandom and Fanfiction' but that particular title was drawn from an early paper based on this thesis – long before I read *Tolkien On Film*.

to 'consider fanfiction from a literary point of view, as one might any other highly successful, popular genre.'¹⁴⁴ She deliberately distances herself from the approach taken by Henry Jenkins, Camille Bacon-Smith and Constance Penley, noting that she 'did not wish to repeat'¹⁴⁵ earlier studies 'of fanfiction as a sociological phenomenon, usually in the context of women's studies or media studies.'¹⁴⁶ Another is the issue of generalisation; Penley's work on slash fiction written by women engaging with themes of a utopian science future in *Star Trek* does not easily map onto slash fanfiction for a television programme which has canon gay characters such as *Torchwood* – of which, as Daniel Allington suggests: 'it is hard to avoid the suspicion that media industry creatives have begun to draw on slash for inspiration'.¹⁴⁷

The appropriation by fanfiction writers of Tolkien also works to demonstrate the complex nature of appropriation. Linda Hutcheon suggests that parody simultaneously subverts and reinforces the source text:

Intertextual parody of canonical American and European classics is one mode of appropriating and reformulating – with significant change – the dominant white, male, middle-class, heterosexual, Eurocentric culture. It does not reject it, for it cannot. Postmodernism signals its dependence by its *use* of the canon, but reveals its rebellion through its ironic *abuse* of it.¹⁴⁸

Hutcheon's concentration on parody led her to conclude that postmodern appropriations of the canon 'abuse' the source texts, but expanded, this rather narrow view serves to illuminate the relationship between the appropriated and the

¹⁴⁴ Sheenaugh Pugh, *The Democratic Genre: Fanfiction In A Literary Context* (Bridgend: Seren, 2005), p. 11

¹⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 11

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 11

¹⁴⁷ Daniel Allington, "'How Come Most People Don't See It?': Slashing *The Lord of the Rings*", *Social Semiotics*, 17:1 (March 2007), 43-63 (p. 44)

¹⁴⁸ Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism*, p. 130

appropriating texts. Jonathan Gray chooses to study parody as ‘a critical form of intertextuality, and its talent at invading other texts and at criticizing them from within’, thereby placing parody at the extreme end of the appropriative continuum.¹⁴⁹ Fanfiction also includes purely parodic works – Cassandra Claire’s *The Very Secret Diaries* is an obvious example of this – but arguably the majority of fanfiction, even satirical and ‘crack’ fanfiction, while showing evidence of intertextual appropriation, falls short of the overt criticism which parody necessitates. *The Very Secret Diaries* parody *Bridget Jones’s Diary* as much as they do Jackson’s *The Lord of the Rings*, and this parodic appropriation, written by a woman writing back to a ‘chick lit’ text through the medium of parody of film adaptations and altering the focus onto various neurotic members of the Fellowship, works as an ironic counter-text to Helen Fielding’s. *The Very Secret Diaries* give an alternate – and very funny – view of the motivations of the Fellowship. The elves are vapid, vain and self-obsessed, demonstrated best in Legolas’s diary entries: ‘Went to Council of Elrond. Was prettiest person there. Agreed to follow some tiny little man to Mordor to throw ring into volcano. Very important mission - gold ring so tacky.’¹⁵⁰ Cassandra Claire’s interpretation of the schisms between the members of the Fellowship are articulated best in ‘The Very Secret Diary of Boromir’ where Boromir’s distrust of Aragorn and desire for the Ring are read as two sides to the same issue: “‘Boromir, give the Ring back to Frooodoo.” “Boromir, let *me* carry Frodo up Caradhras.” “Boromir, quit trying

¹⁴⁹ Gray, *Watching With the Simpsons*, p. 4

¹⁵⁰ Cassandra Claire, ‘The Very Secret Diary of Legolas, Part One’.

<<http://www.ealasaid.com/misc/vsd/legolas.html>> [accessed 18 December 2007]

to cut off Frodo's head while he's asleep so you can get at the Ring.” Blatant favoritism most annoying.¹⁵¹

The fan-written parodies of *The Lord of the Rings* appropriate into a new cultural product (the textual parody) and domain (internet fandom works both as medium and domain) whereas those fanfiction stories which interweave closely with the source text such as Baylor's *The High King's Falcon* remain a specific version of *The Lord of the Rings*, reinterpreted, but still clearly signalling its relationship with the source text. Sanders concludes that ‘we need to view literary adaptations and appropriation from this more positive vantage point, seeing it as creating new cultural and aesthetic possibilities that stand alongside the texts which have inspired them, enriching rather than “robbing” them’.¹⁵² As Bakhtin noted ‘the process of parodying forces us to experience those sides of the object that are not otherwise included in a given genre’.¹⁵³ Gollum's melancholic ruminations on his unloved state when compared to Frodo are extremely funny but also work to subtextually reinforce the binary relationship between Gollum and Frodo in Jackson's films. Tolkien's Gollum and Jackson's Gollum follow the Fellowship, shadowing them as much as any of the Nazgûl, but Cassandra Claire's Gollum is literally carried with the Fellowship:

Day Thirty

V. cold on top of Caradhras. Everyone wants to carry Frodo up mountain. Nobody wants to carry me up mountain. Stowed away in Legolas' backpack but excessive nancing was not good for stomach. I have been sick all over elf collection of hair care products. Hope he does not notice.¹⁵⁴

¹⁵¹ Cassandra Claire, ‘The Very Secret Diary of Boromir’.
<<http://www.livejournal.com/talkread.bml?itemid=19399211>> [accessed 18 December 2007]

¹⁵² Sanders, *Adaptation*, p. 41

¹⁵³ Mikhail Bakhtin quoted in Gray, *Watching With the Simpson*, p. 4

¹⁵⁴ Cassandra Claire, ‘The Very Secret Diary of Gollum’.
<<http://www.ealasaid.com/misc/vsd/gollum.html>>. [accessed 18 December 2007]

The outsider, the tenth member of the Fellowship, is taken *within* the Fellowship in *The Very Secret Diaries* and foreshadows the events of *The Two Towers* and *The Return of the King* where Sam, Frodo and Gollum become a mini-Fellowship, a hobbit trinity of sorts where the events of Amon Hen in *The Fellowship of the Ring* are repeated in Mount Doom with Gollum replacing Boromir. Amy H. Sturgis describes Cassandra Claire's appropriation of Jackson's films as 'a loving send-up,' which would seem to signal a difference from the appropriative critique inherent in parodies such as Stoppard's *Rosencrantz and Guildenstern Are Dead*.¹⁵⁵ Appropriative parodies of *The Lord of the Rings*, exemplified by *The Very Secret Diaries* and *The Bagenders*, are simultaneously endemic of the 'new era of ironically distanced and distancing humor' and supportive of the iconic status of the original text.¹⁵⁶

Conclusion

Consequently, in chapter one I will be investigating Tolkien's appropriations of imperial adventure literature and the imperial ideology which, as a result, runs through *The Lord of the Rings* and is in turn appropriated by modern fantasy writers. Particular attention will be paid to *She* and *King Solomon's Mines* by H. Rider Haggard as Tolkien's appropriations of Haggard are both startling and illuminating. Tolkien himself alluded to the essential nature of appropriation and repetition in a letter:

I believe that legends and myths are largely made out of "truth", and indeed present aspects of it that can only be received in this mode; and long ago

¹⁵⁵ Amy H. Sturgis 'Make Mine "Movieverse": How the Tolkien Fanfiction Community Learned to Stop Worrying and Love Peter Jackson' in *Tolkien On Film* (see Paxson, above), pp. 283-305 (p. 292)

¹⁵⁶ Gray, *Watching With the Simpsons*, p. 7

certain truths and modes of this kind were discovered and must always reappear.¹⁵⁷

The influence of imperial literature extends throughout Tolkien's characterisation of his masculine heroes and is exemplified in his treatment of deception and morality. The influence of colonial literature on *The Lord of the Rings* seems to have been glossed over or entangled with discussions of racism in Tolkien's work and Tolkien's literary inheritance of the imperial adventure narrative of Haggard, Robert Louis Stevenson, G.A. Henty and Rudyard Kipling has itself been obfuscated behind a mask of acceptable academic practice.

In a similar way, Peter Jackson's adaptations of *The Lord of the Rings* work to disguise and rewrite the landscape of New Zealand as Middle-earth. Phillipa Mein Smith, in her history of New Zealand, notes: 'That New Zealand could pose as Middle Earth confirmed the power of inherited mythology'.¹⁵⁸ The stressing of New Zealand's shared heritage with Britain and historical, social and economic connections between the two nations may have helped to culturally displace the Maori. Certainly, it seems that Jackson has evoked an explicitly European method of 'looking' at the land and imposed this new look upon modern New Zealand. However, Jackson's appropriation and visual (re)writing of New Zealand also demand that the films be considered as postcolonial texts in their own right, independent of Tolkien's novel. Jackson's position is therefore a complex one which oscillates between producer of post-colonial text through a re-writing of Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* and a creator of a new economic and artistic view of New Zealand which is in line with previous, European-imposed identities.

¹⁵⁷ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 147

¹⁵⁸ Phillipa Mein Smith, *A Concise History of New Zealand* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), p. 252

Chapter three discusses postmodern unauthorised appropriations in fandom alongside the great tradition of appropriation which was best exemplified in the Grail narratives which were begun by Chrétien de Troyes between 1160 and 1190. Linda Hutcheon's commentary on parody is equally applicable to fandom: 'it is one of the major ways in which women and other ex-centrics both use and abuse, set up and then challenge male traditions in art.'¹⁵⁹ Fannish appropriations remain resolutely unofficial despite modern fandom being formed in the 1920s and 1930s science fiction magazines which encouraged a dialogue between writer and reader. As Henry Jenkins notes: 'almost every major literary science fiction writer came from the ranks of fandom'.¹⁶⁰ He goes on to note that 'every reader was understood to be a potential writer and many fans aspired to break into professional publication; fan ideas influenced commercially-distributed works at a time when science fiction was still understood predominantly as a micro-genre aimed at a small but passionate niche market' which is clearly apposite to current consumption for media texts.¹⁶¹

Resistance to cultural homogeny and cultural imperialism is a feature not only of postcolonial societies but also of fandom. This only becomes a problem when core cultural narratives such as *The Lord of the Rings* are owned by corporations. Fandom is a culture which is told it cannot legally appropriate or resist dominant cultural icons. Barthes and Foucault demand a response to these texts, demand a response which rests upon multiple interpretations which are static – fandom as a culture not only reads multiple interpretations of texts but celebrates them through re-authorings.

¹⁵⁹ Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism*, p. 134

¹⁶⁰ Jenkins, 'Intensities'

¹⁶¹ Ibid.

Chapter One
With Frodo in Middle-earth:
Empire and Adventure in *The Lord*
of the Rings

With Frodo in Middle-earth: Empire and Adventure in *The Lord of the Rings*

A post-World War Two novel about the epic journey undertaken by a set of faux medieval knights to destroy a weapon of ultimate - and ultimately corrupting - power may seem to have little to do with the literature of the British Empire. This is in part because of confusion over the use of the term 'empire', which is itself a measure of chronology, rather than ideological connections. The appellation 'empire literature' generally refers to such literary works as were composed between the late eighteenth and early twentieth centuries, disregarding the staying power of such narratives and their later appropriation. In fact, colonial or empire literature is an important - though largely unacknowledged - part of modern literature, as is clearly demonstrated in the appropriative works of J.R.R. Tolkien.

It is these ideological and stylistic appropriations between *The Lord of the Rings* and the late-nineteenth century and early-twentieth century imperial adventure novels which place Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* on a continuum on which Robert Louis Stevenson, Rudyard Kipling, H. Rider Haggard and G.A. Henty also take their places. These thematic appropriations ensure that, ideologically and stylistically, the imperial adventure story is translated into the twentieth century as a gloriously nostalgic fantasy novel, and for a modern reader it is clear that the imaginative landscapes – Rider Haggard's darkest Africa exchanged for Tolkien's Middle-earth – are separated only by time. The importance of empire adventure narratives on their audience was significant and far beyond the critical evaluation of the quality of the novels in question. It is a mistake to dismiss them because most of these texts were highly popular and

written explicitly for a juvenile audience; what Edward Said identifies as the *writing* of empire in literature is clearly demonstrated through those texts which ‘not only influenced child readers in the past, but continue to influence contemporary children, through both their continued availability in print and [...] their strong influence upon writers of more contemporary texts.’¹⁶² It can be argued that ‘fantasy makes for a fascinating look at colonial rhetoric in its most ideal, unchallenged form... fantasy is fully capable of perpetuating colonial rhetoric because it refers to the fictions we make to screen reality.’¹⁶³

The late nineteenth century and early twentieth centuries became preoccupied with fears that adventure in the heroic imperialist sense was becoming outdated. An era which saw the British empire at its greatest expansion left few blank geographical areas for explorers in the style of Allan Quatermain to find adventure. Many writers instead sought adventure in ‘the unreal world of romance, dreams, imagination.’¹⁶⁴ In addition to this, as Jeffrey Auerbach notes, contemporary reports attest to life on the frontiers of the empire being far from exciting or glamorous.¹⁶⁵ Imperial adventure literature then becomes part of a mythologizing of empire for consumption by the masses as part of a concerted – although by no means entirely conscious – propaganda campaign and the

¹⁶² M. Daphne Kutzer, *Empire's Children: Empire and Imperialism in Classic British Children's Books* (New York: Garland Publishing, 2000), pp. 140-141

¹⁶³ Elizabeth Massa Hoiem, ‘World Creation as Colonization: British Imperialism in “Aldarion and Erendis”’, *Tolkien Studies*, 2: 1 (2005), 75-92 (p. 85)

¹⁶⁴ Patrick Brantlinger, ‘Imperial Gothic: Atavism and the Occult in the British Adventure Novel, 1880-1914’ in *Reading Fin de Siècle Fictions*, ed. by Lyn Pykett (London: Longman, 1996), pp. 184-209 (p. 194)

¹⁶⁵ Jeffrey Auerbach, ‘Art, Advertising and the Legacy of Empire’, *The Journal of Popular Culture*, 35:4 (Spring, 2002), 1-23

‘energising myths of empire remained at the heart of popular culture decades after high culture had abandoned them.’¹⁶⁶

Patrick Brantlinger argues that imperialism ‘functioned as a partial substitute for declining or fallen Christianity and for declining faith in Britain’s future’¹⁶⁷ and by the early twentieth century, the British Empire ‘was a complex, worldwide system stretching over 12.1 million square miles, roughly one-quarter of the Earth’s surface’¹⁶⁸ and it was clear that ‘throughout the imperial century (1815-1902), the novel participated vigorously in the celebration, legitimation, and interrogation of imperialism and colonialism’.¹⁶⁹ Martin Green argues that it is ‘the adventure novels which could be explained in terms of empire’¹⁷⁰ and M. Daphne Kutzer’s analysis of classic British children’s literature reveals that the ‘ethos that both produces imperialism and is engendered by imperialism’ underpins many of the texts which are considered the canon of children’s literature¹⁷¹. Kutzer goes on to argue that children are themselves part of the voiceless colonised ‘natives’ of the British empire with novels rather than trade or warfare providing the colonial impetus. This inculcation of children into empire – and the unacknowledged ‘othering’ which it necessitates – fits alongside arguments that the writings for juveniles of Kipling, Henty and Haggard played their part in the presentation and re-presentation of empire to a global audience. Guy Arnold noted of Henty that: ‘in

¹⁶⁶ C.C. Eldridge, *The Imperial Experience: From Carlyle to Forster* (London: Macmillan Press, 1996), p. 77

¹⁶⁷ Brantlinger, ‘Imperial Gothic’, p. 186

¹⁶⁸ *The Oxford History of the British Empire Volume IV: The Twentieth Century*, ed. by Judith M. Brown and Wm. Roger Louis, 8 vols (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), IV p. 3

¹⁶⁹ Deirdre David, ‘Empire, Race, and the Victorian Novel’, *A Companion to the Victorian Novel*, ed. by Patrick Brantlinger and William B. Thesing (Malden, Mass: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), pp. 84-100 (p. 89)

¹⁷⁰ Martin Green quoted in Suvendrini Perera, *The Reaches of Empire: The English Novel from Edgeworth to Dickens* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1991), p. 5

¹⁷¹ Kutzer, p. xv.

Canada, Australia, New Zealand and possibly even more the United States there are more people proportionately than in Britain who could say [...] “We were brought up on him for history at school”.¹⁷² In this sense, the popular novels of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century can be said to both make and re-make empire. Edward Said makes a similar point about *Heart of Darkness*, stressing the inherent instability of both the concept of empire and the *reality* of empire which masked the very methods by which it maintained itself.

The straight-forward appropriation of imperial adventure texts by later writers – including Tolkien and C.S. Lewis – and the unconscious appropriation of the imperialist ideology, or, more accurately, what Kutzer refers to as the ethos of imperialism that is both the product and the source of imperialism, has led to the sustaining of empire in modern literature. Suvendrini Perera goes on to suggest that there is a direct correlation between the reality of the British empire and its representation in novels.¹⁷³

Without arguing that the adventure novels by popular writers such as Stevenson and Henty or the ‘literary canon’ novels by Dickens and Austen *created* empire, ‘the canonical nature and unquestioned status of the works of the English literary tradition and the values they incorporated remained potent in the cultural formation and the ideological institutions of education and literature’.¹⁷⁴ The large international readership of these novels leaves the possibility that the empire era novel ‘prepared for, or made possible a climate for receiving or accommodating,

¹⁷² Guy Arnold, *Held Fast For England: G.A. Henty Imperialist Boys’ Writer* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1980), p. 175

¹⁷³ See Suvendrini Perera.

¹⁷⁴ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, *The Empire Writes Back* (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 4

empire'.¹⁷⁵ The explicit presence of empire in the adventure novels of Robert Louis Stevenson, G.A. Henty, H. Rider Haggard and Rudyard Kipling is not just in the colonial locations which provide the exotic backdrop to their narratives, but is also part of a directed cultural shift which aimed to propagate specific ideologies. Modern scholarship has begun to draw out these embedded propagandas but within literature has concentrated on the English canonic novels.¹⁷⁶ In addition, while "serious literature" was uniformly hostile to the Empire [...] this was not how the general public saw it. For ordinary people, the Empire was the mythic landscape of romance and adventure'.¹⁷⁷ The use of empire in late-nineteenth century and early-twentieth century novels may appear to be obvious but to dismiss the cultural effect these novels had on generations of young men in Britain and British colonies is to do them a disservice. As Lawrence James suggests, it was the emphasis on duty which indirectly led to the thousands of volunteers for World War One:

many exposed to the writings of Henty and his fellows emerged convinced that brawn mattered more than brains, and large numbers of them acted in a manner of which their boyhood heroes would have approved when they volunteered for war in 1914 and 1915.¹⁷⁸

In 'Boy's Own Empire: Feature Films and Imperialism in the 1930s', Jeffrey Richards stresses the importance not only of warfare but of the army which became 'central to the myths and rituals of empire' in the late nineteenth century and cites several contemporary sources which attest to the extent to which the

¹⁷⁵ Suvendrini Perera, p. 7

¹⁷⁶ See for example, Edward Said, *Culture and Imperialism*, M. Daphne Kutzer, *Empire's Children*

¹⁷⁷ Jeffrey Richards, 'Boy's Own Empire: Feature Films and Imperialism in the 1930s' in *Imperialism and Popular Culture*, ed. by John Mackenzie (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1986), pp. 140-164 p. 143

¹⁷⁸ Lawrence James, *The Rise and Fall of the British Empire* (London: Abacus, 2004), p. 215

army was seen as a moral and noble career.¹⁷⁹ Geoffrey Hempstead argues that the ‘mystification of service’¹⁸⁰ and duty which he identifies in the Cold War novels of John Le Carré has a direct root in empire literature where it carries the echo of rigidly defined homosocial organisations and ‘racialism, patriarchy and the concept of service are inseparable’.¹⁸¹ To a lesser extent – although with arguably greater cultural significance – Ian Fleming’s *James Bond* novels can be said to draw upon the same imperial framework: in *Goldeneye*, M calls Bond ‘a dinosaur, a Cold War relic’ and her assessment is critically correct but Bond is far older than the Cold War.¹⁸² Like Allan Quatermain and the ever-green heroes of Henty’s novels, Bond is a creature of the British empire and his adventures are cast in the same mould as other imperial adventurers.

Peter Childs, examining the work of Haggard, Henty and Buchan, identifies the various tropes of imperial adventure narratives as generally containing some or all of the following:

the cult of the heroic individual; the quest for land or treasure; an overdeveloped sense of patriarchal responsibility for foreign peoples, especially the deposed or dominated; a perceived equivalence between heroes and native counterparts; the revelation of the treacherous ‘savage’; the map or coded message; an appetite for violence in desperate but honourable battles.¹⁸³

It is clear to see how easily *The Lord of the Rings* fits into this pattern: from classic medieval to postmodern heroes, *The Lord of the Rings* gives a selection of heroes

¹⁷⁹ Jeffrey Richards, ‘With Henty To Africa’ in *Imperialism and Juvenile Literature*, ed. by Jeffrey Richards (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1989), pp 72-106 (p. 81)

¹⁸⁰ Geoffrey Hempstead, ‘George Smiley and the Post-Imperial Nostalgia’ in *Patriotism: The Making and Unmaking of British National Identity: Volume Three National Fictions*, ed. by Raphael Samuel (London: Routledge, 1989), pp. 233-240 (p. 236)

¹⁸¹ *Ibid.*, p. 239

¹⁸² *Goldeneye*. Dir. Michael Campbell, United International Pictures (UIP) 1995.

¹⁸³ Peter Childs, *Modernism and the Post-Colonial: Literature and Empire 1885-1930* (London: Continuum International Publishing Group, 2007), pp. 10-11

to bolster Childs's cult of the heroic individual and many examples of characters performing heroic deeds. These examples range from the responsibility towards the citizens of Middle-earth which is consistently shown by the elves and also Aragorn; Pippin riding into battle with the Men of the West in *The Return of the King*; the final battle in the Scouring of the Shire where Merry, Pippin and Sam show their experience in warfare. The chapter 'The Scouring of the Shire' becomes the 'real' end to *The Lord of the Rings*, providing one last adventure for the characters and demonstrating how they have changed from the hobbits who fled the Shire in fear.

To examine *The Lord of the Rings* as an imperial adventure text, it is necessary to consider briefly the work of the most popular and prolific writers in the genre. Haggard and Henty were publishing at roughly the same time and for much the same audience – the young men and boys who would grow up to become the stalwart defenders of the Empire that Victorian society demanded that they should be. It is clear that these novels set forward a specific masculine identity which not only reflected Victorian society but was also subtly different from the previous most desirable masculine identity. Tolkien's appropriation of this imperial masculine identity can be seen clearly in the characters of Aragorn and Frodo but also in the character of Pippin, the only true juvenile in *The Lord of the Rings*. This neglected area of Tolkien scholarship is highlighted by William H. Green whose succinct analysis of the relationship between Tolkien and the earlier adventure writers significantly draws a thematic line from Stevenson through Haggard to Tolkien:

The Hobbit, like *Treasure Island*, emerged from a popular tradition and exploits stock devices. Much as Haggard's book is *Treasure Island*

reinvented in the African veldt, *The Hobbit* is King Solomon's Mines reinvented in Tolkien's great linguistic and geographical subcreation, Middle-earth.¹⁸⁴

James Obertino, drawing explicit connections between Tacitus's *Germania* and Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*, argues that:

even before the Great War, many knew that imperialism, even British imperialism, had serious flaws. Both Tacitus and Tolkien would see an empire grow in size even as it seemed to have lost its soul. Tolkien is clearly a Little Englander, who describes the Shire as we find it at the start of *The Lord of the Rings* as a nearly perfect home country, with its leisure-loving, tea-drinking Hobbits, with no factories, mines or telegraph wires to mar the landscape, and no colonies contributing to Frodo's prosperity.¹⁸⁵

For Obertino, the Shire's insularity and lack of industry works to illustrate Tolkien's anti-imperialist stance suggesting that only an idealised rural society is completely without imperialist tendencies. This is also a society without interest in exploration or the wider world outside its borders; both, Tolkien demonstrates, characteristics which can lead to ruin.¹⁸⁶ Equally, it could be argued that the relationship between Isengard and the Shire is archetypal of the coloniser-colonised bond. The apparent stripping of goods and crops from the Shire is illustrative of 'bad' imperialism, contrasted with the 'good' imperialism of Aragorn's Gondor. However, as Edward Said has demonstrated, imperialism has been so embedded into European culture, it is possible for writers to be both anti-imperialist and use imperialist ideology and motifs.¹⁸⁷ What Tolkien and the epic

¹⁸⁴ William H. Green, 'King Thorin's Mines', p. 54

¹⁸⁵ James Obertino, 'Barbarians and Imperialism in Tacitus and *The Lord of the Rings*', *Tolkien Studies*, 3 (2006), 117-131 (p.121)

¹⁸⁶ See James Obertino, 'Barbarians and Imperialism in Tacitus and *The Lord of the Rings*' and Elizabeth Massa Hoiem, 'World Creation as Colonization' for examples of this. Hoiem does acknowledge that currently 'postcolonial commentary on Tolkien (outside the pop-culture versions published in news articles) is nearly non-existent' (p. 75).

¹⁸⁷ Critical analysis of Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* vacillates between anti-imperialism and pro-imperialism interpretations. See Sarah Cole, 'Conradian Alienation and Imperial Intimacy',

fantasy writers who have followed him – the clearest example of this is David Eddings’s *Belgariad* and *Mallorean* series – is to give examples of ‘bad’ imperialism and ‘good’ imperialism. At its most simple level, being part of an empire whose armies are described as ‘boundless’ and habitually dress in black or dark armour and which rampage through the world, intending to destroy and exploit everything they find, is suggestive of ‘bad’ imperialism. On the other hand, the hereditary monarch of a western island nation who unites disparate nations under a single banner while acknowledging their difference may be charitably described as a fantasy of commonwealth but more accurately as ‘good’ imperialism.¹⁸⁸ M. Daphne Kutzer writes of *The Lord of the Rings* that in addition to being a ‘reverse quest story, in many ways it is a reverse tale of imperialism’ and argues that the actions of the hobbits in actively resisting the advance of Sauron suggest an anti-imperialist ideology in Tolkien himself, coloured by his experiences in the First World War.¹⁸⁹ It is through the troubling treatment of Sauron’s armies that Tolkien is most often accused of racism and indeed, the wholesale extermination of evil which *The Lord of the Rings* seems to advocate potentially rests more uneasily with a modern twenty-first century reader than a mid-twentieth century reader. Having said this – and Jackson’s *The Return of the King* does appear to offer this conclusion to the final battle on the ‘Field of

Modern Fiction Studies, 44:2 (1998) 251-281. Also Robert P. Marzec, ‘Enclosures, Colonization, and the Robinson Crusoe Syndrome: A Genealogy of Land in a Global Context’, *boundary 2*, 29:2 (2002), 129-156.

¹⁸⁸ Númenor may have been destroyed by the Valar but Aragorn’s status as a ‘son of Númenor’ is reiterated throughout. In David Eddings’s *The Belgariad* and *The Mallorean*, Garion is King of Riva (small island nation) and Overlord of the West. In the battle sequences in *Enchanter’s End Game* the different cultures and abilities of the nations are continually stressed. By comparison, the Angaraks tend to be cast more as military categories: infantry, cavalry, cannon-fodder and so on.

¹⁸⁹ Kutzer, p. 131

Cormallen' – Tolkien's text takes a different path following the destruction of the Ring and the death of Sauron:

so the creatures of Sauron, orc or troll or beast spell-enslaved, ran hither and thither mindless; and some slew themselves, or cast themselves in pits, or fled wailing back to hide in holes and dark lightless places far from hope. But the Men of Rhûn and of Harad, Easterling and Southron, saw the ruin of their war and the great majesty and glory of the Captains of the West. And those that were deepest and longest in evil servitude, hating the West, and yet were men proud and bold, in their turn now gathered themselves for a last stand of desperate battle. But the most part fled eastward as they could; and some cast their weapons down and sued for mercy.¹⁹⁰

Those followers of Sauron who were Men not only survive but are even allowed their own heroic last stand; the orcs and trolls who are merely 'creatures of Sauron' seem to have a more prosaic fate.¹⁹¹ Tom Shippey notes that the orcs in *The Lord of the Rings* 'recognise the idea of goodness, appreciate humour, value loyalty, trust, group cohesion and the ideal of a higher cause than themselves, and condemn failings from these ideals in others.'¹⁹² Shippey argues that 'orcish behaviour is also perfectly clearly human behaviour' and goes on to stress the difficulties Tolkien found in reconciling the orcs with his belief that evil could not create.¹⁹³ If Morgoth had not created the orcs then they were a corrupted form of humanity, and therefore not irredeemable: Tolkien leaves the battlefield in the capable hands of 'Aragorn and the other lords' and the eventual fate of the orcs in darkness.¹⁹⁴

¹⁹⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 949

¹⁹¹ Ibid.

¹⁹² Tom Shippey, 'Orcs, Wraiths, Wights: Tolkien's Images of Evil', *Roots and Branches: Selected Papers on Tolkien* (Switzerland: Walking Tree Publishers, 2007), pp. 243-268 (p. 248)

¹⁹³ Ibid.

¹⁹⁴ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 949

It seems most likely that Tolkien, like Conrad, ‘as a creature of his time [...] could not grant the natives their freedom, despite his severe critique of the imperialism that enslaved them’ but to use an allegedly simple division of good and evil in *The Lord of the Rings* as proof of Tolkien’s racism is to misjudge both text and author.¹⁹⁵ Anderson Rearick III’s thorough rebuttal of allegations of racism levelled at Tolkien in ‘Why Is the Only Good Orc A Dead Orc? The Dark Face of Racism Examined In Tolkien’s World’ certainly bears referencing here: to summarise, many of the accusations of Tolkien’s apparent racism come from critics ‘making some claims about Tolkien primarily based on their film experience’.¹⁹⁶ Rearick goes on to argue that Tolkien’s ‘use of terms like darkness and shade comes from scriptural images. So the battle between light and dark, which runs all through *The Lord of the Rings*, comes from Tolkien’s Judeo-Christian mindset’.¹⁹⁷ The Orcs are not evil because they are dark, they are dark because they are evil as ‘dark and light in *The Lord of the Rings* is about the powers of good and evil and not race’.¹⁹⁸ Patrick Curry points out that ‘Saruman’s sign is a white hand; Aragorn’s standard is mostly black; the Black Riders were not actually black, except their outer robes; and the Black Stone of Erech is connected with Aragorn’s forebear, Isildur.’¹⁹⁹

In a letter to his son Christopher in April 1944, Tolkien noted that the ‘treatment of colour nearly always horrifies anyone going out from Britain, & not

¹⁹⁵ Edward Said, ‘Conrad’s *Heart of Darkness* and the Histories of Empire’ in *Reading Fin De Siècle Fictions*, ed. by Lyn Pykett (London: Longman, 1996), pp. 223-231 (p. 228)

¹⁹⁶ Anderson Rearick, ‘Why is the Only Good Orc a Dead Orc? The Dark Face of Racism Examined in Tolkien’s World’, *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (Winter 2004), 861-874 (p. 863)

¹⁹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 870

¹⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁹⁹ Patrick Curry, *Defending Middle-earth: Tolkien Myth and Modernity* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 1998), p. 42

only in South Africa. Unfort. not many retain that generous sentiment for long',²⁰⁰ and his July 1938 draft response to the German publishers of *The Hobbit* who wanted him to confirm if the name 'Tolkien' was Jewish was scathing:

if I am to understand that you are enquiring whether I am of *Jewish* origin, I can only reply that I regret I appear to have *no* ancestors of that gifted people [...] Your enquiry is doubtless made in order to comply with the laws of your own country, but that this should be held to apply to the subjects of another state would be improper, even if it had (as it has not) any bearing whatsoever on the merits of my work or its suitability for publication, of which you appear to have satisfied yourselves without reference to my *Abstammung*.²⁰¹

Patrick Curry draws attention to the friendship between Legolas and Gimli, 'members of races traditionally estranged', asserting that Tolkien's focus on this friendship excludes accusations of apartheid in Middle-earth and finally points to the interracial union between Aragorn and Arwen as evidence of a celebration of multiculturalism.²⁰² James Obertino notes that the Fellowship, 'an alliance among various peoples, shows Tolkien's preference for accommodation over domination'.²⁰³ Elizabeth Massa Hoiem in contrast asserts that in actuality this apparent celebration of inter-racial marriage actually conceals an imperialist ideology:

The reason why racial intermarriage and gender interdependence are privileged in Tolkien, contrary to the fear of miscegenation prevalent in colonial discourse, is that Tolkien depicts the fictional unified center from the opposite end of history. He is not trying to prevent racial decay, but to trace the ascension of a race long ago. Interracial marriage between elf and man is far from threatening, as it is always the woman who is an elf. Through patrilinear inheritance, the superior elven race is harnessed within modern man: the fertile spirit, colonized and tamed by male order in the name of progress. Tolkien begins with diversity, but ends with dominance.²⁰⁴

²⁰⁰ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 73

²⁰¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 37-38.

²⁰² Curry, p. 44.

²⁰³ Obertino, p.128

²⁰⁴ Hoiem, p. 85. See also Chapter Two.

Both Obertino and Massa Hoiem make interesting points and there is enough textual evidence in Tolkien's writings to support either reading. While it is certainly appealing to connect the line of descent from Aragorn to the present monarchy just as Geoffrey of Monmouth did with the Trojans, this seems a somewhat shallow reading of Tolkien. Given Tolkien's well known dislike of allegory,²⁰⁵ declaring that Tolkien was making a serious commentary on twentieth-century race relations in *The Lord of the Rings* is as useful as asking 'if Communists are Orcs.'²⁰⁶ As the work of Obertino, Massa Hoiem and Patrick Curry demonstrates, it is possible to read seemingly contrary arguments into *The Lord of the Rings* without having the explicit evidence of authorial intention. In this way, *The Lord of the Rings* acts as a mirror, reflecting back the critic's own interests and bias. As Tolkien noted, just because 'there is no allegory does not, of course, say there is no applicability.'²⁰⁷

The continual existence of the imperial adventure narrative in a multitude of forms belies its initial associations. 'Empire' and 'colonialism' have come to refer exclusively to the imperial era 1770-1940 when the European empires were at their height, and the treatment of empire in history and literary criticism has certainly been limited by the association of 'empire' with the British empire. Suvendrini Perera argues that the 'enmeshing of literature and empire can be traced at least as far back as Spenser's prescriptions for a recently colonized Ireland.'²⁰⁸ Krishan Kumar notes that:

The English were an imperial nation in a double sense. They created a land empire, Great Britain or the United Kingdom, formed by the expansion of

²⁰⁵ See Tolkien's letters to Sir Stanley Unwin, 31 July 1947 and Milton Waldman, 1951

²⁰⁶ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 262

²⁰⁷ Ibid.

²⁰⁸ Suvendrini Perera, p. 5

England from its southern position at the base of the group of islands off the north-western coast of Europe (the “East Atlantic archipelago”). And they created an overseas empire, not just once but twice: first in the western hemisphere, in North America and the Caribbean, and later in the East, in India, and South-East Asia.²⁰⁹

Colonial literature and the specific cultural use to which literature has been put by no means began with the expansion of Britain’s trading links in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. Lynn Archer, writing on the use of colonial rhetoric in the fourteenth-century poem, ‘Sir Gawain and the Green Knight’, concludes that:

some of the terms of colonialist ideologies that the English later employed in its era of expansion and colonization beyond British and European borders were not entirely new. Rather, nascent versions of these terms were first utilized by the English against their neighbors in the British Isles in the late Middle Ages before the English exported these mechanisms to more distant lands.²¹⁰

The significance of the imperialist tropes in ‘Sir Gawain and the Green Knight’ not only suggests that cultural appropriation and suppression through literature and the arts was present before the great expansion of the European empires from the Renaissance onwards in general, but also their impact upon Tolkien in particular. It can reasonably be argued that ‘Sir Gawain and the Green Knight’ was one of the narratives which influenced *The Lord of the Rings*: consider Tolkien’s description of Gawain, ‘the warmth of his character, generous, even impetuous, which by a slight excess leads him ever to promise more than necessary’ which is certainly

²⁰⁹ Krishan Kumar, ‘Nation and empire: English and British National Identity in Comparative Perspective’, *Theory and Society*, 29 (2000), 575-608 (p. 588)

²¹⁰ Lynn Archer, ‘The Ends of Enchantment: Colonialism and Sir Gawain and the Green Knight’, *Texas Studies in Literature and Language*, 48:2 (Summer, 2006), 79-101 (p. 95)

suggestive of his description of the hobbits.²¹¹ If the hobbits, like Gawain, carried their imperialism with them then the identification of Middle-earth with England sustains the colonising narrative; firstly Bilbo and later Frodo, Sam, Merry and Pippin, travel further than any other member of their race in their recorded history and carry with them Tolkien's equivalent to what Laurence Kitzan notes is emblematic of imperial adventure literature. The intangible presence of England in the British empire becomes the Shire for the wandering hobbits and memories of Gondor for Boromir and the past glories of Moria for Gimli. Only Aragorn and Gandalf can be described as being true wanderers and Aragorn's narrative is in one sense the mythic, large scale version of the hobbits' triumphant home-coming. The two narratives come to mirror each other; Aragorn returns to a home he was driven out of by the machinations of evil just as Frodo was. The home-coming is not merely a return as the home must be restored to its former glory and that task also falls to the wandering adventurer. The implication is clear: just as in *She* or *Heart of Darkness* the wider issues of empire are mirrored at home and it is the task of those successful empire adventurers to replicate their success at home. 'Nostalgia for a lost, or eroding, imperial order is also a recurrent theme in the strongly masculinist fiction of H. Rider Haggard.'²¹²

Adventure and Appropriation: Rider Haggard and *The Lord of the Rings*

William H. Green notes that 'even though Tolkien apparently did not describe himself as imitating Haggard, many parallels between *King Solomon's Mines* and

²¹¹ J.R.R. Tolkien, *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, Pearl and Sir Orfeo*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 1995), p. 4

²¹² Deidre David, *Rule Britannia: Women, Empire and Victorian Writing* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1995), p. 161

The Hobbit argue that Haggard's work fed Tolkien's creative process'.²¹³ Green elucidates many striking similarities between *The Hobbit* and *King Solomon's Mines* which encompass plot, description of the landscape, character and narrative. In particular he draws attention to the relationship between Allan Quatermain and Bilbo Baggins:

Tolkien's Bilbo Baggins and Haggard's Allan Quatermain, are repeatedly said to be small and timid but are, nevertheless, hardy, strong-willed, and ethical – reluctant to kill but loyal to the death. Both heroes are distinguished by their alertness [...] Both are of good birth, with modest wealth and education [...] both are, like Don Quixote, about fifty years old.²¹⁴

Arguably, Green might have included Frodo in this comparison. Both narratives begin with the introduction of an ancient treasure map which is printed in the text – Haggard's alongside the text which refers to it but Tolkien's more commonly found in either the front or back of the text – and which clearly demonstrates the path that the adventurers will take. Even the most cursory examination of these maps reveals surprising topographic similarities, even if the direction of travel is different – Haggard's map leads north from the Lukanga River whereas Tolkien's goes west from Hobbiton – both maps feature 'a river, an alpine range, and a deadly wasteland'²¹⁵ as well as 'an ancient road, and a town near the destination'.²¹⁶ Green also draws attention to the way that both maps include places where the party can rest; first Beorn's house and Rivendell in *The Hobbit* and the 'pan bad water' in the middle of the desert in *King Solomon's Mines*.²¹⁷

This apparent topographic appropriation by Tolkien for one of his earliest

²¹³ Green, 'King Thorin's Mines', p. 54

²¹⁴ Ibid.

²¹⁵ Ibid., p. 56

²¹⁶ Ibid.

²¹⁷ H. Rider Haggard, *King Solomon's Mines* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), p. 54

conceptions of Middle-earth seems to have been either discounted or deemed unimportant by Tolkien scholars.

In H. Rider Haggard's *King Solomon's Mines* Infadoos gives Allan Quatermain, Captain Good and Sir Henry ancient chain mail coats which are 'magic coats through which no spear can pass.'²¹⁸ Allan remarks on the superb quality of the chain mail, stating that it is: 'the most beautiful chain work we had ever seen. A whole coat fell together so closely that it formed a mass of links scarcely too big to be covered with both hands.'²¹⁹ He also records that it is a 'shining shirt of chain armour'²²⁰ and that it is 'neither very heavy nor uncomfortable'.²²¹ This immediately calls to mind Tolkien's description of the mithril shirt which Thorin gives to Bilbo in *The Hobbit* and Bilbo bequeaths to Frodo in *The Lord of the Rings*:

The silver corslet shimmered before his eyes like the light upon a rippling sea. Carefully he took it off and held it up, and the gems on it glittered like stars, and the sound of the shaken rings was like the tinkle of rain in a pool.²²²

When Allan questions Infadoos about the origin of the mail, he is told that they had not made the armour but 'they come down to us from our forefathers'.²²³ In *The Lord of the Rings*, Glóin explains to Frodo:

'We have done well,' he said. 'But in metal-work we cannot rival our fathers, many of whose secrets are lost. We make good armour and keen swords, but we cannot again make mail or blade to match those that were made before the dragon came.'²²⁴

²¹⁸ *King Solomon's Mines*, p. 100

²¹⁹ *Ibid.*

²²⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 99

²²¹ *Ibid.*, p. 100

²²² *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 336

²²³ *King Solomon's Mines*, p. 100

²²⁴ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 229

More suggestive still is the stabbing of Captain Good:

On examination we discovered that he had been seriously wounded in the leg by a *tolla* in the course of the pursuit, but that the chain armour had prevented his last assailant's spear from doing anything more than bruise him badly.²²⁵

Comparing this to the stabbing of Frodo in 'The Bridge of Khazad-Dûm' reveals a striking similarity:

Diving under Aragorn's blow with the speed of a striking snake he charged into the Company and thrust with his spear straight at Frodo. The blow caught him on the right side, and Frodo was hurled against the wall and pinned.²²⁶

In both cases, the spear thrusts do not cause serious injury but in *The Lord of the Rings*:

There was a dark and blackened bruise on Frodo's right side and breast. Under the mail there was a shirt of soft leather, but at one point the rings had been driven through it into the flesh. Frodo's left side also was scored and bruised where he had been hurled against the wall. While the others set the food ready, Aragorn bathed the hurts with water in which *athelas* was steeped.²²⁷

This is hauntingly reminiscent of *King Solomon's Mines*. After the battle is over and the defeated Twala has been killed in single combat with Sir Henry, Allan and the others retired to Twala's hut to rest and:

we found that the flesh underneath was terribly bruised, for though the steel links had kept the weapons from entering, they had not prevented them from bruising. Both Sir Henry and Good were a mass of bruises, and I was by no means free. As a remedy Foulata brought us some pounded green leaves, with an aromatic odour, which, when applied as a plaster, gave us considerable relief.²²⁸

²²⁵ *King Solomon's Mines*, p. 143

²²⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 325

²²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 336

²²⁸ *King Solomon's Mines*, p. 150

In both cases, the easing of the bruises by means of a poultice has a significant effect on the narrative. In *The Lord of the Rings*, it is an example of Aragorn's hereditary healing powers which will be displayed in their greatest power in *The Return of the King*. In *King Solomon's Mines*, Foulata's devotion to Captain Good compels her to follow them into the mines and brings about the death of Gagool. It is highly suggestive of Tolkien's appropriation that both Frodo and Captain Good were stabbed with a spear; that they were at first feared dead; that they escaped with serious bruising which was alleviated with a special folk remedy.

Green suggests that 'Tolkien's most unmistakable echo of *King Solomon's Mines* is his Battle of Five Armies' where:²²⁹

an outnumbered force executes a pincers movement to win against the odds, attacking from two arms of high ground into a plain. Haggard's battleground is between two arms of a steep, flat-topped hill [...] Tolkien's between narrow spurs of a solitary mountain.²³⁰

However, Green does acknowledge that both Haggard and Tolkien have appropriated 'an ancient tactic used successfully by the Athenian Miltiades against the Persians and the Roman Scipio Africanus against Hannibal' which was also used by Shaka, the Zulu general who 'held back the British [...] [Haggard's] fictional battle is an exact implementation of Shaka's tactics'.²³¹

John D. Rateliff draws attention to the significant similarities between the Mirror of Galadriel and Ayesha's watery glass and concludes that 'the fact that Tolkien gave Galadriel her Mirror when a crystal ball, one of the *palantiri*, would have done just as well, argues for a deliberate borrowing on his part.'²³² Dale

²²⁹ Green, 'King Thorin's Mines', p. 60

²³⁰ Ibid., p. 61

²³¹ Ibid., p. 61

²³² John D. Rateliff, 'She and Tolkien', *Mythcore*, 8:2 (1981), 6-8 (p. 7)

Nelson is more temperate in his analysis, declaring that he is not intending to 'suggest that Tolkien drew, consciously and copiously, from the earlier writer'.²³³ He also disavows any subtextual imperial links between Haggard and Tolkien, arguing that: 'Academic critics read Haggard as a relic of imperialism or as a case in Jungian psychology, but Tolkien was evidently spontaneously moved by mythopoeic and straightforward adventure romance as found in the older writer's book.'²³⁴ In other words, although there are incontrovertible connections between Haggard's work and Tolkien's, it was only the romance and adventure in Haggard by which Tolkien was inspired. This line of enquiry works only if adventure and empire could be easily disengaged in either Haggard or Tolkien. More than this, however, critical commentary of fantasy fiction seems to begin – and in some cases end – with Tolkien, seeming to assume, without a trace of irony that 'no other fiction had ever been written'²³⁵ though the reality, as William Green points out, is far more likely to connect Tolkien directly to Haggard:

The many parallels between Haggard's first successful fiction and Tolkien's are specific enough, however to draw a line of descent from Stevenson through Haggard to Tolkien in the family tree of fiction. An entire clan of fantasy descends from *The Hobbit* and its sequels, and another clan, including the Tarzan books and Michael Crichton's *Congo*, descends independently from Haggard. The link between Haggard and Tolkien marks the kinship between these clans in the genealogy of influence.²³⁶

Tom Shippey, for example, warns that it is 'especially necessary, then, for followers of Tolkien to pick out the true from the heretical, and to avoid snatching

²³³ Dale Nelson, 'Literary Influences, Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries', *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London and New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 367-378 (p. 370)

²³⁴ Ibid.

²³⁵ Lobdell, 'Defining *The Lord of the Rings*', p. 115

²³⁶ Green, 'King Thorin's Mines', p. 63

at surface similarities.²³⁷ Shippey's knowledge of Tolkien is clearly most comprehensive and it is interesting that in *The Road to Middle-earth* he records the influence of very few modern writers on Tolkien. Shippey explicitly names George MacDonald and William Morris and, despite the lack of evidence: 'I cannot help thinking that Tolkien knew Kipling's stories well'. It is by no means insignificant for this theory that Shippey asserts that only Kipling's England-based narratives *Puck of Pook's Hill* and *Rewards and Fairies* would interest Tolkien.²³⁸ While it is possible that this is a throw-away reference on Shippey's part, the inclusion of Kipling *does* raise the issue as to *why* Shippey chose to include it in the first place. There are very few records of Tolkien's literary interests but he would have been a very extraordinary fin-de-siècle schoolboy had he not come across Kipling and Stevenson's juvenilia as well as Henty and Haggard. John Garth points out that:

Haggard had been a favourite in the King Edward's library; during the mock school strike of 1911 the sub-librarians called for a ban on "Henty, Haggard, School Tales etc... that can be read out in one breath". (The following year Tolkien had presented the school library with another Haggard-esque 'lost race' yarn, *The Lost Explorers* by Alexander Macdonald.)²³⁹

Quite why Shippey excludes Rider Haggard from his list of modern influences on Tolkien is difficult to understand, especially given Tolkien's own stated interest in Haggard's work: 'I suppose as a boy *She* interested me as much anything – like the Greek shard of Amyntas, which was the kind of machine by which everything got moving.'²⁴⁰ In addition, 'interviewer Henry Resnick asked

²³⁷ Shippey, *The Road to Middle-Earth*, p. 296

²³⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 302

²³⁹ Garth, pp. 78-79. Ellipses in original.

²⁴⁰ Tolkien quoted in Lobdell, 'Defining *The Lord of the Rings*', p. 110

Tolkien to name two or three of his favourite books. The only particular work Tolkien mentioned was Haggard's *She: A History of Adventure* (1887).²⁴¹

Jared Lobdell notes that Tolkien 'once remarked that "his typical response upon reading a medieval work was to desire not so much to make a philological or critical study of it as to write a modern work in the same tradition".'²⁴² Equally, Tolkien noted of *The Lord of the Rings* that 'most people that have enjoyed *The Lord of the Rings* have been affected primarily by it as an exciting story: and that is how it was written.'²⁴³ The typical setting for such adventure narrative was an exotic location outside of the experience of the majority of the readers, typically in the outskirts of the British empire, but in Tolkien, this exotic location becomes the Secondary World of Middle-earth. That the majority of Tolkien scholarship has seemed to deny Tolkien's own interest in adventure literature and the adventure qualities of *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit* perhaps says more about the continuing disregard for the genre in academia than a lack of evidence.

Into the Wild: The Imperial Adventurer and the Unknown Lands

In 1907, Lord Curzon declared that 'the outskirts of Empire, where the machine is relatively impotent and the individual is strong, is to be found an ennobling and invigorating stimulus for our youth, saving them alike from the corroding ease and the morbid excitements of Western civilisation' and the implication that the boundaries of the British empire were not only a proving ground where young (British) men could prove their worth as members of the empire but also 'purer'

²⁴¹ Nelson, p. 368

²⁴² Lobdell, 'Defining *The Lord of the Rings*', p. 109

²⁴³ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 212

and more 'noble' than the easy life of the cities is carried through adventure literature as a thematic link.²⁴⁴

W.J.T. Mitchell argues that landscape can become 'a potent, ideological representation that serves to naturalize power relations and erase history and legibility' and although his analysis of the cultural use of land and landscape is primarily centred around the painted landscape, it is by no means inappropriate to expand this argument to encompass textual landscapes.²⁴⁵ What the representation of the imperial landscape achieved was to reduce the component nations and continents to a wide expanse of red on a map. Africa, especially, suffered from this generalising treatment and disappeared into a single representational identity as deepest, darkest Africa with little delineation between separate nations or any acknowledgement that the continent was not solely there for the use of Europeans. Africa's history and diverse cultures were turned back into an 'empty landscape, the waste or wilderness or void, is an iconoclastic icon; it throws down the high places and smashes the traces of indigenous or aboriginal dwelling.'²⁴⁶ Not only this but as William Howarth suggests, 'literary places are never empty because they have implied observers, trying to read the stories there' and if this is so then the writers of imperial adventure novels re-populated the 'empty' landscape of Africa with their (predominantly white) readers, colonising the land imaginatively just as the real-life administrators of the empire were doing in actuality.²⁴⁷ Gillian Tindall's interest in landscape is:

²⁴⁴ Lord Curzon quoted in Peter Childs, p. 3

²⁴⁵ W.J.T. Mitchell, 'Holy Landscape: Israel, Palestine, and the American Wilderness', *Critical Inquiry*, 26:2 (Winter, 2000), 193-223 (p. 194)

²⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 209

²⁴⁷ William Howarth, 'Imagined Territory: The Writing of Wetlands', *New Literary History*, 30:3 (1999), 509-539 (p. 513)

with what these physical settings have become in the minds of novelists [...] the roles they play when they are re-created in fiction, the psychological journeys for which they are the destinations. Actual countries become countries of the mind [...] these worlds do not remain private but are transmitted back to readers, who then, in their turn, see the original locations with changed and awakened eyes.²⁴⁸

William Howarth notes of Tindall that for her, the process of re-writing of the landscape not only changes it but that this change is 'invariably for the better'.²⁴⁹ The textual rewriting of place in empire adventure novels into imperial resources which were entrusted to the British to use and administer by a higher authority and the consequent distancing from the initial conquering, plundering and the slave trade, leaves many 'empty' spaces, especially in Africa. Once the re-writing of the British acquiring the empire – ideologically and mythologically – was complete, the 'empty' spaces were left for exploration by popular culture through the imperial adventure novel and no matter how apparently inhospitable the landscape, it could be conquered and tamed by British explorers. Perhaps no imperial landscape better encapsulates the tenuous hybrid nature of the ownership of the land – be it by the natives or the British conquerors – than the wetlands as, for example, the journey of Horace Holly, Leo Vincey and Job through the marshes in Haggard's *She* and the crossing of marshland in *The Fellowship of the Ring* and *The Two Towers*. Howarth notes that the 'shifting, evanescent boundaries of wetlands naturally suggested relations between actual and imagined, surface and depth' and the liminal, ever changing boundary between land and water suggests a hybridity between two opposing forces which co-exist uneasily and are dependent on a fragile ecological balance in order to maintain life. The marsh or wetland is

²⁴⁸ Gillian Tindall quoted in Howarth, p. 514

²⁴⁹ Howarth, p. 514

therefore a marginal landscape and Theo D’Haen argues that ‘[D]uring the colonial period the literature of the centre took possession of the margin, also of the imagination of the margin.’²⁵⁰ The wetland also carries connotations of being problematic when land is seen as commodity; the wetland not only represents the wilderness but carries potential difficulties in being ‘used’, it is not ‘solid enough to allow farming or building, the ground of civilisation’.²⁵¹

Having miraculously survived a shipwreck, Holly, Leo and Job have discovered the immense carved head which is the first of the signs towards the path that Killikrates took. They find themselves:

on a strip of dry land about two hundred yards broad by five hundred long, bordered on one side by the river, and on the other three by endless desolate swamps that stretched as far as the eye could reach.²⁵²

Holly’s surprisingly exact measurements are suggestive of a qualitative aspect to imperial adventure; Haggard is not just conjuring up an image of the landscape through Holly’s narrative but Holly himself is judging the usefulness of the land. The marshes are ‘endless’ and ‘desolate’, evoking the distance that the three have travelled from England; the immensity of the landscape is also suggested as the marshes ‘stretched as far as the eye could see’. Haggard suggests a vast and lonely landscape and one which while suggestive of human industry, Holly cannot imagine being put to any use: ‘Who would be stupid enough to build a wharf in the middle of these dreadful marshes in a country inhabited by savages – that is, if it is

²⁵⁰ Theo D’Haen, ‘Shades of Empire in Colonial and Post-Colonial Literatures’ in *Shadows of Empire In Colonial and Post-Colonial Literatures*, ed. by CC. Barfoot and Theo D’Haen (Amsterdam, Atlanta, GA: Rodopi B.V, 1993), pp. 9-16 (p. 14)

²⁵¹ Howarth, p. 521

²⁵² H. Rider Haggard, *She: A History of Adventure* (New York: Ballantine, 1978), p. 55

inhabited at all?'²⁵³ The 'who' that Holly refers to it would be safe to assume are probably Europeans as he finds it difficult to believe that any Africans would have the ability to construct either the wharf itself or the infrastructure necessary to support trading on such a vast scale. The remains of a great civilisation are present all around Holly but he misreads the landscape. When Leo discovers the dressed stone which forms the remains of the vast wharf, Holly is forced to admit that the 'endless desolate swamps' conceal the ruins of a vast city. According to Evelyn O'Callagan, travel writing 'participates in the "rhetoric of discovery" [...] Destinations [...] are conquered textually' and through Holly and Leo's discovery the land is given a specific textual identity which immediately denies an 'African' identity.²⁵⁴

'A country like Africa,' I said, 'is sure to be full of the relics of long dead and forgotten civilisations. Nobody knows the age of the Egyptian civilisation, and very likely it had offshoots. Then there were the Babylonians and the Phœnicians, and the Persians, and all manner of people, all more or less civilised, to say nothing of the Jews whom everybody "wants" nowadays. It is possible that they, or any one of them, may have had colonies or trading stations here. Remember those buried Persian cities that the consul showed us at Kilwa.'²⁵⁵

From being an 'empty' landscape, in just a few paragraphs Haggard has altered the meaning of the landscape. It is now ancient and full of 'dead and forgotten civilisations' and for the first time, Holly feels a curiosity which he was 'prepared to gratify [...] at any cost'. It is still a landscape waiting for understanding. What Haggard asks, through the revelation of the ancient wharf, is the same as that which W.J.T. Mitchell asks in his consideration of the 'holy' landscape of Israel

²⁵³ *She*, p. 55

²⁵⁴ Evelyn O'Callaghan, "'A Hot Place Belonging To Us: The West Indies in Nineteenth-century Travel Writing By Women', *Landscape and Empire 1770-2000*, ed. by Glenn Hooper (London: Ashgate, 2005), pp. 93-109 (p. 93)

²⁵⁵ *She*, p. 57

and Palestine and what postcolonial landscapes ask through their presentation and re-presentation: 'What was erased, rendered invisible in order that this landscape might present the face it does?'²⁵⁶ Haggard's presentation of Africa is 'endless', 'desolate' and full of civilisations which are 'dead and forgotten'. Mitchell argues that the 'empty landscape, the waste or wilderness or void, is an iconoclastic icon; it throws down the high places and smashes the traces of indigenous or aboriginal dwelling,' but although Haggard's African landscape *appears* to reveal an ancient civilisation buried beneath the 'empty' wetlands, Haggard is in actuality overlaying the real landscape with a textual fantasy and appropriating Africa completely as an imaginative space with his own imaginative history and culture until Haggard's Africa becomes as dislocated from a 'real' environment as Tolkien's Middle-earth and Haggard's Africa has replaced the 'real' Africa in the cultural consciousness of his readers.²⁵⁷ Holly's acknowledgement that the landscape of Africa can be *at once* inhabited by 'savages' and superior civilisations is a literary example of Homi Bhabha's splitting: 'two contradictory and independent attitudes inhabit the *same space*, one takes account of reality, the other is under the influence of instincts which detach the ego from reality.'²⁵⁸ That this splitting takes place in a wetland – itself a contradiction, a blurring between land and water – is significant as the landscape can be read as representing the duality in the colonial gaze.

A similar duality is seen in the journey through the Midge-water Marshes in *The Fellowship of the Ring* which sets up the experiences of Sam and Frodo in the Dead Marshes in *The Two Towers*. As in *She*, the marshes are a 'wide flat

²⁵⁶ Mitchell, 'Holy Landscape', p. 196 Also see Chapter Two

²⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 209

²⁵⁸ Homi K. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), p. 132

expanse of country [...] in the pathless wilderness [...] bewildering and treacherous [...] lonely and unpleasant'.²⁵⁹ Tolkien stresses the shifting and unreliable nature of the landscape which here represents the uncertain relationship between the hobbits and the land(scape) outside the Shire. The passage is bracketed with references to Strider whose abilities keep them hidden so 'they saw no sign and heard no sound of any other living thing'.²⁶⁰ Tolkien reinforces the association between Strider and Númenor or Middle-earth's 'dead or forgotten civilisation' by describing him as 'the tall dark figure of Strider, standing silent and watchful',²⁶¹ just before the first mention of Weathertop, the ancient watch tower of the Númenorians. The association of Aragorn/Strider with the land and his position as a 'Ranger' is extremely suggestive of Haggard's Allan Quatermain, the white hunter hero of *King Solomon's Mines* who eventually leads Captain Good and Sir Henry to the diamond mines and Sir Henry's lost brother. In description, Allan Quatermain is perhaps closer to Bilbo and Frodo but his function in the text is appropriated through Aragorn. It is by no means insignificant that Aragorn's first appearance in *The Lord of the Rings* was as Trotter whom Tom Shippey describes as 'a kind of hero-hobbit'.²⁶²

In *The Fellowship of the Ring* the guide through the marshes is as reliable as the mountain Weathertop despite the ground being 'bewildering and treacherous'.²⁶³ However, in *The Two Towers*, the guide is Gollum who operates in the text not only in a binary relationship with Frodo but also in many respects as the anti-Aragorn. The Midgewater Marshes sequence is expanded and elaborated

²⁵⁹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 182

²⁶⁰ *Ibid.*

²⁶¹ *Ibid.*, p. 183

²⁶² Shippey, *The Road to Middle-earth*, p. 95.

²⁶³ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 183

into the Dead Marshes in *The Two Towers* just as Rivendell is expanded from the Last Homely House in *The Hobbit* to a hall of princes in *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Like imperial adventure literature, there is a constant sense in the early parts of *The Lord of the Rings* that Middle-earth is expanding around the hobbits. Kutzer argues that this is ‘one of the great attractions of colonial spaces: they provide a landscape of opportunity of escape not only from home, but from adult responsibilities and from adulthood itself’ and because these are not ‘real’ spaces but culturally conceived imaginative spaces, despite the overlap with ‘real’ life – and this is most clearly seen in Tolkien’s adherence to an idyllic ‘England’ in his conception of the Shire – they exist within their own escapist temporal narratives.²⁶⁴

But if the natives had been written out of the empire then the only place left for them to go was to England itself and cultural anxiety of an unstoppable, whole scale invasion runs as a thematic link through much fin-de-siècle literature. If the ‘necessary concomitant of imperialism was fear of invasion by aliens, other Empires or the colonized’ then the second chapter of *The Fellowship of the Ring*, ‘The Shadow of the Past’ illustrates perfectly the image of the Shire as being besieged at every corner.²⁶⁵ Not only are elves ‘who seldom walked in the Shire, [...] now [...] seen passing westward through the woods’ but also ‘dwarves on the road in unusual numbers’, ‘orcs were multiplying again’, ‘trolls were abroad’ and ‘there were murmured hints of creatures more terrible than all these, but they had no name’.²⁶⁶ Like Ayesha in *She*, and Dracula, ‘the demons who threaten to subvert the Empire and invade Britain are of both sexes and come in many

²⁶⁴ Kutzer, p. 23

²⁶⁵ Childs, p. 23

²⁶⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, pp. 43–44

guises'.²⁶⁷ The construction of characters such as the Black Riders, Saruman and Shelob do suggest the influence of the gothic and both Haggard and Stevenson used gothic elements and tropes – if not writing within the genre themselves – and Brantlinger asserts that these gothic tropes are bound up with anxieties about empire. The successful repelling of Dracula's influence, the death of Ayesha before she marries Leo and the phallic symbolism of the stabbing of Shelob – the progenitor of the spiders which live in Mirkwood and which Bilbo fought off by stabbing at them with Sting – betray an anxiety about the invasion and corruption of England within the British Empire. The threatening, savage 'other' of such fin-de-siècle literature cannot be allowed to do more than threaten invasion and must be disposed of far beyond the borders of the heartland. This interpretation is broadly compatible with Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* where the omission of the 'Scouring of the Shire' brings the text in line with imperial adventure writers. It is important to remember that the damage to the heartland of Tolkien's text, the Shire, is through the misuse of industry. Post-World War II, the idea of an unassailable nation was unthinkable for an English writer. Tolkien saw first-hand the ravages of war both home and away. The savage, colonising 'other' has been replaced by war, pollution and modernity. Robert Plank argues that 'the state of the Shire looks like a portrait – or maybe a caricature – of something that actually happened in fairly recent history. It is a perfectly recognizable portrait of fascism.'²⁶⁸ He rejects suggestions that a fascist reading of 'The Scouring of the Shire' is not possible because *The Lord of the Rings* was predominantly written between the world wars, arguing instead that 'the strength of this disagreement is

²⁶⁷ Brantlinger, 'Imperial Gothic', p. 191

²⁶⁸ Robert Plank, 'The Scouring of the Shire: Tolkien's View of Fascism', in *A Tolkien Compass*, ed. by Jared Lobdell (Chicago and La Salle, Illinois: Open Court, 2003), pp. 105-113 (p. 108)

more apparent than real, for the war was the high-water mark rather than the birth of these movements. We must not confuse the time of their rise with the time when broad public opinion in the United States woke up to seeing them for what they were.²⁶⁹

The protagonists of imperial adventure literature were, then, by necessity 'othered' from their environment whether it was Africa, an undiscovered Lost World in the Amazon rainforest or Middle-earth. The place of adventure was always set against or represented as the opposite to the 'real' home of the adventurer although this is the area in which the closest form of hybridity occurs through 'white native' adventurers like Allan Quatermain whose existence within the cosy world of England is of short duration. Late-Victorian adventure or romance writers 'take care to distinguish adventure from domesticity' and while *The Hobbit* carries a certain amount of domestic imagery with Bilbo through his adventures, this is dispensed with in *The Lord of the Rings* once the Hobbits have left the Shire.²⁷⁰ This is exemplified in the chapter 'Many Meetings', where Frodo recovers from his wound on Weathertop in Rivendell which was previously described by Bilbo as the valley where Elrond Elf-Friend lived in 'the Last Homely House' which was: 'perfect whether you liked food or sleep, or story-telling, or singing, or just sitting and thinking best, or a pleasant mixture of the two. Evil things did not come into that valley.'²⁷¹

²⁶⁹ Plank, p. 110

²⁷⁰ Lisa Honaker, "'One Man to Rely On": Long John Silver and the Shifting Character of Victorian Boys' Fiction', *JNT: Journal of Narrative Theory*, 34.1 (Winter, 2004), 27-53 (p. 32)

²⁷¹ *The Hobbit*, p. 58

Bilbo's description is repeated in *The Fellowship of the Ring* with Frodo noting that 'merely to be there was a cure for weariness, fear and sadness'.²⁷² Rivendell itself appears to have expanded since Bilbo's visit; Frodo travels through 'several passages and down many steps'²⁷³ and later:

The doors were thrown open, and they went across a wide passage and through other doors, and came into a further hall. In it were no tables, but a bright fire was burning in a great hearth between the carven pillars upon either side [...] "This is the Hall of Fire," said the wizard.²⁷⁴

In *The Fellowship of the Ring*, it is clear that things have changed in Middle-earth. The cosy domesticity of the Last Homely House has been rewritten into an ancient and impressive palace and Elrond has been promoted from elf-friend to 'the Lord of Rivendell and mighty among both Elves and Men'.²⁷⁵ This impressive imagery continues through *The Lord of the Rings*; Moria is typified by the 'loneliness and vastness of dolven halls and endlessly branching stairs and passages',²⁷⁶ the hall of Meduseld is 'long and wide and filled with shadows and half lights; mighty pillars upheld its lofty roof'²⁷⁷ and Minas Tirith is a 'great stone city, vaster and more splendid than anything [Pippin] had dreamed of; greater and stronger than Isengard, and far more beautiful'.²⁷⁸

The representation of place in *The Lord of the Rings* is nowhere as significant as in the penultimate chapter 'The Scouring of the Shire' which has been corrupted by Saruman. As Joseph Bristow notes of *Heart of Darkness*:

²⁷² *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 225

²⁷³ *Ibid.*, p. 226

²⁷⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 230

²⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 227

²⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 315.

²⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 512

²⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 752

Africa's function in the narrative is to provide a *literal* darkness so that the *metaphoric* darkness of London (and Brussels) can be comprehended [...] the journey to Africa and the 'darkness' encountered there will, somehow, explain the 'monstrous' features of a town [...] that must, centuries ago, have been the source of horror to the Romans. England was once an Africa of kinds, and, it may well appear, it still is.²⁷⁹

'The Scouring of the Shire' can be seen to provide much the same effect in *The Lord of the Rings*. The literal darkness – of environment and landscape – in Mordor is contrasted against the technological corruption in the Shire. The encroaching evil which Tolkien identifies in *The Two Towers* is made more immediate in *The Return of the King* as Tolkien quite literally brings evil home. Just as Conrad suggests that the problems of empire are not only in the overseas territories, so does Tolkien use 'The Scouring of the Shire' to suggest how easily even a 'green and pleasant land' can become a corrupted shadow of itself. Even more importantly, as Robert Plank elucidates, the Scouring of the Shire occurs *after* the adventure; 'miracles do not happen, the laws of nature are in full and undisputed force'.²⁸⁰

Elizabeth Massa Hoiem argues against the association of Tolkien with the imperial adventure writers, noting that 'Tolkien is not, as they were, primarily concerned with inventing mystery and mysticism in colonial locales to counter westernization'.²⁸¹ Instead, she believes that 'Tolkien's break with the adventure tradition in favour of a domestic tale is entirely in keeping with England's inward-seeking gaze', citing examples of renewed interest in England's primarily Anglo-Saxon heritage as collaborative evidence of this. *The Lord of the Rings* then,

²⁷⁹ Joseph Bristow, *Empire Boys: Adventures in a Man's World* (London: HarperCollins Academic, 1991), p. 162

²⁸⁰ Plank, p. 106

²⁸¹ Hoiem, p. 76

becomes part of the modernist fashion of 'combining romance and realism [...] to solidify English identity without resorting to fascism'.²⁸² It becomes difficult to argue that there are many spaces in *The Lord of the Rings* which can be described as either domestic or, indeed particularly English. While fantasy tends to begin within small, enclosed domestic spaces – the genre acknowledges the significance not only of *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* beginning with Bag End but also C.S. Lewis's Narnia which is explicitly *within* the domestic space of the wardrobe – the landscape of Middle-earth, once the Shire has been left behind, cannot be described as domestic. Considering the Shire alone as a domestic space, there is ample scope to apply Hoiem's argument. Hermann Wittenberg's analysis of Ruskin's inaugural 1870 Oxford lecture suggests that:

Ruskin's infamous call to colonisation was then not a straightforward jingoist imperial manifesto aimed at the enlargement of British power, but an ambitious programme aimed at the recovery of those aesthetic and social values which had been lost at home through the alienating effects of industrial capitalism.²⁸³

The explicit gendering of the landscape in Rider Haggard's novels has often been read as part of gendering of the British empire in general; the colonies became feminine, waiting for subjection from the male imperialists. If the process of creating a fantasy world becomes gendered in a similar way – drawing evidence from the rhetoric that Tolkien used to describe the creative process – then a similar gendering of the imagined landscape becomes clear; 'the imagination becomes a fertile, feminine, dangerous, boundless location subdued by the male artist'.²⁸⁴ The gendered landscape which seems so evident in *She* and *King Solomon's Mines*

²⁸² Hoiem, p. 76

²⁸³ Hermann Wittenberg, 'Occult, Empire and Landscape: The Colonial Uncanny in John Buchan's African Writing', *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History*, 7:2 (2006), paragraph 28.

²⁸⁴ Hoiem, p. 84

seems to be present in the conceptual landscape of Middle-earth rather than the physical landscape. William H. Green argues that the landscape of Middle-earth as represented in *The Hobbit* is as explicitly gendered as Africa in *King Solomon's*

Mines:

[Tolkien] describes a landscape like a supine woman, crotch in the foreground, breasts in the distance. The symbolic womb is a life-saving waterhole in Haggard's story, a moist ravine of hospitable elves in Tolkien's. The breasts in both books are distant mountains, which Haggard explicitly calls "Sheba's female breast" saying that their snow caps "exactly corresponded to the nipples on the female breast" [...] Tolkien says more subtly that "the tips of snow-peaks gleamed" [...] the buried mother (of author or protagonist) is, in terms of depth psychology, a repressed autonomous complex, and as such, is projected compulsively until the landscape becomes her proxy.²⁸⁵

Although Haggard's description of the landscape in *King Solomon's Mines* and Tolkien's Middle-earth in *The Hobbit* are again tenuously linked linguistically (there are, even in English, a finite number of ways of describing a snow-capped mountain) Green's identification of Tolkien's appropriation of Haggard's imperialist representation of landscape is significant for the representation of landscape in fantasy literature; C.W. Sullivan notes, significantly, that the 'fantasy author must include enough recognizable material in his or her story so that the reader can decode the unrecognizable' and Tolkien's treatment of the landscape and characters in *The Lord of the Rings* would have been accessible to a contemporary audience *because* of those elements which are appropriated from popular imperial adventure literature.²⁸⁶ In the same way, modern fantasy writers use Tolkien as the basis of appropriation for much the same reasons; the reader

²⁸⁵ William H. Green, "'Where's Mama?' The Construction of the Feminine in *The Hobbit*", *The Lion and the Unicorn*, 22.2 (1998), 188-195 (p. 191)

²⁸⁶ C.W. Sullivan, 'Folklore and Fantastic Literature' in *Western Folklore*, 60:4 (Autumn, 2001), 279-296 (p. 292)

must, as Sullivan argues, be able to identify with the fantasy world in order to have access to it and even writers such as Le Guin and Pratchett who write *against The Lord of the Rings* must make implicit reference to it as a way of bolstering their own representation. The most common form of ensuring access to the text is, as Sullivan stresses, those writers who have ‘given us human characters caught up in great events.’²⁸⁷ It is by no means accurate to suggest that this is a technique which is solely found in fantasy or imperial adventure literature but it is perhaps more commonly found in those genres. Certainly Henty inserted his own characters into famous battles or events – the more well-known examples including *With Kitchener in the Soudan* and *With Clive in India*.

Philip Curtin suggests that the ‘Victorians interpreted the global reach of empire and attendant subjugation of millions of racially different peoples as indisputable evidence of Anglo-Saxon racial superiority’, and a superficial reading of *The Lord of the Rings* would suggest that Tolkien was ascribing to this Victorian view.²⁸⁸ Tolkien’s ‘English’ nations are victorious at the end of *The Lord of the Rings* and the Rohirrim are implicitly linked with the Anglo-Saxons. To suggest, however, that Tolkien used *The Lord of the Rings* to extend specific British imperialist racist ideology is to misjudge the text completely. Edward Said argued that ‘stories are at the heart of what explorers and novelists say about strange regions of the world’ and it is clear that the representations in popular literature of the colonies in general and Africa and India in particular had a striking

²⁸⁷ Sullivan, ‘Folklore and Fantastic Literature’, p. 285.

²⁸⁸ Philip Curtin in Deirdre David, p. 88. The other conclusion typically drawn from this superficial reading is that *The Lord of the Rings* is a commentary on World War 2 and that the victory of the Free Peoples of Middle-earth is an analogy for the victory of the Allies.

effect on how they were perceived by the novels' audience.²⁸⁹ Said goes on to suggest that it is the appropriation of these narratives which 'becomes the method colonized people use to assert their own identity and the existence of their own history',²⁹⁰ but it can also be argued that these adventure narratives became part of a larger mechanism by which a 'British' identity was created – the legacies of which can be seen in popular literature, film and popular culture.²⁹¹

Tolkien's vision of Middle-earth under the rule of Elessar as High King in Gondor is not dissimilar from that expressed by G.A. Henty in *At the Point of the Bayonet*:

wherever [British] powers extend, the natives are far better off than they were under the rule of their own princes. Were the British masters, there would be no more wars, no more jealousies, and no more intrigues; the peasants would till their fields in peace, and the men who now take to soldiering would find more peaceful modes of earning a living.²⁹²

Substituting 'hobbit' for 'peasant' and acknowledging the warrior societies of Gondor and Rohan, this extract fits neatly into the golden age of the 'age of man' alluded to in *The Return of the King* appendices. Tolkien's Britain is ruled from its ancient and noble heart, Gondor, guarding forever the comfortable and 'small' England of the Shire. As Richard Mathews comments: 'The monarch's restoration at the novel's end seems politically anachronistic in the twentieth century; Tolkien's utopian vision is curiously neither democratic nor socialistic, but it is certainly Catholic, English, and even Arthurian.'²⁹³

²⁸⁹ Edward Said, *Culture and Imperialism* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1993), p. xiii

²⁹⁰ Ibid.

²⁹¹ Also see Chapter Two.

²⁹² G.A. Henty, *At the Point of the Bayonet*, quoted in Laurence Kitzan, *Victorian Writers and the Image of Empire: The Rose-coloured Vision* (Westport Conn: Greenwood Press, 2001), p. 107

²⁹³ Richard Mathews, *Fantasy: The Liberation of the Imagination* (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 78

Claire Buck comments that at the beginning of the twentieth century, 'poets had to contend with rural England's place in the later moment of British imperialism as an emblem for the pure heart of England and its empire – enduring, unchanging, and innocent of colonial rapaciousness.'²⁹⁴ The association of rural life and the idealising of a specifically English pastoral is typical of the First World War poets who were Tolkien's contemporaries. Rupert Brooke's 'The Soldier' – 'In that rich earth a richer earth concealed'²⁹⁵ – and Ivor Gurney's 'To His Love' are typical of the connection between the pastoral and death which runs through much of the literature of the time. Frodo's harrowing speech in 'Mount Doom' demonstrates the importance of this connection to the pastoral:

No taste of food, no feel of water, no sound of wind, no memory of tree or grass or flower, no image of moon or star are left to me. I am naked in the dark, Sam, and there is no veil between me and the wheel of fire.²⁹⁶

That Frodo's mental breakdown and gradual invasion by the Ring is stressed through his inability to connect with the landscape – 'no memory of tree or grass or flower' – is highly suggestive of the importance of the landscape in the trilogy as a whole. It is not simply a backdrop where the events of *The Lord of the Rings* happen, it is an intrinsic part of the narrative and the characters, especially the hobbits. Tolkien illustrates this in 'The Prologue' where he comments that 'they love peace and quiet and good tilled earth: a well-ordered and well-farmed countryside was their favourite haunt.'²⁹⁷

²⁹⁴ Claire Buck, 'Literary Context, Twentieth Century', *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London: Routledge, 2007), pp. 363-366 (p. 365)

²⁹⁵ Rupert Brooke, 'The Soldier', *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, ed. by M.H. Abrams and Stephen Greenblatt, 7th edn, 6 vols (London: W.W Norton & Company, 2000), II, p. 2050

²⁹⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 937-938

²⁹⁷ *Ibid*, p. 1

However, this is a distinctly nostalgic view of landscape and while Tolkien may have had little awareness of the potential readers of *The Lord of the Rings*, the imperial adventure novelists and First World War poets were writing for a predominantly urbanised readership and therefore ‘represented countryside or rural landscape is thus already exotic, or picturesque or nostalgic for a majority of its audience, which has neither a philosophical nor proprietorial relationship to it’.²⁹⁸

James Obertino argues that:

Tolkien is clearly a Little Englander, who describes the Shire as we find it at the start of *The Lord of the Rings* as a nearly perfect home county, with its leisure-loving, tea-drinking Hobbits, with no factories, mines, or telegraph wires to mar the landscape, and no colonies contributing to Frodo’s prosperity. Emphasizing the Shire’s cozy insularity is its clear boundary – a hedge. Anything outside is likely to be dangerous, uncanny, or frightening, even though there are settlements of Hobbits outside the Shire, and the Hobbits learn to love the friendly uncanniness of the Elves.²⁹⁹

The delineation of inside the bordered Shire and outside the Shire – inside England and outside in the greater Empire – begins to represent the self as much as the Ring does; ‘the primary symbolism of a ring is, traditionally, the self.’³⁰⁰ For Bilbo and Frodo, the Ring becomes another self into which there is the possibility of escape – through invisibility or into evil. Frodo’s mental breakdown, a breakdown of ‘self’ and ‘other’ occurs outside the Shire. Bruce Murphy suggests that the border between the self and the other is a wandering, unstable construction; in *The Lord of the Rings* this is demonstrated through the Frodo-Gollum-the Ring connection.³⁰¹ Christopher Booker argues that the Ring ‘is in fact a symbol not of

²⁹⁸ Ian Christie, ‘Landscape and “Location”’: Reading Filmic Space Historically’, *Rethinking History*, 4:2 (2000), 165–174 (p. 168)

²⁹⁹ Obertino, p. 121

³⁰⁰ Donington, p. 93. Also, see Introduction.

³⁰¹ Bruce Murphy, ‘The Exile of Literature: Poetry and the Politics of the Other(s)’, *Critical Inquiry*, 17:1 (Autumn, 1990), 162-173.

wholeness but of the ego, tempting anyone who possesses it to dreams of infinite power'.³⁰² The duality of evil in *The Lord of the Rings* works as a serious paradox which Tolkien has bequeathed to the genre 'between the Boethian view of evil as nothing and internal and the other view of evil as an active, external force which requires resistance'.³⁰³

Sons of Empire: Imperial Masculinity in *The Lord of the Rings*

As Anne M. Windholz explains, 'young men who came of age in England at the end of the nineteenth century did so as the very nature of masculinity was being contested in social, economic, and sexual arenas',³⁰⁴ and the construction of masculinity which was bred out of the 'muscular Christianity' ethos was supported by 'a generation of university teachers, schoolmasters, clergymen, poets, journalists and boys' fiction writers'.³⁰⁵ The model of masculinity which was developed and popularised was comprised of 'equal parts of patriotism, physical toughness, skill at team games, a sense of fair play (sometimes called 'sportsmanship'), self discipline, selflessness, bravery and daring', and there is extensive evidence in *The Lord of the Rings* to suggest that this model of masculinity was at the heart of Tolkien's vision for his characters.³⁰⁶ Moreover, these virtues are not restricted to those characters who are obviously drawn in the heroic tradition; in the end, the success of the quest hinges on Sam and Frodo's sense of duty and moral resilience in Mordor and, in a lesser fashion, Merry's

³⁰² Christopher Booker, p. 319

³⁰³ John W. Houghton and Neal K. Keese, 'Tolkien, King Alfred, and Boethius: Platonist Views of Evil in *The Lord of the Rings*', *Tolkien Studies* 2:1 (2005), 131-159 (p.133)

³⁰⁴ Anne M. Windholz, 'An Emigrant and a Gentleman: Imperial Masculinity, British Magazines, and the Colony That Got Away', *Victorian Studies* (Summer, 1999/2000), 631-658 (p. 631)

³⁰⁵ James, p. 206

³⁰⁶ Ibid.

bravery in stabbing the Witch King of Angmar. Physical stature, Tolkien stresses, is not as important as their courage. Robert Plank suggests Tolkien's overestimating of the importance of courage is particularly evident in 'The Scouring of the Shire.' Plank comments that:

Frodo and his friends have courage but little else, and entrenched power falls before them like a house of cards. These heroes do not persuade, they do not convince anybody. They rally the people, but the people have already been on their side. Yet discussion and persuasion are the lifeblood of democracy. And courage is more an aristocratic than a democratic virtue.³⁰⁷

Tolkien's 'courageous' hobbits are therefore firmly placed in the bracket of imperial adventurers. While Aragorn, Elrond and Gandalf clearly owe their allegiance to the medieval texts which Tolkien drew upon, the hobbits are drawn from the same cast as Haggard's Allan Quatermain or Horace Holly who find themselves unexpectedly launched into adventures but nevertheless rise to surprising limits of mental and physical endurance. What all these texts suggest is that the unique character of the English gentleman is best suited to survive in situations which would defeat any other race. By 1888, 'gentleman' had a far broader definition which included 'the son of a peer, or a parson, of a soldier, a merchant, or a lawyer'.³⁰⁸ Anne M. Windholz points out that:

The expanded body of men who not only aspired to but also claimed the title of gentleman by the end of the century indicates the pervasive success of this particular gender ideology and the extent to which British maleness became identified with it. Yet just as the title of "gentleman" became increasingly accessible to aspirants, economic depression made the prosperity that it seemed to promise difficult to realize. Gentlemanly status might theoretically be defined by a moral sensibility that democratized the ideal, but it ultimately remained dependent on financial standing.³⁰⁹

³⁰⁷ Plank, p. 111

³⁰⁸ A.G. Bradley (1888) cited in Windholz, p. 634

³⁰⁹ Windholz, p. 634

Sam's behaviour might not change throughout *The Lord of the Rings* but it is only when he inherits Bag End from Frodo that he can attain status in the community as the Mayor of Hobbiton – the final hobbit to achieve the Henty-esque reward for adventure. The casual racial superiority of the British in empire adventure literature was strongly linked with patriotism but England was the site of the *end* of adventure. It was the backdrop against which Haggard and Henty's characters retired to enjoy the fruits of their adventure in the wider empire; Guy Arnold argues that 'the height of Henty's ambition for his young heroes is that they come back to England to marry and become comfortably-off squires'.³¹⁰ This is precisely what happens in *The Lord of the Rings*: Sam, Merry and Pippin all marry and take their places as pillars of the community but this is not where Tolkien's narrative leaves them. Appendix B of *The Return of the King* details how Merry and Pippin return first to Rohan and then to Gondor where they are laid to rest with Aragorn and Sam follows Frodo's path and leaves Middle-earth, the last reward of the final Ring-bearer. Tolkien's message seems to be somewhat different, with the four hobbits all leaving the Shire, but this could be a veiled metaphor for death. Even heroes cannot stay in the Shire forever.

Indeed, it can be argued that a low level of patriotism runs through *The Lord of the Rings* and is especially notable when evidenced by characters such as Aragorn who has been forced to spend most of his life away from Gondor: 'I am Strider and Dúnadan too, and I belong both to Gondor and the North.'³¹¹ The hobbits, too, are sustained throughout *The Lord of the Rings* by the memory of the Shire that they carry with them, 'refreshing them in the arid and dangerous

³¹⁰ Arnold, p. 48

³¹¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 563. This is also stressed in Jackson's films.

portions of the world, inspiring them to fight and win' just as Laurence Kitzan suggests that the imperial adventurer does.³¹²

Edward Said notes of Kipling's *Kim* that 'we are in a masculine world dominated by travel, trade, adventure, and intrigue, and it is a celibate world' and these elements can be gathered into a template for the world in which imperial adventure novels are predominantly set.³¹³ Like the heroes of *With Clive in India*, *King Solomon's Mines* and *Kidnapped*, Frodo leaves the Shire because he has a duty to do so and is accompanied by his faithful servant Sam. Rider Haggard's central characters often set off together, and *She* at least, includes a working class character, Job, who was initially employed to look after the infant Leo. Deirdre David notes that in 'the novels of H. Rider Haggard, for instance, we find that the influence of empire [...] is the very stuff by which an unsubtle masculine and national identity is defined.'³¹⁴

The pattern in G.A. Henty's novels is generally that the young hero will save the life of a working-class or native character who will undertake to serve him in the batman role that Sam takes on, as Martin Simonson notes: 'Sam can also be identified with one of the prototypes of the hero's friends in the British imperial adventure novel'.³¹⁵ Frodo is also initially accompanied by his cousins, Meriadoc Brandybuck and Peregrine Took, who are the respective heirs to the Master of Buckland and the Thain of Tookborough. Most, if not all of G.A. Henty's young heroes are of aristocratic birth or clearly a gentleman by nature. Frodo's family are wealthy and influential in Hobbiton and in addition, Aragorn is the heir of Gondor,

³¹² Kitzan, p. 52

³¹³ Said, *Culture and Imperialism*, p. 165

³¹⁴ David, p. 96

³¹⁵ Simonson, p. 81

Boromir is the son of the Steward of Gondor, Legolas is the son of Thranduil, King of the Woodland Realm of Mirkwood and Gimli is the son of Glóin – these last two characters, Thranduil and Glóin, feature in *The Hobbit* – and it is clear that, like Henty, Tolkien's 'heroes are all gentlemen and incipient members of the establishment.'³¹⁶ Sam's resemblance to the 'faithful black who attaches himself to [the hero], is frequently instrumental in rescuing him from his enemies and in many cases, accompanies him back to England', and who often features in Henty's novels, can by no means be a coincidence, although it is clear that Sam's purpose in the narrative goes far beyond the limited role allowed to Henty's native sidekicks. Sam becomes the unexpected hero of *The Lord of the Rings* and Tolkien's conception of heroism is more inclusive than Henty or Haggard's.³¹⁷

William H. Green argues that many of the characters in *The Hobbit* can be read as female or feminised – including Gandalf and Elrond – in that 'some feminine virtues – such as passivity and fear of adventure – are weaknesses to be overcome, but their masculine opposites, the restlessness and testosterone-driven ambition of the macho hero, are vices' and that those characters whose principal narrative function is to be beautiful and nurturing can be read as female to the point at which changing the gender of the characters would 'not weaken the narrative coherence of *The Hobbit* or alter its moral and psychological themes'.³¹⁸ The masculine ideal described by Green is explicitly pre-1880s and this makes the choice of supporting material interesting given that *King Solomon's Mines*, *Treasure Island* and the novels of G.A. Henty portray a very different idealised masculinity. The tender, nurturing masculinity that Green identifies in *The Hobbit*

³¹⁶ Arnold, p. 71

³¹⁷ Richards, 'With Henty to Africa', p. 91

³¹⁸ Green, "'Where's Mama?'"', p. 192

is supported somewhat tenuously on the connection between the trek across the Misty Mountains by the dwarves, Bilbo and Gandalf and a real hike that Tolkien took in 1911 led by his aunt; a painting of a witch disguised as a man which Tolkien acknowledged inspired the physical description of Gandalf; the lack of significant female characters in the novel and the narrative function of the elves and does not explain a similar lack of active female characters in *The Lord of the Rings*. However, Stephen Prickett makes a far more convincing argument suggesting that Gandalf owes his creation in part to John Ruskin's South West Wind in *The King of the Golden River* 'who is possibly the first magical personage in fiction to show that combination of kindness and eccentric irascibility.'³¹⁹ The character of Billali in *She* is also suggestive of a stereotypical type that both Haggard and Tolkien may have been drawing upon:

He was a wonderful-looking old man, with a snowy beard, so long that the ends of it hung over the sides of the litter, and he had a hooked nose, above which flashed out a pair of eyes as keen as a snake's, while his whole countenance was instinct with a look of wise and sardonic humour impossible to describe on paper.³²⁰

Moreover, Green fails to take into account that *The Hobbit* was written for a juvenile audience whereas *The Lord of the Rings*, with its far more complex representations of masculinity and identity, was written explicitly for an adult audience. It is difficult to cast Boromir, Legolas or Aragorn in the role of 'nurturer'; when they carry the hobbits through the snowdrifts on Caradhras, it is a matter of necessity:

'Have hope!' said Boromir. 'I am weary, but I still have some strength left, and Aragorn too. We will bear the little folk. The others no doubt will

³¹⁹ Stephen Prickett, *Victorian Fantasy*, 2nd edn (Waco, Texas: Baylor University Press, 2005), pp. 64-5

³²⁰ *She*, p. 70

make shift to tread the path behind us. Come, Master Peregrin! I will begin with you.' He lifted up the hobbit. 'Cling to my back! I shall need my arms,' he said and strode forward. Aragorn with Merry came behind. Pippin marvelled at his strength, seeing the passage that he had already forced with no other tool than his great limbs.³²¹

Jane Chance takes a similar stance as Green in considering *The Lord of the Rings* in which she identifies 'serving' behaviours such as care, nurturing and healing from one character to another - for example, Sam to Frodo. Such behaviour demonstrates for Chance that 'what has traditionally been regarded as gender-linked behaviour is here gender-neutral'.³²² I would argue for a slightly different reading of the 'tender' behaviour in *The Lord of the Rings*. It is not precisely a case of Tolkien making such traits specifically gender-neutral in such a way to – perhaps subconsciously – counterbalance the predominantly masculine text; rather that it is perfectly in line with earlier adventure literature. Catherine Stimpson makes a similar point when she argues that 'the most delicate and tender feelings in Tolkien's writing exist between men, the members of holy fellowships and companies.'³²³

The addition of the working-class or native characters serves to combat the issue that both Tolkien and Henty encountered, 'the difficulty he faces in making his characters both heroic and ordinary'.³²⁴ It was essential for the intended audience of imperial boys' novels to be able to identify with the protagonist but this was a common criticism levelled at Henty, as Guy Arnold notes: 'a general criticism of Henty's young heroes is their absolute qualities: they have all the

³²¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 293

³²² Jane Chance, *Lord of the Rings: The Mythology of Power*, 2nd edn (Kentucky: The University Press of Kentucky, 2001), p. 113

³²³ Catherine R. Stimpson, *J.R.R. Tolkien* (New York and London: Columbia University Press, 1969), p. 20-21

³²⁴ Arnold, p. 41

manly virtues.’³²⁵ Lisa Honaker notes that during the nineteenth century, as anxieties about the empire grew, within popular literature the ‘vision of manhood shifted from philanthropic to militaristic’.³²⁶ The heroes of late-Victorian literature were no longer domestic empire-builders who led the way to Christianity; they were now explorers and soldiers. Honaker makes special mention of Thomas Hughes’s *Tom Brown’s Schooldays*, *Swiss Family Robinson*, *Robinson Crusoe* and R.M. Ballantyne’s *The Coral Island* as examples of this. All these texts turn the wild environment - including the public school environment - into a tamed and domesticated space. This is in sharp contrast to the untamed and unknowable territory explored by the heroes of *Stalky and Co*, *King Solomon’s Mines*, *With Clive in India* and made explicit when Aragorn (the soldier) takes the hobbits (the young heroes) into ‘the wild lands’.³²⁷ In addition to this, the nineteenth century marked a change in the way the ‘body’ was conceptualised. Developments in medicine led to compulsory smallpox vaccinations for all children in 1853 so that ‘the body politic had increased its power over the body physical. The individual body therefore now became, to a degree, *state property*.’³²⁸ Modern masculinity vacillates uncomfortably between the ‘man’s man’ ideal which is rooted firmly in imperial popular culture of the nineteenth century and the postmodern deconstruction of this cultural construct. With the thematic heritage of empire underpinning so much of the cultural consciousness of the West, it is perhaps

³²⁵ Arnold, p. 152

³²⁶ Lisa Honaker, “‘One Man to Rely On’: Long John Silver and the Shifting Character of Victorian Boys’ Fiction”, *JNT: Journal of Narrative Theory*, 34:1 (Winter, 2004), 27-53 (p.28)

³²⁷ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 181

³²⁸ Anthony Synnott, ‘Tomb, Temple, Machine and Self: The Social Construction of the Body’, *The British Journal of Sociology*, 43:1 (March, 1992), 79-110 (p. 95)

unsurprising that the 'imperial male survivor has, not so surprisingly, outlived the empire in popular culture'.³²⁹

The physicality of the novels of Henty, for example, place the body of the protagonist continually at the disposal of England and the empire. As Steven Swann Jones argues: 'extraordinary heroes are the embodiments of their culture; they are larger than typical figures in ordinary life [...] because they are exemplars of their society's aspiration and socio-political conflicts.'³³⁰ The perfection of Leo Vincey's body resembling 'a statue of Apollo come to life'³³¹ contrasts sharply with the vivid description of the corruption of Ayesha's body in *She*:

Smaller she grew, and smaller yet, till she was no larger than a monkey. Now the skin was puckered into a million wrinkles, and on the shapeless face was the stamp of unutterable age. I never saw anything like it [...] and let all men pray they never may, if they wish to keep their reason.³³²

The juxtaposition of the perfect or awesome male body against the corrupted female body is repeated in *King Solomon's Mines* where the witch Gagool is described as 'looking for all the world like an animated crooked stick or comma, her horrid eyes gleaming and glowing with a most unholy lustre', and is set against the 'majestic forms' of the soldiers.³³³ This juxtaposition turns into a spectacle as Haggard demonstrates the monstrous result of stepping outside the natural order, whether by being an autonomous woman in a strictly patriarchal society, or by using magic for personal benefit as both Ayesha and Gagool use magic or the threat of magic to retain ultimate control. The destruction of the female monster is a common theme in gothic literature which is contemporary with imperial

³²⁹ Bristow, p. 166

³³⁰ Swann Jones, p. 9

³³¹ *She*, p. 1

³³² *Ibid.* p. 262

³³³ *King Solomon's Mines*, p. 100

adventure literature and it seems likely that, classed together as ‘romance’, such thematic appropriation would be common-place. Maureen Thum compares Tolkien to the other Inklings, specifically C.S. Lewis, when she points out that ‘Tolkien, by contrast, almost invariably portrays powerful women positively and seldom portrays such figures as evil and in need of punishment or death.’³³⁴

Leslie A. Donovan argues that a reading of the female characters in Tolkien’s text as passive is a misreading of Tolkien’s clear appropriation of valkyrie motifs and traits. She states that ‘Tolkien’s primary women characters in *The Lord of the Rings* – Galadriel, Shelob, Eowyn, and Arwen – are narrative agents charged with the authority of distinct heroic women figures from Old Norse mythology and literature called the valkyries’.³³⁵ More importantly, Donovan reads the female characters as responding to social and political changes in post-war British society:

After World War II, the professional, religious, and societal cultures to which Tolkien belonged both continued to emphasize traditional roles for women while simultaneously recognizing the possibilities of new familiar models, employment opportunities, and social as well as political importance for them. Like the medieval valkyrie figures, it was more socially possible for post-World War II women to maintain independent identities without sacrificing their expected cultural validity, a concept the morally conservative but broad-thinking Tolkien may have found attractive.³³⁶

Although Donovan makes some fascinating points – most notably concerning the role of the ‘cup-bearer’ in medieval texts and this connection to Galadriel and Éowyn – I am not convinced by her argument in reference to Shelob. The

³³⁴ Maureen Thum, ‘The “Sub-Subcreation” of Galadriel, Arwen, and Éowyn: Women of Power in Tolkien’s and Jackson’s *The Lord of the Rings*’, *Tolkien On Film* (see Paxson, above), pp. 231-256 (p. 235)

³³⁵ Leslie A. Donovan, ‘The Valkyrie Reflex in J.R.R. Tolkien’s *The Lord of the Rings*’, in *Tolkien the Medievalist*, ed. by Jane Chance (London: Routledge, 2003), pp. 106-129 (p. 108)

³³⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 109

connection Donovan makes between Shelob and Grendal is interesting, but I would hesitate before concluding – as Donovan does – that ‘the monstrous and malevolent Shelob parallels baleful valkyrie figures’.³³⁷ Jes Battis points out that to read Shelob ‘as a feminine caricature, and thereby to ascribe those same preconscious and grotesque tropes to the feminine with syllogistic facility, is to underscore a scathing critique of the female body by Tolkien that simply has no agency, no presence, anywhere else in the text.’³³⁸ In addition Deidre Dawson argues against an explicitly Norse appropriation. She suggests that ‘Éowyn’s name may be Anglo-Saxon, but the inspiration of her character – her fearlessness in the face of death, her determination to avenge her slain kinsmen and her refusal to be dominated by a foreign power – are very Celtic.’³³⁹

Citing Hama’s words in ‘The King of the Golden Hall’, ‘She is fearless and high-hearted. All love her. Let her be as lord to the Eorlingas, while we are gone,’³⁴⁰ Donovan concludes that ‘Where some critics view Éowyn’s character as either reflective of the powerlessness inherent in traditional female roles that trap women in their femininity or as indicative of her rejection of femininity through her warrior trappings, Hama’s words indicate instead her authority to be simultaneously a woman and a warrior.’³⁴¹ Donovan’s reading here is somewhat selective; Théoden is appointing a temporary leader only and in one sense, Éowyn proves to be a poor choice as she follows them into battle disguised as a young man. Edith L. Crowe believes the decision to leave Éowyn in charge is indicative

³³⁷ Donovan, p. 121

³³⁸ Battis, p. 916

³³⁹ Deidre Dawson, ‘English, Welsh, and Elvish: Language, Loss, and Cultural Recovery in J.R.R. Tolkien’s *The Lord of the Rings*’, in *Tolkien’s Middle Ages*, ed. by Jane Chance and Alfred K. Siewers (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp.105-120 (p.106)

³⁴⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 523

³⁴¹ Donovan, p. 122

of a trend in Tolkien's Middle-earth narratives where 'lineage and family are often more important than gender in legitimising female political power. In Éowyn's case, being a member of the House of Eorl is apparently more important than her sex.'³⁴²

It is interesting to note how Jackson's adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings* – which will be discussed in greater depth in Chapter Two – has dealt with the female characters. Thum makes an excellent point when she argues that 'although his transmutation of Galadriel, Arwen, and Éowyn involve often radical departures from the text, Jackson accurately represents Tolkien's views of women as they are expressed throughout his writings'.³⁴³ She cites the active nature of Tolkienian heroines such as Lúthien and argues that despite the *appearance* of marginality, it is through the female characters that the narrative achieves cohesion. Cathy Akers-Jordan makes a similar point when she argues that:

Jackson attempts to portray her as a true descendant of her heroic ancestors, such as Lúthien, Eärendil and Galadriel. In doing so, he remains loyal to the spirit of Tolkien's books, especially in terms of Arwen's influence on Aragorn's life and fate, and makes her more appealing to a modern audience.³⁴⁴

Lisa Hopkins points out that by comparison to Lúthien, Arwen 'is a surprisingly shadowy figure'³⁴⁵ who 'seems to exist only to provide a suitable

³⁴² Edith L. Crowe, 'Power in Arda: Sources, Uses, and Misuses' in *Proceedings of the J.R.R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*, ed. by Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodknight (Milton Keynes and Altadena: Mythopoeic Press, 1995), pp. 272-277 (p. 275)

³⁴³ Thum, p. 254

³⁴⁴ Cathy Akers-Jordan, 'Fairy Princess or Tragic Heroine? The Metamorphosis of Arwen Undómiel in Peter Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* Films' *Tolkien On Film* (see Paxson, above), pp. 195-213 (p. 195)

³⁴⁵ Lisa Hopkins, 'Female Authority Figures in the Works of Tolkien, C.S. Lewis and Charles Williams' in *Proceedings of the J.R.R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992* (see Crowe, above), pp. 364-6 (p. 366)

bride for Aragorn at the end of the story.’³⁴⁶ Victoria Gaydose is less convinced by Jackson’s alteration of Arwen into a more active character. She believes that Tolkien’s Arwen is a ‘serenely beautiful and traditionally feminine image of passivity’.³⁴⁷ Gaydose does concede that modern cinema audiences now demand active and narratively engaged female characters and argues that ‘Peter Jackson shows greater loyalty to this historical process than to Tolkien’s original text in the way he presents Arwen in his version of *The Fellowship of the Rings* (sic)’.³⁴⁸ Certainly the changes in Jackson’s *The Lord of the Rings* seem to bear out this argument; it is Arwen who rescues Frodo from the Nazgûl and calls the river rather than Glórfindel sending Frodo on his horse to Rivendell. Part of this adaptation is surely pragmatic; Tolkien’s *The Lord of the Rings* has an astonishing – epic – cast and it is understandable that in order to preserve narrative clarity, some of the minor characters might be lost in adaptation, especially those who appear briefly in one book only. Equally, it is important for the audience to care about Aragorn and Arwen’s romance; Éowyn is so much more in the model of the modern female heroine that it is possible Arwen might have suffered by comparison. So too does Jackson’s interpretation of Arwen seem to bear out the spirit of Tolkien’s heroine; she is not considered the inheritor of Lúthien because she is as beautiful as Lúthien but rather because she has Lúthien’s spirit and character.

Tolkien’s Galadriel shares several stylistic motifs with Ayesha in that they are both beautiful, long-lived members of an ancient race, who possess the ability to call forth images from pools of water: ‘[t]hat water is my glass; in it I see what

³⁴⁶ Hopkins, p. 366

³⁴⁷ Victoria Gaydose, “‘Crimes Against the Book?’ The Transformation of Tolkien’s Arwen from Page to Screen and the Abandonment of the Psyche Archetype”, *Tolkien On Film* (see Paxson, above), pp. 215-230 (p. 219)

³⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 222

passes if I will to summon up the pictures, which is not often'.³⁴⁹ Ayesha reveals her mirror to Holly in the chapter entitled 'Ayesha Unveils' and although the chapter contains a literal unveiling in that Ayesha removes the gauzy wrappings which conceal her body, it is also a mental unveiling as Ayesha explains the source of her power and how she came to be queen. The chapter 'The Mirror of Galadriel' in *The Fellowship of the Ring*, possesses a significantly similar sequence when Sam looks into the water '[a]s if a dark veil had been withdrawn, the Mirror grew grey, and then clear.'³⁵⁰ The association of truths being revealed after the removal of a literal or figurative veil runs through both *The Lord of the Rings* and *She*.

Concealing Their Roots: Fantasy and the Mask of Empire

The complex relationship between deception and fantasy which is illustrated in *The Lord of the Rings* seems to have its roots in part in imperial adventure literature where the concealing of identity carries with it dishonourable overtones. The presentation of multiple masculine identities serves to obscure the fact that the masculine identity in imperial adventure literature is itself a construct. In Henty's *With Kitchener in the Soudan* for example, the father of the young hero uses his second name 'Hilliard' instead of his true aristocratic surname 'Hartley' after marrying into a lower social class. He dies young and his son, the novel's hero Gregory Hilliard, despite growing up as a hybrid much like Kipling's Kim, gains recognition of his heroism and is eventually established in his true rank as the Marquis of Langdale. Joseph Bristow notes that by using his second name 'he has

³⁴⁹ *She*, p. 136

³⁵⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 363

not dishonourably given a false identity'.³⁵¹ While imperial adventure literature used the concealing or false identity as a plot device, it also occurs notably in the medieval literature which is likely to be another appropriative source for *The Lord of the Rings*, although to discuss in great detail the numerous medieval connections within *The Lord of the Rings* is somewhat beyond the scope of this thesis.³⁵²

The links between medieval and fantasy literature range from the structure of the stories, the evolution of the distinctive 'quest' narrative and the prevalence of devices such as magic swords, impregnable castles and royalty in hiding. It is perhaps easy to see the connections between *Perceval ou Le conte du Graal* by Chrétien de Troyes, Robert de Boron's Grail stories, Malory's *Morte D'Arthur* and Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*. All these narratives share similar stylistic reference points, not the least of which is the necessity for the hero to conceal his identity, as exemplified by Lancelot's comments to the Fisher King about Sir Perceval in one of the thirteenth century continuations of Chrétien de Troyes's *Perceval*: 'it is great adventure of finding him, for oft-times will he change his cognizance in divers fashion and conceal his name in many places.'³⁵³ Medieval and fantasy heroes do not just change their names, they also conceal their faces – especially their eyes – and the moment of revelation of identity-through-name becomes one with the revelation of identity-through-the-un-masking-of-the-face. The motif of un-masking or simply revealing the face while giving the name becomes a common one in fantasy literature:

³⁵¹ Bristow, p. 148

³⁵² See, for example, *Tolkien the Medievalist: Routledge Studies in Medieval Religion and Culture*, ed. by Jane Chance (London: Routledge, 2003); Michael D.C Drout, 'J.R.R. Tolkien's Medieval Scholarship and its Significance', *Tolkien Studies*, 4 (2007), 113-176; Tom Shippey, *The Road to Middle-Earth*

³⁵³ Author unknown, *The High History of the Grail: A continuation of the narrative of Chretien de Troyes thirteenth century France*.

the stranger pulled back the cowl of his cloak to reveal clearly the dark face, now framed by long black hair, cut nearly shoulder length and shading the deep-set eyes, which still showed only as black slits in the shadows beneath the heavy brows [...] he announced his name quietly.³⁵⁴

This extract from *The Sword of Shannara* by Terry Brooks, detailing the revelation of Allanon's identity in the inn in the Shady Vale which is owned by Shea's foster father, can be contrasted directly with the description of Strider in the Prancing Pony in *The Fellowship of the Ring*:

A travel-stained cloak of heavy dark-green cloth was drawn close about him, and in spite of the heat of the room he wore a hood that overshadowed his face; but the gleam of his eyes could be seen as he watched the hobbits.³⁵⁵

It is clear that Brooks has appropriated Tolkien's character; Allanon is revealed to be an amalgamation of Gandalf and Aragorn whose somewhat sinister appearance belies his good intentions in much the same way that Frodo is initially wary of Aragorn. As Clyde B. Northrup suggests:

the cape or cloak can also be used to conceal one's identity, to hide from unfriendly eyes, and so escape detection [...] to remove one's clothes in the presence of another is, both literally and metaphorically, to allow the other person into one's most intimate and secret places.³⁵⁶

In *The Sword of Shannara*, Balinor arrives in the Shady Vale, barely allowing Flick and Shea Ormsford to recover from Allanon's appearance and exposition-laden warning. He too appears 'wrapped in a green cloak'³⁵⁷ which 'covered all his body' and remains only long enough to indicate his significance to the narrative as

³⁵⁴ Terry Brooks, *The Sword of Shannara* (London: Futura Publications, 1989), p. 26

³⁵⁵ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 156

³⁵⁶ Clyde B. Northrup, 'The Qualities of a Tolkienian Fairy-Story', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50: 4 (2004), 814-837 <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/modern_fiction_studies/v050/50.4northrup.pdf> [accessed 18 September 2006]

³⁵⁷ Brooks, *The Sword of Shannara*, p. 58

the king of Callahorn's son and to repeat Allanon's warning.³⁵⁸ Both Balinor and Allanon reveal their purpose for visiting the Shady Vale only after unmasking.

Instead of the many years which pass between Gandalf suspecting there is something untoward about the Ring and Frodo's eventual and prolonged leaving of the Shire, Brooks has substituted an extensively detailed exposition. Events quickly centre around Shea's 'true' identity as the last remaining – although halfblood – heir to the elven king Jerle Shannara. Allanon's reappearance in the dwarf city Culhaven reaffirms his threatening appearance: 'his lean face half hidden in the long cowl, his whole appearance dark and foreboding.'³⁵⁹ The continual partial masking of Allanon's face serves to emphasis his ambiguity in the text just as Tolkien does with Aragorn early in *The Fellowship of the Ring*.

The turning of Trotter from *The Hobbit*-sequel into Aragorn, son of Arathorn in *The Lord of the Rings* also helps to conceal Tolkien's appropriation. Aragorn is, as Verlyn Flieger notes, 'an authentic mythic hero'.³⁶⁰ Flieger asserts that Tolkien is following epic convention by concealing Aragorn's identity through the disguise of 'Strider', but this interpretation itself disguises any appropriation by Tolkien from empire literature and conveniently de-scribes the Trotter/Strider character from any lasting significance in the narrative. The 'Ranger' hobbit Trotter's first appearance in the narrative is very close to Aragorn's:

Suddenly Bingo noticed that a queer-looking, brown-faced hobbit, sitting in the shadows behind the others, was also listening intently. He had an enormous mug (more like a jug) in front of him, and was smoking a broken-stemmed pipe right under his rather long nose. He was dressed in dark rough brown cloth, and had a hood on, in spite of the warmth, - and,

³⁵⁸ Brooks, *The Sword of Shannara*, p. 59

³⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 147

³⁶⁰ Verlyn Flieger, 'Frodo and Aragorn: The Concept of the Hero', *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism* (see Kocher, above), pp. 122-145 (p. 130)

very remarkably, he had wooden shoes! Bingo could see them sticking out under the table in front of him.³⁶¹

From the first incarnation of Aragorn then, it can be argued that deception was a necessary part of his identity – and that this concealment is quite separate from his later evolution into Isildur’s heir. Christopher Tolkien seems very sure that Aragorn’s mythic hero status was a later development and not conceived of from the beginning: ‘Of course, looking back over the texts from Trotter’s first appearance, there is no possibility that my father had “originally planned” to make Trotter anything but a hobbit.’³⁶² Christopher Tolkien suggests that instead of Trotter being replaced by Aragorn:

Rather, he had been potentially Aragorn for a long time; and when my father decided that Trotter *was* Aragorn and *was not* Peregrin Boffin his stature and his history were totally changed, but a great deal of the ‘indivisible’ Trotter remained in Aragorn and determined his nature.³⁶³

Aragorn’s other potential identities included Peregrin Boffin who ‘grew up a dark-haired and (for a hobbit) lanky lad, very much more of a Took than a Boffin’;³⁶⁴ as well as a ‘disguised elf - friend of Bilbo’s in Rivendell’³⁶⁵ who ‘pretends to be a ranger’.³⁶⁶ Peregrin Boffin especially recalls Haggard’s description of Allan Quatermain: ‘I am thin, and short, and dark’.³⁶⁷ What is especially significant in all the versions of Aragorn is that disguise is a crucial part of his function in the narrative. The fact that Strider first appears in *The Fellowship*

³⁶¹ J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Return of the Shadow: The History of Middle-earth Volume 6*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 1994), p. 137

³⁶² *Ibid.*, p. 393

³⁶³ *Ibid.*, p. 431

³⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 385

³⁶⁵ J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Treason of Isengard: The History of The Lord of the Rings Part 2*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2002), p. 6

³⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 7

³⁶⁷ *King Solomon’s Mines*, p. 38

of the Ring with his face concealed is indicative of the genre as a whole as the disguising of the face comes to be linked to the masking of motive.

To consider the use of the mask – and this includes the use of clothing or armour to mask or conceal the face and/or body in fantasy literature and film – it is first necessary to consider briefly the concept of the face as a signifier of emotion and intent. Richard Rushton suggests that:

The face is part of a signifying system that is quite different from that of spoken or written language, and it is quite different from traditional forms of representation like drawing or painting or photography. What these traditional forms of representation need are a certain intentional logic, the determination that “with these marks I am representing *x*” – even if there is no intended meaning, there is certainly the intention that one is doing or producing something (an artwork, for example). The face, opposed to this, on certain occasions, can represent or signify *automatically*, without the intention of the person upon whose face the markings arise.³⁶⁸

The face, Rushton argues, acts as a place of pre-communication which signifies the ‘*potential* – it is of the order of the possible and the virtual’.³⁶⁹ He cites Deleuze and Guattari who claim that ‘choices are guided by faces, elements are organised around faces: a common grammar is never separable from a facial education’.³⁷⁰ The mask therefore works as a disruption of this essential level of communication and signifies a breakdown between the represented face and the actual face. As John J. Honigmann explains, ‘by hiding the face they “interrupt” or “divert” the normal flow of communication [...] the mask acts to disjoin personal identity from the behaviour being enacted’.³⁷¹ Donald Pollock points out that ‘the minimal Western mask works, not by concealing the face, but by concealing the eyes’ and

³⁶⁸ Richard Rushton, ‘What Can A Face Do? On Deleuze and Faces’, *Cultural Critique*, 51 (Spring, 2002), 219-237 (p. 220)

³⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 225

³⁷⁰ Deleuze and Guattari, ‘Year Zero’, quoted in Rushton, p. 221

³⁷¹ John J. Honigmann, ‘The Masked Face’, *Ethos*, 5:3 (Autumn, 1977), 263-280 (p.275)

cites several well-known proverbs which stress how the eyes are crucially important in Western culture as a symbol of intent and identity.³⁷²

Elizabeth Tonkin suggests that ‘every Mask is part of an event, which can only be intelligible when understood as a performance with complex interactions between Masks and non-maskers’ and although she refers explicitly to the use and purpose of masks in central and western Africa, the idea is that the mask is part of a dialogue between the wearer and the viewer – and Tonkin capitalises ‘mask’ to indicate the mask-in-action as both symbol and performance. This would clearly be a dialogue which is distinct from the ‘normal’ face-to-face communication identified by Rushton, Pollock and Honigmann. The mask would therefore seem to signify a specific kind of communication between mask-wearer and mask-viewer and this leads to another important point: that the mask in literature is not ‘seen’ but ‘read’ and as Dennis Duerden stresses, the ‘form of visual images is communicated in a different manner from the form of verbal images’.³⁷³ The describing of a mask in literature therefore becomes a doubled-reading; a textual reading of a visual event which is quite distinct from the reading of a description of a landscape. The author/character who stands in for the reader as the viewer of the mask therefore also acts as decoder of the mask as symbol and performance, limiting the possibilities of interpretation.

The various masks, visual identities and costumes employed in Neil Gaiman’s *The Sandman* are both visual and written due to the blending of visual image with written text in the graphic novel. This is unlike Tolkien, who of

³⁷² Donald Pollock, ‘Masks and the Semiotics of Identity’, *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 1:3 (Sep. 1995), 581-597 (p. 585) His examples include; that seeing is believing; look someone in the eyes.

³⁷³ Dennis Duerden, ‘The “Discovery” of the African Mask’, *Research in African Literatures*, 31:4 (2000), 29-47 (p. 32)

necessity describes Frodo and Sam in orc armour; once Morpheus has dressed in his helmet, he is concealed from the reader in a way that Sam and Frodo cannot be. The combination of the third person narrative and the casting of the reader as 'viewer' reduces the mask-wearing Morpheus to the 'body as sign, itself signed, furrowed and impressed, made to advertise its own unknownness (sic) and savagery'.³⁷⁴

Through the use of the mask, his body is explicitly made other from his identity but there is a curious dualism in place. It is the mask which connects Gaiman's Morpheus with the short lived 1940s comic strip hero the Sandman, a violent vigilante who concealed his actions in the dark and causing his targets to become unconscious.³⁷⁵ That the original incarnation of the Sandman was never seen by the inhabitants of the city he lived in and glimpsed only briefly when wearing the iconic mask must surely be significant. It is the image of the mask-wearing Sandman which stresses continually that Morpheus is not completely Gaiman's invention. Morpheus is an excellent example of the postmodern gothic fantasy anti-hero but every time he puts on the mask, he becomes subsumed into Vertigo's Sandman, not Gaiman's. It is clear that in this case the 'separation between everyday self and performed identity is extreme. He is [...] metaphysically re-identified, and [...] the mask [...] effaces his very existence'.³⁷⁶

This is further underlined when it becomes clear that Morpheus only wears his iconic helmet when he is threatened or required to present himself formally.

³⁷⁴ Elleke Boehmer, 'Transfiguring: Colonial Body into Postcolonial Narrative' *NOVEL: A Forum on Fiction*, 26:3 African Literature Issue (1993), 268-277 (p. 269)

³⁷⁵ Roger Sabin, *Comics, Comix & Graphic Novels: A History of Comic Art* (London: Phaidon Press Ltd, 2003) p. 168

³⁷⁶ John Picton, 'What's In A Mask' in *African Languages and Cultures*, 3:2 (1990), 181-202 (p. 192)

More than a badge of office, this mask reaffirms Morpheus's identity as the Dream-king, an anthropomorphic personification, and it also comes to stand *for* him; the loss of his mask in *Preludes and Nocturnes* prevents his escape from Roderick Burgess. Without the accoutrements of his role, Gaiman stresses, Morpheus is as vulnerable as any of the human characters in the text. This is further elucidated when Morpheus sets aside the mask as a symbol of power and begins almost immediately to change his personality, to become more sympathetic and empathetic with humanity. The Endless, Gaiman notes, are not human and cannot become human. They are endless and unchanging and the changes Morpheus goes through inevitably lead to his death. His mask becomes 'the acceptable face [...] of something, a power, an energy, a metaphysical presence, otherwise too dangerous to see.'³⁷⁷ In this he is comparable to Pratchett's Death who briefly leaves his position in *Mort* and gradually loses those physical qualities which are associated with the character. Death, being a skeleton, does not have a face in the usual sense and the conceit of confusion between his face and a mask is repeated in several novels.³⁷⁸ The Sandman's mask, like Death's face, comes to represent not only his formal, powerful identity but by concealing completely his eyes and face, it also eradicates the identity of Morpheus as a separate entity from the anthropomorphic personification of the Sandman.

As John Emigh suggests, 'the tendency is to speak of the mask as an impediment to expression, protecting and hiding the individual, corrupting understanding and disfiguring truth' and the use of masks to conceal the face and

³⁷⁷ Picton, p. 192

³⁷⁸ In *The Light Fantastic*, Death is summoned from a masquerade ball and he appears wearing a skull mask in *Masquerade*.

body of evil in fantasy is significant and widespread.³⁷⁹ Evil in fantasy literature is frequently portrayed as not only faceless and therefore unknowable but also isolated. Whereas the hero may have several companions, each with a specific task to perform, the villain is generally alone or served by minions and may either conceal his body or be incorporeal.³⁸⁰

The hero may also conceal his or her identity in an effort to evade the attention of the villain either by taking on a different name as Frodo does in Bree: ‘My name is Underhill’³⁸¹ or by concealing his body, ‘a perfect little orc, if I may make so bold – at least you would be, if we could cover your face with a mask.’³⁸² As Richard C. West points out: ‘Tolkien found it morally acceptable for his heroes to dissimulate at least in dire circumstances, when it was a choice between lying and losing their lives’.³⁸³ Jane Chance points out that ‘Gandalf’s lesson to Wormtongue (and Theoden and Rohan) reveals clearly that appearances may mask a higher reality – a lesson in symbolism *and* courtesy.’³⁸⁴ There appear to be two distinct sets of rules governing the morality of deception in fantasy literature which draws on Tolkien: the first is that concealing identity or deceiving others is a sign of evil; the second is that such deception is morally justified when performed by the hero. The difference here may only appear to be semantic but is highly significant in practice; concealment with intent to deceive is a characteristic which

³⁷⁹ John Emigh, *Masked Performance: The Play of Self and Other in Ritual and Theatre* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996), p. 7

³⁸⁰ See also Rowling’s *Harry Potter*, Eddings’s *The Belgariad*, Brooks’s *Shannara*, Le Guin’s *A Wizard of Earthsea* and *Tombs of Atuan* for examples of this.

³⁸¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 153

³⁸² *Ibid.*, p. 913

³⁸³ Richard C. West, ‘“And She Named Her Own Name”: Being True To One’s Word In Tolkien’s Middle-earth’, *Tolkien Studies*, 2:1 (2005), 1-10 (p. 3)

³⁸⁴ Jane Chance, *Mythology of Power*, 2nd edn (Kentucky: The University Press of Kentucky, 2001), p. 69

links such disparate villains as the Witch-King of Angmar, Lord Voldemort and Senator Palpatine.³⁸⁵

The disguising of the identity of the hero has become a formulaic rather than an ideological element of modern epic fantasy; for example, in *The Pawn of Prophecy* by David Eddings, the young hero Garion and his companions travel as turnip traders, a form of travel which is slow and laborious. When Polgara queries the mode of transportation, suggesting they travel as imperial messengers or as a wealthy family, Belgarath explains that ‘it is better to move slowly than to attract attention’.³⁸⁶ This is, of course, appropriated directly from *The Fellowship of the Ring* where Frodo moves away from Bag End to Buckland and goes by the name of Mr. Underhill. But Frodo – and Gandalf – are protecting the Ring and there have been incursions by outsiders into the Shire. By comparison, Garion, Belgarath and Polgara are attempting to *retrieve* the Orb and by this point there has been only one incident with a mildly evil character. Belgarath’s decision to travel ‘slowly’ seems illogical given that they are travelling through friendly lands, that he has the help of the kings of Alorn and the armies of the West at his disposal and is, moreover, a powerful sorcerer. In fact, given the extensive spy network that had tracked them since leaving Faldor’s farm in Sendaria, Belgarath’s attempted deception not only wastes time but utterly fails and seems to serve no place in the narrative apart from the convention that the hero must leave his home through a concealed purpose.

³⁸⁵ See *Star Wars: The Phantom Menace*, *Star Wars: Attack of the Clones* and *Star Wars: Revenge of the Sith*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm. 1999. 2002. 2004. Senator Palpatine is an elected official of the Republic who is also a Sith Lord.

³⁸⁶ David Eddings, *Pawn of Prophecy* (London: Corgi Books, 1983), p. 98

The evil priests of the Dragon-god Torak – who practise human sacrifice – wear polished metal masks, a copy of Torak’s own mask which he wears to conceal his permanently burning and disfigured face. Not only was Torak’s face originally beautiful – like Sauron and Morgoth – but he has of necessity to conceal it. The priests, or Grolims, become merely aspects or avatars of Torak, their own identities subsumed into his. A copy of the mask also rests above the altars and the hearts of the victims are burned beneath the mask which not only represents but physically stands *for* the god. In *Pawn of Prophecy*, the simple pageant about the creation of the world performed at Faldor’s farm before the quest begins features a ritualistic use of masks:

seven of the older farmhands who had slipped away [...] appeared in the doorway wearing the long hooded robes and carefully carved and painted masks which represented the faces of the Gods [...] with a slow step, the robed and masked figures paced into the hall.³⁸⁷

As the figures speak and Garion identifies each familiar voice, it becomes clear that something of Torak’s personality becomes attached to even a performance of his identity; the smith Durnik who is characterised throughout the five novels as a good man, when representing Torak, speaks ‘hollowly from behind the mask’.³⁸⁸ This is an example of what Marianne Mesnil suggested was indicative of festival masquerades. The performers in the pageant indicate that they are representing something ‘other than what [they are] as individuals, or even as social being[s]: [they] become one of the characters of the story which is related in the festival.’³⁸⁹

³⁸⁷ Eddings, *Pawn of Prophecy*, p. 72

³⁸⁸ Ibid.

³⁸⁹ Marianne Mesnil quoted in Patricia E. Sawin, ‘Transparent Masks: The Ideology and Practice of Disguise in Contemporary Cajun Mardi Gras’, *Journal of American Folklore*, 114 (452), 175-203 (p.184)

The pageant is enjoyed by all in the multicultural and multi-faith country of Sendaria but the six followers of Torak at Faldor's farm react in a significantly different manner: 'the Murgu had covered his face in a strange, almost ceremonial gesture. Beyond him [...] the five Thulls were ashen-faced and trembling.'³⁹⁰ This corresponds with the encounter of Nienor with the dragon Glaurung in *The Silmarillion* and *Unfinished Tales* when Glaurung lays 'a veil of his malice' over her mind.³⁹¹ Tom Shippey notes that in the Eddic poem 'Fáfnismál', the dragon boasts of bearing 'a helmet of fear over all the race of men'.³⁹² Tolkien appropriates this image into:

The Helm of Hador [...] A power was in it that guarded any who wore it from wound or death [...] It had a visor [...] and the face of one that wore it struck fear into the hearts of all beholders [...] Upon its crest was set in defiance a gilded image of the head of Glaurung the dragon.³⁹³

Shippey argues that it is the face of the dragon, the 'dragon-mask' itself which causes this reaction from those who see it and goes on to draw attention to the Nazgûl being described as being 'helmed and crowned with fear'.³⁹⁴ The mask of the Dragon-God Torak in the *Belgariad* continually has a similar effect on the characters. Garion, now under his true name *Belgarion*, the Overlord of the West, falters when he meets Torak in single combat in the final novel *Enchanter's End Game*. Garion eventually succeeds by assuming another, distinct identity, that of the Child of Light, the avatar of the 'good' prophecy which has directly interfered in his life to the extent of 'performing' tasks for him. The final battle in *Enchanter's End Game* is in fact, a repetition of the play-fight between Garion and

³⁹⁰ Eddings, *Pawn of Prophecy*, p. 72

³⁹¹ J.R.R. Tolkien, 'Narn I Hîn Hûrin' *Unfinished Tales of Númenor and Middle-earth*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 1998) pp. 75-209 (p. 177)

³⁹² Shippey, *The Road to Middle-earth*, p. 302

³⁹³ J.R.R. Tolkien, 'Narn I Hîn Hûrin' *Unfinished Tales of Númenor and Middle-earth*, p. 98

³⁹⁴ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 706

his friend Rundorig when they were children where Garion, armed with a stick and a saucepan lid as a shield with the saucepan as a helmet, nearly killed his friend while in a fugue state. Even the rehearsal of the performance of this masked identity is dangerous but Eddings explicitly suggests that these multiple identities – king, avatar, ordinary man – co-exist inside Garion and as the narrative unfolds through the five novels, Garion is stripped down to his most essential identity – that of the Child of Light. Rather than Garion taking on new identities as his position changes, he is instead unmasked throughout the series until, like Frodo on Mount Doom, he faces Torak with no barriers between himself and evil. It is a significant feature of the genre that the hero must face evil at the climax of the novel with no deceptions or illusions and inevitably it is the will and purpose of the hero set against the power of evil.

It is clear that the meaning of the mask and the corresponding ‘identity transformation taking place’ is different depending on where the character is placed in the moral order of the text.³⁹⁵ The Angaraks as a people are irredeemably evil and therefore fear the mask which represents their god. It is significant that the few Angarak characters who are not evil, or at least morally ambiguous are, in no particular order: Zakath, an atheist, Drosta, cosmopolitan, and Urgit, who is an Alorn ‘passing’ for an Angarak.

In fantasy literature, the masked face enables both concealment and the ‘passing’ as part of a community he or she is not actually a member of. By concealing their bodies and faces with orcish armour, Sam and Frodo can pass for ‘little orcses’ in *The Return of the King* and Luke Skywalker and Han Solo

³⁹⁵ Pollock, p. 593

successfully infiltrate the Death Star in *Star Wars* by stealing storm trooper uniforms. Significantly in this latter case, only Princess Leia notices that there is anything unusual about the (masked) Luke Skywalker: 'Aren't you a little short for a storm trooper?'³⁹⁶ To the other storm troopers, Luke and Han's appearance does not require extensive 'looking'; for Princess Leia, it is plausible that, being more unfamiliar with the storm troopers, she simply pays more attention and thus notices that Luke is 'a little short'.³⁹⁷ It is also significant that Luke's performance of a storm trooper slips once he is in Leia's prison cell as he stops and stares at her. It is not enough, clearly to *wear* a mask or false identity, the crucial element is the successful *performance* of this identity.

Luke and Han can pass visually as storm troopers just as Sam and Frodo can pass visually, under the concealing armour, as orcs, but it is the additional *performance* as orc deserters which enables them to remain concealed: 'he bent all his will to draw his breath and to make his legs keep going'.³⁹⁸ In *The Empire Strikes Back*, Luke's vision has Darth Vader removing his mask to reveal Luke's face, and Sophia van Gameraen argues that this demonstrates 'that Luke's shadow side is Darth Vader, and that the Dark Side of the Force exists within Luke as much as it does in Vader'.³⁹⁹

Luke removing his helmet in Leia's prison cell becomes a stylistic and thematic foreshadowing not only of the vision in *The Empire Strikes Back* but also of the final revelation of Darth Vader as Anakin Skywalker in the final minutes of

³⁹⁶ *Star Wars: A New Hope*. Dir. by George Lucas. Lucasfilm. 1977

³⁹⁷ Ibid.

³⁹⁸ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 931

³⁹⁹ Sophia van Gameraen, "'That Boy Is Our Last Hope': Andrew, Star Wars and the Figure of the Jedi in Buffy the Vampire Slayer.' *The Slayage Conference on Buffy the Vampire Slayer Paper Archive*

<http://slayageonline.com/SCBtVS_Archive/index.htm > [accessed 26 February 2008]

Return of the Jedi. In all these cases, it is the removal of the storm trooper helmet – an all-encompassing mask which covers the face completely – which precipitates these revelations of identity. As Mircea Eliade asserts, the person wearing the mask ‘ceases to be himself [...] he seemingly, if not actually, becomes another’.⁴⁰⁰ In *The Lord of the Rings* this same mechanism can be seen in the Gollum/Sméagol dualism; Sam likes ‘the new Gollum, the Sméagol, less than the old’.⁴⁰¹ Sam acknowledges that there are two distinct personalities and the differing behaviour is exhibited by Sméagol when he initially joins Sam and Frodo to lead them through the Dead Marshes to Cirith Ungol:

He spoke with less hissing and whining, and he spoke to his companions direct, not to his precious self. He would cringe and flinch, if they stepped near him or made any sudden movement, and he avoided the touch of their elven-cloaks; but he was friendly, and indeed pitifully anxious to please.⁴⁰²

This is suggestive of Gollum *using* Sméagol as a mask to conceal his real intentions. Tolkien’s own choice to continue to use the name ‘Gollum’ to refer to Gollum/Sméagol during the Dead Marshes sequence when he is explicitly behaving as Sméagol is also indicative that the Sméagol-personality is a transient identity, concealing imperfectly Gollum beneath: ‘a greenish light was kindled in Gollum’s pale eyes [...] for a moment he seemed to relapse into his old Gollum-manner’.⁴⁰³

It is clear that ‘there are also very great differences in the amount of iconographical matter presented by particular masks’.⁴⁰⁴ Picton identifies three distinct variations in the relationship between the mask, the mask wearer and the

⁴⁰⁰ Honigmann, p. 273

⁴⁰¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 619

⁴⁰² *Ibid.*, pp. 618-619

⁴⁰³ *Ibid.*, p. 622

⁴⁰⁴ Picton, p. 191

viewer. The first of these is a mask which effects a distance between performer and audience for dramatic effect where ‘the performer wearing a mask can be nothing more than a performer wearing a mask’.⁴⁰⁵ Sam and Frodo disguised as orcs, Perceval changing his name and the numerous examples of fantasy characters who change their appearance in order to deceive the enemy would seem to be examples of this. Another example is Éowyn, who deceives Théoden in order to ride into battle at the Pelennor Fields. The moment of her revelation has very similar imagery as Tolkien uses in ‘Nam I Ilîn Húrin’: ‘A little to left facing them stood she whom he had called Dernhelm. But the helm of her secrecy had fallen from her, and her bright hair, released from its bonds, gleamed with pale gold on her shoulders.’⁴⁰⁶

The ‘dramatic effect’ Picton identifies in the theatrical performance of masks can easily be connected to the fantasy literature convention which demands that characters travel concealed through the enemy’s territory. It is almost always linked to the need for self-preservation on the part of the characters and exists for only a short duration in most cases.

The second of Picton’s variations is the masks which channel the power of something *other* through them which denies ‘human agency’. The mask wearer becomes, he states, ‘whatever it is that the mask hides, sometimes in a state of possession by that metaphysical presence [...] invariably with the authority to speak as its oracle’.⁴⁰⁷ The metal masks of Torak’s face in *Pawn of Prophecy* and the Sandman’s helmet have an identity which is separate from the explicit performance of the masked character but are imbued with this intangible authority.

⁴⁰⁵ Picton, p. 191

⁴⁰⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 841

⁴⁰⁷ Picton, p. 192

In *The Belgariad* series, something of Torak's personality is evoked through the performance and ritual of the mask-wearing and his disciples even come to resemble him over time. After Morpheus's death, the helmet is still used to signify him as an image on his funeral shroud in *The Wake*.⁴⁰⁸

Finally, there are masks which 'create dramatic distance in the context of performance, but [...] [w]hat matters in this case is the visible [...] reality of the artefact rather than what it causes to remain hidden'.⁴⁰⁹ The Nazgûl 'helmed and crowned with fear' is itself a symbol of evil which negates the reality of the men the Nazgûl were before their corruption.⁴¹⁰ The Mouth of Sauron is another example of this: his face was 'twisted with amazement and anger to the likeness of some wild beast [...] as it crouches on its prey';⁴¹¹ 'the mask reveals rather than conceals' his evil nature and reinforces his position as the 'mouth' of Sauron.⁴¹²

The use of masks in fantasy literature, although clearly allied to the literary conventions of the genre, seems to stem from a clear internal morality. Fantasy writers also seem to draw on conventions in mask use and masquerade which is more conventionally seen in anthropological studies of the use of masks in Africa, South America and across Asia. This suggests not only the colonial appropriation of these symbols and tropes but also the cross-pollination of ideas and narratives through Europe when the first medieval quest stories were being written. Nathan W. Schlacter's examination of the use of lying in Plato's *Republic* leads him to conclude that while a 'real' lie or deception is always morally wrong, there is another kind of lie, the 'noble' lie or deception 'which can serve important

⁴⁰⁸ Neil Gaiman, *The Sandman: The Wake* (New York: DC Comics, 1997)

⁴⁰⁹ Picton, p. 193

⁴¹⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 706

⁴¹¹ *Ibid.*, p. 891

⁴¹² Picton, p. 193

purposes'.⁴¹³ He goes on to argue that the 'the root of the verb Socrates uses here, "muthologias" (translated as "telling tales") is *muthos*, or "myth," a richly layered word that designates a narrative that on the surface may be literally false but at the same time conveys a deeper or more profound truth' and the use of deception in fantasy not only acts as a convention of the genre but also as an indication of the potentially allegorical or metaphorical nature of the work itself.⁴¹⁴ Just as Frodo, disguised in orc armour has not actually *become* a member of Sauron's army, he nevertheless has exhibited characteristics which suggest he is closer morally to Gollum than Sam. His concealing of his identity in the Orcish armour then, not only enables him to pass for a member of the enemy but also reveals a truth about his identity.

Conclusion

It is important to remember, as Eldridge does, that the 'imperial adventure genre, then, played an important role in popularising and glamourising the empire' and the connections between imperial adventure literature and modern fantasy literature are significant and clearly part of the continuing discourse about the modern reaches of the British empire in current popular culture.⁴¹⁵ The appropriation by fantasy writers not only of Tolkien but through Tolkien, of the structure and themes of popular mid- to late-nineteenth century imperial adventure stories, ensures the continuing repetition and appeal of this genre of literature. As Kutzer notes, 'issues of empire are still with us' and resonating in modern

⁴¹³ Nathan W. Schlucter, 'The Virtue of "Lying": Recovering the "Saving Beauty" of Plato's Poetic Vision', *Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought and Culture*, 9:1 (2006). 72-107 (p. 74)

⁴¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 75

⁴¹⁵ C.C. Eldridge, *The Imperial Experience: From Carlyle to Forster* (London: Macmillan Press Ltd, 1996), p. 77

literature and film.⁴¹⁶ This is supported by Suvendrini Perera who declares that the ‘representation of empire draws on a pre-existing and continually expanding vocabulary for confronting and regulating other forms of cultural domination’.⁴¹⁷

While the writers of epic and quest fantasy who have followed Tolkien engage with *The Lord of the Rings* to a greater or lesser extent, it is clear that alongside the narrative pattern that has been appropriated by these writers, post-Tolkien writers have also appropriated elements of the imperial grand narratives that Tolkien also drew on. It is also clear that the visual and written arts have been a mechanism for the transmission of imperialism and that the misleading nature of the term ‘post-colonial’ has led to a dismissal of theories of imperialism as being no longer appropriate to late twentieth century and early twenty-first century popular culture, despite imperialism being ‘one of the most influential forces which has shaped, and is still shaping, the world’,⁴¹⁸ and that ‘understanding imperialism is essential to understanding the contemporary world’.⁴¹⁹ Edward Said argued that modern literary criticism ‘must connect the structures of a narrative to the ideas, concepts, experiences from which it draws support’ and while a great deal of Tolkien scholarship has concentrated on drawing out the connections between Tolkien and medieval texts, it is important to extend and expand these connections to the culture that he lived in.⁴²⁰ Verlyn Flieger makes the excellent point that Tolkien was ‘no more stuck in the Middle Ages than he was stuck in the

⁴¹⁶ Kutzer, p. 141

⁴¹⁷ Perera, p. 5

⁴¹⁸ Bush, p. 7

⁴¹⁹ Ibid., p. 4

⁴²⁰ Said, *Culture and Imperialism*, p. 79

twentieth century, and to be fair to him and his work, we have to see him situated in both.’⁴²¹

William N. Rogers II and Michael R. Underwood point out that although Tolkien acknowledged Haggard’s influence on his writing ‘the thematic and other links between these writers have largely remained unexplored.’⁴²² They go on to state that ‘Our concern is not source hunting as an end in itself, but rather how a source influences a writer’s imagination and how that source finds a congruent place in the particular cultural and ideological meanings of the “borrowing” text.’⁴²³ I hope in this chapter to have demonstrated the critical connection between Tolkien and the imperial adventure writers who preceded him and to have elucidated some of the lesser known appropriations by Tolkien, both textually – as, for example his appropriations of the armour scene in *King Solomon’s Mines* – and subtextually through the embedding of imperialist tropes within *The Lord of the Rings*.

⁴²¹ Verlyn Flieger, ‘A Postmodern Medievalist?’, in *Tolkien’s Modern Middle Ages*, ed. by Jane Chance and Alfred K. Siewers (Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 17-28 (p. 21)

⁴²² Rogers and Underwood, p. 122

⁴²³ Ibid.

Chapter Two
A Cartographic Fantasy:
Peter Jackson, New Zealand
and *The Lord of the Rings*

A Cartographic Fantasy: Peter Jackson, New Zealand and *The Lord of the Rings*

The world of *The Lord of the Rings* is a fantasy one. It is populated by elves and wizards, castles and primeval forests and other, well-known conventions of the fantastic landscape. Much scholarship around *The Lord of the Rings* is concerned with comparing it to other fantasy texts, many of which have been heavily influenced by Tolkien. Other approaches seek to illuminate the many Northern European myths and legends that Tolkien drew upon such as the Icelandic epic writings *Edda*, or to investigate the complex themes and motifs within the text itself and Tolkien's other writings. Almost all of these approaches, whatever their final conclusions, agree that the landscape is explicitly Northern European and that it illuminates Tolkien's beliefs about the relationship between man and environment as a striking critique of modernity. Furthermore, there is widespread consensus that Tolkien invented the template for fantasy texts in the relationship between the principal characters and the landscape they traverse. Critical responses to Peter Jackson's adaptations have briefly replicated these thematic approaches in their consideration of the cinematic landscape of *The Lord of the Rings*, often overlooking the implicit collusion between New Zealand government and tourist board, New Line Cinema and Peter Jackson in explicitly linking the landscape of Middle-earth to the real land of New Zealand. This 'remaking' of New Zealand, a rebirth on an international stage through *The Lord of the Rings* films, casts Jackson as the author of a definitive and subversive post-colonial text with a global audience for discourse about New Zealand, landscape and a post-colonial national identity.

This 'heroic' reading of Jackson's appropriation of *The Lord of the Rings* and the return to a 'romantic wilderness' reading of the New Zealand landscape

does not preclude a reading which suggests that Jackson's presentation of the New Zealand landscape is itself a product of colonisation and may indicate a neo-colonial position for Jackson in his representation of Middle-earth.⁴²⁴ Chris Prentice, for example, points out that 'settler post-colonial discourses of resistance to the structures of power and subjectivity that informed nationalism tend, in their attempts to recuperate "nation" as a viable cultural and political structure, to replicate – or at least supplement – the discursive structures they putatively oppose.'⁴²⁵ When considering the representation of the land, it is important to take into account the possible political perspectives of the artists responsible and not to assume that the image of the land does not have a symbolic or political motivation, for example, 'the fact that the land cannot "act" on cue does not render its filmic representation any less prone to manipulation. The presented image of a landscape is necessarily a sign.'⁴²⁶ As Malcolm Andrews explains:

Landscape art [...] has from early on been implicated in nationalist, imperialist and socio-economic ideologies, and often most potently so when, superficially, least touched by suggestions of any political agenda. This is not a matter of past history only. The heightened consciousness in the western world about the environment in the late twentieth century makes us increasingly aware of what, in different ways, has always pertained; landscape is a political text.⁴²⁷

Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin assert that "place" in post-colonial societies is a complex interaction of language, history and environment'

⁴²⁴ W.J.T. Mitchell, 'Imperial Landscape', in *Landscape and Power*, ed. by W.J.T. Mitchell, 2nd edn (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2002), pp. 5-34 (p. 18)

⁴²⁵ Chris Prentice, 'Some Problems of Response to Empire in Settler Post-Colonial Societies', in *De-Scribing Empire*, ed. by Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 45-58 (p. 55)

⁴²⁶ Ross Gibson, 'Formative Landscapes' in *Australian Cinema*, ed. by Scott Murray (St. Leonards, New South Wales: Allen & Unwin, 1994), pp. 45-59 (p. 54)

⁴²⁷ Malcolm Andrews, *Landscape and Western Art* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), p. 175

and it is important to stress the difference between 'place' and 'landscape'.⁴²⁸ Ashcroft et al use 'place' as a signifier for a range of geographical, cultural and artistic terms regarding the representation and treatment of the physical earth; Malcolm Andrews uses *one* of these terms, landscape, in order to unpack the cultural and historical influence the imperial West has had on the world when it comes to presenting and re-presenting 'place'. Andrews makes two vital points about the relationship between viewers and landscapes: first, that 'we are not passive consumers of landscape images'.⁴²⁹ It is an idea, he stresses, and an experience that evokes an emotional response – and it is this emotional response and the pleasure we take from landscapes that goes some way to explaining the dominance of the landscape in Western art for over five hundred years. The second point Andrews has to make is this: that 'landscape in art tells us, or asks us to think about where we belong' and has, as a consequence, a significant part to play in the forming of national identities.⁴³⁰

In his investigation into the merging of Christian tenets with the indigenous South African Tswanan beliefs, Charles Piot suggested that 'if missionary modernity is forever getting locally appropriated / reauthored / hybridized – and if appropriation of the foreign is a property of *setswana* itself – is such appropriation also an example of colonialization?'⁴³¹ This reading has tremendous implications for Jackson's adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings*; if, as Piot suggests, the act of appropriation is an intrinsic element of colonisation on the part of the colonised

⁴²⁸ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, 'Introduction: Place', in *The Postcolonial Studies Reader* ed. by Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin (New York: Routledge, 1995), pp. 391-393 p. 391

⁴²⁹ Andrews, p. 8

⁴³⁰ Ibid.

⁴³¹ Charles Piot, 'Of Hybridity, Modernity, and their malcontents' *Interventions*, 3:1 (2001), 85-91 (p. 87)

population, then the re-making of *The Lord of the Rings* into an explicitly New Zealand text is not an act of post-colonial rebellion or appropriation but part of what W.J.T. Mitchell terms the ‘dreamwork of imperialism’.⁴³² Alternatively, if Jackson’s actions are read as purely colonial in construct then his metaphorical remaking of New Zealand is also a colonial act, and it is this act of remaking which gives what M. Daphne Kutzer terms the ‘illusion of power and control’.⁴³³ Much like the Europeans in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, the act of remaking physical geography through a symbolic renaming becomes a method of laying claim to the landscape – the Ka Tiritiri o te Moana mountain range, for example, became the Southern Alps under British rule and Ered Nimrais in *The Lord of the Rings* films.⁴³⁴ Supporting this interpretation is Suzanne Romaine’s comment that ‘European understandings of literacy gave no meaning to indigenous acts of oral narration such as the Māori whakapapa or Aboriginal Australian ways of “writing the country”, which were accomplished through the naming of places.’⁴³⁵ A European definition of literacy which leaves no space for alternate narratives works to eradicate or silence dissident or ‘native’ land ownership by not recognising that it exists. This is particularly significant for a post-colonial nation which has been independent for less than one hundred years and which is, in the opinion of W.J.T. Mitchell, ‘virtually synonymous with pristine natural beauty, a nation whose principal commodity is the presentation and representation of

⁴³² Mitchell ‘Imperial Landscape’, p.10

⁴³³ Kutzer, p. 120

⁴³⁴ Just as Te Haukaretu became Harcourt Park (Rivendell) and Takuranga became Mt. Victoria (Hobbiton).

⁴³⁵ Suzanne Romaine, ‘Contested Histories in Aotearoa New Zealand Literature: Witi Ihimaera’s *The Matriarch*’, *The Contemporary Pacific*, 16:1 (Spring 2004), 31-57 (p. 40)

landscape.’⁴³⁶ Romaine goes on to note that the act of renaming the landscape meant that ‘Europeans wrote over its Māori past, as if erasing a slate. In naming and mapping the territories they “discovered,” explorers like Cook claimed them for their sovereigns: finders, keepers.’⁴³⁷ Jackson’s more conventional – and colonial – reauthoring of New Zealand is easy to assimilate by European-influenced Western society; this rewriting of New Zealand becomes a globally recognised economic ‘truth’.

This chapter draws heavily on the theoretical work of art critics to consider Peter Jackson’s use of landscape in his adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings* as well as more conventional film and literary theorists. In this, I am following the guidance of Angela Miller who argues that ‘Landscape, as an image of raw (or reshaped) nature in a work of art – be it a literary account, a painting, or a photograph – is, by definition, an area of interdisciplinary study.’⁴³⁸

A View of the Land: The Colonial Landscape of New Zealand

As Franco Mercurio explains, following Jacope Sannazzaro’s pastoral epic poem *Arcadia* in 1504, a fashion for literary works which were ‘cultured vehicles of communication of pastoral ideology that was directly related to the possession and utilisation of natural resources’ swept through Europe.⁴³⁹ Examples of this include *Los siete libros de la Diana* by Jorge de Montemayor in 1559 and Philip Sidney’s *Arcadia* of 1593. This concept of ‘arcadia’ as an idealised pastoral environment

⁴³⁶ Mitchell, ‘Imperial Landscape’, p. 20

⁴³⁷ Romaine, ‘Contested Histories’, p. 39

⁴³⁸ Angela Miller, ‘Review: Magisterial Visions: Recent Anglo-American Scholarships on the Represented Landscape’, *American Quarterly*, 47:1, 140-151 (p. 141)

⁴³⁹ Franco Mercurio, ‘Virtual Territories, Real Landscapes: Notes of a Journey Around an Interpretation’ <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/mercurio.pdf>> p.109, [accessed 16 January 2008]

which is explicitly linked with nostalgia has had a striking impact on the way that British colonies – and especially New Zealand – have been represented nationally and globally. As Roger Sales noted, colonial landscapes were endowed with an almost Eden-like quality:

American Arcadias are usually set, not in a garden but in a wilderness that is presumed to be in an innocent, original state that is beyond the frontier in both space and time. American Arcadian innocence is therefore located in a land before civilisation.⁴⁴⁰

Colonial New Zealand was also represented as 'Arcadia', an idealised and untouched landscape which was, as Cheleen Mahar suggests 'ready and waiting to be used in productive ways by British people'.⁴⁴¹ The representation of New Zealand in the late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries consistently adheres to the rules of landscape painting – itself a European import – and 'New World landscapes have been rendered in Old-World formulae, a procedure that represents a kind of cultural colonization of the new territory'.⁴⁴² As W.J.T. Mitchell has observed, New Zealand was represented as a sublime landscape in the style of Salvator Rosa, although the more domesticated paintings show an acknowledgement of the conventions of the Picturesque. Colonial paintings frame or depopulate the New Zealand landscape in order to 'harmonise the more unruly aspects of nature'.⁴⁴³ The landscape of William Hodges's painting 'Waterfall in Dusky Bay' (1775) is plainly idealised and exotic; clearly intended to provoke

⁴⁴⁰ Roger Sales, *English Literature in History 1780-1830: Pastoral and Politics* (London: Hutchinson, 1983), p. 32

⁴⁴¹ Cheleen Ann-Catherine Mahar, 'Landscape, Empire and the Creation of Modern New Zealand' in *Landscape and Empire* (see O'Callaghan, above), pp. 65-78 (p. 67)

⁴⁴² Andrews, p. 162.

⁴⁴³ Glenn Hooper, 'Introduction' in *Landscape and Empire* (see O'Callaghan above), pp. 1-16 p. 5

wonder and enchantment in what is obviously not a European landscape.⁴⁴⁴ It is also not obviously a New Zealand landscape but ‘of the Sublime’ and gives the impression that Hodges (who accompanied Captain Cook’s second voyage to the Pacific in 1772) saw the New Zealand landscape in a very specific way; it was exotic, it conformed to the prescriptions of the sublime and it was, crucially, other.⁴⁴⁵ Sara Mills defines the sublime moment as ‘one in which the ego is represented in isolation from other humans; it is a confrontation of the viewer and the landscape’⁴⁴⁶ and argues convincingly that ‘Within the colonial context, the sublime moment is one where the power of the colonisers informs these seemingly transcendental moments.’⁴⁴⁷ Malcolm Andrews suggests that ‘New World landscapes have been rendered in Old-World formulae, a procedure that represents a kind of cultural colonization of the new territory.’⁴⁴⁸ Eleanor M. Hight and Gary D. Sampson suggest that this kind of cultural colonization may not have been explicitly imperial in motivation: ‘the Western visualisation of native people and their environments as primitive or exotic was more often an attempt to make the unfamiliar or strange seem desirable in a traditionally legible way, than it was a deliberate racial or ethnographic denigration.’⁴⁴⁹ An example of this is nineteenth-century artist William Mathew Hodgkins who noted that the New Zealand landscape has ‘the special features of every country which is remarkable for its scenery: the English lakes, the Scottish mountain and glen, the snow-covered

⁴⁴⁴ Francis Pound, *Frames on the Land: Early Landscape Painting in New Zealand* (Auckland: Collins, 1983), p. 61 (Plate 15). It is in Admiralty House, Whitehall, London.

⁴⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 60

⁴⁴⁶ Sara Mills, *Gender and Colonial Space* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2005), p. 85

⁴⁴⁷ *Ibid.*

⁴⁴⁸ Andrews, p. 162

⁴⁴⁹ Eleanor M. Hight and Gary D. Sampson, ‘Introduction: Photography, “Race”, and Postcolonial Theory’, in *Colonialist Photography: Imag(in)ing Race and Place*, ed. by Eleanor M. Hight and Gary D. Sampson (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), pp. 1-19 (p. 4)

peaks of Switzerland, the fiords of Norway'.⁴⁵⁰ His descriptions stress not only the beauty of the landscape, but also New Zealand's apparent amenability to being read in explicitly European terms.

The work of later artists is more recognisable as being New Zealand but they employ the motifs of colonial representation; for example, Augustus Earle's 1827 landscape 'Distant View of the Bay of Islands' has the six figures foregrounded but only one, the sole European clearly distinguished by his clothes and white panama hat, is gazing presumably appreciatively at the view.⁴⁵¹ The Maori work in the landscape, Earle suggests through the figures of Maori men bowed under burdens, while the white European (presumably English) is there in command of what appears to be a long baggage train into the distance. It is clear that by turning the Maori impact on New Zealand into a convention of landscape painting, these early landscape painters contributed to the colonial vision of an untouched New Zealand, a country that was legitimately owned by no one and, much as Paul Chafe suggests in his examination of Newfoundland culture, which was predisposed to accept signification and an 'identity that comes *from the outside*'.⁴⁵² As Ross Gibson suggests: 'The existence of the land in the image works to authenticate the actions of the figures in the landscape.'⁴⁵³ In this way, New Zealand becomes an active part of the image rather than just a picturesque backdrop.

⁴⁵⁰ William Mathew Hodgkins cited in Pound, *Frames On The Land*, p. 64

⁴⁵¹ See Pound, *Frames on the Land*, p. 41 (Plate 5). It is in the Rex Nan Kivell Collection, National Library of Australia.

⁴⁵² Paul Chafe, 'Hey Buddy, Wanna Buy A Culture?' <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/chafe.pdf>> pp. 68-76 (p. 71)

⁴⁵³ Gibson, 'Formative Landscapes', p. 52

In 'View of Auckland in 1873' by John Barr Clarke Hoyte, the viewer is situated at the perfect point to enjoy the scenery.⁴⁵⁴ Like John Kensett and other American landscape painters of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries whose work became allied to the new tourist market, these early New Zealand landscape painters helped to 'shape the way [their] viewers responded to the natural world'.⁴⁵⁵ Elizabeth Helsinger alludes briefly to the production and circulation of guidebooks promoting private estates and notes that 'books reproducing views of English landscape sights addressed an audience of potential vicarious tourists' in the late-eighteenth century.⁴⁵⁶ Landscape paintings formed a significant part of the evolving tourist industry and Helsinger suggests that 'the genre offers a social identity in terms of a variety of possible relationships to English rural scenery'.⁴⁵⁷ It is what Helsinger terms a *vicarious* possession of the land which is significant to postcolonial usage and ownership of the landscape; the landscape on display in *The Lord of the Rings* offers itself for vicarious ownership by the audience of the films. W.J.T. Mitchell points out that landscape has a 'double role as commodity and potent cultural symbol' which is available for consumption through postcards, package tours and photographs – to which films must be added – but which distances itself from the presentation of the urban environment by an apparent lack of use – an aesthetic landscape rather than a commodified one.⁴⁵⁸ This is entirely consistent with the colonial presentation of New Zealand. As Christine McCarthy argues, 'this production of images revisits the colonising desires of nineteenth-

⁴⁵⁴ See Pound, *Frames on the Land*, p. 73 (Plate 21). It is in Auckland City Art Gallery.

⁴⁵⁵ Rebecca Bedell, *The Anatomy of Nature: Geology and American Landscape Painting 1825-1875* (Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001), p. 93

⁴⁵⁶ Elizabeth Helsinger, 'Turner and the Representation of England' in *Landscape and Power* (see Mitchell, above), pp. 103-126 p. 105

⁴⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁸ Mitchell, 'Imperial Landscape', p. 15

century Britain projected across the oceans to Aotearoa/Te Wai Pounamu'.⁴⁵⁹ She goes on to note that these images became part of an advertising campaign to encourage people to emigrate. Francis Pound argues that 'picturesque taste accounts for all the tourists in New Zealand. They are looking to see nature as pictures.'⁴⁶⁰ Jackson uses the huge vistas in *The Lord of the Rings* to demonstrate the scale of his landscape and its untouched, unwritten status – a landscape waiting for signification. Unlike England, New Zealand is presented as clean of other, conflicting narratives or signifying mythologies; W.J.T. Mitchell notes that the South Pacific offered 'a kind of tabula rasa for the fantasies of European imperialism.'⁴⁶¹ Jackson can be compared to influential American landscape painter John Kensett whose work came to symbolise the landscape he was painting to the extent that visitors to the sites of his paintings were already conditioned to 'look' on the actual landscape in a specific way. The New Zealand tourist board's numerous 'The Lord of the Rings tours' are merely a twenty-first century adaptation of this conditioning; fans of Jackson's films are given the opportunity to tour the specific shooting locations with an 'authentic' guide. That the way landscape is used seems to oscillate between these two conflicting positions – where the New Zealand landscape is both a useful commodity and aesthetic wilderness – demonstrates the difficulty in assigning binary classifications to the representation of landscape.

Alfred Sharpe's 'A View of Wenderholme' painted in 1880, resembles the English countryside and, rather than coding the landscape as exotic or idealised,

⁴⁵⁹ Christine McCarthy, 'A Summer Place: Postcolonial Readings of the New Zealand bach' *Jouvert* 2:2 (August 1998) <<http://152.1.96.5/jouvert/v2i2/confour.htm>> [accessed 16 January 2008]

⁴⁶⁰ Pound, *Frames on the Land*, p. 26

⁴⁶¹ Mitchell, 'Imperial Landscape', p. 18

clearly shows tree stumps and other detritus of modern agriculture – this is Arcadia which has been put to work exactly as Mahar suggested.⁴⁶² Both ‘A View of Wenderholme’ and ‘View of Auckland in 1873’ contribute to a colonial way of *seeing* or coding New Zealand explicitly *as* landscape; although in two different ways. Sharpe’s New Zealand landscape was the colonial landscape-at-work whereas ‘View of Auckland in 1873’ is the colonial landscape-as-spectacle with the purple islands and the tiny three-sailed tall ships in the distance sailing through the archipelago and complete with ‘as so often in nineteenth-century New Zealand painting, the picturesque peasant leaning on his pole is replaced by the picturesque Maori’.⁴⁶³

New Zealand’s appellation *God’s own country* not only resonates so closely with Blake’s *Jerusalem* that New Zealand could be legitimately substituted for England, but also became allied to New Zealand at a time when ‘New Zealand was seen as offering a model for European societies to emulate’.⁴⁶⁴ Snesa Gunew cites P.R Stephenson’s 1935 essay in which he suggests that visual representation of Australia through and by landscape painters is more ‘real’ and less contaminated by English trends. What Gunew suggests is Stephenson’s crucial difference between art and literature; that the former ‘depends on the patronage of “men of taste” whereas literature thrives on “mass-patronage”’.⁴⁶⁵ The implication here is that the ‘true’ representation of Australia can only be understood by a

⁴⁶² See Pound, *Frames on the Land*, p. 95 (Plate 32). It is in Fletcher Holdings collection, Auckland. Also see Sharpe’s 1876 painting ‘Taupiri Village and Plain looking towards Pirongia’ *Frames on the Land*, p. 97 (Plate 33). It is in the Auckland City Art Gallery.

⁴⁶³ *Ibid.* p. 72

⁴⁶⁴ Leonard Bell, ‘The Representation of the Maori by European Artists in New Zealand, ca. 1890-1914’ *Depictions of the Dispossessed (= Art Journal)*, 49: 2 (Summer, 1990), pp. 142-149 (p. 147) < <http://www.jstor.org/stable/777194> > [accessed 18 December 2006]

⁴⁶⁵ Snesa Gunew, ‘Denaturalising Cultural Nationalisms: Multicultural Readings of “Australia”’ in *Nation and Narration* ed. by Homi K. Bhabha (London: Routledge, 1990), pp. 99-121 (p. 102)

cultural elite through the translation of Australian land into a culturally significant – and European-compliant – form of representation; in this case it is the fact that ‘the Maori did not paint [landscapes]: their art has its own quite different modes and splendours’ which is pertinent.⁴⁶⁶

W.J.T. Mitchell argued that landscape can become ‘something like the “dreamwork” of imperialism’ going on to mark the pre-Petrarch enjoyment of landscape as a specific mode for the appreciation of natural beauty and the relationship between the non-European imperial landscapes of China.⁴⁶⁷ Crucially in ‘Imperial Landscape’ Mitchell drew attention to the dismantling of the major ‘facts’ about landscape painting: that it is a western European genre; that it emerged in the seventeenth century and is explicitly linked to commerce and exploration; that it is ‘originally and centrally constituted as a genre of painting associated with a new way of seeing’.⁴⁶⁸ New Zealand critics, among them Francis Pound and Leonard Bell, argue that landscape painting in New Zealand was far from being a wholly independent form of landscape representation and was instead linked to exclusively European art forms and that the desire for an authentic New Zealand art form is itself a product of colonisation:

The quest for painting ‘characteristic’ of New Zealand can be linked to currents of thought and feeling that emerged only in late-nineteenth- and early twentieth-century ‘mature’ colonial society – namely, an intensifying sense of distinct national identity (among Europeans), the belief that there should be developing in New Zealand an indigenous European culture that was different from ‘old world’ culture, and an assertion of independence from Britain.⁴⁶⁹

⁴⁶⁶ Francis Pound, *Forty Modern New Zealand Paintings* (Auckland: Penguin, 1985), unpaginated (p. 1)

⁴⁶⁷ Mitchell, ‘Imperial Landscape’, p. 10

⁴⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 7

⁴⁶⁹ Bell, p. 147

Pound cites New Zealand artist Rita Angus who noted that 'for me, New Zealand is, in essence, medieval' and this reading of New Zealand with its colonial motifs has deeply significant issues for its Maori population, literally writing over their pre-Cooke occupation of New Zealand and inscribing it with yet another European identity.⁴⁷⁰ The fact that this rewriting comes from a New Zealander suggest how deeply the colonial representation and presentation has become a part of New Zealand's cultural life.⁴⁷¹ With the tenets and motifs of colonialism absorbed into New Zealand and Australian culture, it no longer becomes accurate to label New Zealand as 'post' imperialism.

Modern New Zealand is typically presented in film as an empty or primitive landscape and the perfect receptacle for stories and images that are culturally European.⁴⁷² The colonial gaze, argues Mahar, 'already knew what would be discovered in New Zealand' and in one way, the colonial gaze 'invented' the way New Zealand is represented visually and culturally in the sense of conceptualising geography into an explicitly coded landscape.⁴⁷³ Jane M. Jacobs stressed that cartography was a tool of colonialism: 'the making of maps constructed a possessable "other" place (and people) and provided a practical

⁴⁷⁰ Francis Pound, *The Space Between – Pakeha Use of Maori Motifs in Modernist New Zealand Art*, 2nd edn (Auckland: Workshop Press, 1994), p. 38

⁴⁷¹ Sue Kim notes another possible 'inscribed' identity on the Maori in Jackson's films: 'Disturbingly, with their white face paint ("the White Hand of Saruman") and coarse black hair, the Uruks strongly resemble Maori warriors'. Sue Kim, 'Beyond Black and White: Race and Postmodernism in *The Lord of the Rings* Films', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (Winter 2003), 875-907 (p. 877)

⁴⁷² See Phillip Matthews 'Fast, Cheap and Out of Control: Three Films from New Zealand's Digital Video "Revolution"', in *Senses of Cinema* (2004)

<http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/04/31/nz_digital_revolution.html> [accessed 14 January 2008] for a brief examination of the treatment of New Zealand in contemporary home-grown film.

⁴⁷³ Mahar, p. 67

guide for dispossessing “others” of their place’.⁴⁷⁴ This colonial or imperial gaze is replicated in *The Lord of the Rings*. For example, Frodo notes that ‘maps made in the Shire showed mostly white spaces beyond its borders,’⁴⁷⁵ just as Glenn Hooper notes that several maps of Ireland and parts of North America were identified as ‘*terra incognita* one moment and as a place of potential and abundance the next’.⁴⁷⁶ As Phillip C. and Juliana O. Muchrcke suggest, ‘for Frodo, the most fascinating part of a map is what lies beyond its boundaries’.⁴⁷⁷ The maps of Middle-earth that first appear in *The Hobbit* even have the dragon Smaug drawn upon them – here be monsters indeed. J. B. Harley suggested that maps are ‘artefacts in the creation of myth’ and the many detailed maps of Middle-earth drawn first by Tolkien and supplemented by Christopher Tolkien have helped to both root Middle-earth within a ‘real’ world and to lay down an important convention for fantasy literature – it is now not enough for the writer to *describe* the journey, the reader must be able to plot the company’s progress across an imaginary landscape.⁴⁷⁸ Elizabeth Massa Hoiem argues that imperialism creates ‘borders by drawing maps, creates countries by assigning names, creates identities with descriptive travel accounts’,⁴⁷⁹ and indeed Tolkien noted that ‘in such a story

⁴⁷⁴ Jane M. Jacobs, “Snake ‘im this country”: The Mapping of the Aboriginal Sacred in Australia – The Case of Coronation Hill’ in *Constructions of Race, Place and Nation* ed. by Peter Jackson and Jan Penrose (London: University College London Press, 1993), pp. 100-118 (p. 100)

⁴⁷⁵ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 43

⁴⁷⁶ Hooper, ‘Introduction’, p. 6

⁴⁷⁷ Phillip C Muehrcke and Juliana O. Muehrcke, ‘Maps in Literature’ *Geographical Review*, 63:3 (July 1974) 317-338 (p. 324) <<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0016-7428%28197407%2964%3a3%3c317%3amil%3e2.0.co%bb2-1>>

[accessed 19 December 2006]

⁴⁷⁸ J.B. Harley quoted in Glenn Hooper, ‘Planning Control: Cartouches, Maps and the Irish Landscape’, *Landscape and Empire* (see O’Callaghan above), pp. 17-43 (p. 19)

⁴⁷⁹ Hoiem, p. 84

one cannot make a map for the narrative, but must first make a map and make the narrative agree'.⁴⁸⁰

It can certainly be argued that Peter Jackson has written *The Lord of the Rings* across the landscape of New Zealand but he has also *mapped* New Zealand by asking the audience to read *The Lord of the Rings* as a conceptual map for New Zealand; it is 'both more and less than itself, depending on who reads it, in the sense that one can use the symbols to look beyond the map'.⁴⁸¹ Ross Gibson, writing about Australian cinema, draws a clear line between England which simply is and a 'colonial society which *becomes*' and he goes further to link this 'becoming' to the national landscape and to suggest that land is *translated* into landscape through art, cinema and writing.⁴⁸² Indeed, Graeme Turner goes so far as to declare that the revival of the Australian cinema was not only an economic project but that it 'also represented a semi-official project of nation formation'.⁴⁸³ He argues that, by the end of the 1960s, a developing nationalist mythology in Australia had come to 'recognise film as the most desirable medium for projecting an image of new confidence and maturity seen to mark contemporary Australian culture and society'.⁴⁸⁴ Gibson stresses that for cinema 'a movie screen which shows images of a landscape can be regarded both as the realist window on the existing world and as a canvas on which a created world can be presented'.⁴⁸⁵ *The Lord of the Rings* promotional material which included several books, a location guide, a number of documentaries, tourist packages and the testimony of the cast

⁴⁸⁰ *Letters Of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 168

⁴⁸¹ Muchrcke and Muchrcke, p. 320

⁴⁸² Gibson, 'Formative Landscapes', p. 45

⁴⁸³ Graeme Turner cited in Elizabeth Jacka, 'Australian Cinema' in *World Cinema*, ed. by John Hill and Pamela Church (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 132-138 (p. 133)

⁴⁸⁴ Turner cited in Elizabeth Jacka, p. 133

⁴⁸⁵ Gibson, 'Formative Landscapes', p. 49

and crew, effectively succeeded in this translation, endowing the landscape with an iconic status and paving the way for the claiming of *The Lord of the Rings* as an authentic cultural product. The representation of the land in art and fiction is inevitably a product of both culture and ideology and increasingly the film adaptations are being regarded as a cultural product of New Zealand. This is made more problematic by the shared literary canon, heritage and language rather than a simple rewriting with culture specific tropes as seen in some Hollywood adaptations of English texts. Rather, it appears that through the characters' connection to the land and supplemented by cohesive and encompassing legends about the making of *The Lord of the Rings*, where the entire country was involved – up to and including the armed forces – the initial stages of a mythology of legitimate ownership of the land is beginning to be constructed through the self-perpetuating narratives about the making of the films. Like the nineteenth-century aesthetic pioneers who wandered through the American wilderness and 'took raw nature and turned it into "scenery"', Peter Jackson has turned the land of New Zealand into a cultural construct.⁴⁸⁶

Conceptualising the land as 'text' leads inexorably to reading it and rewriting it.⁴⁸⁷ Helen Tiffin, in contrast, reads such appropriation as a 'vital and inescapable' task for the post-colonial nation in order to create a national identity adapted from but independent of the European imperial nation.⁴⁸⁸ Tiffin would read Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* as an excellent example of what she termed

⁴⁸⁶ Bedell, p. 87

⁴⁸⁷ See Simon Ryan, 'Inscribing the Emptiness: Cartography, Exploration and the Construction of Australia' in *De-scribing Empire: Postcolonialism and Textuality*, ed. by Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 115-130

⁴⁸⁸ Helen Tiffin, 'Post-colonial Literatures and Counter Discourse' in *The Postcolonial Studies Reader* (see Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin, above), pp. 95-98 p. 95

'canonical counter discourse' where a post-colonial writer (the example given is Jean Rhys and *Wide Sargasso Sea*) appropriates characters or themes from a British canonical novel and subverts the original text.⁴⁸⁹ It is clear that Tiffin's canonical counter-discourse has far-reaching implications in the field of appropriated popular culture writing, and while this is not the place to draw attention to the overlap between post-colonial writing and fanfiction, it is interesting to note that, following Tiffin's theory, some post-colonial writers and fanfiction authors use canonical literature and dominant cultural icons in very similar ways. It seems likely that the reality rests between these points; that the appropriation and rejection of European cultural artefacts and motifs exist simultaneously as legitimate responses to the dominant imperial culture. Theo d'Haen also argues that 'post-colonial literatures are writing themselves back into the centre'.⁴⁹⁰ Jackson's appropriation and rewriting of New Zealand could well be indicative of an appropriative trend which enables European New Zealanders to remake themselves 'by deliberately forgetting their own history'.⁴⁹¹

Louise Tyler argues for what is essentially a colonial reading of landscapes in film noir and westerns, noting the shifting in status of the man who knows the land, adding that 'the noble savage is no longer the Indian but the white Anglo male who can negotiate the terrain, and who thus proves he is a hero'.⁴⁹² It can be seen from her examination of 1940s and 1950s films in two genres that the white, hybrid hero of imperial literature has his descendants in these characters who are used to 'spin and interrogate myths about selfhood and society' *through* their

⁴⁸⁹ Helen Tiffin, 'Post-colonial Literatures and Counter Discourse', p. 97

⁴⁹⁰ d'Haen, p.14

⁴⁹¹ Romaine, 'Contested Histories', p. 52

⁴⁹² Louise Tyler, 'Landscapes in Film Noir and Westerns 1940-1950s', p. 179, <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/tyler.pdf>>

relationship with the landscape.⁴⁹³ Kipling's Kim, Haggard's Allan Quatermain and, significantly, Tolkien's Aragorn, all fit into a pattern of dominating the land through using and *knowing* it. Tyler goes on to suggest that 'the frontier, the mythic West, becomes less about an actual geographical place and more symbols, metaphors and illusions [*sic*] to our character'.⁴⁹⁴ This is certainly true where the landscape is only generically 'of the West' and has no significance other than location either within or without the text, but clearly the reverse is true for *The Lord of the Rings*, as the symbols and metaphors of the landscape of Middle-earth become, through the medium of film, about a real geographical place. The mythic significance of the landscape, however it is achieved, does have the same end effect; both the generic Western such as *The Searchers*, and *The Lord of the Rings* are part of an evolving process which works with the geographical *reality* of the landscape and the mythic *idea* of the landscape to produce a culturally and historically specific reading of the landscape.⁴⁹⁵

Jackson observed that as an eighteen-year-old reading *The Lord of the Rings* for the first time he lifted his eyes 'from the book and look[ed] at a familiar landscape – which all of a sudden looked like Middle-earth'.⁴⁹⁶ What Jackson has accomplished, whether explicitly intended or not, is to rewrite New Zealand as Middle-earth; the cinematic locations are real ones and it has moved out of the imaginative space of Western culture and into a 'real' space; New Zealand and Middle-earth are now inextricably entwined. As Deborah Jones and Karen Smith note '*The Lord of the Rings* films give iconic status to the New Zealand

⁴⁹³ Louise Tyler, 'Landscapes in Film Noir and Westerns 1940-1950s', p. 178

⁴⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 181

⁴⁹⁵ *The Searchers*. Dir. John Ford. Warner Bros. Pictures. 1956

⁴⁹⁶ Peter Jackson, 'Introduction' in Ian Brodie, *The Lord of the Rings Location Guidebook*, rev edn (London: Harper Collins, 2003), p. 6

landscape'⁴⁹⁷ and Jackson went further and declared that 'New Zealand is ideally suited to bringing *The Lord of the Rings* to the screen because Tolkien wrote the book as a mystic prehistory.'⁴⁹⁸ He unambiguously links the New Zealand landscape to an explicitly colonial reading in which New Zealand is as James Belich wrote, 'nature only, not culture,'⁴⁹⁹ empty, primitive and untouched.⁵⁰⁰ What Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin identify as the need for post-colonial artists to express their sense of the other by 'formally distinguishing them from the place of origin' Jackson has achieved by essentially 'claiming' the landscape of *The Lord of the Rings* and 'othering' the English and Northern European landscape it was based on.⁵⁰¹ This othering was expressed effectively in the BBC series *The British Isles: A Natural History*, which included the filming by helicopter of snow-capped Scottish mountains and the wry acknowledgement in the voice-over that it was not New Zealand while at the same time seeking to generate a feeling of awe and wonder in the viewer by replicating the sequence of the lighting of the beacons in *The Return of the King*. Not only are the BBC acknowledging that when confronted with aerial shots of mountains, viewers are likely to associate them with New Zealand rather than Britain – even given the title and subject of the series – but this also signifies a separation in cultural ownership between the

⁴⁹⁷ Deborah Jones and Karen Smith, 'Middle-earth Meets New Zealand: Authenticity and Location in the Making of *The Lord of the Rings*', *Journal of Management Studies*, 42:5 (July 2005), 923-945 (p. 937)

⁴⁹⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹⁹ Ibid., p. 939

⁵⁰⁰ In seeing Middle-earth in New Zealand, Jackson is following Janet Frame and Charles Brasch who both used British literature to 'interpret not only social but even the natural environment of New Zealand with no perceived inauthenticity'. Hugh Roberts, 'The Same People Living in Different Place: Allan Curnow's Anthology and New Zealand Literary History' *Modern Language Quarterly*, 64:2 (2003), 219-237 <http://ezproxy.liv.ac.uk:2428/journals/modern_language_quarterly/v064/64.2robertsh...> [accessed 29 January 2007] p. 222

⁵⁰¹ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, *The Empire Writes Back* (London: Routledge, 2002) p. 11

written text and the visual one; the extended sequence of the lighting of the beacons occurs *only* in the film and is one of a number of sequences which seem designed to display the vast and untouched beauty of Middle-earth and through it New Zealand.

E. H. McCormick suggests that 'the modern New Zealander, seeking his spiritual and cultural origins, looks back beyond the year 1840 to that uncertain but distant time when these islands were first settled by Polynesian voyagers' and Francis Pound builds on this idea to argue that the rise of Maori motifs in modern New Zealand art of Walters, Fairburn and Schoon was linked to a need to 'see' New Zealand in non-European way.⁵⁰² Specifically, the Maori method of inscribing non-representational art *into* the land has an unacknowledged link with the way that Jackson inscribed, through the industrial aspects of film-making, onto New Zealand. This writing onto New Zealand is therefore both actual and representational and, although New Line Cinema and Jackson's production company made it clear that they followed the stringent New Zealand Film Commission rules for location filming in respect to the environment, the physical inscribing onto New Zealand is recorded in film and photographs. Much as European urban devastation during the Second World War has, in general, been redeveloped, photographs, documentary film, newspaper reports and anecdotal evidence record the landscape during this period and it is part of the cultural history of the land although very little evidence of this devastation remains – except perhaps through the new development. In the same way, although the effects of the building of Edoras or Hobbiton was apparently erased from the

⁵⁰² E.H. McCormick cited in Pound, *The Space Between*, p. 57

environment, the documentary evidence remains to prevent a denial or rewriting of the cultural history of the site. This documentary evidence forms part of the narrative of the making of Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings*; Edward Said's point that 'National identity always involves narratives – of the nation's past, its founding fathers and documents, seminal events and so on' is particularly appropriate.⁵⁰³ Brian S. Osborne suggests that 'An artistic icon must be revered to be meaningful and by a significant proportion of the populace if it is to be an effective symbol of nationhood.'⁵⁰⁴

Close analysis of three specific landscapes in the trilogy – the Mines of Moria in *The Fellowship of the Ring*, the Dead Marshes in *The Two Towers* and the lighting of the beacons in *The Return of the King* – and how Jackson uses these landscapes, will investigate Jackson's navigation between the binary of colonial and neo-colonial, mediated by Tolkien's text, the requirements of the fantasy landscape and both cinematic tradition and technological innovation. So far as a theoretical framework for this chapter is concerned, I agree with Chris Prentice who makes the excellent point that 'post-colonial discourse has its own moments of neo-universalizing, not so much in the application of the term "post-colonial" to a range of different cultural contexts and products, but rather in the positing of one true post-colonial voice, the authentic post-colonial subject' and insofar as I have engaged with post-colonial theory, I have endeavoured to do so by following those critics who engage with white settler post-colonial societies.⁵⁰⁵

⁵⁰³ Edward W. Said, 'Invention, Memory, and Place', in *Landscape and Power*, ed. by W.J.T. Mitchell, 2nd edn (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2002), pp. 241-259 (p. 243)

⁵⁰⁴ Brian S. Osborne, 'The Iconography of Nationhood in Canadian Art', in *The Iconography of Landscape*, ed. by Denis Cosgrove and Stephen Daniels (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), pp. 162-178 (p. 172)

⁵⁰⁵ Prentice, p. 54-55

The Hitchhiker's Guide To Fantasyland

The fantasy genre habitually makes specific demands as to the physical geography of the fantasy world and *The Lord of the Rings* is possibly the pre-eminent example of this. Terry Pratchett notes of *The Lord of the Rings* that 'there were people in the landscape, but no infrastructure,' and goes on to suggest that there was little in *The Lord of the Rings* which suggests a working economy.⁵⁰⁶ This omission removes the need for Tolkien to detail the effect of large-scale agriculture or cultivation on the landscape. This is by no means restricted to *The Lord of the Rings* but rather seems to be a convention of the genre as a whole. Although gold and silver are generally used as currency and many fantasy heroes have common backgrounds such as farmers, there is usually little development of the economic aspects of the fantasy world. David Eddings, Terry Brooks, Robert Jordan, Terry Goodkind, Anne McCaffrey and Janny Wurts are merely a few examples of the fantasy writers who dispense with economic realities in a few bare paragraphs – if they deal with them at all. Pratchett and Le Modesitt Jr. are two of the post-Tolkien fantasy writers who deal with economic and political realities beyond peasant rebellions and royal intrigues. Pratchett's approach to fantasy has been examined already but Modesitt Jr's *Recluce* series hinges on the complex economic and political upheavals which his humble heroes encounter. Since Modesitt Jr's heroes inevitably come from and, more importantly, *return to* reasonably humble origins, it is the progression of political, economic, social or climate upheaval across the fantasy world which provides the climax for the novel.

⁵⁰⁶ Terry Pratchett, *Post-Fantasy Fantasy: An interview with Terry Pratchett for Amazon.co.uk*, <<http://www.lspace.org/about-terry/interviews/amazon3.html>> [accessed 23 September 2006]

Fantasy writers post-Tolkien had the advantage of seeing the effects of revolution and economic upheaval. It is difficult for a modern reader to believe that, following the events of *The Lord of the Rings*, Middle-earth returned to an idyllic pre-industrial society, especially given the technological advances in warfare that were demonstrated by Sauron and Saruman's armies. *The Lord of the Rings* is concerned with a sorrow for a time which has been lost – a time which is symbolized, perhaps paradoxically, by the Ring – and a regret for the essential nature of change. The large battles of Helm's Deep and Pelennor Fields and before the Black Gate are comparatively only a small part of the narrative. Tolkien was not interested in war for the sake of war; as he wrote in a letter to his son

Christopher in 1944:

The utter stupid waste of war, not only material but moral and spiritual, is so staggering to those who have to endure it. And always was (despite the poets) and always will be (despite the propagandists) – not of course that it has not is and will be necessary to face it in an evil world.⁵⁰⁷

It is difficult to imagine Tolkien describing a battlefield in the same way as Rider Haggard, for example, who notes in *King Solomon's Mines* that it 'was a splendid thing to see those brave battalions come on time after time over the barriers of their dead.'⁵⁰⁸ While Legolas and Gimli compare their individual tallies at various points in the Battle of Helm's Deep, these are almost always set against a reminder of the desperate situation they are in:

"Two!" said Gimli, patting his axe. He had returned to his place on the wall.

"Two?" said Legolas. "I have done better, though now I must grope for spent arrows; all mine are gone. Yet I make my tale twenty at the least. But that is only a few leaves in a forest."⁵⁰⁹

⁵⁰⁷ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 75

⁵⁰⁸ *King Solomon's Mines*, p. 141

⁵⁰⁹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 535

Fantasy writers of the 1970s and 1980s show much more overtly the anxieties surrounding revolution and social order and many bolster their plots with reference to prophecy and destiny. David Eddings is a good example of this; his *Belgariad* consists of not one but *three* quests – the first and second (to retrieve the Orb of Aldur, a divine weapon which only the hero Belgarion can use, and to assemble the prophesised Companions, including the ‘Bowman’ and a ‘Horse Lord’) take place simultaneously while the third, which comprises the final book in the sequence, is Belgarion’s quest, now armed with the Orb of Aldur usefully set into the pommel of his hereditary sword, to destroy the evil god Torak. Throughout the quests, Belgarion and his Companions are guided by two books of prophecy, the Mrin Codex and the Darine Codex. Not to be outdone, the servants of the god Torak have their own multitudinous books of prophecy. Not content to stop there, Eddings stresses the fact that while Belgarion may be a reluctant hero, the universe itself is on his side and one of the prophecies speaks through him. Such fast talking makes it impossible to question Eddings’ plot, nor to wonder why he embroils the entirety of a vast continent into war when actually, ‘in the end it will just be [Belgarion], Torak, Cthrek-Goru [Torak’s sword], and the sword of the Rivan King.’⁵¹⁰ Given the assumption that land is more than geography and comes complete with cultural and historical significance, it is clear that, despite being impressively endowed with mountains, islands, rivers and caves, Eddings’ Twelve Kingdoms are as two-dimensional as the maps they are drawn on.

Fantasy on film suffers from a similar problem but reversed; the land is instantly recognisable as being part of a generic fantasy landscape but it is without

⁵¹⁰ David Eddings, *Castle of Wizardry* (London: Corgi Books, 1986), p. 233

signification. Ridley Scott's *Legend*, with its vast primeval forest and dream-like environment is an excellent example of this.⁵¹¹ It is adrift, set in a Bakhtinian fairytale time in a place which is recognisable only for being 'fantasy'. The immense palette of greens and browns that Scott has at his disposal are supplanted by flame and metal in the fortress of the demonic Lord of Darkness. George Lucas' *Willow* moves through a much larger world but, apart from the titular character farming in a suspiciously Shire-like country at the beginning of the film, there is little or no evidence of trade or formal agriculture.⁵¹² There is, moreover, an overwhelming sense of dislocation throughout the film; each significant scene has its own specific landscape and although the characters are seen trailing through wild and dangerous landscapes, there is little sense that the individual environments make up a coherent whole.

Diana Wynne Jones successfully parodied the conventions of the fantasy landscape in *The Tough Guide To Fantasyland*, an example from which illustrates extremely effectively the habitually superficial nature of the fantasy landscape:

Farming obviously takes place, since produce appears in the MARKETS and the tour will sometimes take you past cultivated fields. But most fields will have been trampled or burnt by ARMIES, or else parched by magical drought. Dairy farming seems very rare. This probably accounts for the extreme dullness of most meals in Fantasyland (see STEW, FOOD, STEW, SCURVY, STEW, etc.)⁵¹³

Wynne Jones notes, not without censure, that:

It is all very historical, in that all characters wear cloaks and go around waving swords, and the only transport is horses. These effusions are mostly written by people in California – which probably accounts for the fact that all the inhabitants of the barbarian North go around in the snow wearing nothing but a fur loincloth – and the writers are quite frank about their

⁵¹¹ *Legend*. Dir. Ridley Scott. Twentieth Century Fox. 1985.

⁵¹² *Willow*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm Ltd. 1988.

⁵¹³ Diana Wynne Jones, *The Tough Guide To Fantasyland* (London: Vista, 1996), p. 77

attitude to historical knowledge [...] After all what does any of this matter when the main point of the book – or books: they are nearly always trilogies – is a quest to conquer the Dark Lord and Save the World? ⁵¹⁴

Wynne Jones's own frustration with the conventions of the fantasy landscape seems to have inspired *Dark Lord of Derkheim* where a particularly obnoxious travel agent organises trips into a classic fantasy world where tourists are promised conflict, magic and the opportunity to destroy the titular Dark Lord. Ironically, it is the tours themselves which are destroying the fantasy world and the Dark Lord who eventually restores the world to its previous state. With Blade (a young human magician) and Kit (his griffin brother) zipping back and forth across the land and the large array of characters as well as trans-world travel, it is no surprise that, while the characters themselves are solid and substantial, the landscape remains nebulous and intangible.

Jackson's achievement in removing the sense of dislocation which often characterised fantasy film landscapes should not be underrated, but it is also true that the length of the films – and significantly, the length of the specific scenes – works in his favour. Jackson is able to invest these landscapes with meaning as the characters spend so much screen time within them. They become part of the narrative in a way that the landscapes of *Willow* or *Dark Crystal*⁵¹⁵ or *Krull*⁵¹⁶ cannot. Here too, Jackson is aided by the size of Tolkien's text and the amount of detail he put into his descriptions; as Brian Rosebury notes: 'Tolkien evokes the human experience of perceiving the landscape'.⁵¹⁷

⁵¹⁴ Diana Wynne Jones, *Inventing the Middle Ages*.

<<http://www.leemac.freemove.co.uk/medieval.htm>> [accessed 14 January 2008]

⁵¹⁵ *Dark Crystal*. Dir. Jim Henson. Jim Henson Productions. 1982.

⁵¹⁶ *Krull*. Dir. Peter Yates. Columbia Pictures. 1983

⁵¹⁷ Rosebury, p. 77

Reading the dramatic landscape outside the Shire as wild and untamed suggests that it is wholly unexplored. It is, in this reading, a landscape waiting to be discovered and used – either by the forces of evil or the forces of good and this entirely in keeping with conventions of the fantasy landscape. Although *The Two Towers* has Edoras and *The Return of the King* has Minas Tirith and Osgiliath, once the hobbits have left the Shire, the architecture is explicitly non-working. Lothlorien with its spiralling tree houses and pale lighting and especially Rivendell with the constantly falling leaves, suggest decay and ending. The Mines of Moria are abandoned and resemble nothing so much as a vast, underground tomb. Once the Shire has been left behind, so has any sense of natural processes such as growing, cultivation, new life and so on. It is highly significant that as Sam and Frodo leave the Shire and meet Merry and Pippin, they go through field after field of tall, green, healthy plants; the brief vegetation they encounter outside the Shire is nondescript and pitiful and even the Forest of Fangorn is threatening rather than nurturing.

Jackson's extensive use of landscape is thrown into sharp relief when considered alongside George Lucas's equally influential epic trilogy *Star Wars*. The flat, featureless plains of Tatooine where much of the action of *Star Wars: A New Hope* takes place and where young, impressionable hero Luke Skywalker grows up, does not invite exploration or evoke anything beyond a sense of the Other that such an alien desert landscape might reasonably be expected to evoke in Western audiences. It is far from being recognisable as Tunisia and 'was conceived as a forsaken place, where the burning heat of the twin suns forces

settlers [...] to live underground'.⁵¹⁸ The landscape may stand as an analogy for Luke's present life – unchanging as far as the eye can see – or to stress his desire to escape such an environment, but there is little cultural significance to be drawn from the desolate landscape. In one sense it is an anti-landscape, fulfilling neither the qualities of the Sublime nor the Picturesque. The shot of Luke silhouetted against the horizon seems to stress his callow immaturity rather than any mastery or understanding of the land. It is only in Luke's return to Tatooine and subsequent defeat of the Sand Worm and rescue of Han and Leia in *Return of the Jedi* that his mastery over the land is complete. Luke, like Kipling's Stalky, returns as colonial master over the land where he originally lived as a child. Lucas' use of panoramic tracking shots, swooping camera movements and swift cuts in editing occur in greater rapidity when Obi-Wan and Luke leave Tatooine in the company of Han Solo and become standard by the time they first encounter the Death Star, the vast space station that they are drawn inexorably into the depths of; the hitherto reasonably-sized Millennium Falcon more than dwarfed by the astonishing size of the Death Star. The power and menace of the Empire is displayed effectively through the use of this vast, labyrinthine environment. In much the same way, Jackson uses the camera to frame the Fellowship against huge structures to emphasise the difficulties inherent in the quest and the almost insurmountable obstacles in their path, and nowhere in *The Fellowship of the Ring* is this better displayed than in the Mines of Moria.

⁵¹⁸ Mark Cotta Vaz and Shinji Hata, *The Star Wars Archives: Props, Costumes, Models and Artwork from Star Wars* (London: Virgin, 1995), p. 16

Undermining Representations: *The Fellowship of the Ring*

It is in the landscapes of Jackson's *The Fellowship of the Ring* that both the most variety and the strictest adherence to the rules of fantasy landscapes can be seen. From the traitorous slopes of Caradhras to the darkest depths of the Mines of Moria and the glorious garden cities of Rivendell and Caras Galadon, at first glance Jackson makes the fullest use of Tolkien's Middle-earth and the least iconic use of New Zealand.

The Fellowship reach the Mines of Moria in the latter half of the film. A significant journey has already been undertaken by the hobbits; they have reached Rivendell after been attacked by the Nazgûl on Weathertop and they have been joined by five companions on the quest to destroy the Ring. Possibly the most significant narrative event to occur in the first part of the film is Frodo's decision to take on the responsibility for the Ring; this has a direct bearing on the rest of *The Fellowship of the Ring*, *The Two Towers* and *The Return of the King*. In the latter half of *The Fellowship of the Ring* and specifically up to and including 'Moria' and 'Lothlórien', he begins to understand exactly what being a Ringbearer means.⁵¹⁹ 'Moria' is the first overt and sustained use of digital technology – CGI or computer generated images – in the trilogy, as almost the entirety of the Mines of Moria exists as miniatures, matte paintings and is filmed and fleshed out digitally. The Mines of Moria, far from being filmed within some vast, cavernous underground complex in New Zealand, actually consists of a combination of miniatures and computer graphics. *The Lord of the Rings* production designer, Grant Major, notes that the 'CG and model work [...] play a large part in the

⁵¹⁹ 'Moria' and 'Lothlórien' are the titles that Jackson uses in the extended DVD edition of *The Fellowship of the Ring*.

immensity of the Mines of Moria.⁵²⁰ There is also a significant deviation from the novel, and it is an excellent example of the care which was taken with adapting the novel for film as, although there are a number of crucial differences, the feel of the sequence is sustained in the film. Jackson also draws extensively upon two Alan Lee paintings: 'The West Gate of Dúrin' and 'In the Halls of Moria'.⁵²¹ Most importantly for the extended narrative, it is in Moria that Gandalf falls to his death after battling with the Balrog.

It is in the close-ups of Gimli and Frodo that the impact of the Mines of Moria is first seen. These close-ups are cut against a wide, panoramic extreme long shot of the 'walls of Moria'.⁵²² Jackson's extensive use of extreme long shots and long shots are reminiscent of directors of Westerns who preferred this technique because 'these shots make the subject part of the environment in addition to conveying the vastness and awesomeness of nature.'⁵²³ This establishing shot in front of Moria goes some way to emphasising the scale of the task before the Fellowship and the whole sequence illustrates Jackson's desire to convey the sense that Middle-earth had sustained civilisations and adventures before the events of *The Fellowship of the Ring*; he notes in the extended DVD that he 'didn't want fantasy movie, Hollywood sort of style of design, I wanted something that felt

⁵²⁰ Grant Major interviewed in 'The Appendices Pt. 1: From Book to Vision: Designing Middle-earth', *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171

⁵²¹ These paintings can be found in the illustrated *The Lord of the Rings* (London: HarperCollins, 1991), 'The West Gate of Dúrin' (between p. 320-321) and 'In the Halls of Moria' (between p. 334-337). The illustrated *The Lord of the Rings* does not give titles to these paintings. They can also be found on The One Ring.Net website at <<http://fan.theonering.net/middleearthtours/lee.html>> [Accessed 26 February 2008].

⁵²² *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171

⁵²³ Bernard F. Dick, *Anatomy of Film*, 3rd edn (New York; St. Martin's Press, 1998), p. 38

authentic.’⁵²⁴ The walls of Moria, the western face of the Misty Mountains, rise up from the plain almost impossibly high and sheer, ‘their stern faces pallid in the fading light: final and impassable.’⁵²⁵ The shot is dominated by dark greys and blues which contrast strongly with the previous ‘The Pass of Caradhras’ scene which was predominantly snow and pale rock.

‘The Pass of Caradhras’ and ‘The Ring Goes South’, stress to the viewer that there is no easy route through Middle-earth; the Fellowship substitute snow for spies by taking on the mountain but it is only in the dark depths of Moria that they are safe from Saruman’s direct interference. Jackson emphasises Saruman’s architecting of their fate by cutting back to Isengard as the Fellowship decide whether to go through Moria or to take the Gap of Rohan. Saruman flicks through a book beautifully illustrated with drawings which closely resemble Tolkien’s originals, further stressing the connection with the novels and suggesting – however obliquely – that the fate of the Fellowship is not in their hands. Isengard, like Caradhras, is all cold colours, sharp corners and an almost inhuman, science fiction feel to the set design, evoking a similar sense to the interior set designs of the Death Star – impressive but ultimately sterile. Saruman, like Lucas’ Empire, is moving towards a future which will eventually prove to be a dead end. Without stretching the comparison too far, it can be suggested that there is a visual link between Jackson’s interchangeable Uruk-Hai – ‘bred for a single purpose’⁵²⁶ – and Lucas’s Storm Troopers (revealed to be clones in *Star Wars: Attack of the Clones*)

⁵²⁴ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. *Designing Middle-earth*. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171

⁵²⁵ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 301

⁵²⁶ *The Two Towers*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2003. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9188. Aragorn to Théoden on the eve of the battle of Helm’s Deep.

but this apparent similarity may be a genre convention rather than a stylistic reference by Jackson to Lucas.⁵²⁷

This cold colour scheme extends throughout Moria, and in many of the shots the only warmer shades are in the characters' skin and hair. The scene before Dúrin's Gate – 'Moria' - almost perfectly replicates Alan Lee's painting before the camera pans around to face the Gate. This shot displays Jackson's fascination with framing within the camera frame and uses multiple frames to indicate knowledge. Given that the frame 'literally defines the landscape, both in the sense of determining its outer limits and in the sense that landscape is constituted by its frame: it wouldn't be a landscape without that frame', Jackson's predilection for re-framing suggests that he is using the genre knowledge that many of the audience will bring with them.⁵²⁸ This is particularly evident during this section where the Fellowship are continually shuffled and reshuffled into component groups. For example, by framing Boromir with the hobbits, the portion of the audience who are familiar with *The Lord of the Rings* will unconsciously anticipate the events at Amon Hen; for those unfamiliar with the books, framing Boromir with first Legolas and then Gandalf stresses his significance to the narrative. The first frame, off-centre in the shot is Gandalf framed between the illuminated pillars on the Gate with Frodo – and only Frodo – on his right. To the left are Gimli, Legolas, Merry and Pippin within the second frame blocked in by the two trees either side of the Gate. The third frame is provided by the dark narrow shape of a dead tree in the shallows of the water and holds Sam, Aragorn and Boromir as well

⁵²⁷ In epic narratives, the forces of evil tend to have vast armies while the forces of good have a small group with complementary talents. Examples of this include *Krull*; Eddings's armies in of *The Belgariad*.

⁵²⁸ Andrews, p. 5

as Bill the pony. Even when the Fellowship are grouped together, Frodo is almost always separated from the others. A long panning shot across the dark landscape in shades of grey and blue from the top of the shot to the bottom suggests a different type of sterility to Caradhras but one which is no less cold and unfriendly.

Although Jackson's 'Moria' is primarily an action sequence, there are some important moments of character development which are important narratively for the trilogy as a whole. For example, in the film it is Merry and Pippin who awaken the Watcher in the Water by throwing stones into the dark pool; their careless behaviour sets up expectations which are met later when Pippin unwittingly alerts the goblins and the Balrog to their presence in Moria and looks into the Palintir in *The Return of the King*. However, in the novel it is Boromir who disturbs the water and Merry who puts Gandalf on the right path to open the Gate.⁵²⁹ These changes are consistent with Jackson's characterisation of Boromir as a wary man of experience and Merry and Pippin as immature and careless. Jim Smith and J. Clive Matthews argue that: 'The innocence of the hobbits is their prime characteristic. This is what makes the fact that they are forced into such horrendous situations all the more powerful'.⁵³⁰

The Fellowship fled into Moria to escape from the Watcher in the Water whereas in the film they have ventured into Moria, silhouetted in the bright moonlight flooding the opened Gate before Boromir says: 'This isn't a mine. It's a tomb'.⁵³¹ As he speaks, the camera zooms in on his face in a close-up not once but twice from different angles. This is by no means the first time that Jackson disrupts the axis of action although it does occur more frequently at times of suspense and

⁵²⁹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 308

⁵³⁰ Smith and Matthews, p. 107

⁵³¹ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

tension. In Moria it is employed to great effect when, combined with the darkness, it serves to instil a sense of disorientation and confusion in the viewer, drawing them further into the action. There is a cut to the hobbits and the camera tilts down to the dead dwarf at their feet just as they recoil back in horror. The next series of shots are of Gimli's reaction cut with shots of the multiple dead dwarfs strewn across the stairs and up to Dúrin's Gate as he cries out in horror; the viewer is reminded that this is a *dwarven* stronghold through the visual connection between the design of the dead dwarf's helmet and Gimli's; Alan Lee notes in an interview that: 'it would all feel very crystalline and that design ethic was kind of followed through into the armour and the weapons and every aspect of the Dwarves.'⁵³²

Jackson uses the same kind of visual connection later in Boromir's death scene where the resemblances between Aragorn and Boromir are exaggerated to the point where Boromir can say, 'I would have followed you, my brother,' without the viewer finding his response unbelievable.⁵³³ In an unusual camera movement, the camera tracks Legolas pulling an arrow out of a dwarven body in the extreme foreground and examining it; the camera is clearly very nearly on the floor for this shot and this is one of the few times in Moria that any member of the Fellowship is shot from beneath.

There is barely a pause between the tentacle attacking Frodo being cut off and the creature itself rearing out of the dark water and both events take place in a long take – again positioning the viewer as a member of the Fellowship. Jackson

⁵³² Alan Lee interviewed in 'The Appendices Pt. 1: From Book to Vision: Designing Middle-earth', *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD edition. EDV9171

⁵³³ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171. In 'Helm's Deep' in *The Two Towers*, Aragorn is often framed between Legolas and the Rohirrim which works to subtly reinforce his border status as a character caught between two widely distinct cultures.

employs the same disorientating techniques he utilised earlier by showing the next shot from the Watcher in the Water's point of view before cutting back to Frodo's point of view. This alternating of viewpoint coupled with the use of a hand-held camera and, crucially, the muting of the background music, lay the template for close action sequences for the entire trilogy. Jackson uses the same techniques when the Fellowship are cornered within Moria and fight the cave troll; when the Uruk-Hai are defeated by the Rohirrim in *The Two Towers*; and when Sam fights Shelob in *The Return of the King*. Bordwell and Thompson argue that 'sometimes the hand-held shot serves to remind the viewer of the presence of the camera itself but hand-held camera effects in many of the action scenes in Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* actually serve to both disorientate the viewer and to place him or her *within* the action.'⁵³⁴

Seven seconds of total screen darkness follow once the Fellowship have fled into Moria; Jackson opened the film with a dark screen and Galadriel's voice-over for the prologue and Gandalf's words gain added weight and solemnity as they puncture the darkness. A long shot turns into an extreme long shot as Jackson sets up another establishing shot *within* Moria; the camera pulls back and back through a vast cavern with immense rocky arches through which the Fellowship are framed again and again, becoming smaller and more insignificant with each frame.

The whole is dark, threatening and sterile which is echoed through the music which develops into an all-male choir singing something very similar to a

⁵³⁴ David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson, *Film Art: An Introduction*, 4th edn, International Edition (New York: McGraw-Hill Inc, 1993), p. 220

battle hymn.⁵³⁵ James Obertino describes Moria as a ‘barbarian landscape, vast, confusing, and lethal’, and Jackson’s choice of mise-en-scene stresses the labyrinthine nature of Moria and its qualities as an unknown – and unknowable – landscape.⁵³⁶

The camera tracks from the right as the Fellowship climb up huge derelict stairs. The mise-en-scene frames them tightly with the sharply angled stairs and the sharply pointing stalactites keeping the Fellowship moving through a small segment of the canted shot. The numerous bodies on the stairs give the impression not only of a battle but of a massacre; the hobbits climb past ornate books and bundles that could represent a dispossessed community fleeing from invaders. Without going so far as to obliquely indicate that Jackson’s dwarves stand in for the Maori, Leonard Bell’s comments on the colonisation of New Zealand allow a comparison between the two: ‘Colonization inevitably provoked disputes over land and led to warfare between Maori and European, notably in the 1860s. Defeat of the Maori led to extensive land confiscations in the 1860s and 1870s.’⁵³⁷ The explicit connection that Bell makes between colonisation and dispossession is entirely applicable to *The Lord of the Rings* which is in one sense the narrative of dispossessed peoples. Ken Gelder makes the point that this is a convention of the genre when he states that: ‘Exile is necessary in epic fantasy.’⁵³⁸ He argues that evil in fantasy propels the narrative ‘and yet it remains utterly remote, distant,

⁵³⁵ Interestingly, Eddings’s *Magician’s Gambit*, features a very similar effect: ‘they found that the huge cavern was not silent [...] there was the cadenced sound of chanting by a chorus of deep male voices.’ David Eddings, *Magician’s Gambit* (London: Corgi Books, 1990), p. 173. Without explicitly stating that Jackson has drawn from Eddings, this could be a case of cultural intertextuality.

⁵³⁶ Obertino, p.122

⁵³⁷ Bell, p. 142

⁵³⁸ Ken Gelder, ‘Epic Fantasy and Global Terrorism’ in *From Hobbits to Hollywood* (see Brayton, above), pp. 101-118 (p. 112)

absent, unable to be seen even as its effects are continually registered'.⁵³⁹ The detritus left behind by the massacred dwarves serves to foreshadow the long lines of refugees in Jackson's *The Two Towers* who are making their way to Helm's Deep. The Mines of Moria also call into question the ownership of the land; Jackson's Moria appears to be merely a dwarven city now colonised by orcs but this is a very simple reading. The dwarves themselves are not the indigenous owners of Moria but simply another wave of colonisation which laid down what Grant Major calls 'layers of civilisation'.⁵⁴⁰

There is the overwhelming sense that something horrific has happened in Moria but the Fellowship are numbed by the cold and oppressive darkness. As the Fellowship move through Moria, and especially when they peer over the side of a narrow ledge down into the vast depths of Moria, Jackson makes full use of the vertical plane and this is a significant feature of the design of Moria. Height has been used up to this point to indicate immensity in the landscape – for example at Weathertop – and the smallness of the Fellowship in comparison to it. Now Jackson uses depth to indicate 'how thrillingly ancient and foreign' Middle-earth is.⁵⁴¹ A stylistic comparison can naturally be drawn between Moria and Isengard but the cold, dark mines is less of a celebration of industry than it is yet another harrowing warning. Mark Sinker suggests that Moria – like the Ring – represents an kind of making, of industry, which is ultimately destructive: 'The vast underground city – Moria, Khazad-dum, the Dwarrowdelf – their finest civic

⁵³⁹ Gelder, p. 112

⁵⁴⁰ Grant Major interviewed in 'The Appendices Pt. 1: From Book to Vision: Designing Middle-earth', *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171

⁵⁴¹ Tom Shone, *Blockbuster: How the Jaws and Jedi Generation Turned Hollywood into a Boomtown* (London: Scribner, 2005), p. 310

achievement, is also the site of their tragedy.’⁵⁴² His analysis of Moria concludes that it was the *intent* which caused the downfall of Balin:

It’s when for some obsessive reason the making turns into something bad. So they delve too deep, the gold that they mined kindled greed and fear in their hearts and so on. The thing that they are good at – making fabulous jewellery, weapons and the underground city – is done too obsessively for reasons other than making good things.⁵⁴³

Jane Chance argues that ‘death associated with the mines is voluntary because it is spiritual in nature and one chooses it or at least fails to resist its temptation: this spiritual death exists in the form of avarice.’⁵⁴⁴ Not only this but the dwarves, just like Saruman’s orcs, became disconnected from the natural world – signified by elven designs on Dúrin’s Gate – and came to an unfortunate end: ‘Tolkien shows that the final consequence of the Dwarves’ imperial design in Moria is a desert, where only monsters and savages live in darkness.’⁵⁴⁵ In this reading, the Ents, the River Isen and the Balrog are all aspects of ecology fighting back against industry. The anthropomorphism of aspects of Middle-earth’s environment and their subsequent ability to wield weapons and take revenge can be seen as the extreme end of the scale which features other ecologically motivated disaster films such as *The Day After Tomorrow*, *Killer Wave* and *Category 6*. In this way, Jackson has emphasised those aspects of Tolkien’s opinions which coincide with popular thinking about global warming and the possibility of environmental disaster as a direct result of human interference in the natural world and human industries. Tolkien, if not so explicitly Jackson, makes a distinction between Moria and the

⁵⁴² Mark Sinker, ‘Talking Tolkien: The Elvish Craft of CGI’, *Children’s Literature In Education*, 36:1 (March 2005), 41-54 (p. 45)

⁵⁴³ *Ibid.*, p. 46

⁵⁴⁴ Jane Chance, ‘*The Lord of the Rings: Tolkien’s Epic*’, *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism* (see Kocher, above), pp. 195-232 (p. 209)

⁵⁴⁵ Obertino, p.128

dwarven approach to mining when Gimli speaks of the Glittering Caves below

Helm's Deep:

No dwarf could be unmoved by such loveliness. None of Durin's race would mine those caves for stones or ore, not if diamonds and gold could be got there. Do you cut down groves of blossoming trees in the springtime for firewood? We would tend these glades of flowering stone, not quarry them.⁵⁴⁶

Gimli's response to Legolas' warning not to let other dwarves discover the

Glittering Caves repositions the dwarves within Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*.

With only Moria as an example, the dwarves are represented as being far closer to

the Orcs in their response to industry and the natural environment. Danièle

Barberis observes of Gimli and the Glittering Caves that he 'does not suggest

intensive mining, rather he suggests the most appropriate way to use these caves is

simply to respect their beauty'.⁵⁴⁷

'I have no memory of this place at all' says Gandalf when the Fellowship arrive at three identical arches.⁵⁴⁸ James Obertino notes that: 'The tunnels are themselves a kind of wilderness, hopeless in their complexity without the guidance of Gandalf, and hazardous, at times intersected by chasms, and always threatening the possibility of the inextricable trap.'⁵⁴⁹ In the book, they go left to a half closed stone door that 'swung back easily to a gentle thrust' and 'beyond there seemed to lie a wide chamber cut in the rock' where they discover a deep well that Pippin throws a stone into.⁵⁵⁰

⁵⁴⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 548

⁵⁴⁷ Danièle Barberis, 'Tolkien: The Lord of the Mines – Or A Comparative Study Between Mining During the Third Age of Middle-Earth by Dwarves and Mining During Our Age by Men (or Big-People)', *Minerals & Energy*, 20: 3 (2006), 60-68 (p. 61)

⁵⁴⁸ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 301

⁵⁴⁹ Obertino, p. 123

⁵⁵⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 313

‘What’s that?’ cried Gandalf. He was relieved when Pippin confessed what he had done; but he was angry, and Pippin could see his eye glinting. ‘Fool of a Took!’ he growled. ‘This is a serious journey, not a hobbit walking-party. Throw yourself in next time, and then you will be no further nuisance. Now be quiet!’⁵⁵¹

The Fellowship take the right-hand passage because Gandalf distrusts the middle-way and does not ‘like the smell of the left-hand way: there is foul air down there’ and begin to climb upwards again, gradually coming to the vast halls of the Dwarrowdelf.⁵⁵² In the film, these events are rearranged; the Fellowship pause at the three arches long enough for a small fire to be lit and Gandalf and Frodo to talk about the responsibility of the Ring, and of Gollum. This mention of Gollum, and the brief glimpse the viewer gets at this point, is vitally important for the plot of *The Two Towers* where Frodo tames Gollum by calling him by his given name of Sméagol. It also suggests that Frodo is not a helpless protagonist; ‘Bilbo was meant to find the Ring, in which case you also were meant to have it. And that is an encouraging thought’. He has some control over his own fate – a supposition which adds weight to his decision at the end of *The Fellowship of the Ring* to leave his companions and go to Mordor alone.⁵⁵³ In the novel, this conversation takes place in the second chapter, ‘The Shadow of the Past’, when Gandalf returns to Bag End, convinced that Bilbo’s magic ring is the One Ring. In the film, much of this scene was removed and used in the Prologue, leaving only the revealing by fire of the writing on the Ring which confirmed its identity. By displacing this conversation, Jackson attempts to convey to the audience that Frodo is not helplessly reacting to events beyond his control, but is in some small way the

⁵⁵¹ Ibid.

⁵⁵² Ibid., p. 314

⁵⁵³ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

architect of his own fate. This in turn makes the sequence at Mount Doom in *The Return of the King* all the more devastating. So too does it suggest that there are forces of good at work.

In the short scene between Gandalf and Frodo, as throughout all the Moria scenes, the predominant lighting is edge lighting with the warmer colours reserved for the hobbits and Aragorn and Boromir. Unlike the novel, Gandalf leads them *down* through the middle arch (incidentally, it can easily be seen that the right-hand arch does indeed lead *up*). The film follows the book as they move into the ‘great realm and dwarf city of Dwarrowdelf’.⁵⁵⁴ The long shot composition is closely based on Alan Lee’s painting ‘In the Halls of Moria’; the only significant difference is in the design of the enormous pillars. In the painting the stone is curved into vast smooth arches, whereas in the film the cultural design for the dwarves centred on geometric shapes without curves; Alan Lee notes in the ‘Designing Middle-earth’ documentary on the extended DVD edition of *The Fellowship of the Ring* that: ‘The Dwarvish architecture, we decided, was going to be entirely geometric, there wouldn’t be any curves or any rounded forms, any round arches’.⁵⁵⁵ The pillars in Moria, therefore, reflect this change in order to be consistent in the mise-en-scene. The revealing of the Dwarrowdelf alternates between long shots and close-ups and several times the camera pans around from behind the base of an intricately carved pillar. Alan Lee noted that the designers ‘wanted to evoke a feeling of somewhere that, whilst having been hacked from the mountain’s roots, was sophisticated and refined’, and it is clear that the

⁵⁵⁴ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

⁵⁵⁵ Alan Lee interviewed in ‘The Appendices Pt. 1: From Book to Vision: Designing Middle-earth’, *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171

Dwarrowdelf is not just a spectacular set for an action sequence but the remains of a great civilisation on a vast scale.⁵⁵⁶

The finding of Balin's tomb and Gandalf's reading of the 'record of the fortunes of Balin's folk' follow the novel closely and Jackson has clearly moved Pippin's encounter with the well so as to create more tension.⁵⁵⁷ The sharp, echoing sound of the skull and then the body and bucket falling down the well is abrupt and startling as the characters have mainly been speaking in low voices and the background music has been dominated by low-toned instruments and choral music. To heighten this sense of shock, there is no background music present and there is no external diegetic sound for several seconds. The silence is broken only by Gandalf's words, 'Fool of a Took! Throw yourself in next time and rid us of your stupidity!'⁵⁵⁸ As can be seen, Jackson, Walsh and Boyens have changed the majority of Gandalf's admonishment to Pippin but retained the most well known part – 'Fool of a Took!' The stillness of the Fellowship and the tension conveyed through this is emphasised by the sound of their breathing out in relief and the crackle of the torch as Aragorn turns towards the distant sound of screeching goblins. The fight sequence which follows is the first time the Fellowship work as a team against a common foe. Aragorn moves almost inhumanly fast through a series of individual fights with goblins which, neither by execution or choreography, appear to be set pieces in the classic action movie style. The hand-held camera gives almost documentary-style disorientation to the fight which flows into slow motion when the cave troll stabs Frodo. Sue Kim notes that:

⁵⁵⁶ Alan Lee in Sibley, p. 50

⁵⁵⁷ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 321

⁵⁵⁸ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

the cave troll scene in Gloin's tomb is an homage to Harryhausen, producer of such early fantasy films as *The Golden Voyage of Sinbad* (1974) and *Jason and the Argonauts* (1963), and when the Balrog emerges, Jackson notes that one of his references was *Indiana Jones* (1981).⁵⁵⁹

Indeed, Jackson himself explained that: ‘*The Lord of the Rings* is my “Ray Harryhausen movie”. Without that life-long love of his wondrous images and storytelling it would never have been made – not by me at least.’⁵⁶⁰

As the Fellowship leave Balin's tomb and run from left to right of the screen through the halls of the Dwarrowdelf, the camera pulls back and tilts up, giving the impression of being roughly thirty or forty feet in the air while actually being present only digitally. Despite the fact that the Fellowship are on screen, it is their digitally mapped selves and not the cast. The camera cuts back close on the hobbits' frightened faces as they look back. The camera has now taken the position of being one of the Fellowship and the next shot provides a hobbit's eye view of the goblin army following them. The camera cuts quickly to Gimli and Aragorn then pulls back again to reveal goblins coming up out of cracks in the ground, before the tracking shot swings around into position in front of the Fellowship running towards it. The camera continually defeats the axis of action by swinging around and parallel to the running Fellowship. Jackson makes full use of the high ceilings and vast pillars to look down on, or around corners at the Fellowship to increase the sense of disorientation. It is a technique that is employed throughout the trilogy. The shot of the Fellowship surrounded by the goblins - lit by Boromir's torch and Gandalf's staff, their clothes and weapons present a warmer shade and texture to the shot and contrast sharply with the insect-like goblins whose armour

⁵⁵⁹ Kim, p. 880

⁵⁶⁰ Peter Jackson, ‘Foreword’, Ray Harryhausen and Tony Dalton, *The Art of Ray Harryhausen* (London: Aurum Press, 2005), p.viii-xi (p. xi)

glistens like oil – is in miniature what happens before the Black Gate in *The Return of the King*. This is yet another example of Jackson's interest in mirror images. Another example of this can be seen in the following couple of shots. There is a brief pause and as soon as the first growl of the Balrog is heard, there is a cut to Gandalf and then to the goblins who turn towards it. The goblins become a faceless, shifting mass and far behind them, the vast doorway begins to glow with red and orange. The following shot frames Gandalf with Boromir on the left of the screen and Legolas on the right. This composition is repeated several times. Lit by Gandalf's staff, Legolas looks pale and explicitly nonhuman in contrast to Boromir whose face catches the torch light, warming his skin and eyes. Gandalf is framed between them, just as he is framed between Legolas and Aragorn in *The Two Towers* when they arrive in Edoras. There is an almost Shakespearian quality to Boromir's line – 'What is this new devilry?'⁵⁶¹ – and this has been adapted from Gandalf's line in the novel, 'There is some new devilry here'.⁵⁶² This is common throughout the films; lines said by one character in the novels may be transplanted either fully or in part to the films and assigned to a different character entirely. This is especially the case with Aragorn and Gandalf who have a great deal of the exposition in the novels and a greater majority of the most memorable lines than other characters.

During Gandalf's line, 'A Balrog. A demon of the ancient world', the close-up widens to include Legolas who has dropped down the arm which held the bow and arrow pointed at the unseen foe.⁵⁶³ It is clear from the lighting and the look on his face that Legolas, unlike the other members of the Fellowship, knows

⁵⁶¹ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

⁵⁶² *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 328

⁵⁶³ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

exactly what a Balrog is. This subtly stresses both the fact that Gandalf, for all that he looks like an old man, is closer in nature to the elves, and also that the elves are extremely long-lived, and a creature which may be a 'demon of the ancient world' could well have been co-existing with the elven characters already introduced in the film and this is the way that Legolas reports Gandalf's fate to Celeborn and Galadriel in Caras Galadon.

Again, the camera moves between Jackson's signature swooping movements and extreme close-ups of the Fellowship as they run from the Balrog. The viewer is only able to find a position in space because the glow from the Balrog is consistently behind the Fellowship. The spectacular sequence following the large gap in the stairs does not appear in the novel at all although the state of the ground is alluded to:

There were fissures and chasms in the walls and floor, and every now and then a crack would open right before their feet. The widest was more than seven feet across, and it was long before Pippin could summon enough courage to leap over the dreadful gap.⁵⁶⁴

The sequence was inspired by one of Alan Lee's conceptual drawings for the stairs, and the swift cuts in and out, showing the characters' reactions to the tumbling rock, are contrasted with the long shot displaying exactly the level of danger that they are in. Jackson further ratchets up the tension by leaving Aragorn and Frodo on the wrong side of the gap as it begins to teeter to and fro. Even a viewer unfamiliar with the storyline must realise that killing off two such central characters so early in the narrative is unlikely to occur, and yet Jackson creates genuine dramatic tension and proves that the slow and extended beginning to the

⁵⁶⁴ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 311

film was fully justified as the viewer is firmly engaged and sympathetic to the characters. Significantly, as Frodo and Aragorn make it across to the other side of the staircase, the Fellowship theme rings out triumphantly in the soundtrack; this is one of the last times that the full Fellowship theme will be heard in the trilogy although themes based on it work as a leitmotif through the following two films.

The Fellowship run across the bridge of Khazad-Dûm and the camera tracks them from above; the characters are all digitally created here but the software is so sophisticated that it is difficult to tell, even by utilising a frame-by-frame analysis.⁵⁶⁵ Several times, Gandalf is left in the shot with the pursuing Balrog, suggesting the confrontation to come; in all these shots, Gandalf is positioned to the left of the Balrog which eventually leads to another defeat of the axis of action as Jackson places the camera on the right side of Gandalf during the battle with the Balrog, presumably in order to reference John Howe's painting 'Moria'.

The Balrog lights up Moria, revealing carved pillars and arching ceilings as the Fellowship run through halls towards the bridge. It is almost a creature of edge lighting; etched in flame and seeming to emerge almost unseen from the shadows. John C. Hunter suggests that the Balrog is 'a direct, traumatic experience of the legendary past bursting into the contingent present for both Elves and Dwarves'.⁵⁶⁶ It is a past which calls into question the ownership of the present; Jackson introduces the Mines of Moria as a Dwarven stronghold; there is little in Jackson's film to suggest that ownership of Moria and the mithril it produced was in question. The presence of the Balrog, while reaffirming the existence of Middle-

⁵⁶⁵ It is an interesting example of the depth of detail in Jackson's adaptation that all the digitally created creatures have different and distinct way of moving.

⁵⁶⁶ Hunter, p. 132

earth's ancient histories, also subjects the dwarves to consideration of colonisation and conquest. More than this, though, the derelict Mines of Moria work as a signifier of industry in New Zealand; industry on this scale, Jackson obliquely suggests, has no place in this 'new' vision of New Zealand. Unlike the rest of Jackson's Middle-earth, Moria reveals a post-industrial landscape which has defeated every layer 'of occupation'.⁵⁶⁷ The Fellowship – apart from Gandalf – manage to successfully traverse Moria, suggesting subtly that: 'the land is habitable, but only by a very special breed of people; in mythic terms, therefore, the nation is feasible, but only as a collection of extraordinary individuals'.⁵⁶⁸

After Gandalf falls, there is a shot of him falling into the endless depths – the camera is motionless above him which is unusual for the Moria sequence as the camera is almost always in motion – before cutting to a close-up of Frodo and Aragorn. Most unusually for Jackson's films, the repetition of this scene in *The Two Towers*, while remaining faithful to Tolkien's account, seems not to take place in the 'real' Middle-earth at all. Alan Lee explains that:

I wanted to convey the feeling that they are struggling in an unreal space – somewhere between life and death – Gandalf pursuing the Balrog up, down and around; now coming towards you; now rushing away; a roller-coaster of a tracking shot, during which the whole axis might turn, creating the vertiginous feeling of not knowing which way up you are!⁵⁶⁹

The battle with the Balrog here takes on a spiritual dimension and subsequently takes place in its own space which is both within and without Middle-earth.

Jackson's Middle-earth, as much as Tolkien's, has its 'extra' mythic dimensions.

⁵⁶⁷ Grant Major interviewed in 'The Appendices Pt. 1: From Book to Vision: Designing Middle-earth', *The Fellowship of the Ring*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171

⁵⁶⁸ Gibson, 'Formative Landscapes', p. 52

⁵⁶⁹ Alan Lee in Sibley, p. 51

The action is all in slow motion but it is Aragorn's reaction that the camera follows rather than Frodo's. In a series of close-ups, Aragorn is clearly dazed, stumbling towards the exit and the camera moves slowly with him in a tracking shot as he moves towards the stairs that lead out of Moria. There the camera stays at the bottom of the stairs, tilting up to follow him but otherwise remaining motionless. The contrast with the somewhat frenetic swooping camera movements earlier in the sequence is sharp and this difference is only heightened by the vast orchestral score being reduced to a single chorister singing in a minor key and the abrupt replacement of the reds and oranges which dominate the mise-en-scene from the first appearance of the Balrog, with the cold, sterile colours of the pallid rock and the pale light of morning.

The constraints of time that Jackson was operating under mean that the film's Aragorn becomes a leader far earlier than in the books. This can be seen in the sequence immediately following Gandalf's battle with the Balrog and subsequent fall in Moria. In the novel, Aragorn is 'divided in his mind' and more willing to accept Boromir's suggestion that they travel to Gondor.⁵⁷⁰ He hesitates only because he suspects that Frodo will not be willing to trust Boromir so far: 'he could not now forsake the Ring, if Frodo refused in the end to go with Boromir.'⁵⁷¹ It is not until the breaking of the Fellowship at Amon Hen that authority is ceded to Aragorn; Boromir is dead and Frodo chooses to disassociate himself from the Fellowship. It is Aragorn's skills first as ranger and later as general which cement his role as leader. Although Gandalf essentially casts Aragorn in the role of leader, it is not until he has fully utilised his own unique skills that he can inspire the

⁵⁷⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 368

⁵⁷¹ *Ibid.*, p. 368-9

battered and besieged nations of men to unite under his banner and march on Mordor: 'The Lords of Gondor have returned and all this land that is theirs they take back.'⁵⁷² In comparison the film makes this transition much more overt.

Although Aragorn's reluctance is evident, his abilities as a natural leader are never called into question. 'Lead them on, Aragorn' Gandalf says at Kazad Dûm, and outside Moria, where Boromir would have let them rest and mourn – his sympathy for the hobbits' grief presumably over-ruling his better sense – Aragorn shows no such softening, proving that he has the necessary qualities to make the difficult decisions that leaders must:

BOROMIR Give them a moment for pity's sake.

ARAGORN By nightfall these hills will be swarming with orcs!

We must reach the hills of Lothlorien. Come Boromir, Legolas, Gimli, get them up.⁵⁷³

The final shots of the Moria sequence are of Frodo, walking off into the distance. Again, this separation of Frodo from the rest of the Fellowship both acts as a foreshadowing of events to come and as an acknowledgement to 'knowledgeable viewers' that Frodo *is* alone.⁵⁷⁴ The extreme close-up of a character turning his head – and it seems to be reserved almost exclusively for the male characters – is used as an indication of intense emotional and narrative importance. Jackson appears to be turning the act of 'looking' back on itself by having the character 'look back' at the audience to signify such moments. Another good example of this occurs in *The Return of the King* just before the Black Gate where Aragorn, apparently seduced by the full force of Sauron's mind against him,

⁵⁷² *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 884

⁵⁷³ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

⁵⁷⁴ This indicates viewers who watched the films with full knowledge of the narrative and plot from Tolkien's novels.

turns his head and appears to be talking directly to the audience when he says, 'For Frodo' before charging towards the enemy.⁵⁷⁵ Narratively this only makes sense if Aragorn *is* addressing the audience rather than the people closest to him, Legolas, Gimli and Gandalf, who not only understand the importance of Aragorn's defiance before the Black Gate but were also present in Minas Tirith when he explained the plan originally. The battle before the Black Gate is not for glory, Jackson reminds the audience, it is not for revenge or for conquest, it is for one purpose and one purpose only: to distract Sauron and his army long enough for Frodo to reach Mount Doom and destroy the Ring.

Both Jackson and Tolkien use Moria as a warning against technological extremes. It is far too simple a reading of either text to use the Moria landscape and narrative events as an indication of a purely ecological agenda. Instead, both Jackson and Tolkien can be said to be suggesting a model for sustainable development in industry. Glóin notes that: 'Too deep we delved there, and woke the nameless fear' and it was the *over* use of Moria – not an ideological or political reason – which left it uninhabitable and use-less as a mine and site of manufacturing.⁵⁷⁶ Moria works as a representation of an environmentally-driven view of landscape in the post-industrial West which 'may be viewed as a cultural mystification by new economic subjects who are imposing new production relations and new forms of exploitation of natural resources.'⁵⁷⁷ This ecologically driven conceptualisation of landscape has both economic and political aspects and is beginning to become the dominant form of landscape presentation in the West,

⁵⁷⁵ *The Return of the King* Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2003. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9248

⁵⁷⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 240

⁵⁷⁷ Mercurio, p. 135

ted as it is to theories of climate change and global warming. Francis Pound argues that the conventions of New Zealand landscape art mean that: 'Landscape is, in fact, the imposition of a European convention on the land; logically it too should be rejected by nationalists as foreign'.⁵⁷⁸

This is highlighted by Sean Cubitt who reads this as indicative of a softened attitude to technology in Jackson's films compared to Tolkien's text:

Tolkien is unambiguous: the Balrog has been awakened by the dwarves, because they have transgressed the unwritten law against delving too deep. In the film, however, the Balrog is just a force in the mines of Moria, linked by color thematic to Sauron's eye, otherwise unexplained. New Zealand's mining heritage, its ghost town relics of a typically brutal gold rush, and its volcanos sacred in Maori tradition, may have helped Jackson make this cut, which absolves the dwarves of being the instruments responsible for the arrival of teleological technology – mining for its own sake.⁵⁷⁹

Cubitt's point about New Zealand's mining past is illuminating but I am unconvinced by his argument that Jackson attempts to blur effects of excessive mining by concealing the origin of the Balrog. Indeed, in the 'The Pass of Caradhras', Saruman notes: 'Moria. You fear to go into those mines. The dwarves delved too greedily and too deep. You know what they awoke in the darkness of Khazad-Dûm: shadow and flame!'⁵⁸⁰ Jackson's industrial Moria serves as a critique of a non-New Zealand landscape, turning the signification and conceptualisation of Moria into an explicitly exported landscape. Although New Zealand has heavy industry including oil refining, steel and aluminium, Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* serves to mask or obfuscate the industrial side of land use in

⁵⁷⁸ Pound, *Forty Modern New Zealand Paintings* (unpaginated) p. 2

⁵⁷⁹ Sean Cubitt, 'The Fading of the Elves: Eco-Catastrophe, Technopoly, and Bio-Security' in *From Hobbits to Hollywood* (see Brayton, above), pp. 65-80 (p. 67-68)

⁵⁸⁰ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

New Zealand by presenting the only 'good' industrial landscape – opposed to the 'bad' industry typified by Isengard – as ancient and dangerous.⁵⁸¹

The Two Towers; Colonial Borders

The Two Towers offers three distinct narratives and equips each narrative with its own supporting cast and landscape. Frodo, Sam and Gollum traverse the sterile mountains of Eryn Muil and the Dead Marshes, passing the Black Gate and through the ruined city of Osgiliath. Merry and Pippin escape from the Uruk-Hai into the lushly verdant Forest of Fangorn which is almost diametrically opposite to the environment encountered by Frodo and Sam and where Merry and Pippin's meeting with Treebeard and Gandalf is contrasted sharply against the Ringbearer's encounter with Faramir and the Nazgûl. These two narratives are thematically the more important of the three; the quest to destroy the Ring is, naturally, the overarching plot of the film, and the rousing of the Ents ties into the repetition of the ecological motifs of the film. To a certain extent, both of these narratives are overshadowed visually by the dramatic battle sequences leading to, and including, the battle at Helm's Deep.

The Two Towers opens by revisiting the caves of Moria in Frodo's dream and the landscape is fantastic and an appropriately 'unreal space'.⁵⁸² This is followed by the close and claustrophobic rocky scenery in which Frodo and Sam have lost themselves and will encounter Gollum. They wander, dwarfed by the rock and shot from above which emphasises how small they are by comparison to

⁵⁸¹ The New Zealand Ministry of Economic Development identifies six heavy industry sectors: including steel and oil refining. Covex, Hale & Twomey, and Exergi Consulting. <http://www.med.govt.nz/templates/MultipageDocumentTOC_21873.aspx> [accessed 18 February 2008]

⁵⁸² Alan Lee in Sibley, p. 51

their environment. In contrast, the first shot of Aragorn is level with him and moves as he does. Despite the extensive use of aerial shots, the close ups of Aragorn, Gimli and Legolas are consistently shot from either below or level with the actors which, set against the bare and empty landscape, suggests their mastery over it – a classic component of the colonial gaze. Swift cuts between the wide panoramic shots and close ups serve to keep the camera level with the actors and the long tracking and panning shots together with the extensive use of helicopters, provide the perfect opportunity to emphasise the vast and non-English landscape. Aragorn's skills as a tracker are made clear for the first time in these scenes, stressing his hybridity. Aragorn, as has already been elucidated, perpetually inhabits the borders between classifications; he is neither completely human nor thoroughly elven, he exists in the world of men both as a (re)named Ranger and as a vacuum (Isildur's heir). Crucially for *The Two Towers* in general and Jackson's adaptation in particular, Aragorn inhabits the space between coloniser and colonised – he is the White Native of imperial literature and a literary descendant of the conceptual space of Rider Haggard's *Allen Quatermain*.⁵⁸³ Rather than attempt to negotiate these multiple binary identities – coloniser/colonised, son of Númenor/son of Middle-earth, human/elf – Aragorn's identity, through a process of renaming which sees him directly called by four distinct names during the narrative and references a further two, grows and evolves by seeming to shed the previous identity as he sheds the name.⁵⁸⁴ However, some reconciliation between his various identities is evidenced in *The Return of the King* where Aragorn

⁵⁸³ Please see Chapter One. Allan Quatermain as a character is far closer to Bilbo and Frodo but the conceptual space of the character – the knowledgeable guide – is far closer in function to Aragorn.

⁵⁸⁴ Aragorn's multiple names are a direct result of both the king-in-waiting and of growing up in two cultures. His names can, roughly, be apportioned thus: *Estel* – youth; *Strider* – the ranger; *Aragorn* – the general; and *Elessar* (and *Envinyator*) the king.

announces the name Strider, translated into the high tongue ‘and *Telcontar* I will be and all the heirs of my body’, although this apparent reconciliation could be read as an acknowledgement of Aragorn’s border status and a desire to make an in-between space into a legitimate one.⁵⁸⁵ Aragorn and Arwen’s children, the future rulers of a Middle-earth united under the high king in Gondor, allude to a future where the in-between space of the hybrid is legitimised as the establishment. This is not a legitimisation of native rulers exemplified in the British Raj – although Aragorn’s ‘divine right of kings’ is indeed legalised by powerful individuals who return to a distant island – but instead a kind of super-hybridity where the hybrid individual is superior to the non-hybrid population. Aragorn, it could be argued, is a perfect example of Homi Bhabha’s ‘cultural hybridities that emerge in moments of historical transformation.’⁵⁸⁶ Through Aragorn, Tolkien has presented the bicultural hybrid not as ‘being caught between two worlds in a no-man’s-land with the identity of neither, but rather as a position of strength and dynamism.’⁵⁸⁷

Aragorn, Legolas and Gimli are silhouetted against the horizon, posed level with convenient rocky cliffs, and are only shot from above in a close up when the Riders of Rohan appear. In these opening sections, the camera is in constant movement following the actors as they run across headlands and cliffs and through sharply cut gorges. The combination of fluid camera movement and long takes keep the audience part of the action just as Jackson did in the Moria section in *The Fellowship of the Ring*; he intended to ‘give a flow to the chase’.⁵⁸⁸ When they

⁵⁸⁵ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 863

⁵⁸⁶ Homi K. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture*, p. 2

⁵⁸⁷ Celestine Woo, ‘Towards a Poetics of Asian American Fantasy: Laurence Yep’s Construction of a Bicultural Mythology’, *The Lion and the Unicorn*, 30 (2006), 250-264 (p. 257)

⁵⁸⁸ Peter Jackson, ‘Audio Commentary’, *The Two Towers*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2003. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9188

arrive at the border of Rohan, the camera pans up behind and above them but is still positioned in such a way as to suggest their mastery over the environment and to call to mind some of the iconic New Zealand landscape paintings already referenced, especially the work of Alfred Sharpe. The use of a camera on a dolly tracking in front of Legolas and Aragorn when Legolas sees the Uruk-Hai:

ARAGORN Legolas! What do your Elf eyes see?

LEGOLAS The Uruks turn north east. They are taking the hobbits to Isengard.

means that although both actors are standing still, the background moves behind them, retaining the impression of constant movement. This helps to sustain the tension. Harmony between the characters and the landscape is further achieved by the repeating of the colours of the landscape in the characters' clothes. Even Gimli's armour is reflected against the bare rock. They are silhouetted against the horizon, posed level with convenient rocky cliffs and are only shot from above in a close up when the Riders of Rohan appear. Jackson's use of the vast panoramic vistas at his disposal suggest not only the broad landscapes of Moria but also the iconic landscapes of John Ford's westerns where the overwhelming scale and 'ageless character of this landscape evoke the awesome challenges and tests of the frontier experience'.⁵⁸⁹

Ownership of the land in the Aboriginal sense, according to Benterrak, Muecke and Roe, is concerned with the extensive and intimate knowledge of it – this was demonstrated by the Maori ability to 'read' the land.⁵⁹⁰ This 'reading' of the land is a specific cultural practice which is distinct from the colonial method of

⁵⁸⁹ Jim Kitses, *Horizons West: Directing the Western from John Ford to Clint Eastwood* (London: BFI Publishing, 2004), p. 48

⁵⁹⁰ Benterrak, Muecke and Roe cited in Fiona Probyn and Catherine Simpson, "'This Land is Mine/ This Land is Me": Reconciling Harmonies in *One Night the Moon*', *Senses of Cinema*, <http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/01/19/this_land.html> [accessed 26 February 2008]

'viewing landscape' and while the land in Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* is there to be viewed, to invoke a sense of wonder and awe, Aragorn 'reads' the landscape as he searches for Merry and Pippin much as Jackson intends the audience to read New Zealand as Middle-earth.

The extended version of *The Two Towers* shifts the attack by Old Man Willow from the Shire to Fangorn but apart from this, the two chapters are conspicuous by their absence. In 'The Old Forest', not only is there a foreshadowing of Merry's destiny at Pelannor Fields but the description of the hobbit's attempts to keep the Old Forest at bay is not unlike that of Saruman's attack on Fangorn in *The Two Towers*. This apparent dichotomy, which parallels the peaceful agriculture of the hobbits with the careless destruction of Saruman, threatens not only one of the stronger themes in the films, but also removes the possibility of portraying Isengard and the Shire as mirror images. Jackson's employment of mirror images and doubling in the three films is considerable and not restricted to place or character.

The Dead Marshes, through which Gollum guides Sam and Frodo to the secret entrance to Mordor, appear out of the shifting mists as a dull landscape coloured in a limited palette of shades of green, pale greys and browns and the drifting reddish clouds tinted by the perpetual eruptions from Mount Doom. It is an intensely claustrophobic environment; although the hobbits and Gollum are moving through the landscape, the design of the set gives the impression that they are trapped in a small space and their interactions reinforce this. Dead trees provide some depth to the establishing shots but this is quickly dispensed with in favour of a more enclosed set where the characters almost seem to be walking on

the edge of the screen. Frodo especially seems to be constantly hemmed in by foliage. They move almost exclusively from left to right; the camera moves alongside them but in contrast to the long, flowing shots of the earlier Rohan sequence, the camera moves almost lethargically. The axis of action is sustained as the characters are exclusively shot from either the right hand side or facing the camera. The second establishing shot is a long take across 'real' (not CGI or constructed set) marshland on the South Island which pans slowly up to reveal the dark, jagged line of the distant mountains. Just like the earlier establishing shots over Rohan, Jackson stresses the enormous distance that the characters have to travel; unlike Aragorn, Legolas and Gimli in Rohan, Jackson chooses to stress how small and insignificant Sam, Frodo and Gollum are by comparison with the task ahead of them. Steven Woodward and Kostis Kourelis suggest that this juxtaposition of different landscapes is emblematic of the trilogy as a whole where: 'Infinite exterior landscapes, for example, contrast with claustrophobic interiors such as Shelob's Lair, Faramir's base above the Forbidden Pool, the caverns behind Helm's Deep, the Mines of Moria, and the road under the mountain.'⁵⁹¹ Considering these two sections in comparison yields some unexpected similarities and a striking doubling of Aragorn and Gollum through not only their roles as guide and tracker but also their identities as dispossessed and hybrid individuals. Gollum is unique in Middle-earth – although he is often described as being hobbit-like, by the time he first appears in *The Hobbit* it appears that any residual hobbitness has been burnt out of him by the Ring. Aragorn, Gollum and Frodo are linked through the Ring not only as an emblem of their quest but as a symbol of

⁵⁹¹ Steven Woodward and Kostis Kourelis, 'Urban Legend: Architecture in *The Lord of the Rings*', in *From Hobbits to Hollywood* (see Brayton, above), pp. 189-214 (p. 197)

character; through the quest, Frodo attains a level of grace which is reserved for the Elves, Aragorn and Gandalf – hobbits, Tolkien reminds the reader, ‘can’t live long on the heights’ though they can appreciate them.⁵⁹²

The conscious linking of Frodo and Gollum begins here with Gollum mimicking Frodo’s gesture towards the Ring, but is stressed in more subtle ways through the use of lighting, especially on Frodo’s eyes. Jackson uses swift cuts between the dead faces in the water and Sam and Frodo not only to suggest their horror at the perfectly preserved bodies in the water but also – and this is especially true of Frodo whose pallor during the Dead Marshes section is particularly note-worthy – to suggest a temporal and symbolic connection between them. The dead faces belong to elves who died during the first War of the Ring which is referenced in ‘The Prologue’, the ultimate purpose of which was to destroy Sauron. The dead faces of the marshes have a stylistic resonance with the many statues in Rivendell, but the level of distancing achieved by memorials to the dead is removed by Sam and Frodo’s first-hand encounter with the many dead of the first War of the Ring. The fact that the faces are both unexpected and out of context yet perfectly preserved only adds to the horror which is intensified by the use of close ups and extreme close ups.

The Dead Marshes are the only part of the landscape in Jackson’s Middle-earth which show the devastation of the previous conflict and both the remoteness of the location and its inhospitable nature – Gollum notes succinctly that ‘Orcs don’t use it, Orcs don’t know it’ coupled with the fact that it is Gollum who tells Frodo and Sam about it suggest that this period in history has been blotted out –

⁵⁹² *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 870

literally overlaid with a marshland.⁵⁹³ The Dead Marshes become a sustainable metaphor for the colonial impact on the national landscape of postcolonial nations; the raw facts of colonialism, along with the very real horror of colonial occupation apparently sink out of view as time passes, but remain just below the surface in a national unconscious. This is also the point at which Jackson most closely evokes the spirit of Tolkien's Middle-earth. As Verlyn Flieger notes of the Barrow-downs specifically and of Middle-earth in general, the features of the landscape are:

at once repositories of the past and gateways to it, portals through which old memory can touch the present, and the present can connect back to the past. Memory is alive and active and always with us, Tolkien seems to be saying, not just in our eyes and in our ears, not just in our languages and the stories we tell and the books we read, but embedded in the deepest recesses of the world we live in and the deepest recesses of our minds which are at all times and in all circumstances that world's mirror.⁵⁹⁴

The writing of *The Lord of the Rings* onto the land(scape) of New Zealand allows for a reading of the Dead Marshes as the memorial not only to a colonial conquest but to an ideological conquest (and colonialism) which othered the Maori into a faceless native tribe without history or culture; 'Maori cultural achievements were a result of their early intercourse with civilization'.⁵⁹⁵ This reading allows for equality amongst the dead – 'All dead. All rotten. Elves and men and Orcses' says Gollum – but the apparently plain and unproblematic landscape of the postcolonial

⁵⁹³ *The Two Towers*. EDV9188

⁵⁹⁴ Verlyn Flieger, 'The Curious Incident of the Dream in the Barrow: Memory and Reincarnation in Middle-Earth', *Tolkien Studies*, 4 (2007), 99-112 (p.110)

⁵⁹⁵ Gerald Massey, *A Book of Beginnings*, 2 vols (London: 1881) quoted in Tony Ballantyne, 'Race and the webs of empire: Aryanism from India to the Pacific', *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History*, 2: 3 (2001), paragraph 21.

<http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/journal_of_colonialism_and_colonial_history/v002/2.3ballantyne.html> [accessed 18 June 2007]

nation (presented, represented and metaphorical) proves to be fraught with difficulties.⁵⁹⁶

The Return of the King: Landscape and Location

Jackson continually uses mirrored images throughout the films, especially with the hobbits. The hobbits are split into two pairs; Sam and Frodo, and Merry and Pippin and within these pairs, there is significant stylistic doubling. Merry and Sam are linked both visually and by their secondary roles as protectors and guardians of Pippin and Frodo respectfully. Visual links include hair colour and some similarity in accent as Sam's accent is reminiscent of deep rural West Country and Merry's has a distinctive Yorkshire burr. In both cases, the vowels are elongated which contrasts to Frodo's clipped Received Pronunciation English and the shortening of the vowels in Pippin's Scottish accent. The four different accents help to differentiate the four hobbits from each other and it is important to remember that to a British audience, the accents will have more meaning than international audiences who hear only four slightly different British accents. Frodo and Pippin are linked through a physical resemblance both in build and facial features and also by the way Jackson has chosen to emphasise Elijah Wood's youth.⁵⁹⁷ This is one of the most noticeable changes from the textual canon. Tolkien's Frodo was the eldest of the four hobbits; Jackson's is clearly the youngest. This alteration ties the films more closely with the literary and film tradition post-Tolkien where it is the youngest and most inexperienced of the companions who has the most critical

⁵⁹⁶ *The Two Towers*. EDV9188

⁵⁹⁷ Elijah Wood was eighteen when filming began.

role.⁵⁹⁸ Jackson also chooses to film Pippin and Frodo in similar ways although the almost pre-Raphaelite turn-of-the-head shot seems to be used exclusively for Frodo and this seems calculated to stress his youth and naivety.

The hobbits are not only linked visually to each other but also to the other characters. Merry's fair colouring connects him with the Rohirrim and Pippin's red hair and green eyes tie him very closely to Faramir – to the point that in one particular sequence, they could pass for brothers. The sequence which most clearly illustrates this is in Minas Tirith when Denethor orders Faramir to retake Osgiliath. The swift cuts between Pippin and Faramir heighten this visual connection as the vivid colour of the hair and eyes of both characters is contrasted sharply against the black and silver uniform they wear and the dull grey stone walls of the set. Jackson clearly invites the audience to make this association in contrast to *The Fellowship of the Ring* where there is no such fraternal connection between Pippin and Boromir; the relationship is presented as being similar to that of student to mentor. Through these stylistic decisions, Jackson suggests that Pippin has matured to the point where he can save Faramir's life and can do so as an equal, a Guard of the Citadel and a scion of Denethor. The events following Amon Hen – the capture by the Uruk Hai, the Entmoot and the taking of Isengard – have placed Pippin higher on the hierarchy of knowledge and experience. In some respects, Tolkien's novel is a bildungsroman almost exclusively for Pippin as he is the only one not to display adult behaviour before they leave the shire. The films, however, stress that for all four hobbits, this is a maturation process and rite of passage.

⁵⁹⁸ Another example would be Garion (*The Belgariad*) or Shea Ormsford in *The Sword of Shannara*. In films this can be seen in *Star Wars* (1977) and *Dark Crystal* (1982).

Pippin's emotional development only begins when he is separated from Merry. The point of separation in *The Return of the King* marks the beginning of Pippin taking personal responsibility for his actions. No longer can he depend upon Merry to provide a barrier between him and the world or explain it to him. There is a foreshadowing of this when he asks Treebeard to take them south close to Isengard so that Treebeard would see the decimation of the Forest of Fangorn by Saruman's orcs. His pledging of his life to service to Gondor can be seen as an act of personal responsibility and this places him in a position of authority which enables him to save Faramir and also to light the beacons. As a Guard of the Citadel, Pippin has a vested interest in the survival of Gondor which is wholly unconnected to his allegiance to the Shire. It is important to remember that both Merry and Pippin are heirs to important landowners, the Master of Buckland and the Thain of Tuckborough. Given Tolkien's stress on the moral responsibilities of leadership, it is not a stretch to imagine that their upbringing would have instilled within them such responsibility for the people who would be under their care. The pledging to Gondor and Rohan therefore, would not be undertaken lightly.

The sequence of the lighting of the beacons illustrates not only the vast scale that the action has now moved to, but also one of the underlying themes of both the novel and the film that: 'even the smallest person could change the world'.⁵⁹⁹ In the novel, the beacons are lit as Gandalf and Pippin make the ride from Rohan to Minas Tirith:

'What is that?' cried Pippin suddenly, clutching at Gandalf's cloak. 'Look! Fire, red fire! Are there dragons in this land? Look, there is another!'
For answer Gandalf cried aloud to his horse. 'On, Shadowfax! We must hasten. Time is short. See! The beacons of Gondor are alight, calling

⁵⁹⁹ *The Fellowship of the Ring*. EDV9171

for aid. War is kindled. See, there is fire on Amon Dîn, and flame on Eilenach; and there they go speeding west: Nardol, Erelas, Min-Rimmon, Calenhad, and the Halifirien on the borders of Rohan.⁶⁰⁰

In the film, however, Gandalf's first instruction to Denethor is 'send word to Théoden of Rohan. Light the beacons'.⁶⁰¹ As with the events at Edoras in *The Two Towers*, there is a suggestion of an abdication or dereliction of duties by the kings of Middle-earth – through the interference of Saruman and Sauron – which is only halted by Gandalf's arrival and subsequent involvement either outright or by stealth. It is apparent that Jackson is clearing the way for Aragorn-the-king by making Denethor's dereliction of duty almost criminal. By moving the lighting of the beacons chronologically until Gandalf and Pippin arrive in Minas Tirith, Jackson is able to turn the sequence into both a spectacle for the audience, a foreshadowing of the events of Cirith Ungol and refocus on the themes of the novel and the importance of the hobbits.

The camera pans past a rocky tower and moves fluidly in Jackson's signature style to a panoramic establishing shot. Gondor is laid out beyond and below the tower with cultivated fields, the river and even some roads visible. It is highly reminiscent of the maps that feature in *The Fellowship of the Ring* and *The Two Towers* but dominated by the dark, looming mountains which feature in nearly every exterior shot in Minas Tirith. As the camera moves to the left, the city of Minas Tirith is revealed and this, following as it does the establishing shot of Pippin and Gandalf before the gates of Minas Tirith (taken from Alan Lee's painting 'Pelennor Fields and Minas Tirith') suggests not only the immensity of

⁶⁰⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 747

⁶⁰¹ *The Return of the King*. EDV9248

Gondor and the city but also exactly how far off the ground the camera must be.⁶⁰²

The next shot reveals to the audience that once again, Jackson is utilising a hobbit's eye view as there is a tight shot of Pippin climbing the rocky tower. This sequence, although invented purely by Jackson, both mirrors perfectly and foreshadows the climb of Sam and Frodo up the steps of Cirith Ungol.

As Pippin – always tightly framed – pauses before climbing the pile of wood, Jackson uses the hobbit point of view to show a guard leaning against the wall and drinking. This brief shot does much to reinforce the idea of mismanagement with which Jackson imbues both Gondor and Rohan. The camera tracks alongside Pippin as he pulls himself up onto the pile of wood, and the tight framing and clear use of a hobbit point of view cast the audience into the role of the absent Merry. Jackson stresses the relationships between the hobbits and, as has already been discussed, the relationship of Sam and Frodo is doubled in Merry and Pippin. The visual foreshadowing of Cirith Ungol is further strengthened by the fact that Pippin has been given this task to do by Gandalf and must do it alone. The brief cut to Gandalf waiting expectantly below only serves to reinforce this reading.

Jackson cuts back from Gandalf to another establishing shot which puts the audience in the place of a Gondorian guard. Jackson's use of the camera to stand in for a character is used consistently throughout *The Return of the King* as a mechanism of bringing the audience more fully into the story. In this shot, the beacon tower is in the centre of the frame with Pippin as a clearly visible but tiny

⁶⁰² This painting appears in the illustrated *The Lord of the Rings* (London: HarperCollins, 1991), between pp. 912-913. Please note that the illustrated *The Lord of the Rings* does not give titles to these paintings. They can also be found on The One Ring.Net website at <http://fan.theonering.net/middleearthtours/lee.html> [Accessed 26 February 2008].

figure standing on the top. The white pillars of the beacon tower provide another frame while the armoured bodies of the guards provide yet another one while Jackson uses the dull red glow on the right of the shot to indicate the distant volcano and the lurking presence of Mordor. The shots of the mountains throughout the Minas Tirith parts of the film suggest the lurking presence of evil; it is an implacable, non-human landscape and Jackson uses the mountains to stress the fact that the White City lives under the shadow of constant danger of invasion and conquer.

Jackson uses very tight framing as Pippin lights the beacon; Jackson concentrates on small things such as the rope breaking causing oil to spill onto the wood, to reinforce the theme of it only taking something small to change the world. Music swells as Pippin lights the beacon – again this is a leitmotif of the Fellowship theme – and there is a close up as he realises he has also set fire to what he is standing on. As the camera pulls back, Jackson deliberately repeats the earlier composition of the beacon tower framed by the white pillars and the guards, but this time the fire of the beacon is contrasted to the dull red glow of the volcano as Pippin withdraws. There is a sharp cut to the first guard who almost moves out of frame as the camera moves more slowly than the actor in order to stress his surprise. Another sharp cut to the second guard whose movements are tracked by the camera which pulls back as he comes forward. The camera pulls back to circle the tower again with the blazing fire of the beacon just off centre. This long take shows Minas Tirith cut into the side of the mountain just as Tolkien describes it: ‘the fashion of Minas Tirith was such that it was built on seven levels, each delved

into the hill.’⁶⁰³ The camera cuts back to a gleeful looking Gandalf who moves decisively to the left and out of frame before a second shot picks him up marching through stone corridors past guards who seem ornamental next to Gandalf’s urgency. The little torches in the wall brackets mimic the beacons – warm orange fire against a cold grey background – and Gandalf emerges into a sunlit balcony, framed again by two little torches.

The camera cuts to another establishing shot over Gondor which is reminiscent of Ambrogio Lorenzetti’s fresco ‘La Vita In Campagna’, its vast flat plains and undulating hills leading to sharp, snow-capped mountains lit with morning sunlight and a blue sky beyond. Jackson uses another long take as the second beacon is lit.⁶⁰⁴ The camera cuts back to Gandalf and the guard next to him who shouts ‘the beacon! The beacon of Amon Dîn is lit!’ and a swift cut shows Denethor pulling back from a window, framed by the dark metal pillars which make up the window.⁶⁰⁵ These two shots, of Gandalf smiling in the sunlight and Denethor frowning in the shadows, are deliberately contrasted against each other to suggest the depth of Denethor’s despair and corruption by Sauron. Like Saruman, he is ‘kingly, beautiful, and powerful’.⁶⁰⁶ The thematic connections between Gandalf and sunlight reinforce the idea that he has ‘greater power and the deeper wisdom’ and Gandalf’s ride out to drive away the Nazgûl with bright white light utilises these concepts.⁶⁰⁷

The actual lighting of the beacons is one minute thirteen seconds of pure spectacle. Despite Geoff King’s assertion that ‘the narrative coherence of the

⁶⁰³ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 751

⁶⁰⁴ Lorenzetti’s (1319-1348) fresco is on the wall of the Palazzo Pubblico in Siena, Italy.

⁶⁰⁵ *The Return of the King*. EDV9248

⁶⁰⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 757

⁶⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 757

blockbuster is often said to have been undermined by an emphasis on the provision of over-powering spectacle', the three *The Lord of the Rings* films and *The Return of the King* in particular balance narrative cohesion alongside cinematic spectacle.⁶⁰⁸ While the lighting of the beacons and, to a lesser extent, the battle at Helm's Deep in *The Two Towers* and the battle of Pelannor Fields in *The Return of the King* – are, in one sense, pure spectacle, they also have an important narrative function. Although it could be argued that Jackson's own interest in the stunning landscape and in the idea of spectacle interrupts the narrative, it is more likely that the lighting of the beacons functions simply as a more entertaining method of switching the narrative back to Aragorn and Théoden in Edoras. Of vital importance in this sequence is the soundtrack which begins with Pippin climbing up the tower with urgent strings and subdued brass which rings through the strings as the beacon is lit. The music builds to a resounding crescendo as the beacons are lit, and finally the whole orchestra comes in on the Gondor theme, which draws extensively from the Fellowship theme. The combination of the swelling music and the stunning scenery turns the viewing of this landscape into the kind of emotional response that Malcolm Andrews describes as being a vital part of the construction of the relationship between the viewer and the landscape. Francis Pound notes that in New Zealand art:

natural spectacles were used to symbolise man's aspirations to the infinite, or a related feeling of man's smallness in the vast face of nature, a kind of pleasurable vertigo' and the visual spectacle presented in the lighting of the beacons sequence can be read in a similar way.⁶⁰⁹

⁶⁰⁸ Geoff King, *New Hollywood Cinema: An Introduction* (London: Tauris, 2005), p. 179

⁶⁰⁹ Pound, *Frames on the Land*, p. 19

The swooping movements of the camera tracking back and forth over huge mountains is both undeniably impressive and a visual link to the beginning of *The Two Towers*, which begins with Frodo's dream of Gandalf's fate, and to the Fellowship crossing the mountain Caradhras in *The Fellowship of the Ring*. The beacons are lit in fog, in darkness and in the blazing sunlight in some of the most inhospitable scenery featured in the films. Even in these most unfriendly mountains, however, there is human habitation evident. Small figures can be seen lighting the first beacon and waving flaming torches alongside them; the pioneering spirit of the peoples of Middle-earth (and New Zealand) will attempt to master any landscape. Phillipa Mein Smith notes that: 'National heroes, most popularly represented by Sir Edmund Hillary, were men of the outdoors, adventurers, frontier types who stride across – and some historians maintain colonise – the landscape.'⁶¹⁰ Although most of the flaming beacons were computer generated and superimposed onto film recorded on a helicopter flight, for the lighting of one of the beacons, wood for the beacon, the small hut and two actors were transported up the mountain and filmed as they set the beacon on fire. On the audio commentary for *The Return of the King*, Jackson makes a point of stressing that 'the hills are real, those beautiful clouds in the valley are real. It was exactly the way it was on the morning we shot it.'⁶¹¹ The sequence of the beacons has a far more important effect for displaying the sheer scale and vastness of Middle-earth as John Howe notes:

this is finally the indication of the scale of this place, it finally becomes a world and this sequence brings it across very well' and it is a world in

⁶¹⁰ Phillipa Mein Smith, p. 246

⁶¹¹ Peter Jackson, 'Audio Commentary', *The Return of the King*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2004. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9248

which all the landscapes, no matter how inhospitable, are put to use, either as aesthetic view or as a working landscape.⁶¹²

In addition, Jonathan Bordo argues that people in such a landscape are 'an obstacle to the fulfilling of an apocalyptic intention, the utter dissolution of human presence, which the witnessing itself arrests by its being visually posited.'⁶¹³ Like Augustus Earle's painting 'Distant View of the Bay of Islands', Jackson reminds the audience that this is a landscape by the use of figures in the foreground. With the two figures lighting one of the beacons, Jackson has managed to signify both approaches to the New Zealand landscape which were offered by colonial landscape painters. As has been demonstrated, Jackson's (re)presentation is deceptively ambiguous; though he has encapsulated and referenced two explicitly colonial views of New Zealand, he has done so from the perspective of a post-colonial artist which suggests that he had used traditional perspectives on New Zealand in order to mobilise them for his own purposes.

It is therefore surprising that in an article that explicitly deconstructs nature in Middle-earth, Michael J. Brisbois refers to the increasing 'emptiness of the landscape' as the hobbits move away from the Shire towards Mordor.⁶¹⁴ Brisbois unwittingly traps himself by explicitly connecting nature to landscape and to a cultural construction of landscape. The landscape of Mordor is not 'empty' in either a geographic or symbolic sense any more than the landscape of Middle-earth is. Brisbois unambiguously connects his composite theoretical compound 'nature'

⁶¹² John Howe, 'Audio Commentary', *The Return of the King*. Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2004. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9248

⁶¹³ Jonathan Bordo, 'Picture and Witness at the Site of Wilderness', in *Landscape and Power* (see O'Callaghan above), pp. 291-315 (p. 296)

⁶¹⁴ Michael J. Brisbois, 'Tolkien's Imaginary Nature: An Analysis of the Structure of Middle-earth' *Tolkien Studies*, 2:1 (2005), 197-216 (p. 200)

to Middle-earth's culture and through its 'imaginary soil' to the 'real' world of the reader, stressing that this is an important reason for the success of *The Lord of the Rings*.⁶¹⁵ Brisbois's value-laden judgements on the landscape – that it is both empty and damaged by (mis)use – act as a sweeping imperial reading of the landscape and the text as a whole. Tolkien describes the land subjected to Sauron's rule as 'hills of slag and broken rock and blasted earth [...] towards Mordor lay like a moat a great mire of reeking mud and foul-smelling pools'.⁶¹⁶ Mordor resembles nothing so much as a gigantic factory and foundry and yet it is more than just the final epic backdrop of the quest to destroy the Ring. It is inside the borders of Mordor that *The Lord of the Rings* becomes a story of invasion and conquer. Brisbois's empty landscape suggests a subjective – and an unconsciously subjective at that – reading of the text. Clearly the reader is meant to follow Tolkien's intentions and read the landscape of Mordor as a 'hideous dream made true', a nightmare landscape seen primarily through the eyes of Sam and Frodo who are nearing the end of their strength, which has strong correlations with Dante's vision of hell and Milton's *Paradise Lost*.⁶¹⁷ It is, however, in the chapter 'The Scouring of the Shire' that the real horror of the industrial landscape and the misuse of land is felt; the Shire, the reader is aware, should be a 'green and pleasant land'.⁶¹⁸ *The Silmarillion* explains that Morgoth was to blame for Mordor. Tolkien's Shire was not untouched by the darkness and corruption which spread over Middle-earth and this is reflected in the landscape:

⁶¹⁵ Brisbois, p. 200

⁶¹⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 887

⁶¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 886

⁶¹⁸ William Blake, 'And Did Those Feet' in *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, ed. by M.H. Abrams and Stephen Greenblatt, 7th edn, 6 vols (London: W.W Norton & Company, 2000), II, p. 86

This was Frodo and Sam's own country, and they found out now that they cared about it more than any other place in the world. Many of the houses that they had known were missing. Some seemed to have been burned down. The pleasant row of old hobbit-holes in the bank on the north side of the Pool were deserted, and their little gardens that used to run down bright to the water's edge were rank with weeds. Worse, there was a whole line of the ugly new houses all along Pool Side, where the Hobbiton Road ran close to the bank. An avenue of trees had stood there. They were all gone. And looking with dismay up the road towards Bag End they saw a tall chimney of brick in the distance. It was pouring out black smoke into the evening air.⁶¹⁹

Just as Malcolm Andrews noted that 'landscape in art tells us, or asks us to think about where we belong'⁶²⁰ so too does Fred R. Myers suggest that 'identification with a named place is, in this sense, at once a defining of who one is and at the same time a statement of shared identity with others'.⁶²¹ In the film, the hobbits return home to a Shire which is as untouched and idyllic as an early colonial painting; they set out to save the Shire, to preserve this Arcadian landscape and their reward is to return home to enjoy it. While Frodo has to leave at the Grey Havens, the film ends with Sam returning to Bagshot row and the voice-over informing the viewer that Sam's 'part in this story will go on', part of a continuing and evolving new mythology for New Zealand and its quest for a modern national identity which simultaneously draws upon its own colonial history and rewrites it.⁶²²

⁶¹⁹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 1004

⁶²⁰ Andrews, p. 8

⁶²¹ Fred R. Myers, 'Ways of Place-Making', *La Ricerca Folklorica*, 45: Antropologia delle sensazioni (April 2002), pp. 101-119 (p. 109)

⁶²² *The Return of the King*. EDV9248

Conclusion: Owning Aotearoa/New Zealand/Middle-earth: Making the
(Post)Colonial Landscape

Jim Kitses's examination of John Ford's Westerns suggests that such (re)iconicising of the landscape 'repeats the original sin, disenfranchising the earliest Americans and stealing their land'.⁶²³ This can also be applied to the treatment of New Zealand in *The Lord of the Rings* films which is (re)made into epic 'Jackson' country. Ruth Harley, Chief Executive for the New Zealand Film Commission notes that *The Lord of the Rings* has left:

a unique and lasting footprint. It leaves significant intellectual property and human capital gains. It has changed the way the film world views New Zealand, our capabilities and the risk of doing business here. It has given New Zealand a stunning new profile in our key tourism markets [...] *The Lord of the Rings* project has changed the aspirations of our filmmakers. It has extended the limit of their dreaming.⁶²⁴

Ian Conrich has argued that: 'the myths of New Zealand identity are foregrounded and enhanced in the marketing and publicity surrounding *The Lord of the Rings*, to the point where there is almost an obsessive "belief" in New Zealand being Middle Earth.'⁶²⁵ While Peter Jackson, the New Zealand Film Commission and the cast and crew of *The Lord of the Rings* should be celebrated for their remarkable achievement in bringing Middle-earth – and through it New Zealand – to a new and vibrant life in international popular culture, it is important to remember the empty spaces of Jackson's text: the spaces where Maori culture and history belong, and the reality of the bloody conflicts between European and Maori. As Sue Kim points out:

⁶²³ Kitses, pp. 97-8

⁶²⁴ Ruth Harley cited in *Scoping the Lasting Effects of The Lord of the Rings* (Auckland: New Zealand Institute of Economic Research, 2002) Preface 3, p. iv

⁶²⁵ Ian Conrich, 'A Land of Make Believe: Merchandising and Consumption of *The Lord of the Rings*' in *From Hobbits to Hollywood* (see Brayton, above), pp. 119-136 (p. 132)

But while *The Lord of the Rings* films were produced by and for multicultural societies putatively dedicated to racial, ethnic, and cultural harmony, the fantasy of cross-cultural cooperation and harmony draws on (while denying) racist discourses that are themselves 'real' yet elusive. In doing so, the films obscure their own premises: the economic, political, social, and psychological processes that rely on, create, and exacerbate racism in our world.⁶²⁶

For New Zealander Sean Cubitt: 'the strange symbolic absence of the Maori from the re-imagined New Zealand of the films suggests that the culture to be protected is not that of the first inhabitants, but the civilisation of the Pakeha settlers.'⁶²⁷

In one sense, Jackson's films work to disguise the complicated issues of identity and nationhood facing New Zealand, the multifaceted connections between New Zealand and Europe, and the literature, film and art which is attempting to reconcile diverging global and local interests. The relationship between landscape and New Zealand – 'in a kind of general cultural sphere as well as in specific political, ideological, economic, and social practices' - is far from being a simple representation of land in cinema.⁶²⁸ It has widespread implications for how land – and landscape – is read in popular culture and film theory, and the relationship between representations of landscape and national identity through an historical and mythic understanding. Francis Pound argues that:

landscape painting, for the first settlers in New Zealand as for us, was a way of inventing the land we live in, of modifying and reconstructing it in pictorial terms, in terms of the codes of the genres. No visual experience of nature – whether in New Zealand or elsewhere – can exist outside the frames of the genres: there is no innocent eye, no possible access to a "real" and pre-existing New Zealand nature.⁶²⁹

⁶²⁶ Kim, p. 887

⁶²⁷ Cubitt, p. 69

⁶²⁸ Said, *Culture and Imperialism*, p. 8

⁶²⁹ Pound, *Frames on the Land*, p. 14

This is equally relevant to the consideration and analysis of cinematic landscapes as for painted ones, especially given that, as Malcolm Andrews and W.J.T. Mitchell have argued, the landscape itself is a cultural construct which is 'not only a matter of internal politics and national or class ideology but also an international, global phenomenon, intimately bound up with the discourses of imperialism.'⁶³⁰ More than this, however, *The Lord of the Rings* significantly draws attention to the simulated nature of myths of 'place', 'nation' and 'culture' and the dominance of a synthetic form of representation in the landscape. Just as David Cook described the connection between technology and humanity as a mythic relationship in *2001: A Space Odyssey*, so too does *The Lord of the Rings* offers a mythicised and nostalgic account of the relationship between humanity and landscape, and landscape and imperialism.⁶³¹

⁶³⁰ Mitchell, 'Imperial Landscape', p. 9

⁶³¹ David A. Cook, *A History of Narrative Film*, 3rd edn (New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1996), p. 925

Chapter Three
***The Lord of the Rings* and**
Mythmaking for a Digital Age

Chapter Three: *The Lord of the Rings* and Mythmaking for a Digital Age

Humans have been using myth as a framework for high-level discourse for thousands of years in order to explain the world around them, the ‘unknowable’. From the early Moon Goddess narratives to the complex Holy Trinity in Christianity, multifaceted narratives revolve around birth, death and the universe. In order to understand the world, we have a pressing need to explain it and myth ‘gives man, very importantly, the illusion that he can understand the universe and that he *does* understand the universe.’⁶³² Richard E. Nisbett and Ara Norenzayan note that ‘it is easy to lose sight of the fact that every time humans manipulate numbers, we exploit a host of cultural tools invented and modified over historical time by cultural predecessors’ and this in microcosm is what happens with the manipulation and appropriation of narrative.⁶³³ Tolkien, in his essay ‘On Fairy-Stories’, suggested a link between the origin of stories and the beginning of language: ‘Related things appear in very early records; and they are found universally, wherever there is language.’⁶³⁴ The development of language and other forms of communication such as writing, history and stories are tools which have helped the human race develop and advance: ‘In species terms, narrative would presumably constitute a distinct evolutionary advantage, promoting more

⁶³² Claude Levi-Strauss, *Myth and Meaning* (London: Routledge, 1980), p. 17

⁶³³ Richard E. Nisbett and Ara Norenzayan, ‘Culture and Cognition’ in *Stevens’ Handbook of Experimental Psychology: Volume 2: Memory and Cognitive Processes*, ed. by Hal Pashler and Douglas Medin, 3rd edn (New York and London: John Wiley & Sons, 2002), pp. 561-597 (p. 568)

⁶³⁴ Tolkien, ‘On Fairy-Stories’, p. 26

fear in potentially threatening circumstances and less fear in circumstances whose probable harmlessness multiple storytelling acts have cumulatively revealed.⁶³⁵

Levi-Strauss believed that ‘myth is language: to be known, myth has to be told; it is part of human experience’.⁶³⁶ While it is clear that myth and language have an intrinsic and even parasitic relationship, it is also possible to argue that myth is part of human experience in that it enables us to *articulate* human experience: ‘it has been deemed worthy of repetition because it is loved, and it is loved because it tells us something about ourselves that we want and need to know.’⁶³⁷ The myth is the method of delivery and preservation but myth is also concerned with specifically *lived* human experience. This goes some way to explaining why the same basic myths seem to reoccur throughout history and across cultures; Nisbett and Norenzayan argue that ‘regularities in theories about the world, as well as apparent domain specificity of learning mechanisms, serve as building blocks of cultures and place some limits on the range of beliefs and forms of expression that can be found in different cultures.’⁶³⁸ Such cultural building blocks are ideas or beliefs which are ‘easier to communicate, and more likely to spread to other minds’, and this transmission and sharing of ideas is what distinguishes a group of people from a culture.⁶³⁹ A culture, then, is ‘the sociocognitive processes by which such contagious ideas spread and stabilize in a population of minds.’⁶⁴⁰ It can be put forward that mythic narratives are one form of transmission of these cultural building blocks; so successful – or infectious – is

⁶³⁵ David Herman, ‘Storytelling and the Sciences of Mind: Cognitive Narratology, Discursive Psychology, and Narratives in Face-to-Face Interaction’, *Narrative*, 15:3 (2007), 306-334 (p. 325)

⁶³⁶ Levi-Strauss, *Structural Anthropology*, p. 209

⁶³⁷ Swann Jones, p. 5

⁶³⁸ Nisbett and Norenzayan, p. 563

⁶³⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 564

⁶⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 564

the contagion that these building blocks survive being altered and appropriated; *The Da Vinci Code*, *Indiana Jones and the Last Crusade* and *Monty Python and the Holy Grail* can co-exist without disrupting the core cultural narrative of the Grail myth. Katharyn W. Crabbe suggests that ‘myths exist as myths because they say something to the human spirit, something that remains worth saying even though the meaning, not just the story, is ages old’.⁶⁴¹

Vladimir Propp’s work on the morphology of folktales suggests an explanation for the prevalence of similar myths across vastly different cultures. He suggests that it is the structure or framework which is analogous rather than the components of each specific narrative.⁶⁴² Propp argued that breaking folktales into their component parts is essential in order for them to be studied. This approach presupposes that the folktale (or myth, or legend) *can* be broken down into smaller sections. He suggested that stories were made up of similar paired functions or mythemes which acted as the building blocks, reasoning that this accounts for the phenomenon of the mythic story being at once ‘amazingly multiform, picturesque, and colourful, and, to no less a degree, remarkably uniform and recurrent’.⁶⁴³ Perhaps surprisingly, given the fact that his work proved that there were common components for over a hundred different Russian folktales, Propp was reluctant to assume a common psychological source for these folktales, while simultaneously acknowledging the improbability of a common geographical origin. If similar narratives do not have a common psychological origin or a specific geographical one, then perhaps it is the migration of narratives across cultures, continents and

⁶⁴¹ Katharyn W. Crabbe, ‘The Quest as Legend: *The Lord of the Rings*’, *J.R.R. Tolkien’s The Lord of the Rings* (see Lobdell, above), pp. 141-170 (p. 161)

⁶⁴² Vladimir Propp, *Morphology of the Folktale*, trans. by Laurence Scott, 2nd edn, rev. by Louis A. Wagner (Texas: University of Texas Press, 1998)

⁶⁴³ Propp, *Theory and History of Folklore*, p. 169

centuries which accounts for the replication and reworking of similar myths across the world. Propp clearly prefers the model of migrating mythic narratives rather than the geographical or psychological models. He also suggests the model of myth which refers explicitly to the structure of the narratives, removing the content from the discussion completely. The apparent similarities between the Crucifixion of Christ and the death of the Ancient Egyptian god Osiris owe more to a similar narrative structure than to the older story being reworked or recast. The structure in this case at its most basic level appears to be: wise and gentle leader of royal birth – betrayed by a loved friend/brother – murdered in a horrific fashion – intervention of a female character – brief resurrection – reign over the fortunate in a paradise after death.⁶⁴⁴ As Levi-Strauss noted: ‘dramatis personae and their attributes change, but the actions and the functions do not.’⁶⁴⁵ Indeed, Tolkien argued that: ‘it is plain enough that fairy-stories (in wider or in narrower sense) are very ancient indeed.’⁶⁴⁶

Interestingly, both Propp and Levi-Strauss break mythic forms into symbols which resemble mathematical equations or chemical formulae. This suggests that even theorists are forced to use another form of discourse (in this case, the language of mathematics) to explain what they intuitively understand. As Joseph Schwartz noted: ‘mathematics is only a language invented by human beings to describe sizes and quantities and relationships between measurable

⁶⁴⁴ See Roger Lancelyn Green, *Tales of Ancient Egypt* (London: Puffin Books, 1967)

⁶⁴⁵ Claude Levi-Strauss, ‘Structure and Form: Reflections on a Work by Vladimir Propp’ in Vladimir Propp, *Theory and History of Folklore*, trans. by Ariadna Y Martin and Richard P Martin, ed. by Anatoly Liberman (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984), p. 167

⁶⁴⁶ Tolkien, ‘On Fairy-Stories’, p. 26

things.’⁶⁴⁷ Myth, it can be argued, is simply another form of communication, a meta-language operating at a level which circumvents ordinary discourse, or a mythic framework that is comparable to the schemas which are used in everyday life, a cognitive map for dealing with day-to-day life. The events dealt with in mythic frameworks are not commonplace and might occur only once or twice in any one person’s lifetime; perhaps it is necessary to inherit through culture and society, a framework, or cultural schema for dealing with these events and ‘those cultural schemas that are intersubjectively shared in a group are known as *cultural models*.’⁶⁴⁸ William Righter argues that it is the *structure* which is important and that the very meaning of a myth ‘lies not in the elements but in the way in which they are combined.’⁶⁴⁹ A framework would, of necessity, be coded as a narrative to enable it to be perpetuated from generation to generation and across cultures and this is exactly what Propp argues is seen in the movement of myths. Henry Jenkins suggests that:

a mythology can articulate a set of ethical or moral values through stories, and people are deeply invested in those stories. They retell them, they recirculate them, they see them as revealing some deeper truth about human experience. But they don’t necessarily believe them to be true. They believe them to be fabricated as an encapsulation of certain sets of values. And I believe cult texts can function as a mythology in that sense.’⁶⁵⁰

The Narrative World

For many thousands of years, humanity has been articulating ethical and moral values through stories. Indeed, Christopher Booker has argued at length about the

⁶⁴⁷ Joseph Schwartz, *Einstein For Beginners* (London: Writers and Readers Public Cooperative, 1979), p. 135

⁶⁴⁸ Nisbett and Norenzayan, p. 565

⁶⁴⁹ William Righter, *Myth and Literature* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1975) p.108

⁶⁵⁰ Jenkins, ‘Intensities’

deep need for stories in everyday life: 'they are far and away one of the most important features in our everyday existence'.⁶⁵¹ Ursula Le Guin suggested that: 'Narrative is a central function of language. Not, in origin, an artifact of culture, an art, but a fundamental operation of the normal mind functioning in society. To learn is to speak is to tell a story'.⁶⁵² These stories are appropriated, retold, recirculated and rewoven into human cultural consciousness and history. While any of the important popular narratives of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries may fit easily into one of the seven that Booker identified, it is clear that the deeper themes within these stories are just as important as the plot itself. What is also clear is that retelling and reworking is as vital a process as the initial telling, and modern technology, especially the rise of the internet and the introduction and widespread use of the weblog, has dramatically increased the number of people able to tell their stories directly to their audience rather than being filtered through publishing companies. There is a general understanding that fanfiction is written explicitly using copyrighted narratives in the media to offer 'pleasures found lacking in the originals' but this interpretation posits fanfiction and the related appropriative processes firmly in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries.⁶⁵³ If, as Sperber suggests, 'mutation is the rule' then the appropriation and rewriting of these mythic narratives is part of the natural – but by no means unconscious –

⁶⁵¹ Christopher Booker, p. 2. Booker is by no means the only theorist interested in this area of research; the debate over the meaning and importance of stories as local and international cultural products ranges from literary criticism and film studies to anthropology to psychology and across such fields of theory as postcolonialism, structuralism and postmodernism. Upon one point the critics seem to agree: stories are important to human cultural and intellectual development; it is the meaning and usage of stories which seems to divide them.

⁶⁵² Ursula K. Le Guin, 'Some Thoughts on Narrative, 1980', *Dancing At the Edge of the World: Thoughts on Words, Women, Places* (London: Paladin, 1992), pp. 37-45 (p. 39)

⁶⁵³ Penley, p. 105

process of cultural transmission.⁶⁵⁴ Indeed, David Herman suggests that 'stories provide insight into a culture's or subculture's emotionology - and also into how minds are made sense of via this system'.⁶⁵⁵ The appropriation and rewriting of dominant cultural texts by minority or hybrid societies that Homi Bhabha, Benita Parry and Paul Gilroy argue is a facet of empire is no less an act of appropriative power than the appropriation and editing of Chaucer's unfinished work by the order of the Lancastrian kings which worked 'as a consciously instigated policy designed to gain support for a questionable usurpation of the throne'.⁶⁵⁶ Claire Sponsler argues that far from there being a clear top-down bottom-up relationship between the appropriated object and the appropriating subject, there is a:

reciprocal relation between the act of poaching and the cultural role that is being poached: the cultural meanings of the stolen role are conferred on the poacher, but at the same time the act of poaching gives renewed meaning to that cultural role.⁶⁵⁷

Stories and storytelling are an integral part of all human cultures; indeed Anne Foerst, a theology professor at MIT, suggested that to be human is to 'constantly weave stories [and] to be in a culture means to be endlessly woven into a tapestry of more stories'.⁶⁵⁸

⁶⁵⁴ Sperber cited in Pascal Boyer, 'Evolution of the Modern Mind and the Origins of Culture: Religious Concepts as a Limiting-case' in *Evolution and the Human Mind: Modularity, Language and Meta-cognition*, ed. by Peter Carruthers and Andrew Chamberlain (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), pp. 93-112 (p. 98)

⁶⁵⁵ David Herman, p. 322. Herman defines emotionology as 'system of emotion terms and concepts, that people deploy rhetorically in discourse to construct their own as well as other minds.' p. 322

⁶⁵⁶ Claire Sponsler, 'In Transit: Theorizing Cultural Appropriation in Medieval Europe', *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 32:1 (2002), 17-39 (p. 24)

⁶⁵⁷ Ibid., p. 35

⁶⁵⁸ Anne Foerst 'In the Beginning is the Brain (and then Come the Questions)' *Spirituality & Health: The Soul/Body Connection*, Spring 2000, <http://www.spiritualityhealth.com/newsh/items/article/item_55.html> [accessed 3 May 2006]

It is a common convention to link fantasy, fairytale and myth together. Certainly they superficially share many general features such as the use of the supernatural, allegory and themes such as the end of childhood and the battle between good and evil. They are also widespread, occurring in every human culture from the Australian Aborigines to the Vikings, and many appear to be repeated across cultural boundaries, history and continents.⁶⁵⁹ In some cases, they permeate into a kind of universal human unconsciousness, becoming narratives which are not only emotionally accessible to everyone, but also physically part of the cultural heritage; as Barthes argued, 'the fundamental character of the mythical concept is to be *appropriated*'.⁶⁶⁰ Clearly, these narratives are important not only for what they tell us about our shared past but also for what they tell us about ourselves. Stories are only retained and repeated while there is something applicable to both the teller and the audience, so despite the apparently frivolous nature of these narratives, with an over-reliance on swords and sorcery, 'fantasy is a natural human activity'.⁶⁶¹ Superficially, at least, the overarching narrative of *The Lord of the Rings* seems far from the natural experience of the average reader, but one of the most powerful themes in *The Lord of the Rings* is that of conflict – conflict on many levels ranging from the international to the interpersonal to cognitive dissonance. Conflict is, if not a *necessary* feature of life, certainly a common one. Tolkien did not write fantasy for the sake of fantastical literature; he argued explicitly for an acknowledgement of the importance of fantasy, noting the parallels between fairy-stories and the basic tenets at the heart of major religions:

⁶⁵⁹ See for example Georgina Pell Curtis, *The Interdependence of Literature*, <<http://www.gutenberg.org/etext/3778>> [accessed 5 February 2006]

⁶⁶⁰ Roland Barthes, *Mythologies*, trans. Annette Lavers (London: Vintage, 1993), p. 119

⁶⁶¹ Tolkien, 'On Fairy-Stories' p. 56

'the Gospels contain a fairy-story, or a story of a larger kind which embodies all the essence of fairy-stories.'⁶⁶²

If myth is a way of articulating what cannot be articulated about human experience – giving a narrative to what can only be 'felt' – then fanfiction is a way of talking about a text on a level which is not accessible through legitimate discourse, academic language or impenetrable 'fannish' terms. It is generally accepted by psychologists (for example Gainotti; Tompkins and Mateer; Kolbo and Whishaw), that language is a left brain hemisphere function whereas emotion is a right brain function.⁶⁶³ What mythic narratives enable us to do is to access right brain emotions directly without being filtered through conventional language. Gomulicki argued that it is the thematic and emotional components which have the most impact on a reader as these are the components which are remembered: 'what is extracted from a story and then remembered closely resembles a summary in its emphasis on the main theme of that story.'⁶⁶⁴

Cognitively, socially and culturally, narrative seems to be an essential part of human interactions. Fanfiction is one of the ways in which predominantly Western societies retain the significant narratives of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries and is possibly the closest link the modern world has to the oral storytelling tradition as it is 'socially shared in a storytelling group.'⁶⁶⁵ Henry Jenkins also alludes to this aspect of fandom when he suggests that: 'In many ways,

⁶⁶² Tolkien, 'On Fairy-Stories' p. 71

⁶⁶³ Cited in Michael Eysenck, *A Psychology Student's Handbook* (Hove: Psychology Press, 2000), p. 86

⁶⁶⁴ Gomulicki (1956) in Eysenck, *Psychology*, p. 355

⁶⁶⁵ Fredric Bartlett in Nancy Nelson Spivey, *The Constructivist Metaphor* (Burlington, MA: Academic Press, 1997), p. 34

fandom extends traditional folk practices into a modern era of mass production.⁶⁶⁶

The appropriation of narratives such as *The Lord of the Rings* demonstrates their importance as cultural artefacts.

Evolving Narratives: The Holy Grail As Case Study

Retold and appropriated narratives do not always remain utterly faithful to the original material and it is possible to trace shifting political, historical and sociological change through the altering of popular narratives; Roland Barthes noted that 'some objects become the prey of mythical speech for a while, then they disappear, others take their place and attain the status of myth'.⁶⁶⁷ Obviously, popular narratives have to change to remain popular; today, the financial power of the audience dictates which films, television series and novels will be successful; in the Middle Ages, narratives were written to please and flatter the writer's patron. *Perceval ou Le conte du Graal* was written by Chrétien de Troyes between 1160 and 1190, and he is generally credited with the invention of the Grail quest.⁶⁶⁸ Not only this, but the story of Perceval who 'comes first to maturity in physical skills, and then grows to his full moral and spiritual stature' begins a specific tradition in quest-narrative-bildungsroman which is not only the most commonly used in fantasy literature but possibly one of the most familiar in the arts as a whole.⁶⁶⁹ *Perceval ou Le conte du Graal* was never completed by de Troyes; the story was continued by Wauchier de Denain and in the following forty

⁶⁶⁶ Henry Jenkins, 'Reception Theory And Audience Research: The Mystery Of The Vampire's Kiss', <<http://web.mit.edu/cms/People/henry3/vampkiss.html>> [accessed 7 February 2006]

⁶⁶⁷ Barthes, *Mythologies*, p. 110

⁶⁶⁸ It is important to stress that all of the dates given here are approximate as it is extremely difficult to date such narratives with accuracy.

⁶⁶⁹ Richard Barber, 'Introduction' in Wolfram von Eschenbach, *Parzival: and Titurel*, trans. Cyril Edwards (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), p. xi

years, four waves of 'Continuations' carried on de Troyes' narrative.⁶⁷⁰ Despite the superficial differences made to the text, the cycles are 'linked to a majestic whole, and yet leave scope for other minds and hands', much as Tolkien indicated was his initial wish for the narratives of Middle-earth.⁶⁷¹ Tolkien noted that this was 'Absurd' but it is worth drawing attention away from issues surrounding copyright infringement and plagiarism by using the 'Grail' narrative as an example of a distinctive narrative which has survived retelling and reworkings through the process of becoming a core cultural narrative. It has taken the Grail narrative nearly a thousand years; it might not take the Middle-earth narratives quite so long.

Wolfram von Eschenbach's *Parzival* (1200-1210) 'handles the details quite freely, reinventing them to his own taste'⁶⁷² and von Eschenbach references de Troyes within his narrative – 'if master Chretien of Troyes has done this tale an injustice'⁶⁷³ – while proclaiming that he has drawn upon de Troyes's narrative, asserting that *Parzival* is drawn from the 'original' text that de Troyes rewrote. Richard Barber suggests that von Eschenbach uses the writer of the original text – 'Kyot' – to act as 'a new "authority" to authenticate his tale, even though he increasingly puts himself forward as the creator of the work in the later books'.⁶⁷⁴ Around 1212, *Perlesvaus*, written in French by an unknown author, was immensely popular in translation in Wales:

as late as the fifteenth century an abbot of Valle Crucis near Llangollen in Wales, who had a memorable encounter with the last, rebel Welsh Prince Owain Glyndŵr (Glendower), sent the poet Guto'r Glyn to Glamorgan to

⁶⁷⁰ Over this period there were significant changes made to de Troyes' original story. Robert de Boron's Grail stories *Joseph d'Armathie*, *Merlin* and *Perceval* (1190) change the 'grail' or dish with supernatural powers into what is commonly recognised as the Holy Grail, explicitly linking the story of the grail quest and King Arthur with Christianity.

⁶⁷¹ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 145

⁶⁷² Barber, p. xv

⁶⁷³ Wolfram von Eschenbach, p. 346

⁶⁷⁴ Barber, p. xvii

collect the copy of the work kept there – ‘the goodly Greal, the book of blood, the book of heroes, where they fell in the court of Arthur; a book still in the Briton’s hand – the race of Horsa could not read this’.⁶⁷⁵

The Grail narrative had become an effective weapon in the cultural war between the English and the Welsh; while King Arthur may well be read as an English king today, the medieval Welsh ‘not only claimed to be Arthur’s descendants, but they traced their glorious heritage through Arthur to Brutus, to Aeneas, and ultimately Troy’.⁶⁷⁶ It was not until ‘Wales itself was conquered, could England wholeheartedly embrace the legends, in that characteristic blurring of Britain with England’; the Welsh/British grail quest and King Arthur could finally be assimilated and culturally absorbed.⁶⁷⁷ N.J. Higham draws attention to Geoffrey of Monmouth’s mixed-race status (Celtic and Norman) as he reworked the story of Arthur to eventually (re)create the Britons as the descendants of Troy. The appropriation and reworking of ancient narratives – Higham notes that the ‘list of Geoffrey’s borrowings and adaptations is virtually endless’ – worked as a political text, at once glossing over the Norman conquest and rewriting the poor reputation of the Britons to create a unifying narrative for what was essentially early nation-building.⁶⁷⁸

However, as Jessie Weston points out: ‘there is the strongest possible evidence that Chrétien, as he himself admits, was not inventing but retelling, an already popular tale.’⁶⁷⁹ The fact that the story of The Grail can be seen to change and evolve over the last eight hundred years makes more striking the apparent

⁶⁷⁵ Gwyn A. Williams, *Excalibur: The Search for Arthur* (London: BBC Books, 1994), p. 133

⁶⁷⁶ Archer, p. 83

⁶⁷⁷ Williams, p. 134

⁶⁷⁸ N.J. Higham, *King Arthur: Myth-making and History* (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 225

⁶⁷⁹ Jessie L. Weston, *From Ritual To Romance* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993), p. 191

absence of any plausible proto-grail quest stories.⁶⁸⁰ Gwyn A. Williams argues that as the grail narratives become more popular:

an interlocking world of Arthurian literature was created. The technique of interlacing – starting one tale, breaking off to tell another, returning to the original – was used with differing degrees of sophistication. Stories fed on each other and there were almost endless first and second versions of a post-this and a post-that.⁶⁸¹

The continued repetitions and reworking of the grail narrative have worked to reinforce the importance of the narrative in the cultural heritage of Britain, Europe and beyond, written in 'French, English, German, Italian, Castilian, Catalan, Dutch and Scandinavian [...] There was even a Hebrew Arthur'.⁶⁸²

The three most popular modern retellings of the grail story have taken widely different approaches. *Monty Python and the Holy Grail*, while parodying Malory, nevertheless reinforces the association between the grail legend and British history to the extent that the story is framed by an archaeological dig.⁶⁸³ The archaeologists are patiently reconstructing Arthurian history as King Arthur in the main narrative constructs the familiar trappings of Arthurian legend: the Knights of the Round table and the quest for the Grail. Arthurian legend will not be so contained, however, and Arthur and Bedevere escape from the main narrative, eventually being arrested for the murder of the lead archaeologist; Arthurian legend has its place, the film seems to be suggesting, and is not only

⁶⁸⁰ It is worth noting that the five-part Vulgate Cycle written between 1210 and 1235 first introduces the idea that Joseph of Arimathea's descendants brought the grail to Britain and hid it in a secret castle. Many of the original elements of the grail or 'grail' story have been rewritten or dropped altogether. Jessie L. Weston goes on to speculate about the existence of an eleventh-century storyteller who might have been the author of a 'group of poems, dealing with the adventures of Gawain, his son and brother' whose central adventure was 'the visit to the grail castle'. *From Ritual To Romance* p. 192

⁶⁸¹ Williams, p. 141

⁶⁸² Ibid.

⁶⁸³ *Monty Python and the Holy Grail*. Dir. Terry Gilliam and Terry Jones. Python (Monty) Pictures Ltd. 1975.

inappropriate but also potentially dangerous outside the confines of the culturally sanctioned text. This is a highly plausible reading of the film's treatment of the problematic interaction between Arthurian legend and interpretation of Arthurian legend, but also deeply suspect given the context: aside from the satirical nature of the Monty Python group's previous work, nothing is quite what it seems: Camelot is a 'silly place', Sir Galahad is fooled by a 'Grail light' in Castle Anthrax, the young and fair Sir Bedevere of the original narratives is an elderly man and even King Arthur must rely on two coconut shells banged together to simulate a horse. If nothing in the text can be trusted on first appearance, then perhaps it is not Arthur's arrest which is significant but his escape from the confines of the text. The film ends in seeming confusion, the narratives having blurred together as Arthur and Bedevere are put into a police car. The Arthurian legends seem to be just too big to be contained and confined in a single narrative.

1989's *Indiana Jones and the Last Crusade* on the other hand, rejects the modern grail story in favour of harking back to Robert de Boron and Chrétien de Troyes and drawing on the Crusade influences to the Grail story.⁶⁸⁴ Many of the original elements remain; it is explicitly stated that it is a *quest* for the Grail; Indiana Jones makes for an unlikely knight but his motivations are both pure and unselfish – he does not seek the Grail for personal advancement and is therefore able to 'use' the Grail having proved himself worthy. *The Last Crusade* also explicitly states that the Grail is the ultimate force for good and must not be allowed to fall into the hands of evil and while, unlike the conclusion of *Morte d'Arthur*, it does not ascend to Heaven, it is forever beyond the reach of men at the

⁶⁸⁴ *Indiana Jones and the Last Crusade*. Dir. Steven Spielberg. Lucasfilm. 1989

close of the film. The inclusion of the secret society who will do anything to protect the secret of the Grail (who are easily identified by their tattoos in the film) is revisited in Dan Brown's hugely popular novel *The Da Vinci Code*.⁶⁸⁵ Interestingly, this story about a quest for a grail which is not a cup of Christ's blood but the *vessel* of Christ's blood – the descendant of Jesus and Mary Magdalene – was inspired by, among others, the quasi-historical *Bloodline of the Holy Grail* by Laurence Gardner, which claims that a secret society called the Priory of Sion have been protecting and hiding the descendants of Christ for two thousand years.⁶⁸⁶ An interesting turn in the evolution of the grail story, given that, as Jessie Weston pointed out 'we have no trace of the story before the twelfth century',⁶⁸⁷ although Gwyn A. Williams notes a 'striking parallel in the Irish story, "The Prophetic Ecstasy of the Phantom", composed before 1056'.⁶⁸⁸

The story of the Grail has over the last eight hundred years woven itself into the cultural consciousness of Europe and the former colonies, being linked to real historical events such as the massacre of the Cathars, the Knights Templar and the Crusades, and also with long-standing myths: King Arthur and the Knights of the Round Table, Joseph of Arimathea and Mary Magdalene, the existence of a secret society and the mythic consciousness of Britain. The elements which are commonly associated with the Grail legend – the quest, the battle between good and evil, the lost heir (it can be argued that the descendants of Christ would be the ultimate in royal bloodlines, descending as they would from several kings of Judea, although this appears in the New Testament and could be an example of the

⁶⁸⁵ Dan Brown, *The Da Vinci Code* (London: Corgi Adult, 2004)

⁶⁸⁶ Laurence Gardner, *Bloodline of the Holy Grail* (Element Books, 1997)

⁶⁸⁷ Jessie L. Weston, *From Ritual To Romance*, p. 190

⁶⁸⁸ Williams, p. 125

appropriation of Jewish heroes to support the status of Jesus as the Messiah), the heroism of the 'companions' and the sacrifice of the principal characters – *also* map onto *The Lord of the Rings* and indeed, any of the popular narratives of the twentieth century.

Modern fanfiction, therefore, is part of a much older process of appropriation and reworking. Narratives such as *Star Trek*, *Star Wars* and *The Lord of the Rings* have reasonably simple storylines but complex themes and it is these themes which attract readers and re-readers. It has been roughly six thousand years since the first written languages began to appear and we are still telling stories and reworking cultural icons to try and understand our place in the world and how the world works. Today this is further complicated by the difficulties of constructing a social and personal identity in a world where gender, sexuality and concepts of normality are on a continuum rather than being polarised and fixed. The difference now is twofold: the postmodern world is one where 'corporations claim exclusive ownership of core cultural narratives' and rewriting these narratives potentially leaves the fan writer open to prosecution; and the same corporations who own the mythic narratives are also responsible for disseminating them globally, further standardising the modern constructions of mythic texts.⁶⁸⁹

We Invented the Remix Part 2: Fanfiction and the Law

In 'We Invented the Remix: Appropriation and the Law' in the Introduction, I discussed some of the issues surrounding copyright law and its relationship to

⁶⁸⁹ Jenkins, 'Reception Theory and Audience Research'

appropriation. I want to now briefly examine these issues as they relate specifically to fanfiction.

At present, fanfiction v. copyright law remains a theoretical exercise as to date there have been no major cases brought to the courts in either the U.S.A. or the United Kingdom. The point that Jenkins makes about the ownership of cultural narratives being held by corporations rather than being in the public domain is a valid one but rather disingenuous. Jeremy Phillips and Alison Firth point out that copyright was developed as a consequence of printers wanting to retain control over the texts they produced: 'the Statute of Anne in 1709 was passed in response to a demand from printers that their profitable book monopolies be preserved.'⁶⁹⁰ Copyright, it could be argued, has from the start been involved with protecting the intellectual property of the distributor rather than the 'author'. Lawyer Rebecca Tushnet also notes that: 'It is tempting to assume that copyright is about respecting authorial genius and integrity, but in these contexts it protects corporations that own copyrights in works of mass-distribution'.⁶⁹¹ The issue of creativity seems to be absent from legal definitions surrounding ownership of creative materials: 'Ownership of broadcasts or cable programmes has nothing to do with authorship or creativity at all, while copyright in published editions of works vests in an "author" who is defined as the "publisher".'⁶⁹²

There is no copyright protection, for example, for the original ideas in this thesis. As Lesley Ellen Harris explains: 'Where plagiarism is an appropriation of ideas, without the appropriation of the actual expression of those ideas, it is not a

⁶⁹⁰ Phillips and Firth, pp. 146-147

⁶⁹¹ Rebecca Tushnet, 'Legal Fictions: Copyright, Fan Fiction, and a New Common Law', *Loyola of Los Angeles Entertainment Law Journal*, 17:3, 651-686 (p. 666) This is available online at <<http://www.tushnet.com/law/fanficarticle.html>> [accessed 17 August 2008]

⁶⁹² Phillips and Firth, p. 160

violation of copyright since copyright does not protect ideas.’⁶⁹³ This is fortunate for modern writers such as, for example, J.K. Rowling whose novels feature such ideas as a school for young witches and wizards (like Diana Wynne Jones’s *Witch Week* and Jill Murphy’s *The Worst Witch*), a young orphan pitched against a powerful evil (*Star Wars*), a wizard’s talking hat (Terry Pratchett’s *Sourcery*), an unpleasant and vindictive teacher (Kipling’s *Stalky and Co*) and so on. Had Rowling copied directly from any of these texts, it would have been copyright infringement; being inspired by them is perfectly legitimate within the law. I am not intending to assert that J.K. Rowling definitively drew on these earlier works, merely to illustrate that it is the form the ideas are presented in which is protected, not the ideas themselves. This was illustrated in the 2006 case brought against Dan Brown and Random House by the writers of the non-fiction text *The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail* by Michael Baigent, Richard Leigh and Henry Lincoln. The court held that the ideas presented in *The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail* were not protected by copyright; the presiding High Court judge, Mr Justice Peter Smith, noted that ‘it seems to me that it is accepted that an author has no copyright in his facts nor in his ideas but only in his original expression of such facts or ideas. Original in that context does not mean novel of course.’⁶⁹⁴

While the ideas in *Harry Potter*, *The Lord of the Rings*, and this thesis are not protected by copyright, it is the case that ‘even a tiny proportion of a work may well be a “substantial part” if it possesses key features by which the whole is

⁶⁹³ Lesley Ellen Harris, p. 161

⁶⁹⁴ Mr. Justice Peter Smith, *Baigent & Anor v The Random House Group Ltd (The Da Vinci Code)*. EWHC 719 (Ch). 7.4.2006. This is available online at <<http://www.bailii.org/ew/cases/EWHC/Ch/2006/719.html#part25>> [accessed 17 August 2008]

identified or recognised'.⁶⁹⁵ Mr. Justice Peter Smith cites Lord Hoffman who states that 'the original elements in the plot of a play or novel may be a substantial part, so that copyright may be infringed by a work which does not reproduce a single sentence of the original.'⁶⁹⁶ Fanfiction such as *The Bagenders* which appropriates Tolkien's work without explicitly quoting from it is still therefore, under UK copyright, an unauthorised infringement.

Whether it is in the financial or economic interest of a copyright owner to pursue the writers of fanfiction for copyright infringement remains a contested area. Rebecca Tushnet points out that: 'Copyright law in general has very little to say to noncommercial and noninstitutional actors because until very recently their activities have gone unnoticed.'⁶⁹⁷ C.E. Petit, on the contrary, argues that fanfiction can have a detrimental effect on the economic aspects of the original work: 'fan fiction can foreclose otherwise profitable continuations to the authorized creator; it can confuse potential consumers as to what is "canonical" material; and it can have a number of other harmful effects on the authorized creations, *even without intending to harm anything*.'⁶⁹⁸ Ernest Chua rejects this interpretation, arguing convincingly that:

If fan fiction generally does not decrease the amount of legitimate works purchased, is not readily or at all applicable to the licence approach, does not make money and does not gain any commercial benefit, the need to protect copyright owners' economic rights from fan fiction appears moot.

⁶⁹⁵ Phillips and Firth, p. 192

⁶⁹⁶ Lord Hoffman cited in Mr. Justice Peter Smith, *Baigent & Anor v The Random House Group Ltd (The Da Vinci Code)*. EWHC 719 (Ch). 7.4.2006. This is available online at <<http://www.bailii.org/ew/cases/EWHC/Ch/2006/719.html#part25>> [accessed 5 March 2008]

⁶⁹⁷ Tushnet, p. 664

⁶⁹⁸ C.E. Petit, 'Fan Fiction', <<http://www.authorslawyer.com/web/fanfic.shtml>> [accessed 17 August 2008]

One could argue that fan fictions' breaches of copyright have no detrimental economic effect on copyright owners.⁶⁹⁹

Chua points out that:

Fan fiction is not an accepted substitute to canon in the same way that a pirated DVD is an accepted substitute to a legal DVD. Fan fiction involves significant change from the original work. To this end, it is arguable and unlikely that fan fiction does not actually cause any profit to be lost.⁷⁰⁰

This is a crucial point for fanfiction insofar as the ethics of fanfiction appropriation is concerned. Fanfiction does not claim to be a substitute for the original work and it does not generate income for the fan writer. As Rebecca Tushnet suggests:

Additionally, because fan fiction on the Web is essentially free, it does not use any monetary resources a reader might put aside for fiction consumption. Where distribution is free, the readership cannot prove that a viable market exists. Having to pay anything might deter almost everyone from reading, thus leaving copyright owners no better off.⁷⁰¹

Although ISPs could conceivably track websites hosting fanfiction in order to judge the number of readers visiting the page, it would be an enormously costly and difficult procedure to require ISPs to do so, quite apart from the negative publicity and public backlash that would probably be generated as a result. Chua reads fanfiction as 'free advertising' and it could even be argued that fanfiction actually helps to sustain interest in texts.⁷⁰² Although current copyright legislation makes no specific reference to the economic issues regarding copyright infringement, it would be naïve to suggest that a potential loss of earnings or

⁶⁹⁹ Ernest Chua, 'Fan Fiction and Copyright: Mutually Exclusive, Coexistable or Something Else? Considering Fan Fiction in Relation to the Economic/Utilitarian Theory of Copyright', *Murdoch University E Law Journal*, 14: 2 (2007), 215-232 (p. 226)

< https://elaw.murdoch.edu.au/issues/2007/2/Elaw_fan_fiction_copyright.pdf > [accessed 17 August 2008]

⁷⁰⁰ Chua, p. 223

⁷⁰¹ Tushnet, p. 671

⁷⁰² Chua, p. 228

market share on the part of the copyright owner would not form part of any case brought against fanfiction writers.

The producers of media texts can no longer pretend that the fandom community does not exist and have devised different ways of dealing with them. Joss Whedon has encouraged fanfiction writing; novelists Terry Pratchett and J.K. Rowling are fully aware of the existence of fanfiction it but their official position is to remain distanced from it, to prevent any involvement in possible lawsuits that might both damage their credibility with their fans, or leave them open to being sued for plagiarism by fans. Lucasfilm has in the past actively tried to repress *Star Wars* fanfiction, especially slash or adult-rated stories, so far with highly limited success.

There are a number of large slash archives for *Star Wars* fanfiction despite Lucasfilm's official position on adult-rated fanfiction. In an attempt to bring the fandom into a controllable medium, the official website offers fan club members a forum to post their fanfiction as long as it follows the explicitly stated guidelines and the fan writers understand that Lucasfilm retains the intellectual and creative copyright of any fanfiction posted on their forum. This is in contrast to Paramount who, in correspondence with a *Star Trek* fan, stated that: 'Paramount is familiar with several fanzines, and as such find them to be a "fair use" of *Star Trek*, which we can only hope to encourage.'⁷⁰³ As Henry Jenkins points out:

We are on a collision course between a new economic and legal culture which encourages monopoly power over cultural mythologies and new technologies which empower consumers to archive, annotate, appropriate, and re-circulate media images.⁷⁰⁴

⁷⁰³ Tushnet, p. 673

⁷⁰⁴ Henry Jenkins, 'Quentin Tarantino's *Star Wars*?: Digital Cinema, Media Convergence, and Participatory Culture', <<http://web.mit.edu/cms/People/henry3/starwars.htm>> [accessed 5 February 2006]

It is more complicated with Tolkien; he is no longer able to protest about subsequent appropriations and corruptions of his work, and although his estate retains control over *The Lord of the Rings* and his other writings, the tacit approval of fanfiction produced by the Tolkien Society in their bulletin *Amon Hen* might potentially derail an attempt to prevent fanfiction on the internet, although it is worth pointing out that the Tolkien Estate website prohibits fanfiction based on Tolkien's works. While the film rights are owned by The Saul Zaentz Company, fanfiction which seems to explicitly draw on Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* could be targeted by the copyright holders. It is possible that the moral rights of the author could be said to be infringed by fanfiction: 'In the U.K., the right to be identified as the author of a work, the right to object to derogatory treatment of the work, and the right not to have the work falsely attributed have been statutorily protected since at least 1988; these rights also last for the same term as the work's copyright.'⁷⁰⁵ For the writers of slash fanfiction or fanfiction containing violence or sexual themes which are not found in the original text, it is possible that the creator of the original text would have a legal basis on which to request that such material be removed from the internet. Saint-Amour et al point out that, unlike the United Kingdom at present:

the pivotal consideration under U.S. fair use is whether the purpose and character of the use are "transformative," or instead merely "superseding," of the copyrighted work. A transformative use is one that "adds something new, with a further purpose or different character, altering the first with new expression, meaning, or message...." *Campbell v. Acuff-Rose Music, Inc.*, 510 U.S. 569, 579 (1994).⁷⁰⁶

⁷⁰⁵ Paul K. Saint-Amour, Michael Groden, Carol Loeb Shloss and Robert Spoo, 'James Joyce: Copyright, Fair Use, and Permissions, Frequently Asked Questions', *James Joyce Quarterly*, 44:4, 753-784 (p. 767)

⁷⁰⁶ Paul K. Saint-Amour, and others, p. 761. Ellipses in original.

Rebecca Tushnet concludes by arguing for a navigation of the complex space between the appropriating fanfiction writer and the copyright owner:

Copyright owners should be able to defend their creations against pure copying and against harm to market share. These two uses form a boundary that is easily policed and that fulfills the legitimate goals of copyright law. When no lucrative market share is sought and productive use is made of copyrighted characters, fan fiction should be recognized as expressing a protected and valuable form of human creativity – if only in the margins.⁷⁰⁷

The uncertainty surrounding the rights of authors and the rights of the community have been further complicated by the legal action taken by J.K. Rowling and her publishers to prevent the publishing of *The Harry Potter Lexicon* based on the popular website. The ability of copyright holders to prevent the publication of what is essentially a scholarly work could potentially have serious repercussions for academics writing critical scholarly works on modern cultural artefacts.

A Digital Campfire: Fandom and Fanfiction

Fanfiction in its most modern, apparently subcultural form is generally agreed by most critics writing on the subject to have begun with the original series of *Star Trek*.⁷⁰⁸ For Constance Penley, fanfiction in general and slash in particular is about promoting a utopian vision which is 'an experiment in imagining new forms of sexual and racial equality, democracy, and a fully human relation to the world of science and technology.'⁷⁰⁹ Henry Jenkins, whose *Textual Poachers* has become the iconic text for fandom and fanfiction research in much the same way that Edward Said's *Culture and Imperialism* is for postcolonialism, argues that 'its

⁷⁰⁷ Tushnet, p. 686

⁷⁰⁸ Constance Penley, Henry Jenkins, Camille Bacon-Smith and Sheenagh Pugh, for example, all assert that fanfiction 'began' with *Star Trek* and seem to have no issue with a whole new appropriative process apparently appearing overnight.

⁷⁰⁹ Penley, p. 148

cultural products articulate the fans' frustration with their everyday life as well as their fascination with representations that pose alternatives [...] A poached culture, a nomadic culture, is also a patchwork culture, an impure culture, where much that is taken in remains semi-digested and ill-considered.⁷¹⁰ 'Poached' or 'stolen' could be replaced by 'appropriated' and suddenly the appropriation and assimilation of icons from a dominant culture by a disparate and 'patchwork' culture begins to resemble the resistance by colonised nations to the cultural homogeneity of the coloniser.⁷¹¹ If 'children are used as a metaphor for the colonized themselves'⁷¹² in imperial children's fiction, as both Peter Childs and M. Daphne Kutzer argue, and 'modernity is forever getting locally appropriated/reauthored/hybridized' in colonial and postcolonial cultures, then the response to those texts which draw upon imperial adventure literature can be articulated in terms of postcolonial.⁷¹³ Resistance to cultural hegemony and cultural imperialism is a feature not only of postcolonial societies but also of fandom. This is not to intimate that *all* postcolonial writers appropriate and rework dominant narratives, and that those postcolonial writers who do so are motivated by the same political, ideological or artistic impetus, merely to suggest that the way that fandom deals with such texts may be elucidated through postcolonial discourse and theories. This only becomes problematic when core cultural narratives such as *The Lord of the Rings* are owned by corporations or restricted through copyright; Tom Shippey, for example, noted that 'Middle-earth is such a

⁷¹⁰ Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 283

⁷¹¹ See Chapter One and Chapter Two

⁷¹² Childs, p. 30

⁷¹³ Charles Piot, 'Of Hybridity, Modernity, and Their Malcontents', *Interventions*, 3:1 (2001), 85-91 (p. 87)

powerful universe that many readers [...] felt and feel an immediate urge to write their own story in it or alongside it.⁷¹⁴

It is from *Star Trek's* proto-fandom that some of the unwritten conventions of fandom have descended; 'fanfiction' became the term to designate stories written by fans for each other; 'fan art' comes from the same root as 'fanfiction'; words such as 'slash' indicate a homosexual relationship within a text, and so on.⁷¹⁵ Although Henry Jenkins argues that 1920s and 1930s science fiction fandom set the model for later fandoms in that the reciprocal relationship 'between readers, writers, and editors set expectations as science fiction spread into film and television',⁷¹⁶ he concedes that 'fans' in this sense are only a small part of the viewing public: 'fans were the primary readers for literary science fiction, they were only a small fraction of the audience for network television'.⁷¹⁷ This fandom was proactive, hierarchical, organised and more importantly, 'interracial, includes people of all ages, has a fair number of disabled members, is sexually balanced, and has a strong cross-class representation.'⁷¹⁸ Both Henry Jenkins and Constance Penley chose to study *Star Trek* fans when considering fannish modes of reception and consumption, although both also selected a specific and underground sub-set of fandom, slash readers and writers, as they operated outside the legitimate fandom.

The most common way for fans to meet and interact socially was through conventions and local fan clubs. New fans or 'newbies' were integrated carefully

⁷¹⁴ Tom Shippey, 'Literature, Twentieth Century: Influence of Tolkien', *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London and New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 378-382 (p. 379)

⁷¹⁵ See Appendix A.

⁷¹⁶ Jenkins, 'Interactive Audiences'

⁷¹⁷ Ibid.

⁷¹⁸ Penley, p. 99

and with the guidance of a mentor until they had fully assimilated into the fandom having learnt the rules of fan behaviour and language and been guided down a carefully prepared fanfiction reading list.⁷¹⁹ Fandom was in some ways a closed society, hierarchical and highly organised and, as Ted Friedman notes, 'a distinct, self-defined, deeply dedicated fan group.'⁷²⁰ At the core of the fandom was the belief that 'the fandom matters, that what the fans do can affect the world in significant ways.'⁷²¹ The active fans in question were generally adults rather than teenagers and those writing fanfiction were overwhelmingly women. This gender bias is in sharp contrast to the science fiction magazine-based fandoms of the forties and fifties which encouraged discourse between the (male) readers and (male) writers and acknowledged the importance of the fans to the direction the genre took. The science of *Star Trek* with its democratic utopian quest to 'know' the universe and 'to boldly go where no man has gone before,' represented a modern retelling of the classic quest-myth and an accessible recoding of a technologically advanced society which still needs admirable human qualities such as loyalty, friendship, love, courage and honesty in order to succeed in its missions.⁷²² It also provided a basic mythic framework for living with technology – not just the highly complicated 'warp drive' but the mundane 'replicators' and even the automatic doors. *Star Trek* modelled a world in which technology was not only reliable but *relying* on technology was an unspoken part of life and

⁷¹⁹ Penley, p. 99

⁷²⁰ Ted Friedman, 'Fandom as a Materialist Aesthetic: Debbie Gibson and Pierre Bourdieu' Presented to Duke University, April 1995.

<http://www.tedfriedman.com/essays/2005/03/fandom_as_a_mat.html> [accessed 6 January 2008]

⁷²¹ Penley, p. 124

⁷²² *Star Trek*. Dir. Gene Roddenberry. CBS Paramount Television. 1966-68

'represents one of those most important populist sites for debating issues of the human and everyday in relation to science and technology.'⁷²³

The work that Penley and Jenkins in particular have published on fandom has centred on fandoms which were of necessity closed communities where the existing members had control over the admittance of new members and of the direction the community took and the way it responded to the text. Friedman goes on to point out that such a group is easier for ethnographic research than the 'more ambivalent, mediated, nebulous, multitudinous practices of everyday consumer preference.'⁷²⁴ This suggests that the fan audience is not representative of the audience as a whole. Jenkins also draws a distinction between fan culture and consumer culture which no longer exists. The commercial success of the video recorder, cable television channels and digital television means that the audience does not have to be as emotionally or financially invested in a television show or film as they are so much more readily available to buy now. Penley refers to a discussion about the impact of the internet on the *Star Trek* fandom where concern was centred on the risk of 'diluting the fandom' by losing control over who had access to fan productions.⁷²⁵ The community would potentially lose its homogeneity by a sudden and uncontrollable influx of new members; Camille Bacon-Smith's description of the fanfiction community seems as archaic as knights in armour:

access to the community is difficult and requires both acceptance on the part of the local group and commitment on the part of the newcomer. Sometimes, however, even the limited access of the fanzine community at large seems too open. The circuit limits access to a circle or set of trading circles, or to fans who have already demonstrated an interest in a less widely accepted kind of friendship.⁷²⁶

⁷²³ Penley, p. 99

⁷²⁴ Friedman, 'Fandom as a Materialist Aesthetic',

⁷²⁵ Penley, p. 16

⁷²⁶ Bacon-Smith, *Enterprising Women*, p. 210

While it is clear that fandoms lost control over their membership, it is also clear that modern fandoms, spread over the internet, are far more democratic in membership and that the secret society aspect of fandom has almost completely been eliminated. *Textual Poachers, NASA/Trek* and Camille Bacon-Smith's *Enterprising Women* have been used as the canonical texts in fandom research, and while their contribution to the burgeoning field should not be underestimated, the value of these texts lies more in what they can inform about past fandom behaviour and organisation rather than what they illuminate about modern fans and the consumption and production of fanfiction.

The internet as an instrument of fandom is in this case something of a Damoclean sword as internet fandoms are simply too big to be actively political. Even an issue which a fandom might be expected to unite behind, for example the cancelling of *Angel*, actually divided the fandom further. Expecting *all* fandoms to unite behind one political issue is naïve at best, especially when the act of writing fanfiction is no longer in itself a political one. This is one of the biggest shifts from Penley's theory of fandom and it is broadly a generational one. The world, the writers, and the relationship between producer and consumer have changed to the point that the idea of the fan community appropriating in secret no longer applies. Espen J. Aarseth argues persuasively that: 'To elevate a consumer group to producerhood is a bold political statement; and in the production and consumption of symbolic artefacts (texts) the boundary between these positions becomes a highly contested ground.'⁷²⁷ It is no longer *what* is being produced which can be read as a political statement – a remaking of male dominated texts by female

⁷²⁷ Espen J. Aarseth, *Cybertext* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997), p. 103

writers, for example – but *how* it is being produced. The boundary between ‘fan’ and ‘author’ is further made problematic by the assertion of fan status by author/creators such Russell T. Davies and Peter Jackson.

The shift in attitude towards fandom and fannish activities from serious, political and underground to playful, recreational and mainstream has in turn changed the line of divide between the fan and the non-fan.⁷²⁸ During a research project, Matt Hills found that subjects tended to self-identify as fans and the one subject who didn’t was conscious of being ‘abnormal’, which is highly suggestive that, for the subjects, who were predominantly university students, the state of being a ‘fan’ was a normal one and free of the stigma excessive or obsessive interest in a media text generated even ten years ago.⁷²⁹

In 2002, having been asked as a fairly new fanfiction writer why people wrote fanfiction, I suggested that ‘I think that unless you’re in the fandom, you wouldn’t be interested anyway and certainly wouldn’t understand the impetus to write, to further explore the characters.’⁷³⁰ This was an interesting response given the investigations into fanfiction and fan behaviours, and perhaps serves to illustrate the continuing gap between academic work and the self-reflexive work produced by fans. It could also be interpreted as the difference between academic and fan-orientated studies of fandom and fanfiction: the academic, emotionally detached from what they are studying, can see the wider implication and themes in a broad overview of fandom; the fan, with an emotional investment not only to the text but also to the fandom community, is too close to the source material to be

⁷²⁸ Some fans, however, *do* see their involvement in fandom in general and fanfiction writing in particular to be both a political and underground act.

⁷²⁹ Matt Hills reporting on the AHRC funded research project at the Audiences Conference held at Liverpool John Moores University on 22nd November, 2004.

⁷³⁰ This was formerly available on the Octaves of the Heart fanfiction recommendations site.

able to evaluate it critically and cannot be objective enough to study its trends and themes, being over-concerned with his or her own place in fandom and the importance of his or her own particular fandom to the exclusion of all others. Matt Hills pointed out, however, that 'academics are not resolutely rational, nor are fans resolutely immersed'.⁷³¹ However, Henry Jenkins draws an emotional distinction between 'fans' and 'viewers': 'the difference between watching a series and becoming a fan lies in the intensity of their emotional and intellectual involvement.'⁷³² I had clearly made the same distinction, believing that non-fans or non-fandom participants simply 'wouldn't understand the impetus to write', that an emotional investment in the text and a desire to go beyond the text is necessary to understand the motivations of fanfiction writers and fandom in general. While fandom is being explored more and more by academics, it is still arguably helpful to be a participant in fandom in order to understand it completely for a number of reasons, not the least of which is because fandom can resemble a *Mirror of Erised* in which researchers can read exactly what they hoped to read. Catherine Tosenberger makes an excellent point when she argues that academic work on fandom studies has helped to alter the perception of 'the fan' in society: 'The work of scholars writing not just about fandom, but slash fandom in particular, changed that: they recast slash fandom as a space for savvy, subversive women, engaging in creative – and very adult – ways with media texts.'⁷³³ Henry Jenkins made an interesting point about the fan and academic dialectic when he stated that: 'the identities of the fan-academic or the academic-fan are always problematic ones

⁷³¹ Matt Hills, *Fan Cultures* (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 21

⁷³² Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 56

⁷³³ Catherine Tosenberger, 'Homosexuality at the Online Hogwarts: Harry Potter Slash Fanfiction', *Children's Literature*, 36:1, 185-207 (p. 189)

that have to be sorted through, even though I think there's more freedom to shed that issue today.'⁷³⁴ Matt Hills suggested that 'we tend to assume that academic knowledge is "superior" knowledge, yet within fan cultures it may well be devalued, or even sneered at, which would challenge our own sense of centrality or cultural hierarchy.'⁷³⁵

The ever-changing, expanding and theoretically illusive nature of fandom with its own critical discourse and practices, is widely open to multiple interpretations. To the non-fan, too, local fandoms can seem impenetrable, communities with an unspoken ethos and sense of hierarchy and an unshakable faith in their place within the larger community of fandom in the global sense, a veritable Wonderland where linguistic conventions are guidelines rather than rules. This is most clearly demonstrated through the use of acronyms, which feature heavily in the language of fanfiction; acronyms such as 'OTP', 'AU' and 'PWP' can be impenetrable for the casual reader. In addition, purposeful misspelling such as 'teh' for 'the' and invented words such as 'glomp' combined with an understandable interest in language and the community, to a greater or lesser extent, 'routinely dismantle parts of speech and jury-rig them back together however they please'.⁷³⁶

The most significant difference which a model of appropriation, applied to fandom and fanfiction, offers, as opposed to the models of fandom which have

⁷³⁴ Jenkins, 'Intensities'

⁷³⁵ Ibid.

⁷³⁶ Steve Wilson, 'Laugh, Spawn of Hell, Laugh', *Reading the Vampire Slayer: An Unofficial Critical Companion to Buffy and Angel*, ed. by Roz Kaveney (London and New York: Tauris Park Paperbacks, 2002), pp. 78- 97 p. 93 Steve Wilson is writing about the use of language in *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* but the playful attitude to language in fandom is very similar to that used in *Buffy*. In addition, it is likely that a large proportion of the fandom community has been influenced by *Buffy*, as even a brief examination of popular blog sites such as LiveJournal reveals a linguistic debt to *Buffy* and the American teenage slang the show parodies.

preceded it, is that this model suggests that the processes of reception, consumption and creativity which Jenkins and Penley and others identify is not simply the result of a reaction to a media text or novel, but actually relates to fundamental methods of processing experience. Fanfiction is a way of articulating the emotional response and cognitive processing of texts which themselves contain a mythic framework. Texts with a more explicit mythic framework such as *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* or *The Lord of the Rings* generate more fanfiction and this is unlikely to be a coincidence. Texts seem to engender super-fandoms only when the text itself possesses this mythic framework. All of the 'super-fandoms' have huge numbers of participants, extensive fan activity ranging from conventions to fanfiction, and all have impacted critically *outside* the niche of fandom.⁷³⁷

It is important to reiterate at this point that fans and those involved in fandom do not account for the total viewing figures which television stations use to calculate the popularity of any given programme. There is also a tendency in the study of fandom to concentrate on the fans of cult rather than mainstream texts. However, it is also evident that the level of production of fan materials is far higher in a cult fandom than a mainstream one; for example, *CSI: Crime Scene Investigation* which has far higher viewing figures than *Stargate SG-1*, but a fraction of the fanfiction. It is not clear (although it could certainly be argued) that this is explicitly the result of genre or cult texts possessing more extensive imaginative blank or 'play spaces' around the text. Jenkins uses the term 'play spaces' to indicate the utopia of shared and equal virtual play areas for girls and boys in computer games which is equivalent to a shared physical play space such

⁷³⁷ For example, the academic work on *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* and *Angel*, *Harry Potter* and *The Lord of the Rings*.

as 'the informal settings of the subdivisions and apartment complexes'.⁷³⁸ The gendering of social recreation spaces both on and offline for adults is certainly indicative of a gendered play space surrounding cult texts which could go some way to explain why fanfiction is overwhelmingly produced by women.⁷³⁹

Jenkins suggested that fan reading of media texts is part of a social discourse between fans in which 'individual interpretations are shaped and reinforced'.⁷⁴⁰ Moreover, he asserted that 'fan reception cannot and does not exist in isolation'.⁷⁴¹ The assumption that an ability to critically read media texts is something which is learnt in fandom does not account for fans who evidence critical reactions to media texts without the social aspects of fandom. Indeed, 'the brain is a device which possesses certain theories about the world before it is ever confronted with actual sense data,' which arguably suggests that humans are pre-conditioned to interpret and re-interpret the world around them in a critical way.⁷⁴² Not only that, but Pascal Boyer's work on the evolution of culture has led Boyer to conclude that 'cultural concepts are built by inferential processes',⁷⁴³ and that 'no communicator's output ever includes a complete description of the representation to be conveyed'.⁷⁴⁴ This suggests that no matter how much information a viewer takes in from the television programme or community-based fan 'meta' analysis, fans are not passive receivers but actively making inferences and extra-textual

⁷³⁸ Henry Jenkins, 'From Barbie to Mortal Kombat: Further Reflections' <<http://culturalpolicy.uchicago.edu/conf2001/papers/jenkins.html>> [accessed 12 February 2008]

⁷³⁹ It is likely that large multifunctional websites such as BBC Online and many national newspapers have an equally gendered usage. It is equally likely that the gender balance pivots based on content; tribalfootball.com or therivals.net will be weighted towards men. This is not static; *Top Gear* now generates fannish products which suggests that the gender bias has shifted.

⁷⁴⁰ Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 45

⁷⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 76

⁷⁴² Alan Kennedy, *The Psychology of Reading* (London: Methuen, 1984), p. 53

⁷⁴³ Pascal Boyer, p. 109

⁷⁴⁴ *Ibid.*

links between form, content and the mythic quality of the narrative. Rod McGillis goes further to argue that:

Each of us, no matter what our training, reading habits, or interest, is a critic; none of us simply reads. We learn to expect certain things from our reading. We become critics in the sense that we have notions about what kinds of books speak most deeply to us.⁷⁴⁵

Before fanzines, message boards and open forums for discussion on the internet, there was USENET and internet relay chat (IRC) and individual bulletin boards. Critical commentary on fandom and fan activities is not wholly dependent upon social reinforcement. What may be more accurate is that those fans who are inclined to engage in critical commentary are more likely to do so whether they have social interaction with other fans or not. There is probably a high percentage of fans engaging in critical commentary both of the media text which is the source of the fandom, as well as meta-criticism of the fandom community itself, but what has not been addressed is that fandom may well attract people who engage with the media in this way already. Fandom is, in this case, a model for the self-conscious reader. This could explain the highly self-conscious nature of fandom today. With a much wider membership from different social, economic, cultural and religious backgrounds, fans are constantly analysing what their particular fandom means to them, how they relate to others, how the community works as a whole – fandom is used as a way of understanding the world and the fan's place in it: 'In fiction, the women of the fan community construct a safe discourse with which to explore the dangerous subject of their own lives'.⁷⁴⁶

⁷⁴⁵ Rod McGillis cited in Jill P. May, *Children's Literature and Critical Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), p.166

⁷⁴⁶ Bacon-Smith, *Enterprising Women*, p. 203

The Lord of the Rings As Backdrop: Playing In the Text

Trends in fanfiction since the 1970s are indicative of political and social changes through the use to which media texts are made. The steady rise in strong female characters in genre television and film in the early 1990s, coupled with the widening access to fandom that the internet facilitated, produced a shift in the focus of fanfiction texts. With positive, active heroines such as Agent Scully and Buffy Summers, the represented woman in fanfiction became a tangible, rather than marginal figure. This is not to argue that female characters were not featured or represented in fanfiction before *The X Files* – some early *Star Trek* fanfiction such as Leslie Fish's *The Weight* uses as a thematic subtext: 'the sexist treatment of women within the original episodes'. As film and television have developed the active heroine, so has fandom followed. Fanfiction is no longer almost exclusively about men as it was to a large extent in the 1970s.⁷⁴⁷

From the earliest fanfiction, two distinctive subgenres developed: the 'Mary-Sue', and slash or homocrotic fanfiction. Mary-Sue fanfiction is in general considered the most immature form of fan writing as it tends to be nothing more than an authorial self-insert in the form of an original character and has consequently been rejected by the fanfiction community as a whole: 'a Mary Sue character is obviously a bit of a risible cliché and it is understandable that fanfiction writers did not want to be seen writing them'.⁷⁴⁸ The genre allegedly gained its name from an early piece of *Star Trek* satire fanfiction which featured an original female character called 'Mary-Sue'. In general, Mary-Sucs can be identified by possessing superlative beauty, extraordinary intelligence and the

⁷⁴⁷ Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 182. Jenkins has an excellent summary of Fish's novel pp. 177-184 of *Textual Poachers*.

⁷⁴⁸ Pugh, p. 86

ability to out-hero the hero. Henry Jenkins notes that Mary-Sues often possess 'crude personalization' and that there is a very strong community taboo against such fiction.⁷⁴⁹ Mary-Sues also often have a romantic entanglement with the hero or fandom heart-throb and many die tragically at the end of the story, the fan writer having exhausted all other options for them.

Fanfiction writer Mooncalf's 'Every Fanfic Ever Written' has a succinct and accurate definition of both the Mary-Sue and the Self-Insert (or Authorial insert) which are generally conflated into one:

THE MARY SUE
 CHARACTER I'm OOC.
 MARY SUE I'm stereotypical.
Awkward moment
 CHARACTER I love you.
 MARY SUE: I love you too, snookie-ookie-wookums.

THE SELF-INSERT
 CHARACTER Something is wrong.
 SELF-INSERT I can fix it!
She does.
 CHARACTER You're very strong.
 SELF-INSERT I can beat you all up!
 CHARACTER You're fourteen.
 SELF-INSERT And I can solve all your problems!
 CHARACTER That's wonderful! We trust you utterly!⁷⁵⁰

In one sense, these Mary-Sue stories are the purest form of fanfiction as the writers are writing specifically for themselves and not for any perceived audience, although Mary-Sue fiction is popular among other juveniles as is revealed through feedback left on websites such as FanFiction.net. This is complete appropriation of

⁷⁴⁹ Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 173

⁷⁵⁰ Mooncalf, 'Every Fanfic Ever Written!', <<http://mooncalf.org/library/misc/everfic.html>> [accessed 30 December 2007]. Mooncalf's compression of the most common subgenres of fanfiction is in a clearly parodic fashion but the humour rests in the fan recognising that these are both parodies and functional definitions. Such self-referential parody is a common feature of the fandom community as a whole and academic critics who have approached fan fiction in the belief that it is all 'serious business' have missed a crucial element of the community.

the fandom as the Mary-Sue writer sees the original textual material as something to be manipulated into a personal wish-fulfilment fantasy, for example Galadrianna in LadyGaladrianna's *Galadrianna, Daughter of Rivendell*, is Arwen's sister, betrothed to Legolas and 'Commander of the combined forces of Rivendell and Lothlorien'.⁷⁵¹ Mary-Sue fanfiction sustains stereotypical gender relationships; Mary-Sue may be strong, beautiful and independent but she still needs the male love interest. This suggests that a character is incomplete without his particular soul-mate and is one of the building blocks of Mary-Sue fanfiction, along with the assumption that the original text would be improved if the hero had a love interest to explain everything to him. A Mary-Sue is not necessarily a heroine; she may be deeply evil or at least possess dubious morals, but she is always the centre of the storyline. In *The Lord of the Rings* fandom, this is typified by a sudden influx of female relations of Elrond's, mysterious beauties in Gondor, and a huge number of 'Tenth (or Eleventh or Twelfth) Walker' stories as exemplified in Lady Arabella Sedai's *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12*.⁷⁵²

Her Mary-Sue is 'tall (Of course) with hair like Arwen's, and blue eyes. And she's good with a bow' and the story begins at the Council of Elrond:⁷⁵³

I sighed in relief as we cantered through the beautiful wooden gates of Rivendell. It had been a wet journey though mud and marshes, but thank

⁷⁵¹ LadyGaladrianna, 'Chapter One', *Galadrianna, Daughter of Rivendell*, <http://www.fanfiction.net/s/2760476/1/Galadrianna_Daughter_of_Rivendell> [accessed 2 January 2008].

⁷⁵² In *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*, there are gorgeous vampires and an unsurprising number of vampire slayers. The final episode of *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* saw all the potential slayers all over the world transformed into slayers. This could almost be Mary-Sue fanfiction on a mass scale as the *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* writers provided a wish fulfilment fantasy for the target audience of the programme within the text itself.

⁷⁵³ Lady Arabella Sedai, 'Undomiel', *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12*, <http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/4/The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12> [accessed 3 January 2008].

Valar had only taken ten days. We were here because of the Ring of Power. It had been found at last, and the Council was meeting to discuss its fate. Of course, no one knew that I knew that. They had tried to keep it a secret, but nothing escapes the ears of me, Nilseregwen Silverstar, Princess of Lothlorien. I was a Princess of Rivendell before I was married off to Prince Christopher Whitestar. Come to think of it, I was also named Silverqueen by the silver elves.⁷⁵⁴

Despite the reference to the Valar in this extract, the writer's subsequent use of 'Elvish' and the story's place in the 'Book' section of Fanfiction.net, it is clear that the writer has been highly influenced by Jackson's films: both Boromir and Legolas ride through the wooden gates of Rivendell in Jackson's *The Fellowship of the Ring* and Nilseregwen Silverstar has apparently travelled through similar terrain to the hobbits and Aragorn to reach Rivendell. In the author's notes to the second chapter 'Omentien', Lady Arabella Sedai explains that:

Celebrían has a sister (Well, not really, but it is *my* story, right?) named Lalaith. So that's how she was a Princess of Rivendell. Also, another creation of mine was Chris. He's my crush in real life [...] I wanted to add him in the story. He's the Prince of Lothlorien because there is no child of Galadriel's line alive that can rule Lothlorien that's not somewhere else with other duties, like Elrond, Arwen, etc [...] I chose that Chris should be the grandson of [...] how about her third-oldest brother, named Angrod. He's dead, and so is Chris's father. So he's Prince of Lothlorien, and then Nilseregwen married him.⁷⁵⁵

Obviously there are a number of factual errors, not the least when Nilseregwen 'whispered the spell for teleportation' which seems more suggestive of *The Forgotten Realms* than *The Lord of the Rings*.⁷⁵⁶ What is interesting is that Lady Arabella Sedai clearly identifies most with the female characters in *The Lord of the*

⁷⁵⁴ Lady Arabella Sedai, 'Welcome', <<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/1>> [accessed 3 January 2008].

⁷⁵⁵ Lady Arabella Sedai, 'Omentien', <http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/2/The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12> [accessed 3 January 2008]

⁷⁵⁶ *Ibid.*

Rings, stating that: ‘No one else in the whole Elvish world could do these spells except for Galadriel, Arwen Undomiel, and some of the Elves in the Undying Land.’⁷⁵⁷ With Prince Chris of Lothlorien named as the Tenth Walker, Nilseregwen and Arwen vow to follow the Fellowship despite Elrond telling them that ‘Chris and the Fellowship were leaving for “Mirkwood.” That’s the lie they told us. Arwen and I knew they were really headed for Mordor.’⁷⁵⁸

Perhaps without intending it, Lady Arabella Sedai’s *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12* is a critical commentary – if an unsophisticated one – on Jackson’s films. She notes in chapter fourteen, ‘Morie alanta’, that ‘we had convinced them, Arwen and I, to skip trying to go over the mountains, and instead go through Moria’.⁷⁵⁹ Arguably, Caradhras is significant in terms of plot and character development; Boromir carries Pippin through the passage through the snow drift he and Aragorn had forced out in Tolkien’s novel, and across a narrow pass in Jackson’s film. His kindnesses and willingness to undertake unpleasant tasks encourage the reader to empathise with him which makes the events at Amon Hen more dramatic, and serves to underline both the power of the Ring through Boromir’s temptation and Aragorn’s strength through his own resistance to it. In the book, Caradhras allows for a moment of humour to lift the mood as Legolas points out that he can run on top of the snow and lightly mocks ‘our Strong Men’ who are forcing their way through it.⁷⁶⁰ The personification of Caradhras as ‘the cruel’ allows Tolkien to make the point that ‘There are many evil and unfriendly

⁷⁵⁷ Lady Arabella Sedai, ‘Omentien’.

⁷⁵⁸ Lady Arabella Sedai, ‘Namaarica’,

<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/5/The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12> [accessed 3 January 2008].

⁷⁵⁹ Lady Arabella Sedai, ‘Mornie alanta’

<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/15/The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12> [accessed 3 January 2008].

⁷⁶⁰ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 292

things in the world that have little love for those that go on two legs, and yet are not in league with Sauron, which not only heralds the Balrog but also Shelob.⁷⁶¹ It is understandable why Lady Arabella Sedai may see Caradhras as superfluous to the narrative; the Fellowship are defeated by the mountain and forced to go through Moria, so omitting it seems to carry the action on while losing character development. The Mary-Sue writer tends not to care about character development of the canon characters except where it is absolutely critical or where it impacts on her own character.

Sheenaugh Pugh makes an interesting connection between Mary-Sue fiction and 'chick lit': 'Criticism of the genre has focused not only on its fluffiness but on the fact that it acts as a mirror rather than a window, reflecting the lives of its readers and writers rather than showing them other lives'.⁷⁶² This interpretation denies that there are any positive aspects of Mary-Sue fanfiction; Pugh cites Pat Barker's commentary on chick lit as evidence that Mary-Sue fiction is something which writers – and readers – grow out of, and to distinguish between Mary-Sue and an original female character created by a female author:

I think young people, because they have an insecure sense of their own identity, love reading books which confirm that identity, which mirror their lifestyle choices back to them and I think as people get older they need that from their reading less and less.⁷⁶³

This is very plausible, but there are some inescapable facts which Pugh has glossed over: the majority of chick lit is not marketed for a teenage audience but for women in their twenties and thirties; the majority of Mary-Sue fanfiction is written by adolescents; the majority is written in fandoms which cannot be said to mirror

⁷⁶¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 289

⁷⁶² Pugh, p. 85

⁷⁶³ Pat Barker in Pugh, p. 85-86

in any way – except possibly allegorically – their lives – for example, *The Lord of the Rings*, *Harry Potter*, *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*.⁷⁶⁴

Braidotti describes feminism as ‘the means chosen by certain women to situate themselves in reality so as to redesign their feminine condition.’⁷⁶⁵ In a sense, this is exactly what the Mary-Sue writers are doing. If, as Jane Kroger has suggested, adolescence is a state which has been artificially created by western technological societies, rather than something which is intrinsically part of the human developmental process, then this rewriting of core narratives such as *The Lord of the Rings* is indicative of the importance of such narratives.⁷⁶⁶ Geoffrey Madell suggests that ‘our concept of a person is some sort of social construct’ and personality seems to be in conflict during adolescence, leading to teenage rebellion and identity crises.⁷⁶⁷ Given that the majority of Mary-Sue writers are adolescents, in their fanfiction they are essentially rewriting their own reality and personal mythology. They can reinvent themselves as beautiful Elven princesses, gutsy Muggle-born witches or tragic vampire slayers. From a reality where they have little or no control over their own lives, they can displace their anxiety by recreating themselves as heroines or saviours. In this way, the writers of Mary-Sue fanfiction can be seen to be internalising the mythic narratives and incorporating them into their framework for conceptualising and understanding the world. While Shakespeare’s texts are potentially more culturally significant than Tolkien’s, Fischlin and Fortier’s point that ‘the rewriting of Shakespeare can be seen as a key

⁷⁶⁴ Obviously, one person’s Mary-Sue may be another person’s plausible and interesting original female character and Pugh does recognise that it is fairly subjective in many cases.

⁷⁶⁵ Chris Beasley, *What Is Feminism?* (Sage Publications, 1999), p. xvii

⁷⁶⁶ Jane Kroger, *Identity in Adolescence: The Balance Between the Self and Other* (New York: Routledge, 1993), p. 1

⁷⁶⁷ Geoffrey Madell, ‘Personal Identity and the Idea of a Human Being’, in *Human Beings*, ed. by David Cockburn (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), pp. 127-142 (p.142)

location for the exploration of culture and its transmission' can equally be applied to the rewriting of *The Lord of the Rings*.⁷⁶⁸ Equally significant is John Chambers Christopher and Mark H. Bickhard's argument that there is:

no clear split between culture and the self. Rather, cultural meanings are implicit in the interactive patterns that the child learns are successful in getting basic needs met. Culture remains present in the social practices in which the developing person is increasingly embedded.⁷⁶⁹

Reading the creation of fanfiction as a social practice through which the adolescent or 'developing person' locates and experiments with textual meaning and culture enables a valuing of Mary-Sue fiction as a textual version of the imaginary games played by younger children.

Slashing *The Lord of the Rings*: Playing With the Text

The second, and arguably more influential form of fanfiction to come out of the *Star Trek* fandom, is slash or homoerotic fiction. Predominantly written by women, slash fiction posits a relationship between two male characters in a media text, often turning a perceived or actual homoerotic subtext into a romantic relationship. The days of slash fiction being a marginalised form of expression came to an end once fanfiction expanded onto the internet. This was in part because for the first time slash readers and writers could communicate globally, and the anonymity of the internet meant that slash fans could keep their identities secret and gain access to slash stories without having to necessarily join a community. Unlike the communities cited by Penley and Jenkins, modern slash

⁷⁶⁸ Fischlin and Fortier, p.1

⁷⁶⁹ John Chambers Christopher and Mark H. Bickhard, 'Culture, Self and Identity: Interactivist Contributions to a Metatheory for Cultural Psychology', *Culture Psychology*, 13:3 (2007), 259-295 (p. 287)

readers and writers tend to read before they join the community rather than the other way around. As a genre of writing, and of fanfiction in particular, slash is increasingly legitimised through acceptance in the community as a whole, by a larger number of positive homosexual role models in the media, and by being included in discourse on fandom and fan writing. Slash fiction and the study of slash fiction is not so much an opposition to patriarchy as it is an examination of the rules of patriarchy and the differences between men and women which are socially or psychologically determined rather than biologically determined. Sonia Katyal argues that slash rejects 'the notion that gender roles are fixed and predetermined' and therefore also rejects the misogynistic theories of personality which state that certain characteristics are gender linked.⁷⁷⁰ Pugh suggests that 'some slash writers who were themselves gay may have wanted to explore this territory partly for ideological reasons, but many fanfic writers, both gay and straight, just followed their insatiable curiosity about alternative scenarios.'⁷⁷¹ However, the male characters can be both idealised and unstable given the myriad interpretations possible.

Having said that, it is important to bear in mind that for some fandoms, a lack of strong or interesting female characters may well lead writers to slash as a way of experimenting with gender roles, stereotypes and in one sense, to 'take back' the genre. Fantasy in general and *The Lord of the Rings* in particular has a distinct lack of female characters who enjoy the freedom and adventures of the male characters, and it is the unknown space of male friendships which interests female slash writers. The lack of strong, complex or identifiable female characters

⁷⁷⁰ Sonia K. Katyal, 'Performance, Property, and the Slashing of Gender in Fan Fiction' in *Journal of Gender, Social Policy and the Law*, 14:3, 461-518 (p. 485)

⁷⁷¹ Sheenaugh Pugh, p. 95

in the genre as a whole forces women to write about the more well-formed characters who happen to be men.⁷⁷² This suggests that surrounding a media text is a blank or 'play' space which encompasses all that is not written or not canonically known. In *The Lord of the Rings* fandom, these play spaces are primarily centred around events between *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* and the time after the quest (which is only mapped out briefly in the Appendices to *The Return of the King*). David Halperin noted that such texts deal 'with a specific cultural formation, a type of heroic friendship which is better captured by terms like comrades-in-arms, boon companions and the like.'⁷⁷³ Catherine Salmon went on to note that 'one of the appeals with slash is that the relationship is based in the first place on their friendship and the interdependence that they share'.⁷⁷⁴ Lacking a discourse and vocabulary specifically for describing love-between-friends, texts dealing with friendship have to resort to borrowing language and inferences from romantic and familial relationships which gives ample scope for the slash writer: "Sam, dear Sam," said Frodo, and he lay back in Sam's gentle arms.⁷⁷⁵ Indeed, Lucie Armitt argues that:

So acute and convincing is the feminised nature of this relationship between Sam and Frodo that, by the end of the trilogy, it takes what can only be seen as a brutal contrivance to sever the bond. This comes in the form of Rosie Cotton, the girl left behind in the Shire, whom Sam suddenly remembers as he returns, though she seems to have slipped his mind for the best part of two and a half volumes.⁷⁷⁶

⁷⁷² Fantasy fiction does have strong female protagonists but these tend to be more limited by the genre than their male counterparts. It may be that Éowyn is the most atypical of all fantasy heroines.

⁷⁷³ David Halperin, *One Hundred Years of Homosexuality* (New York: Routledge, 1990), p. 77

⁷⁷⁴ Catherine Salmon speaking about her book with Donald Symens. *Warrior Lovers*. Women's Hour 18 June 2001. <<http://www.hermit.org/Blakes7/Merchant.Books.WarLov4.htm>>

⁷⁷⁵ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 292

⁷⁷⁶ Lucie Armitt, *Fantasy Fiction: An Introduction* (New York and London: Continuum, 2005), p.

This is of course entirely typical of the imperial adventure narratives that Tolkien drew on: William H. Green remarks of G.A. Henty that ‘the wife is hardly more than an empty sign of heterosexuality and social connection’.⁷⁷⁷ Although straightforward porn-without-plot, or PWP as it is commonly referenced, is abundant in slash fiction as much as heterosexual fanfiction, for plot or emotion-based fanfiction, it is the central relationship between the two men (or women) which is being explored. David Halperin notes that ‘to define, to make familiar, and to situate (both socially and emotionally) the central friendship’, the writers and creators of ancient legends and sagas used sexual and familial relationships and the language associated with them: slash fiction writers do exactly the same.⁷⁷⁸ The difference is that of Sam Seaborn saying frankly, ‘I love Josh’, firstly, meaning platonically as a best friend, and secondly, familiarly as a brother, *also* takes on a third romantic or sexual meaning when handled by a slash fiction writer.⁷⁷⁹ A character in slash fiction is rarely allowed to use the word ‘love’ without the weight of this additional meaning – any more than a man in modern society would be able to. The fact that Sam’s full line reads ‘I love Josh *like a brother*’ only serves to emphasise this issue.⁷⁸⁰ Despite this being the sixty-seventh episode of *The West Wing* and by no means the first time that Sam and Josh’s close personal friendship has been alluded to, Sam still has to qualify the kind of love he feels for Josh; the unwritten guidelines surrounding male friendships do not allow for such an unqualified statement. Slash fiction tends to handle the linguistic restrictions of the English language better than modern television programmes or

⁷⁷⁷ Green, ‘King Thorin’s Mines’, p. 57. See also Chapter One.

⁷⁷⁸ Halperin, p. 85

⁷⁷⁹ *The West Wing*. Dir. Aaron Sorkin. Episode 4:01 *Twenty Hours in America*. NBC. 2002

⁷⁸⁰ *Ibid.* Italics added.

films which instead seem to pretend they do not exist. *The Lord of the Rings* offers huge opportunities to the slash writer because the language and interpersonal relationships between the characters – especially Sam and Frodo – are not readily translated to modern society. It becomes easy to read a different meaning into Tolkien's text than was intended with passages such as:

‘I didn't ought to have left my blanket behind,’ muttered Sam; and lying down he tried to comfort Frodo with his arms and body. Then sleep took him, and the dim light of the last day of their quest found them side by side.⁷⁸¹

If this appeared in a piece of fanfiction, it would be categorised as classic hurt/comfort – where one character is injured and protected and comforted by the other – whereas it could be possible that Tolkien stresses Sam's working-class background through his speech in order to defuse a romantic interpretation of the scene. Rather than romantic, the relationship is that of knight and squire or officer and batman, but the ambiguity of Sam's actions and words – both out of context as above and in context within the text – leave space for the slash writer.

Visual media do have the added element of body language and meaningful looks between characters which can suggest an intimacy or hint at an unspoken attraction. It is not a surprise that there is close analysis of actors' body language as slash readers and writers look for different interpretations of the text. For example, one gesture can be interpreted as many ways as the fan writer can imagine. In the film adaptation of *The Two Towers*, Legolas returns the Evenstar, which he has been wearing, to Aragorn while Éowyn looks on. Interpretations of this scene could include:

⁷⁸¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 940

1. Legolas took the Evenstar to return to Arwen in the apparent event of Aragorn's death. Éowyn is dismayed by Aragorn's apparently continuing devotion to Arwen and the support this devotion receives from his closest friends.
2. The return of the Evenstar represents Aragorn's links to the Elves, a world from which Éowyn is barred by culture and language.
3. The sequence is emblematic of the shared history between Aragorn and Legolas, a male friendship which excludes Éowyn.
4. An established couple, the brief exchange is emblematic of an embrace.
5. The sequence is a moment of realisation for both Aragorn and Legolas about their feelings for the other.
6. The sequence represents an acknowledgement of Legolas's romantic attachment to Aragorn.
7. Aragorn acknowledges the depth of his affection for Legolas but this is curtailed by the return of the Evenstar which is a reminder of Aragorn's pledge to Arwen.

The last, for example, provides the inspiration for Zarah's 'Contrasts':

His fingers feather over your palm, light, a mere ghost of a touch, gone far too soon. All that remains is the pendant he handed you. It feels cold. Engraved in your memory, unshakable, burning, is the warmth of his skin.⁷⁸²

⁷⁸² Zarah, 'Contrasts', <<http://www.femgeeks.net/zarah/index-pop.htm>> [accessed 3 January 2007]

The contrast between the cold pendant and the warmth of Legolas's skin echoes Jackson's colour palette for the scene; the Evenstar seems to have an inner glow against both their hands.

As Esther Saxey notes, 'the use of Elven language as a token of love between Aragorn and Arwen adds a suggestive note to his exchanges with Legolas', and this foregrounding of the instability not only of Aragorn's hybrid identity but also Jackson's potentially problematic handling of the relationship between male characters reveals the tenuous nature of the assumptions which govern the interpretations of media texts.⁷⁸³ Certainly the producers and consumers of slash see identity in general and sexual identity in particular as something malleable and in flux rather than being polarised and static. This tallies with queer theorists who suggest that 'sexual identity cannot be viewed as fixed,' but does not encompass the convention of making the characters heterosexual apart from with their one true homosexual lover.⁷⁸⁴ When regarded apart from the confines of fandom, this seems a highly unlikely scenario but within fandom it is all too common: 'the whole issue of object choice or sexual orientation gets resolved in an idea of *cosmic destiny*: the two men are somehow meant for each other and homosexuality has nothing to do with it.'⁷⁸⁵ The slash writer rarely makes a commentary on contemporary representations of homosexuality in the media, but instead pairs up two heterosexual male characters whose sexuality is not a threat because they are monogamous, and therefore the threatening, stereotypically

⁷⁸³ Esther Saxey, 'Homoeroticism' in *Reading The Lord of the Rings: New Writings on Tolkien's Classic*, ed. by Robert Eaglestone (London: Continuum, 2005), p. 136

⁷⁸⁴ Beasley, p. 97

⁷⁸⁵ Constance Penley, 'Feminism, Psychoanalysis, and the Study of Popular Culture', *Cultural Studies*, ed. by Lawrence Grossberg, Cory Nelson and Paula A. Treichler (New York and London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 479-500 (p. 487)

promiscuous homosexual character has been appropriated within the stylistic confines of a conventional heteronormative romantic relationship.

This is in sharp contrast to the work of Catherine Belsey and Jane Moore who argue that for an explicitly feminist reader 'all interpretation is political'.⁷⁸⁶ When gender and sexuality issues are part of adolescent rhetoric and are handled by the media in everything from *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* to *Hollyoaks*, the political aspect of writing a slash story about Xander suddenly realising he has feelings for Spike becomes decreased to the point of not existing. What remains, what the underlying focus of the story then becomes about, is the conflict between gender identities and sexuality and the emotional risks of relationships and interpersonal communication. The slash story has re-evaluated its landscape; it has become local rather than universal. In one sense, the slash story has not expanded the so-called domestic sphere of women's writing but superseded it.

Slash writers tend to see their writing as being either empowering (retaking patriarchal spaces) or marginalising (a covert misogyny perpetrated by women on women). The lack of female characters featuring in slash fiction and the way female characters can be demonised in order to remove them from the romantic sphere for the male leads suggests a self-perpetuating misogyny; equally, the suggestion that female writers should focus on female characters because it is easier – or more appropriate – to 'identify' with female characters is in opposition to a more general societal trend, which suggests that female writers need to move out of this limited sphere. Slash fiction scholarship has perhaps over stressed the fact that it is women writing homosexual relationships between *men* as if 'this

⁷⁸⁶ Catherine Belsey and Jane Moore cited in Lidia Curti, *Female Stories, Female Bodies: Narrative, Identity and Representation* (Basingstoke: Macmillan Press Ltd, 1998), p. 84

would be any harder than say, identifying with one of Shakespeare's kings or Richard Adams's rabbits.⁷⁸⁷

In February 2005, the *Guardian* published an article by A.L. Kennedy about modern women's writing, highlighting the unspoken restrictions which allegedly keep women writers in the domestic domain. Kennedy saw this as a loss to literature of a form of communication, an ability to tell the 'private truth of our senses, our emotions, our dreams.'⁷⁸⁸ Adrienne Rich noted that 'every woman writer has written for men even when [...] she was supposed to be addressing women.'⁷⁸⁹ What Penley makes explicit in *NASA/Trek* is her interest in the connection between slash writers and a scientific utopia; of necessity to her theory is a believable scientific basis for the science of fan-authored *Star Trek* stories. But Penley's presumption of such a link possibly narrows the scope of her argument. The reality of slash fiction, which is overwhelmingly written and read by women, is not the feminine utopia conceived by Penley: like any other community it is fractured and distinctly marginalised within fandom as a whole. Slash fiction is frustrating to categorise: it can be read as empowering; as misogynistic; as anti-patriarchy; as promoting the patriarchy; as denigrating; as celebration; and the community itself is divided along these – and many other – interpretations. What slash fiction cannot be is ignored or glossed over. The same privileging of written literature over oral texts that Ruth Finnegan protests against works against slash fiction by marginalising the importance of texts presented non-traditionally. This is while celebrating the appropriative nature of texts such as Christa Wolf's *Cassandra* where 'frequently it is the male representation of the female (or the

⁷⁸⁷ Pugh, p. 97

⁷⁸⁸ A.L. Kennedy, 'Belittled Women', *Guardian*, 24 March 2003, section G2, pp. 2-3

⁷⁸⁹ Adrienne Rich, *Poetry and Prose* (New York: Norton, 1993), p. 1969

lack thereof) that is the focus of the rewriting'.⁷⁹⁰ Finnegan argues that 'our theories of literature need also to recognize the problematics around the relative significance and role of the verbal component within the multidimensional web in which it is set.'⁷⁹¹

Given that fan writings subvert, imitate and manipulate the original text and the celebration of published appropriations of female rewritings, Kendra Hunter's assertion that slash is a form of 'character rape' seems more than a little excessive, especially considering that it seems unlikely that such an argument would be aimed at Christa Wolf, Angela Carter or Carol Ann Duffy, whose appropriations are often less than favourable presentations.⁷⁹² Hunter is perhaps alluding to exegesis and eisegesis interpretations; George Aichele argues that it is 'an ethical distinction: exegesis respects the integrity of the text, and eisegesis does not.'⁷⁹³ If fanfiction is drawing out a latent or subtextual 'truth' in the text, then by definition it cannot be 'character rape'. If, on the other hand, as Hunter seems to be arguing, a homoerotic interpretation of the characters in *The Lord of the Rings* is an eisegesis interpretation, then contrary to postmodern understanding and critical works, the text is a static object which has only one meaning or 'truth' within it, precluding any and all other interpretations. As Aichele points out:

The term "exegesis" is an ideological subterfuge used to conceal a preference for one type of eisegesis over others, to make one way of reading into the text appear to be the natural, normal reading - out of what the text had within it.⁷⁹⁴

⁷⁹⁰ Linda Hutcheon, *The Politics of Postmodernism*, 2nd edn (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 97

⁷⁹¹ Ruth Finnegan, 'The How of Literature', *Oral Tradition*, 20:2 (2005), 164-187 (p. 181)

⁷⁹² Kendra Hunter cited in Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 187

⁷⁹³ George Aichele, 'Reading Beyond Meaning', *Postmodern Culture*, 3.3 (1993).

< https://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/postmodern_culture/v003/3.3aichele.html > [accessed 5 January 2008]

⁷⁹⁴ Ibid.

It can certainly be argued that there is less inherent subversion in suggesting a romantic relationship between Sam and Frodo than there is in suggesting that Sam would claim the Ring for himself – the first example deals with the subversion of a character and the second with the subversion of the narrative which is a far more significant rewriting and reconceptualisation of the text. If the description ‘character rape’ is going to be applied to one part of fan writing, then it should be applied to all of it because, for example, the Boromir of Lady Arabella Sedai is far less in keeping with *The Lord of the Rings* than the Boromir who reconciles with Aragorn after his discovery of the Ring on Caradhras.

Boromir hesitated and then, head bowed to study his own hands, said quietly, "I was going to give it back." Without thinking, Aragorn reached out and cupped Boromir's neck, giving it a reassuring squeeze. "I know," he said sincerely. Boromir turned to him then, responding to the warmth of the tone as much as to the words themselves, an odd look on his face – one very different from the one Aragorn had observed in the snow, one that he hesitated to define... but that he found himself wanting to encourage.⁷⁹⁵

Indeed Lisa Hopkins argues that the presentation of Aragorn and Boromir's relationship in Jackson's *The Fellowship of the Ring* is the most overtly homosexual: 'From the moment we register the initial antagonism between them, their relationship follows the classic courtship trajectory, tracing a growing intimacy and culminating finally in a kiss'.⁷⁹⁶

Modern fantasy series have often been described as a 'bring your own' approach to the subtext of the interpersonal relationships.⁷⁹⁷ It is also worth

⁷⁹⁵ Jenwyn, 'Such A Little Thing', <http://www.squidge.org/fellowship/fic/jenwyn_suchalittlething.htm> [accessed 3 January 2008]

⁷⁹⁶ Lisa Hopkins, *Screening the Gothic* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2005), p. 146

⁷⁹⁷ This came from Joss Whedon who stated: 'I personally find romance in every relationship [with exceptions] I love all the characters, so I say B.Y.O.Subtext!' This can no longer be found at its

pointing out that there is no sex in *The Lord of the Rings*, and the only love affairs are long-standing or apparent pastiches of courtly love, as Richard Matthews suggests:

Love, for Tolkien, assumes an ideal, medieval, Christian quality – it is a beatific *caritas*. *The Lord of the Rings* is practically unique in twentieth-century literature for its epic depiction of this central value, linked closely, as previously stated, to free choice and increasing in significance during the course of the quest. He presents his idealized love as an idea, or an instinct totally lacking in any overtone of sexual passion, and this too distinguishes him from most other modern writers.⁷⁹⁸

There are, however, numerous examples of intensive male friendships and for a modern reader, the text is ambiguous enough in places to warrant a different interpretation and ‘slash turns that subtext into the dominant focus of new texts.’⁷⁹⁹ The ‘brotherhood’ element of the narrative may well contribute to the appeal of texts like *The Lord of the Rings*, as Jared Lobdell argues that in modern society: ‘for the most part, a sense of brotherhood is sadly lacking. This may be one reason for the widespread appeal of professional sports: fans otherwise sundered and separate are given a sense of belonging’.⁸⁰⁰ Lobdell’s example is the Pittsburgh Pirates whose theme song is ‘We Are Family’; an even more appropriate example would be Liverpool Football Club whose supporters are regularly described by the manager, owners, players and journalists as the ‘twelfth man’ and who sing ‘You’ll Never Walk Alone’ to encourage the team.⁸⁰¹ The current squad markets itself on the home grown ‘heart’ of the team being local players Steven Gerrard

original location but is available at <<http://members.tripod.com/%7Ebuffyfaith/joss.htm>> [Accessed 26 February 2008]

⁷⁹⁸ Richard Matthews, *Fantasy: The Liberation of the Imagination* (London: Routledge, 2002), p. 71

⁷⁹⁹ Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 205

⁸⁰⁰ Lobdell, *England and Always: Tolkien's World of the Rings*, p. 77

⁸⁰¹ The version that is played before and sung after each LFC home game is not the original *Carousel* version; the supporters have appropriated the Gerry and the Pacemakers 1963 cover.

(captain, midfielder) and Jamie Carragher (vice-captain, defender), but one of the oldest recurring banners held by supporters is: 'Our team come from all over the place, they talk dead funny and they play dead great'.⁸⁰² Liverpool Football Club's intangible narrative quality rests on the fact that it is the most successful British football team, the tragedies of Heysel and Hillsborough, the Hollywood-like comeback in the 2005 Champions League final, and the emotional ownership of the club by the fans typified by 'You'll Never Walk Alone' turns the club – and supporting the club – into 'Fortress Anfield' where the fellowship of the team take on the world.⁸⁰³ This connection is not a spurious one; Spanish striker Fernando Torres has a tattoo on his left arm of 'his name, Fernando, written in Tengwar, the script invented by J.R.R. Tolkien in *The Lord of the Rings*,'⁸⁰⁴ and *The Lord of the Rings* actor Dominic Monaghan was photographed at Old Trafford in a football shirt with 'Hobbit' on the back in the place of the name of the player.⁸⁰⁵

Traditionally the football supporter space has been a male-dominated one and many studies of football fandom are concentrated on violence and hooliganism among and between fans, but Raymond Boyle and Richard Haynes suggest that:

in many ways it is the appeal of that actual sense of community, which being a football supporter offers, that makes it such a potent cultural force in an increasingly fragmented and turbulent social and economic world. People like to feel they belong and sport offers a highly charged emotional

⁸⁰² Red and White Kop: Independent Liverpool FC website, <<http://www.redandwhitekop.com/gallery/displayimage.php?album=4&pos=54>> [accessed 18 December 2007]

⁸⁰³ That Liverpool can frequently under-perform at the highest level *does not matter* for the story. The power of the LFC narrative means that everything is absorbed into it.

⁸⁰⁴ Leo Moynihan, *The Liverpool Miscellany* (London: Vision Sports Publishing, 2007), p. 64

⁸⁰⁵ This can be seen at Dominic Monaghan Online: <<http://dominic-monaghan.org/picturegallery/displayimage.php?album=120&pos=0>> [accessed 18 December 2007]

public area within which to express this sense of belonging, even if at times this carries with it negative aspects.⁸⁰⁶

This parallels the development and importance of online communities in media fandoms, suggesting that neither community is a result of the central focus of the fandom – whether it is an organised sport or media text – or indeed, of the gender of the community, but that the formation of the community is a natural and appealing part of being a fan. The hundreds of *The Lord of the Rings* fans who convened at film premières and conventions is comparable to the hundreds of Liverpool fans who massed in the city centre to welcome the team home after the victory in the European Champions League. It is through identification as a fan that the boundaries between ‘fan’ and ‘creator’ are maintained.

Re-imagining the text: *The (Other) Lord of the Rings*

Mooncalf’s helpful classification of fanfiction defines Alternate Universe (AUs)

firstly as:

THE AU

AUTHOR So if *this* never happened then *this* happened instead and this never happened and then this happened, and...

CHARACTER ... who am I?

OTHER CHARACTER I'm so lost. I don't think I used to be this nice.

READERS Whoa. Cool.⁸⁰⁷

The value of using Mooncalf’s definitions is that it elucidates the fact that despite hundreds of potential fandoms and narrative forms, fanfiction tends to draw only on the twenty-nine distinctive forms that Mooncalf defines. Some are, naturally,

⁸⁰⁶ Raymond Boyle and Richard Haynes, 'New Media Sport', *Sport, Media, Culture: Global and Local Dimensions*, ed. by Alina Bernstein and Neil Blain (London: Frank Cass Publishers, 2003), pp. 95-114 (p. 111)

⁸⁰⁷ Mooncalf, 'Every Fanfic Ever Written!'

more prevalent than others, and Steven Swann Jones argues that 'audiences generally have a cultural orientation that also contributes not only to what stories are asked for and enjoyed, but also to the way they are told'.⁸⁰⁸ This suggests that repetition through a stable form is one of the most appealing features of fanfiction although it does not explain the popularity of Alternate Universe (AU) fanfiction where the stable forms of the narratives – for example, the romance – are destabilised along with the original narrative.

An AU commonly features characters from one text in a narrative which departs from the canon. It is typically understood to deal with departures in plot rather than character development; for example, most fanfiction readers would not necessarily class slash as an AU, whereas Galadriel claiming the Ring as she does in 'Love Me and Despair' by EdorasLass would certainly be classed as an AU.⁸⁰⁹ The power of this piece of fanfiction rests in the slow build up; each small section deals with a member of the Fellowship and gradually the sinister atmosphere is increased. Boromir, Gimli and even Aragorn seem to be thriving under Galadriel's leadership and 'the Lady has assured him that Mordor is still, the lands of the South prosper under the Steward's able command'.⁸¹⁰ Aragorn has Arwen, Middle-earth seems to be at peace and Boromir is alive – but these things, EdorasLass asserts, come at a terrible price: Rohan has fallen to Grima with Théoden murdered while Fangorn is failing under 'the Shadow of the Lady'.⁸¹¹ More striking still is the fate of the remaining members of the Fellowship; Merry and Pippin have fled and: 'Legolas son of Thranduil wants nothing, needs nothing.

⁸⁰⁸ Steven Swann Jones, p. 28

⁸⁰⁹ EdorasLass, 'Love Me and Despair'.

<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/2232043/1/Love_Me_and_Despair> [accessed 28 September 2007]

⁸¹⁰ Ibid.

⁸¹¹ Ibid.

His ruined body has been thrown beyond the borders of the Golden Wood for the beasts to scavenge'.⁸¹² The implication is that Gimli has killed him for daring to defy Galadriel: 'the Prince of Mirkwood flouted the Lady's will, and there is only one penalty for such treachery'.⁸¹³ Sam has a garden but with his mind dominated and subordinated to Galadriel's will, he does not notice that 'once-gentle flowers now sprout wicked thorns, and that his hedges are withering into skeletal ghosts'.⁸¹⁴ This image of Sam's garden is emblematic of the story as a whole; Middle-earth itself is wilting under Galadriel's rule and those who, in *The Lord of the Rings*, stand firmly against such domination and destruction, are either actively working with evil or cannot see it for what it is. EdorasLass makes a strong comment on the insidious nature of evil in 'Love Me and Despair' and on the nature of heroism: all of these things have happened because of Frodo's cowardice. By portraying a Frodo who succumbed to the opportunity to give up the quest – and, not the least, a Galadriel who succumbed to the lure of the Ring – EdorasLass refocuses attention on *The Lord of the Rings'* Frodo as a hero. William K. Ferrell comments that 'heroism, in its most romantic and respected form, is expressed as a conscious choice of one individual to sacrifice him or herself for the benefit of others' and it is Frodo's failure to be a hero which leads to the events in 'Love Me and Despair'.⁸¹⁵ The terrible irony in 'Love Me and Despair' is that the agony and torture which Frodo suffers in the latter half of the quest is as nothing to the pain which he suffers having given up the quest. Having agreed to take the Ring to Mordor – 'if you do not find a way, no one will' - Frodo's fate in *The Lord*

⁸¹² EdorasLass, 'Love Me and Despair'.

⁸¹³ Ibid.

⁸¹⁴ Ibid.

⁸¹⁵ William K. Farrell, *Literature and Film As Modern Mythology* (London: Praeger, 2000), p. 60

of the Rings, to leave the Shire and Middle-earth, to lose his finger and suffer always the pain of the stabbed shoulder, does not seem like any kind of a reward,⁸¹⁶ ‘Love Me and Despair’ reminds the reader that there is great mercy in *The Lord of the Rings* and that it could have been so much worse:

The halfling Frodo has been both her salvation and her vengeance. He bore the Ring to her, offered it freely, and that has earned him a place of highest honour, ever at her side. As a reward, she has not clouded his mind; he alone has been allowed to keep his memories of the time before. If not for Frodo, she would have diminished, and gone into the West. She would still be Galadriel.⁸¹⁷

Interestingly for an AU story, the final line – ‘She would still be Galadriel’ – actually signifies the appropriative nature of the narrative.⁸¹⁸ The Galadriel of ‘Love Me and Despair’ is not the Galadriel of *The Lord of the Rings*, who is tempted by the Ring but: ‘laughed again, and lo! she was shrunken: a slender elf-woman, clad in simple white, whose gentle voice was soft and sad. ‘I pass the test,’ she said. ‘I will diminish, and go into the West, and remain Galadriel.’⁸¹⁹

Leslie A. Donovan draws parallels between Galadriel and the valkyrie of medieval Germanic literature: ‘her refusal of the One Ring [...] is valkyrie-like in that it is an action undertaken as the result of a supreme exertion of the character’s will’.⁸²⁰ No more than Gandalf is Galadriel immune to the lure of the Ring: goodness does not preclude temptation, but the moral strength of those characters who resist the Ring makes them more believable and more admirable than if, like Tom Bombadil, ‘the Ring has no power over him’.⁸²¹ Tom Shippey draws

⁸¹⁶ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 270

⁸¹⁷ EdorasLass, ‘Love Me and Despair’.

⁸¹⁸ Ibid.

⁸¹⁹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 366

⁸²⁰ Donovan, p. 117

⁸²¹ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 265

attention to the fact that many characters in *The Lord of the Rings* seem disinterested in the Ring despite their proximity to it.⁸²² Shippey's point here is that the Ring is addictive: Merry, Pippin, Legolas and Gimli are not at risk from the Ring because they have not come into contact with it and the brief addiction suffered by Sam and Bilbo is something they can recover from. Tolkien does not elucidate whether Legolas and Gimli are affected by the Ring, but both would have very good reasons to keep their distance, and there is little evidence of close physical contact between either of them and Frodo, for example. The unusual resistance of hobbits to the power of the Ring is stressed in Bilbo, Sam, Frodo – and Gollum, who retained a small amount of 'hobbitness' despite possessing the Ring for hundreds of years – which could account for Merry and Pippin's resistance. Finally, if the power of the Ring was simply addictive, then either Frodo is more susceptible to addiction than Bilbo; the Ring is more active during *The Lord of the Rings* than it was during the years Bilbo used it in the Shire; or the Ring as an object of power is more dangerous to those who already possess power. All of these are perfectly plausible interpretations in the text:

Its strength, Boromir, is too great for anyone to wield at will, save only those who have already a great power of their own. But for them it holds an even deadlier peril. The very desire of it corrupts the heart. Consider Saruman. If any of the Wise should with this Ring overthrow the Lord of Mordor, using his own arts, he would then set himself on Sauron's throne, and yet another Dark Lord would appear. And that is another reason why the Ring should be destroyed: as long as it is in the world it would be a danger even to the Wise. For nothing is evil in the beginning. Even Sauron was not so.⁸²³

⁸²² See Tom Shippey, *The Lord of the Rings (2): Concepts of Evil*, *J.R.R. Tolkien: Author of the Century* (London: HarperCollins, 2001), pp. 112-160

⁸²³ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 267

'Love Me and Despair' is then an investigation into what Katharyn W. Crabbe notes: 'ultimate defeat, then, in *The Lord of the Rings*, is not simply to lose the battle with evil, but to be incorporated into it.'⁸²⁴

If there is a faint glimmer of hope in 'Love Me and Despair', with Merry and Pippin still free and Frodo with his mind still his own, then there is none at all in Roz Kaveney's 'Webs'. A stunning exploration of the character of Shelob and a chilling alternative for the events of Cirith Ungol, 'Webs' posits a Middle-earth where Gollum tells Shelob about Frodo and the Ring: 'The small one, who smelled of marsh and blind fish, had whispered to her [...] He was her meat from the first day they met, and she sat and savoured the anticipation of his taste.'⁸²⁵ Shelob is described in such a way as to make a reader returning to *The Lord of the Rings* more aware of the horror of Cirith Ungol and of Sam's bravery. Roz Kaveney's Shelob is thoroughly monstrous in a way that exceeds the lingering memory of the Mirkwood spiders in *The Hobbit* and returns to childhood the spiders in the Forbidden Forest in the *Harry Potter* series.

She had lived an eternity and would live an eternity more. Greatest of the children of Ungoliant, she had eaten her mother's heart and brains while her siblings contented themselves with the belly-fat and the guts [...] waiting until all were dead before she let herself eat any of them. She had strategy, when she needed to. And was capable of delay, and of sudden speed.⁸²⁶

This is clearly drawn from Tolkien's *The Two Towers* – the visual qualities of the medium mean that Jackson's sequence in *The Return of the King* is more action based and there is very little way of conveying information about Shelob's past –

⁸²⁴ Crabbe, p. 155

⁸²⁵ Roz Kaveney, 'Webs'. <http://www.henneth-annun.net/stories/chapter_view.cfm?stid=476&SPOrdinal=1> [accessed 28 September 2007]

⁸²⁶ Ibid.

'still she was there, who was there before Sauron, and before the first stone of Barad-dûr; and she served none but herself, drinking the blood of Elves and Men, bloated and grown fat with endless brooding on her feasts, weaving webs of shadows; for all living things were her food'.⁸²⁷ 'Webs' is consistent with canon in Shelob's description and behaviour; it becomes an alternate universe when Sam's heroic battle becomes just 'a short painful struggle':⁸²⁸

All things came to her web in their time. All things came to her stomach in their time [...] She stepped the end of the smallest leg she had into Its circle and suddenly It clung to her as if It had always known her as Its Mistress.

And she remade the world. And not slowly.⁸²⁹

Jane Chance notes that 'Gollum and Shelob both illustrate the lower sins of gluttony, sloth and lechery', and Shelob's triumph in 'Webs' can be read as a commentary on the potential state of the world – Middle-earth or the 'real' world – if such traits are allowed to take control.⁸³⁰ At the conclusion, the compelling image of Shelob swinging on a great web from Minas Morgul to Minas Tirith and beyond is haunting and lingering:

She would live an eternity spinning her webs across the land and beyond the sea. Orcs were her meat and elves and men, and even the Valinor should dread her bite and her web and her appetite [...] nested in a slow grey web.⁸³¹

Paul Kocher comments that Shelob is 'one of the many variations on the theme of evil of which Sauron is the generic type', but the medium of fanfiction, with its multiple interpretations and appropriations, allows an examination of Shelob's

⁸²⁷ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 723

⁸²⁸ Kaveney, 'Webs'.

⁸²⁹ *Ibid.*

⁸³⁰ Chance, 'The Lord of the Rings: Tolkien's Epic', p. 216

⁸³¹ Kaveney, 'Webs'.

powers as the sustainable and enduring evil of Middle-earth.⁸³² Shelob is in many ways the 'feminine counterpart to Sauron' and 'Webs' describes Shelob's domination of Middle-earth as no less complete than the one which Frodo and Sam see in Galadriel's mirror in *The Fellowship of the Ring*.⁸³³

Both EdorasLass and Roz Kaveney have drawn inspiration from Tolkien's text and (re)imagined the outcome of the quest. Henry Jenkins points out that 'there is still a tremendous authority vested in the original that withstands most grassroots challenges', and such appropriations and rewritings are unlikely to impact enormously on *The Lord of the Rings* – except that even, and perhaps especially, alternate universes provide something akin to the best academic criticism: they encourage the reader to reconsider the text in a new way.⁸³⁴

Other fanfiction writers are not content to leave the text the way it ends and write 'post-quest' stories set after the end of *The Return of the King*. Stories set in the West when Frodo and Sam are reunited are very popular, especially amongst slash writers who see Sam's following of Frodo as the final affirmation that his love for Frodo is above all others, including his family. Mooncalf's second definition of the AU is very apt for the post-quest AU series by Lady Alyssa and

Random Dent:

THE AU, PART 2

CHARACTER: ... this isn't an AU, I'm just ridiculously OOC.

OTHER CHARACTER: I think that's thanks to the freakishly modern-day setting.

CHARACTER: ... someone, help, I'm having an identity crisis!

OTHER CHARACTER: Jeans! I'm wearing jeans!⁸³⁵

⁸³² Paul Kocher, *Master of Middle-earth*, p. 73

⁸³³ Hugh T. Keenan, 'The Appeal of *The Lord of the Rings*: A Struggle for Life', *J.R.R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings* (see Lobdell, above), pp. 3-16 (p. 9)

⁸³⁴ Jenkins, 'Reception Theory and Audience Research'

⁸³⁵ Mooncalf, 'Every Fanfic Ever Written!'

The Bagenders is a long, unfinished series set in an alternate universe where the Fellowship become immortal, and somehow (this is never fully elucidated) live together in a three bedroom semi-detached house somewhere in the north of England: 'some fellowships were not meant to be broken [...] History has become legend; legend has become myth and myth has become merchandising'.⁸³⁶ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent make an explicit link between the corporate ownership of and subsequent exploitation of cultural myths. The important cultural narratives of the twentieth and twenty-first centuries have, as they point out, 'become merchandising'. Mythic narratives have become a commodity to buy and sell in the marketplace and they are used explicitly to make money. Fan writers subvert this model of consumption by providing a new mythic text which is both free and easily accessible.

The clever interweaving of the fantasy and satirical elements turn a one-device story into a highly popular and well-written series. The characterisation is loose but the series has its own particular charm, exposing as it does the 'dark' side of the Fellowship, or rather, those parts of their personalities which are human instead of heroic. The series displays an affection for the original text which seems to be missing from non-fan produced parodies such as *Bored of the Rings*⁸³⁷ of which Louise Karczmarz notes: 'its only real intention is to be entertaining'.⁸³⁸

The Bagenders joyfully mocks the characters, embroiling Aragorn in a bitter divorce from Arwen, where he frequently suffers 'emotional blackmail from three continents away' as Arwen unreasonably brings up 'things that happened

⁸³⁶ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/>> [accessed 10 September 2007].

⁸³⁷ Harvard Lampoon, *Bored of the Rings* (London: Gollancz, 2003)

⁸³⁸ Louise Karczmarz, 'Review of Bored of the Rings', <http://www.allscifi.com/topics/info_403.asp> [accessed 6 January 2008]

five and a half thousand years ago'.⁸³⁹ The series also demotes him from king to park ranger in a clever consideration of where Aragorn's talents might be best used in modern society. Instead of battling Orcs and Uruk Hai, he shepherds school parties around the woods, an aspect of his job that he regards with dislike: 'Orcs, he could deal with, Uruk-hai, and on a good day even the Nazgûl, but a school trip was beyond even the former king of Gondor'.⁸⁴⁰ However a later episode, 'Strider Scoutmaster', displays his apparent flair with children as he turns a Scout Troop into a 'precision drilled [...] five-foot tall legion of Gondor'.⁸⁴¹ Like Monty Python's Sir Gawain, however, Aragorn does not fit easily into this new environment; whether implicitly intended or not, the writers of *The Bagenders* demonstrate the inapplicability of certain elements of *The Lord of the Rings* to a postmodern society. The use of humour to deconstruct and stress the cultural power inherent in Tolkien's portrayal of the character construction is suggestive of Linda Hutcheon's analysis of how such approaches to core cultural texts are used by female writers and artists 'to point to the history and historical power of those cultural representations, while ironically contextualizing both in such a way as to deconstruct them.'⁸⁴² Parody remains a strong element of the creative products produced by fans and such definitions of parody as used by Hutcheon for example, are certainly applicable – with reservations – to fanfiction, fan vids and other creative outputs, and to draw comparisons with the 'legitimate' creative arts. However, it is naïve to assume that a wider understanding of the links between the

⁸³⁹ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Shadow of the Past*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/ep2.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]

⁸⁴⁰ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Shadow of the Past*,

⁸⁴¹ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: Strider Scout Master*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/ep10.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]

⁸⁴² Hutcheon, *The Politics of Postmodernism*, p. 98

professional artists and writers whose work is protected under various 'Fair Dealing' statutes through the understanding that their work is explicitly parodic, and the fans who create not-for-profit creative arts, will lead to a relaxing of the somewhat hostile attitude towards the writers of fanfiction on the part of the corporate copyright owners.⁸⁴³

The Bagenders becomes a study not of disparate communities working together to survive but a microcosm of antiquated individuals who are unable to fully interact in a fractured modern society: this is where most of the humour of the series is drawn from. The heroes of *The Lord of the Rings* can remain heroes so long as they remain within the confines of Tolkien's text; the penalty for straying outside the text is parody and ridicule. However, while clearly a parody of Tolkien's creation, *The Bagenders* approach to the source text is far closer to Linda Hutcheon's description of postmodernism; *The Bagenders* series 'install and then subvert convention in parodic ways, self-consciously pointing both to their own inherent paradoxes and provisionality and, of course, to their critical or ironic re-reading of the art of the past'.⁸⁴⁴ Through the extensive use of intertextual material, *The Bagenders* continually draws attention to the artificial boundaries between the texts it draws upon. For example, funnelled through *The Bagenders* appropriative methods, the close relationship between *Men Behaving Badly* and *Father Ted* becomes explicit in the behaviour of the Fellowship, as demonstrated in Gandalf's repeated demands for alcohol. *The Lord of the Rings* becomes a way for the writers to discuss a reading of British culture and society that appears to be

⁸⁴³ In fandom, there exists not only an understandable confusion over what is and is not considered copyright infringement but also a dominance of American legal terminology. What is known as 'Fair Dealing' in British Copyright Acts is also known as 'Fair Use' in the United States.

⁸⁴⁴ Linda Hutcheon, 'The Politics of Postmodernism: Parody and History', *Cultural Critique*, 5 (Winter, 1986-1987), 179-207 (p. 180)

indistinguishable from that presented – and parodied – in the media. This re-presenting of the middle classes and the associated texts like *Ground Force*, *University Challenge* and, although *The Bagenders* does pre-date the specific property boom on British television, the docu-soap narratives, draws attention to the apparent invisibility of these narratives and the presentation of British society that they represent: ‘even the most self-conscious and parodic of contemporary works do not try to escape, but indeed foreground, the historical, social, ideological contexts in which they have existed and continue to exist.’⁸⁴⁵ Ulrike H. Meinhof and Jonathan Smith, writing on *Spitting Image*, suggest that:

Spitting Image consists of TV pastiche or parody quite as much as in anything else. This pastiche or parody takes as its object or target not simply individual TV programmes, but also the more anonymous and generalized generic formats of television programmes and, occasionally, a sequence of such formats which combine to parody an entire evening’s schedule.⁸⁴⁶

This is equally applicable to the layered intertextuality of *The Bagenders* which uses *The Lord of the Rings* in order to wander through contemporary cultural products and interrogate the medium of television as much as television texts:

The authors appeared wearing ill-advised furry parkas, headphones and holding strangely shaped microphones stupidly close to their mouths, but the fellowship were too involved in their argument to notice this strange phenomenon.

"Good morning and welcome to 69 Waterton Crescent where the teams are warming up for the International Video in a Jiffy Bag Rugby Championship. Today's competing teams are the Men of Gondor vs the Hobbits of the Shire warming up by having a screaming row [...] The Men of Gondor, are unusually for them, fielding an elf. What do you think about that Bob?"⁸⁴⁷

⁸⁴⁵ Hutcheon, ‘The Politics of Postmodernism: Parody and History’, p. 183

⁸⁴⁶ Ulrike H. Meinhof and Jonathan Smith, ‘*Spitting Image: TV Genre and Intertextuality*’, in *Intertextuality and the Media* (see Kelly-Holmes, above), pp. 43-60 (p. 46)

⁸⁴⁷ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: At Home with Boromir*. <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/story/ep7.html>> [accessed 7 August 2008]

Hutcheon's assertion that in postmodern parody 'what appears to be an aesthetic turning-inward is exactly what reveals the close connections between the social production and reception of art and our ideologically and historically conditioned ways of perceiving and acting' fails to encompass an appropriative – and apparently sub-cultural – response to an artistic work such as *The Lord of the Rings*.⁸⁴⁸

Either ironic and satirical appropriative works such as *The Bagenders* are not parody, or Hutcheon's definition is limited and does not possess the appropriate theoretical language in order to address parodic fanfiction which is both a revelation of the production and reception of art and a creative work which is unacknowledged or sidelined by conventional scholarship. Heavily intertextual fanfiction like *The Bagenders* is highly self-conscious of the 'very acts of production and reception' of the medium, but this self-consciousness is not a commentary within the text, unlike films and novels which deal with demonstrating the constructed and contested nature of representations.⁸⁴⁹ Through the use of author's notes the fanfiction reader is invited to be aware of the various appropriations which may well go beyond the original text being appropriated:

[The Bagenders: 'Many Meetings']

JRR Tolkien owns the Fellowship. Debt to 'Father Ted' in the characterisation of Gandalf. General situation debt to the 'Young Ones'. 'Tally ho, pip pip' etc belongs to Balckadder (sic) goes Forth; Spanish Inquisition belongs to Monty Python and/or the Catholic church. We don't own Benny Hill, The Dambusters, Lego (well actually we own quite a lot of Lego, but that's not the point), Dr. Who, Abba, Gladiator, Isambard Kingdom Brunel or the Clifton Suspension Bridge.

[The Bagenders: 'A Conspiracy Unmasked']

Mink bikini borrowed from 'Round the Home'. One scene blatantly plagiaris- sorry, 'inspired' by 'Red Dwarf'. Latin motto courtesy of the

⁸⁴⁸ Hutcheon, 'The Politics of Postmodernism: Parody and History', p. 184

⁸⁴⁹ Hutcheon, *The Politics of Postmodernism*, p. 105

Emperor Vespasian. Mrs. Wainthrop appears courtesy of the WI, and both she and Julie belong to us.

[*The Bagenders*: 'The Silver Forest']

The beginning of the story is a misquote of the beginning of Virgil's 'Aeneid'. Most of the story in the Retirement home is based on a very funny play by Aristophanes called *Thesmophoriaszusae*, which is translated into English either as 'The Women of the Thesmophoria', or 'The Poet and the Women', and it's filthy - we've really only used the clean bits. Lady Cora and Lady Clarice are residents of Gormenghast and belong to Mervyn Peake - will be sent back by return of post at great personal expense.

Robert Phiddian points out that a 'complex parody can involve not just a particular aesthetic object, but many kinds of discourse within its own structure' and this is highly applicable to non-parodic fanfiction.⁸⁵⁰ The meta-textual environment of fandom is one of constant intertextual appropriation which goes far beyond the cursory investigation into cross-over fanfiction where characters from one text appear alongside characters from another; for example Spike and Angel from *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* appearing in *Heroes* fanfiction or Mulder and Scully working on a case alongside *Torchwood's* Captain Jack Harkness. This multi-textual movement is equivalent to the fan writers themselves who are likely to move easily between fandoms. Sheenagh Pugh asserts that: 'some writers do write in more than one fan universe but it would be rare to write in more than two or three, and many are faithful to one only', but this is, I suspect, a relic from the days of the fanzine. Both economically and socially, it has never been easier to move between fandoms and many writers take their readers with them.⁸⁵¹

⁸⁵⁰ Robert Phiddian, 'Are Parody and Deconstruction Secretly the Same Thing?', *New Literary History* 28:4 (1997), pp. 673-696 (p. 683)

⁸⁵¹ Pugh, p. 116. I have written in about ten fandoms and read in far more; admittedly, some of those stories were one-offs and I count *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* as being separate from *Angel* which some purists might not. The point is that according to Pugh, I am in the minority whereas based on my own experience in fandom, my reading and writing practices are far closer to the norm.

Presented as 'episodes' rather than 'chapters', *The Bagenders* is clearly intended to be read as a quasi-interactive text. The main website hosts links to the series mailing list called 'Tolkien Silliness' and to artwork contributed by readers, and although the series was abandoned by its original writers for some considerable time, it has been passed on to a new set of fan writers to continue.⁸⁵² The interactive qualities of fanfiction enable the readers of a particular series to contribute and communicate far more easily with the writers they enjoy.

The Bagenders is almost defiantly British, referencing as it does a wide variety of inter and extra-textual material, especially British popular culture sources from *Father Ted*⁸⁵³ to Terry Pratchett's *Discworld*, *University Challenge*⁸⁵⁴ and *EastEnders*.⁸⁵⁵ It is clear that the fan writers have extensive knowledge and understanding of the minutia of Middle-earth, but their more obscure references are used subtly and blended into the narrative.

Dear Elbereth, how are you? The Fellowship are all well. Including Boromir. He seems to have reincarnated back here for some reason. I know you can take him back since you had Glorfindel bouncing back and forth between here and Valinor like an elven yo-yo. Take him back! Please. Please! Please!
Yours sincerely
Legolas of Mirkwood.⁸⁵⁶

The humour in this extract is increased with the extra-textual knowledge that the writers are satirising conventional representations of Legolas in fanfiction as an

⁸⁵² Inwai and Ololay, *The New Bagenders*, <<http://bagenders.tripod.com/>> [accessed 20 January 2008]. The new writers have relocated the Fellowship to the U.S.A. This 'continuation' of *The Bagenders* accommodates a 'second wave' appropriation; Inwai and Ololay are appropriating an appropriation of *The Lord of the Rings*. The fact that 'second wave' appropriation is commonly termed 'sharing the sandpit' heightens the correlation between fanfiction and play.

⁸⁵³ *Father Ted*. Channel 4 Television. 1995-1998.

⁸⁵⁴ *University Challenge*. BBC. 1962 – present.

⁸⁵⁵ *EastEnders*. BBC. 1985 – present.

⁸⁵⁶ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Mirror of Modernity*. <<http://www.stormpages.com/bagenders/episodes/2ep4.html>> (The website notes that as of December 2005, many of the pages are not working but they hope to remedy this shortly.)

aloof and inhumanly calm individual, unused to dealing with human emotions. The Legolas of *The Bagenders* frequently resorts to blackmail, sarcasm and the ‘Scary Elf Eyes’ to get his own way.⁸⁵⁷ This extract also exemplifies the high level of contextual knowledge that the writers possess about Tolkien’s novels. Rather than using Peter Jackson’s adaptations as a definitive source, they refer explicitly to the ‘book canon’ – all the events and characters who appear in *The Lord of the Rings*.

The conflict between Boromir and Legolas, which reoccurs at several key points in the series, is centred around a personality conflict which does not occur in *The Lord of the Rings* and allows the writers to explore the clash of relatives which has been a staple of British situational comedy for several decades; although they stress the differences between the humans, hobbits and elves, this can rarely be extrapolated into any commentary on race in twentieth and twenty-first century Britain.⁸⁵⁸ Rather than being happy about being reunited with the missing member of the Fellowship, Legolas actively campaigns to get him removed, disliking the disruption to the status quo. Although it is never explained exactly why the Fellowship are forced to live together, it is intimated through the series that Legolas is the only one who can successfully survive in modern Britain and that despite his best efforts, the others always end up finding him. As a result of this, he frequently takes on a ‘mothering’ role with the others. The tension between Boromir and Legolas is to some extent drawn out through Aragorn being positioned between them as a hybrid figure – *The Bagenders* demonstrates

⁸⁵⁷ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Dream-Fridge*,

⁸⁵⁸ *The Bagenders* only features one dwarf, so there is not a representative proportion to assume that Lady Alyssa and Random Dent are commenting on Tolkien’s portrayal of the dwarves. Lady Alyssa and Random Dent do note their awareness of and appropriation of *Discworld* so it is possible that parodying Tolkien’s dwarves would cover the same area as Pratchett and undermine their original elements. This is conjecture but reasonable conjecture given the popularity of Pratchett with the likely target audience of *The Bagenders*.

Aragorn's difference by stressing his similarities and differences to Boromir and Legolas and by also setting Boromir and Legolas in conflict with each other. It is by no means a coincidence that Aragorn's anxiety about his ranger skills – which he developed in Rivendell – occurs most heavily in 'The Dream Fridge' which features Boromir's return to the Fellowship.

In 'The Dream-Fridge', Aragorn's concerns about losing his Ranger skills are dealt with firmly by Legolas:

Halfway through Aragorn's confused and depressive rant, Legolas had climbed into the tree beside him and was patting him ineffectually on the shoulder. It was so much easier with Elves, they just sang for a while and forgot, but humans always seemed to brood, and brooding led to crying and someone, usually him, ending up with a damp shoulder. He decided this had to stop.

'Aragorn, stop being so silly. You haven't lost your Ranger skills, it's like riding a bike, you just have to practice. Now, we're going to go indoors, make a cup of tea and watch that documentary and then you're going to have an early night.'

Aragorn looked at his boots. 'Yes, Elrond.' There was a confused pause. 'Sorry, it's the autopilot.'⁸⁵⁹

Here, Lady Alyssa and Random Dent draw attention to the difference between humans and elves in dealing with their emotions. They set up archetypal traits for the elves in particular and then systematically subvert them by their characterisation of Legolas, Elrond, and his sons, Elladan and Elrohir, who are turned into 'surfer dudes'. It is suggested in *The Bagenders* that the Fellowship's general and amusing inability to take care of themselves is the main reason why Legolas makes all the decisions. As can be seen in the later episodes, Legolas organises Gandalf being put into a care home, the Fellowship moving to a new house and various festive gatherings. His frustration with the others is one of the

⁸⁵⁹ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: The Dream-Fridge*,

running themes of the series and this ties into the suggestion in the series that the Fellowship are more than just flatmates, but are actually a dysfunctional family. It is a family without an effective patriarch because neither Gandalf or Aragorn are characterised in this role. Gandalf is portrayed as a thinly veiled homage to Father Jack from *Father Ted*, and Aragorn's attempts at authority are constantly undermined by the hobbits, who are collectively portrayed as teenagers, for example: '[Legolas] turned round to see all 4 hobbits attempting to mosh whilst sitting down and bopping left and right to the music.'⁸⁶⁰ In 'And The Sign Said: Center Parcs', Legolas and Aragorn put Merry into a daytime children's play group: 'Someone was going to suffer for this. However, he was going to have to wash the face paints off first.'⁸⁶¹ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent take the opportunity to play with political correctness and familial relationships as the childminder struggles to identify the relationship between Aragorn, Legolas and Merry: "You were left here by your daddy, and, and," she sought desperately for a word to describe Legolas, and decided to go for the politically correct route, "his friend."

The quasi-familial relationships are further emphasised in 'Farewell To Sanity' where Pippin and Frodo claim to be Aragorn's sons.

Frodo did some quick thinking. He grabbed Pippin's hand and then tugged on Legolas' sleeve, looking up with an angelic expression. 'When is daddy coming home?' He and Pippin, who'd cottoned on to this, then looked at the nurse with the same expression. 'Why can't we see daddy?'

Pippin followed this up with, 'Is he going to die?'

⁸⁶⁰ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: A Shortcut to Whitby*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/story/ep4.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]

⁸⁶¹ Lady Alyssa and Random Dent, *The Bagenders: And the Sign Said: Center Parcs*. <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/story/ep9.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]

No human could withstand such an assault of calculated cuteness. She not only let them in, but gave Frodo and Pippin lollipops.

The Bagenders can be read as an example of how fan writers concentrate on the mythic aspects of a text which is analogous with their own life experience. Lady Alyssa and Random Dent wrote the series while university students and *The Bagenders* can be seen as an attempt to come to terms with the change in environment and emotional attachments as they moved from living and interacting with their families to building similar bonds with an 'artificial' or constructed 'family' of friends.

Writing in the Margins: Expanding the text of *The Lord of the Rings*

Henry Jenkins's book *Textual Poachers* was one of the first serious examinations of fandom and fannish methods of appropriation and consumption. While the book exhibits Jenkins's extensive knowledge of *Star Trek* fan culture over a number of years, published as it is in the early 1990s the book cannot be expected to account for the realities of fandom in the twenty-first century, nor indeed of the younger – and by now, larger – fandoms which have sprung up in the last ten years. The rational, organised and above all, adult activities that Jenkins analyses provide the interested reader with a map of organised fandom's early years but fail to predict the shifts in focus, the increasing legitimisation of fandom and the broad spectrum of ages that fandom attracts. What Jenkins has done, to the detriment of fandom, is to label the actions of fans definitively as 'poachers' and the negative connotations of poaching – being, for example, synonymous with stealing – have helped to shape critical approaches to fandom. Jenkins's term works as part of a new

discourse, the academic discourse which straddles two oscillating positions; 'the fan' and 'the academic'. This new position, occurring at a time when academic research is perceived as being more rigorously tied to institutional and publication constraints, has financial and professional implications and is subject to peer and management review and, over the last ten years in the United Kingdom, is subject to national departmental review in the Research Assessment Exercise (RAE). None of these are the case for the fanfiction writer. Jenkins noted that 'approaching popular culture as a fan gives me new insights into the media by releasing me from the narrowly circumscribed categories and assumptions of academic criticism and allowing me to play with textual materials'.⁸⁶² This is not to suggest a wholesale rejection of Jenkins's or Penley's work; the progression of fandom studies owes its existence to their original works and the significance of *NASA/Trek* and *Textual Poachers* should not be underestimated. But it is perhaps time to fully contextualise these works and to acknowledge that the specific moment and texts that they concentrated on has passed. Fandom must look beyond Jenkins and Penley and other 'big name' media scholars in order that the field progresses, rather than stagnates academically. Equally, evaluating fanfiction through a model of intertextuality and appropriation opens up the field beyond a reading of fanfiction through feminist or queer theory. As Craig Latrell suggests:

The act of borrowing itself (no matter who is doing it) is an essentially creative and artistic one, and one that deserves to be examined as an aesthetic phenomenon rather than simply as a demonstration of (or reaction to) political power.⁸⁶³

⁸⁶² Jenkins, *Textual Poachers*, p. 5

⁸⁶³ Craig Latrell, 'After Appropriation', *The Drama Review*, 44:4 (Winter, 2000), 44-55 (p. 47)

The point is that fan writings are not limited by the text; rather that the text provides multiple interpretations dependant solely on the imagination of the fan writer. Fan adaptations are therefore potentially more inventive and indicative of the socio-cultural climate – of gender and erotic trends in popular cultures or progressive thinking about gender definitions and limitations – than traditional accounts of fandom allow for. *Textual Poachers* suggests that fans are taking something from the media texts illegally, not appropriating something in the public sphere. Barthes argued that the ‘writer’s language is not expected to *represent* reality, but to signify it’ and the relationship between the text and the appropriating fanfiction writer can be characterised in the same way; the fanfiction writer is not representing the original text, but through the appropriation of characters, location or narrative, the text is being signified.⁸⁶⁴ In addition, the writers of fanfiction use the same appropriative devices as postmodern parody and medieval narratives, and fanfiction becomes a carrier of a myth form about the original text which, as

Barthes argues:

does not deny things, on the contrary, its function is to talk about them; simply, it purifies them, it makes them innocent, it gives them a natural and eternal justification, it gives them a clarity which is not that of an explanation but a statement of fact.⁸⁶⁵

The Lord of the Rings is a carrier for – among others – a set of myths about the British empire and imperial nationhood and identity. As in Haggard and Henty, the imperial is subsumed into the adventure; Tolkien’s appropriation of imperial adventure through the fantasy epic ‘gives in return [...] a *natural* image of this

⁸⁶⁴ Barthes, *Mythologies*, p. 137

⁸⁶⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 143

reality'.⁸⁶⁶ The appropriation of Tolkien by modern fantasy writers continues this naturalization of apparently antiquated myths of imperial nationhood and identity. Jackson's adaptations use the visual nature of film to create a New Zealand which is 'without depth, a world wide open and wallowing in the evident', a landscape without prior history or culture which can be appropriated without conflict into Middle-earth and remade.⁸⁶⁷ It is more complex with fanfiction; it is simultaneously a 'metalanguage which is trained to *celebrate* things, and no longer "act them"', but it takes the form of a pre-depoliticized and pre-denaturalised commentary which acts on the original text and frequently, this takes the form of expanding and identifying the spaces in the text – narrative, character-based or thematic.⁸⁶⁸

The spaces in *The Lord of the Rings* are archetypes of the fantasy epic. The domestic is quickly replaced by the unknown and the unsafe. Pippin's comment to Merry in Jackson's *The Two Towers*, 'It's too big for us,' can stand not just for the concepts of the battle being waged but also for the very nature of the battle.⁸⁶⁹ Hobbits, Pippin seems to be suggesting, are denizens of the domestic spaces, and this certainly seems to be where both Tolkien and Jackson position them. While there is certainly a great deal of 'quest-fic', one of the major subgenres of *The Lord of the Rings* fanfiction centres around the pre-quest play space of the hobbits in the domestic setting of the Shire, and Willow Wode's *Rites of Passage* and Baylor's *Handkerchiefs and Mushroom Soup* are both excellent examples of this.

⁸⁶⁶ Barthes, *Mythologies*, p. 142.

⁸⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 143

⁸⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 144

⁸⁶⁹ *The Two Towers*. EDV9188

Rites of Passage is an epic pre-quest family saga set in and around Brandy Hall, examining what fans of the series have termed the 'forging of the Ringbearer' and his complicated family ties, both canon and invented. Willow Wode successfully blends Tolkien's extended writing on the nature of hobbit society and family relations into a coming-of-age story which deals with the death of Frodo's parents, the hierarchical workings and the customs and traditions of hobbit society.⁸⁷⁰ Taking as her premise the idea that Frodo is unusual even by hobbit standards, Willow Wode weaves a story of a child growing up in isolation, coloured by the strange circumstances surrounding his birth and paternity and a source of mistrust for even his closest family members. The Frodo of *Rites of Passage* could be seen as the disenfranchised and powerless teenage boy of modern American cinema, traumatised by the death of his parents. It is not enough that Bilbo would leave the Ring to Frodo and that this act would set off the events of *The Lord of the Rings*; Willow Wode's narrative has Elladan and Elrohir inadvertently awakening and stimulating the psychic gift Frodo inherited from his Tookish mother as they try to prevent Frodo dying in utero. For Frodo, Willow Wode suggests, there are no safe spaces; even Bag End becomes the site of a second attack which leaves him in a coma. Frodo is not an every-man hero; he is 'special' and 'different' and it is his difference to normal Hobbit society which pre-emptes the narrative of *The Lord of the Rings*. Willow Wode's appropriation and rewriting of *The Lord of the Rings* not only creates and expands the narrative gap between *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings* but also writes over *The Lord of the Rings* with a more modern interpretation of the fantasy hero; Frodo of *Rites*

⁸⁷⁰ Willow Wode, *Rites of Passage*. <<http://willow-wode.net/AdultFanic/ROPMain.htm>> . [accessed 10 September 2007]

of Passage is far closer to Luke Skywalker, Harry Potter and Buffy than he is to Tolkien's Frodo. This does not, of course, invalidate either Willow Wode or Tolkien; there is room within *The Lord of the Rings* for the rebellious, misunderstood Frodo and the every-man hero.

Willow Wode posits the relationship between Frodo and Merry as close but complex and a source of tension between Frodo and Esmeralda, Merry's mother. As Frodo appears to lead Merry and later Pippin into not only mischief but serious danger, culminating in Pippin nearly drowning in the Brandywine, the conflict increases until Frodo is literally left defenceless against an attacker: the dark and potentially sinister side of Hobbit society revealed in *The Return of the King* 'The Scouring of the Shire' is elaborated and extended. This is in marked contrast to the free and easy relationships suggested by Baylor in *Handkerchiefs and Mushroom Soup*, where the representation of Hobbiton is possibly canonically closer to Tolkien but the problematic issues surrounding Saruman's exploitation of Hobbiton are never handled – Baylor's work moves straight from Minas Tirith to stories about Merry and Pippin's children.⁸⁷¹

Baylor's pre-quest stories centre on the relationship between Merry and Pippin rather than an individual character focus and exploration like Willow Wode. Baylor's interest is not Merry *or* Pippin but rather the ways in which their lives are interwoven and how this affects their later actions. She portrays them as being closer than brothers or best friends; she sees their relationship as soul mates without the romantic connotations, but her strength lies in the fact that she can do this without excessive sentimentality. Despite the fact that both writers are drawing

⁸⁷¹ Baylor, *Handkerchiefs and Mushroom Soup*
<<http://home.comcast.net/~baylorsr/handkerchiefs.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]

on the same source material and maintain book canon rather than film canon, there is a distinctive difference in the way they approach the text which is not to do with the fact that *Rites of Passage* is slash and *Handkerchiefs and Mushroom Soup* is classified as general or 'gen' fiction or non-pairing orientated. Willow Wode's interpretation of the Shire is one of danger for the young Frodo, threatened on all sides and unable to trust anyone. Although this seems to bear little resemblance to the Shire as portrayed in *The Hobbit* or the beginning of *The Fellowship of the Ring*, it is perfectly in keeping with the Shire of the end of *The Return of the King* and under threat from Nazgûl after Bilbo leaves. Willow Wode keeps the action in the domestic setting of Brandy Hall but stresses the perils within the domestic sphere.

Baylor, on the other hand, despite the various adolescent trials and tribulations suffered by Frodo, Merry and Pippin in her pre-quest stories, clearly sees the Shire as a place of safety. Her post-quest saga *The High King's Falcon* is far darker and more desperate in theme. The domestic space is being reworked into a place of peril and the apparently safe post-textual ending space is fraught with unforeseen dangers as Pippin lies in a fever on the field of battle outside the Black Gate. 'The Black Gate Opens' ends with Pippin stabbing a troll and being crushed under the troll's body: 'Blackness and stench and crushing pain came upon Pippin, and his mind fell away into a great darkness'.⁸⁷² He just manages to be aware that the Eagles have arrived and to wish Merry 'an easier end'⁸⁷³ before 'his thought fled far away and his eyes saw no more'.⁸⁷⁴ It is not until 'The Field of Cormallen' that Pippin reappears, healed and whole, 'clad in the silver and sable of the Guards

⁸⁷² *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 892

⁸⁷³ *Ibid.*

⁸⁷⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 893

of Minas Tirith', over fifty pages later.⁸⁷⁵ Of Pippin's fate on the battlefield – and of Merry at Minas Tirith and Legolas and Gimli on the Field of Cormallen – Tolkien offers very few clues. Gandalf urges the hobbits to rest: 'you went to the very brink of death ere he recalled you, putting forth all his power', and Gimli adds:⁸⁷⁶

'And not only Sam and Frodo here,' said Gimli, 'but you too, Pippin. I love you, if only because of the pains you have cost me, which I shall never forget. Nor shall I forget finding you on the hill of the last battle. But for Gimli the Dwarf you would have been lost then.'⁸⁷⁷

Fate and the High King's Falcon takes place between the end of 'The Black Gate Opens' and the hobbits reuniting in 'The Field of Cormallen', beginning with Gimli finding Pippin on the battlefield:

The dwarf's roar of anguish rushed over the battlefield, and Legolas nearly dropped the end of the litter he was carrying. He knew that sound of uttermost grief - he had heard it once before, at the discovery of Balin's tomb. It was a dwarf's cry of mourning, of sorrow at the loss of a loved one, close as kin, and it could mean only one thing - their long hours of searching were over, and Pippin was dead.⁸⁷⁸

Baylor references the last few lines of 'The Black Gate Opens' in order to make sure that the reader is aware not only *where* inside *The Lord of the Rings* her story takes place but also *when* as she gives a date and year reference – 'Day Two of the New Year (March 26 SR)' – which adds to the sense of authenticity and scholarship which characterises her writing.⁸⁷⁹

⁸⁷⁵ *The Lord of the Rings*, p. 955

⁸⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 956

⁸⁷⁷ *Ibid.*

⁸⁷⁸ Baylor, 'Cool Sunlight and Green Grass', *Fate and the High King's Falcon*. <http://menneth-annun.net/stories/chapter_view.cfm?stid=1811&SPOrdinal=1> [accessed 20 January 2004]

⁸⁷⁹ *Ibid.*

A Textbook Case: Using *The Lord of the Rings* as an Intertextual Handbook

Fiske's theory of intertextuality suggests that any one text is read in relationship to others and that a range of textual knowledge is brought to bear on it.⁸⁸⁰ Media texts exploit this by embedding links and visual links to previous texts. This puts the viewer in a privileged position for being able to decode the reference and the text's various meanings. For example, Legolas's stunt with the Oliphant in the film *The Return of the King* is a direct reference to a similar stunt by Luke Skywalker on an AT-AT in *The Empire Strikes Back*.⁸⁸¹ The film *Shrek 2* used a similar 'ring' montage as the one in *The Fellowship of the Ring*.⁸⁸² Embedding these references in the text enables the producer/creator to add another level of meaning to the text which can strengthen its validity by intertextual reference to real world or popular culture events (such as references to the *Harry Potter* books in *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*) or by gaining authority by linking to an older and more established text, for example the Orc-like vampires in the final series of *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*.⁸⁸³ Whedon has noted on several occasions that the genesis for the series came from teen slasher films where the pretty blond is usually killed by the monster; in *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* he attempts to redress the balance. This appropriation and rewriting of a cultural stereotype is no less significant than Jean Rhys's appropriation and rewriting of Brontë's *Jane Eyre* in *Wide Sargasso Sea* and

⁸⁸⁰ John Fiske and John Hartley, *Reading Television* (London: Methuen, 1978), p. 88

⁸⁸¹ *Star Wars: Episode V – The Empire Strikes Back*. Dir. Irvin Kershner. Lucasfilm. 1980

⁸⁸² *Shrek 2*. Dir. Andrew Adamson. Dreamworks. 2004.

⁸⁸³ *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* 5:02 'Real Me'. Dir. David Grossman. 20th Century Fox. 2000. The appropriative nature of *Buffy the Vampire Slayer* is far too extensive to go into in great detail here.

potentially as important a contributor to the debate about conceptions of post-
(modern, colonial) feminism.⁸⁸⁴

Deliberately signalled intertextuality — as is often displayed in parody —
directs the reader beyond the borders of the text to see what else is there and where
it came from. Indeed, Hutcheon contends that:

the notion of parody as opening the text up, rather than closing it down, is
an important one: among the many things that postmodern intertextuality
challenges are both closure and single, centralized meaning. Its willed and
wilful provisionality rests largely upon its acceptance of the inevitable
textual infiltration of prior discursive practices.⁸⁸⁵

The relocation of emphasis from the author-text relationship to the reader-text
relationship in textual meaning formation by Barthes, Foucault and Kristeva —
among others — and the acknowledgement of the situating of ‘the locus of textual
meaning within the history of discourse’⁸⁸⁶ suggests that the appropriative and
intertextual elements of fanfiction should be considered as precisely the kind of
expansion of fiction that Hutcheon argues is indicative of ‘the formal linking of the
common denominators of intertextuality and narrativity’.⁸⁸⁷ Increasingly, this is a
technique employed by producers through extra-textual spin-off novels and series;
exclusive behind-the-scenes footage and deleted scenes on ‘special edition’
versions; and official forums for fanfiction and fan work. Will Brooker comments
that:

It might not be going too far to say that the fan mode, the interactive
engagement with the text, may be becoming the norm for home viewing
and also that films may be made for this type of viewing now more than

⁸⁸⁴ See for example, Arwen Spicer “‘It’s Bloody Brilliant!’ The Undermining of Meta Narrative
Feminism in the Season Seven Arc of *Buffy*’ in *Slayage* 15 (2004)

<<http://slayageonline.com/essays/slayage15/Spicer.htm>> [accessed 6 January 2008]

⁸⁸⁵ Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism*, p. 127

⁸⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 126

⁸⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 129

they are for cinema - or, in the case of Star Wars, tweaked for DVD after their theatrical release.⁸⁸⁸

Brooker suggests that the level of detail on DVD versions of cinematic texts will draw 'non-fans' into a similar level of analysis and attention minutia which had hitherto been the preserve of the fan:

this tendency to watch scenes repeatedly and in detail, with a painstaking attention to mise-en-scène and camerawork, is encouraged and enabled by DVD to the extent that I think it will no longer be appropriate to call it "fan practice" because it will be more widespread [...] The "casual" viewer, the "nonfan," is drawn or at least invited into this precise mode of viewing, this double-checking, careful examination that would previously, I think, have been the preserve of more dedicated fans.⁸⁸⁹

The detailed examination of the text which precipitates the multiple interpretations which inspire fanfiction may now belong to the wider audience rather than just those dedicated fans. The border between 'fan' and 'non-fan' is becoming blurred and indistinct. Indeed, in some cases the official extra-textual construction is manipulated by the creators to appear like a fan production. An excellent example of this is *Doctor Who*, which returned in 2005 with two distinct websites: the official BBC hosted site, and the whoisdoctorwho.co.uk website, which is clearly modelled on fan-run websites and features in *Doctor Who* as run by first Clive and then Mickey. The only way to distinguish it from a particularly sophisticated fan production is a small disclaimer which affirms that the team behind it are the BBC Doctor Who web team.⁸⁹⁰

The term 'extra-textual' can be used to describe all discourse and creative works around a text: this would include official and fan websites, spin-off media,

⁸⁸⁸ Derek Johnson, 'Star Wars Fans, DVD, and Cultural Ownership: An Interview with Will Brooker', *The Velvet Light Trap*, 56:1 (2005), 36-44 (p. 39)

⁸⁸⁹ Johnson, p. 39

⁸⁹⁰ *Doctor Who*. Dir. Russell T. Davies. BBC. 2005.

message boards, critical works and fanfiction. Within this 'extra-textual' world, the appropriation of the original text through new interpretations and new creative texts as fanfiction – which may develop their own spin-off media and critical works – is only a small part of a greater cultural intertextuality. In one sense, the literary quality of fanfiction is irrelevant – although a minority in any fandom may be of higher quality writing than the original text – as it is how the fanfiction writers are appropriating the original text and why they have chosen to appropriate it which is of greater importance. Fanfiction sits, uncomfortably, with parody, pastiche and plagiarism in the critical world: fanfiction does appropriate and reformulate: 'with significant change – the dominant white, male, middle-class, heterosexual, Eurocentric culture. It does not reject it, for it cannot. Postmodernism signals its dependence by its *use* of canon, but reveals its rebellion through its ironic *abuse* of it'.⁸⁹¹

Appropriation is potentially a far more acceptable term to the people who are engaging in these practices than 'textual poaching', as it is far less contentious and more accurately explains the processes involved, and places fan appropriations alongside 'legitimate' appropriations in literature, film and history. Baylor, in *The Care and Feeding of Hobbits* - which has the sub-title 'Ruminations on the Little People by Boromir, Man of Gondor' - uses the events of the last chapters of *The Fellowship of the Ring* to go beyond the text and develop the characters further to understand how the Boromir of 'The Council of Elrond' who was suspicious of both the hobbits and the quest, became the man who could both try to take the Ring from Frodo and sacrifice himself for Merry and Pippin in the first chapter of

⁸⁹¹ Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism*, p. 130

The Two Towers.⁸⁹² Tolkien's Boromir is a man who has a strong sense of duty – it is through his allegiance to Gondor that he falls – and the desperation born through living in a nation at war and besieged by the enemy. Duty and patriotism are less accessible to the modern audience – self-preservation and bonds to family and friends are more accessible and more easily understood. Baylor also bridges the gap between Jackson's adaptations and the books, retaining the formal quality of the interactions and the language of the books but allowing for the playfulness and informality of the films.

In 'Lesson Seven: Guiding Your Hobbit Over Difficult Terrain', Baylor takes an offhand two sentence description of Pippin being unwilling to jump over a particularly big gap in the path in Moria and uses it as a jumping-off point for a detailed snapshot of the Fellowship.⁸⁹³ She weaves into it subtle references as to what will come later, for example Pippin's expression is likened to that 'seen on the faces of young men heading into battle'.⁸⁹⁴ Here is both intertextuality and extra-textuality in action. The fanfiction reader will be familiar with the films at least and probably the books as well, and will recognise a reference to Pippin going into battle before the Black Gate. So too do the hobbits themselves suggest the young men who left their homes to go to war in the First and Second World Wars in the original text, but the film adaptations *also* drew unintentional parallels with the conflict in Iraq. Hitler and the Nazis are still coded as an ultimate evil, but allusions to Iraq are far more problematic within modern fandoms given the

⁸⁹² Baylor, *Handkerchiefs and Mushroom Soup*.
<<http://home.comcast.net/~baylorsr/handkerchiefs.html>>
[accessed 10 September 2007]

⁸⁹³ Baylor, 'Lesson Seven: Guiding Your Hobbit Over Difficult Terrain', *The Care and Feeding of Hobbits*, <<http://www.geocities.com/baylorsr/lessonseven.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]

⁸⁹⁴ *Ibid.*

current political climate. Clearly Baylor is accessing several different levels of meaning whether consciously or unconsciously. When Boromir catches Pippin who is about to fall, he finds he cannot 'let go at this moment should we be attacked by all the legions of Moria', and this links to one of the more enduring images from Jackson's *The Fellowship of the Ring*, where Boromir catches hold of Frodo and carries him out of Moria while the orcs attack.⁸⁹⁵ This image, which immediately follows the fall of Gandalf, is one of the most affecting in the film and instantly recognisable both for its symbolic and literal meanings. Merry reassuring himself that Pippin is alive also has links later both in the original text and in Baylor's later fanfiction where Merry's reassurance is not only harkening his arrival at Minas Tirith but also an expanded pre-quest story where Pippin comes perilously close to death several times in his childhood. Baylor has neatly placed her fanfiction within the expanded boundaries of the text; she has successfully made room for her stories within the text itself.

Conclusion

What Kennedy termed a 'metascript' or a comprehending process for connecting otherwise incomprehensible texts can be adapted to describe the internalisation of the mythic narrative through continual cultural appropriation of such texts.⁸⁹⁶ As long as a text is capable of engaging with viewers or readers to the point at which the narrative is internalised to the stage where the viewer or reader makes an explicit association between the narrative and his or her own life – however unconsciously or incompletely – the cultural transmission of the text will continue.

⁸⁹⁵ Baylor, 'Lesson Seven',

⁸⁹⁶ Alan Kennedy, *The Psychology of Reading* (London: Methuen, 1984), p. 105

What fanfiction illustrates is not how myths are consciously appropriated but how 'myths operate in men's minds'.⁸⁹⁷ Once the mythic narrative fails to engage with the audience, the mythic structure is not internalised and the mythic narrative as a form of delivery of the 'truth' or 'experience' ceases to be used and 'dies'. Just as some post-colonial and feminist writers appropriate and rework dominant texts in order to fashion new texts which reflect and reveal the constructed nature of myths such as 'place', 'nation' and 'culture', so too do the predominantly female writers of fanfiction appropriate and deconstruct culturally dominant and influential texts, and by rewriting and reinterpreting them simultaneously reaffirm their cultural importance and reveal the fragility of the concept of a single interpretation of such texts. What the internet and internet fandom has enabled is a realisation of Foucault's dream of a:

form of culture in which fiction would not be limited by the figure of the author. It would be pure romanticism, however, to imagine a culture in which the fictive world would operate in an absolutely free state, in which fiction would be put at the disposal of everyone and would develop without passing through something like a necessary or constraining figure [...] All discourses, whatever their status, form, value, and whatever the treatment to which they will be subjected would then develop in the anonymity of a murmur [...] What difference does it make who is speaking?⁸⁹⁸

Fanfiction writers are reclaiming and rewriting social and 'play' spaces through the appropriation of such dominant cultural texts. Just as the embedding of imperial adventure literature myths within *The Lord of the Rings* has succeeded in helping to keep such tropes within modern literature, and Jackson's film adaptations have similarly redrawn New Zealand's myth of national identity by iconically linking Middle-earth to the landscape of New Zealand, so do fanfiction

⁸⁹⁷ Levi-Strauss cited in David McLellan, *Ideology* (Buckingham: Open University Press, 1996)

⁸⁹⁸ Foucault, 'What Is An Author?' p. 22

writers sustain Tolkien's themes and characters by consistently rewriting – and through this rewriting, reaffirming the cultural value of the narrative – *The Lord of the Rings*. Fanfiction is beginning to take the place of folk narratives 'as personal entertainment, as engaging fictions reflecting our ability to laugh at ourselves as well as to express our deepest dreams and fears.'⁸⁹⁹ Lucie Armitt suggests that the many rewritings of *The Lord of the Rings* are generated because of its continued applicability:

One of the reasons *Lord of the Rings* allows for such reinterpretations is that its vast cartographic canvas (another version of elongation) opens across epic space in the same way *Star Wars* opens across outer space, or Arthur opens across time. Like Arthurian tales, it is specific enough in its version of heroism, comradeship, and corruption to mirror the world we know, while being general enough for us to flesh out the detail with the vision of monstrosity most pertinent at the time.⁹⁰⁰

Although it is the modern basis for fandom and fanfiction criticism, *Textual Poachers* has been understood as providing a unified theory of fandom when Jenkins characterised it as simply 'an account of a specific set of sub-cultural practices that straddle multiple texts.'⁹⁰¹ Further studies of fandom and mythic narratives must take into account anthropological investigations into the beginnings of culture as well as audience reception theory to analyse not only how fans conceive and think about fandom and fanfiction but also how it is characterised and described by the academic community. If the barrier between author and reader/producer is being deconstructed by the internet and fanfiction writers then:

it ought to be possible to support this claim solely by observable contemporary social phenomena and without the unreliable testimony of

⁸⁹⁹ Steven Swann Jones, p. 9

⁹⁰⁰ Armitt, p. 10

⁹⁰¹ Jenkins, 'Intensities'

the poststructuralists, whose arguments are about written discourse in general and not about certain specific technologies hardly known at their time.⁹⁰²

Theories of reading and language perception as well as developmental psychology and educational theories will also be useful to construct an over-view of the psychological, literary and cultural processes involved in the reception and retention of mythic texts. The rewriting of core mythic narratives is not a fandom phenomenon, nor is it merely contained to the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, and may have significant implications for the way we, as a species, approach not only language and history, but also the way we perceive the world around us. Fanfiction and fanfiction writers are not a recently developed media fan sub-set but are employing techniques and skills which are not only thousands of years old, but by their longevity and rate of recurrence across cultures and nations, seem an essential part of our mental organisation and understanding of the world. George Aichele defines reading as 'an endless and violent playing with the text, and the reader is in a perpetual struggle with the law of the text', and this definition works equally well for the process of writing fan fiction.⁹⁰³ Fanfiction may yet be interpreted as a textual version of reading.

⁹⁰² Aarseth, p. 165

⁹⁰³ George Aichele, 'Reading Beyond Meaning', *Postmodern Culture*, 3:3 (1993), [accessed 5 January 2008]

Conclusion

There and Back Again

Conclusion: There and Back Again

What I have hoped to demonstrate in this thesis is the essential nature of appropriation and how it has formed a strategic and integral part of one of the most popular texts of the twentieth century. I have used a model for appropriation which is similar to set theory, where many different subsets of appropriation such as parody and adaptation occupy discrete spaces which in some cases – parody and satire, for example – may have overlapping elements. This concept of the overlapping spaces inside appropriation links the oscillating position occupied by Peter Jackson as neo- and post-colonial filmmaker and the space that fanfiction writers create around and inside the texts they appropriate. In drawing out the connections between Tolkien and empire adventure writers, an important link is made from modern fantasy to imperial ideology. By deliberately using a broad range of sources and critical works when considering Peter Jackson's use of landscape in *The Lord of the Rings* films, I hope to have offered a more cohesive and in-depth analysis which will work as a sound framework for further work in this neglected field.

Tolkien was very much a writer of his time and clearly drew on the imperial adventure narratives which he is likely to have read as a schoolboy. He comments in the footnote to a letter that:

the episode of "the wargs" (I believe) is in part derived from a scene in S. R. Crockett's *The Black Douglas*, probably his best romance and anyway one that deeply impressed me in school-days, though I have never looked at it again.⁹⁰⁴

⁹⁰⁴ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 391

In addition, there are a small number of critics – Jared Lobdell, Dale Nelson and William H. Green for example – who draw attention to Tolkien's thematic appropriations of Rider Haggard in an attempt to widen the field of Tolkien scholarship beyond the conventional elucidation of the impact of Tolkien's academic scholarship and interests on *The Lord of the Rings*.

Imperial ideology is very much a sub-textual theme in *The Lord of the Rings* and this is independent of Tolkien's own political views because of the time in which he was writing and the texts upon which he drew. Elizabeth Massa Hoiem argues that Tolkien's work 'offers sophisticated criticism of British imperialism even as it makes use of the colonial rhetoric that saturated the literature of its time.'⁹⁰⁵ Fantasy imperialist writing did not begin with G.A. Henty, Rider Haggard and their contemporaries. It was present as a vital issue in the earlier narratives which Tolkien would have been familiar with because of his academic and professional works. The concealment of the hero's motivations and identity is entirely typical of an adventure story of its time. Even the conception of the heroic fantasy hero and his relationship to his environment owes more to Tolkien's appropriation of imperial protagonists than to medieval knights. The (re)presentation of masculinity in Tolkien is drawn from imperial adventure literature and this codified masculinity is still present in popular culture through repetition and rehearsal in both fantasy literature and film across many genres from adventure to action. I hope that this thesis has significantly contributed to the investigation of Tolkien's appropriations of imperial literature.

⁹⁰⁵ Hoiem, p. 76

This was not intended to accuse Tolkien of plagiarism or to denigrate his originality, but to illustrate how a model of appropriation which is based on intertextuality works within texts. It also enables, as William N. Rogers II and Michael R. Underwood acknowledge, a investigation into 'how a source influences a writer's imagination and how that source finds a congruent place in the particular cultural and ideological meanings of the "borrowing."' ⁹⁰⁶ While Tolkien's appropriations of northern European myths and medieval literatures has been extensively investigated, there are comparatively few studies of his appropriation of more contemporary texts. To continue this area of research is essential to the exploration of post-Tolkien fantasy literature in order to elucidate those elements of the genre which have been considered archetypes without extensive scholarship. Some of these archetypal elements of fantasy may reveal themselves to be influenced strongly by empire adventure narratives mediated through *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*, thus helping to sustain imperial motifs in an apparently post-colonial society. The close analysis of the magic armour in Haggard's *King Solomon's Mines* and *The Fellowship of the Ring* adds to the small body of critical work which has investigated Tolkien's links to Haggard.

It is important for critical work on *The Lord of the Rings* to acknowledge that the adventure aspects of the text – although perhaps indicative of its relationship to empire adventure narratives – were considered an essential part of the text by Tolkien: 'most people that have enjoyed *The Lord of the Rings* have been affected primarily by it as an exciting story: and that is how it was written.' ⁹⁰⁷

The relationship between the landscape in Haggard's *She* and *The Lord of the*

⁹⁰⁶ Rogers and Underwood, p. 122

⁹⁰⁷ *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 212

Rings can be considered more evidence of the links between Tolkien and the earlier adventure writers which have not been fully elucidated before. So too, Tolkien's conception of masculinity owes a great deal to contemporary representations of men which, themselves, were constructed from imperial demands. Although Tolkien's representation of women can be argued to be stylistically close to that of empire adventure writers – again, Tolkien's debt to Haggard is particularly evident – there is more evidence of a progressive representation of women than many critics – Catherine Stimpson, for example, – have given him credit for. Jackson's films, with the extended role for Arwen, are consistent with models of active femininity that appear in Tolkien's later work *The Silmarillion*. Jackson's apparent infidelity to the word of the text has led to a greater fidelity to Tolkien's ethos.

Perhaps Tolkien's greatest achievement – and the one which sets him apart from C.S. Lewis and Lewis Carroll – has been to recognise that fantasy, as a distinct genre, is not the sole realm of juvenile or adolescent literature. *The Lord of the Rings* has allowed for a new legitimisation of the genre that has, at times, led to a practical canonisation of Tolkien and a rejection of the writers who followed him. It has also enabled a reclaiming of mythic forms and narratives – exemplified in Neil Gaiman's *American Gods*.⁹⁰⁸ It is highly appropriate that this recognition of the importance of fantasy may well be Jackson's greatest accomplishment also. Kristin Thompson notes that 'for years, fantasy films have, not without reason, been the butt of jokes', and while Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* may well have stimulated a new wave of clichéd fantasy film, it has also demonstrated beyond a

⁹⁰⁸ Neil Gaiman, *American Gods* (London, Harper-Collins, 2002)

doubt that fantasy can be as serious and important as any other film genre. For an excellent example of hackneyed fantasy film – and superb appropriation of Jackson's 'Lothlorien' sequence - see *Dungeons and Dragons*.⁹⁰⁹ The more recent film *Eragon* manages to reaffirm almost all the clichés that Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* avoids, complete with one of the most confused landscapes in fantasy cinema.⁹¹⁰ Even the Escher-inspired *Labyrinth* shows a more coherent approach to landscape.⁹¹¹ At the 2004 Academy Awards Jackson's *The Return of the King* was awarded eleven Academy Awards including Best Director and Best Picture; the fantasy films of George Lucas, Steven Spielberg and Ridley Scott are ephemeral by comparison. This must be in part because of the resolutely adult handling of the original material. *The Lord of the Rings* films, which in time are likely to be at least as influential as *Star Wars*, competing against the first, second and third *Harry Potter* films, successfully demonstrated not only the importance of fantasy to an adult audience but the continued relevance of J.R.R. Tolkien's finest work.

While neither box office success nor awards have always been an indication of the quality and lasting popularity of films, Laurence Simmons suggests that 'given its commercial success, it could be argued that Jackson's work is crucially important for understanding what factors might shape the "author" of a film and national cinema in general.'⁹¹² Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* has enabled the articulation of a discourse about the dialectic between post- and neo-colonial positions for film. Interestingly, Simmons also suggests that 'Jackson's *Lord of the Rings* film trilogy might be read as a (local) adaptation of the genre of

⁹⁰⁹ *Dungeons and Dragons*. Dir. Courtney Solomon. New Line Cinema. 2000.

⁹¹⁰ *Eragon*. Dir. Stefen Fangmeier. Twentieth Century-Fox Film Corporation. 2006

⁹¹¹ *Labyrinth*. Dir. Jim Henson, TriStar Pictures (1986)

⁹¹² Simmons, p. 226

the fantastic.'⁹¹³ The implication that Tolkien's novel is global and Jackson's films are local is a subtle distinction, but one which is significant for discourses surrounding New Zealand's national identity. Ian Conrich points out that:

Following the success of *The Lord of the Rings*, New Zealand, with its myth of a pastoral paradise, has been compared repeatedly with the idyllic rural culture of the hobbits in Middle Earth, despite the fact that Tolkien's story is based on the English shire. The production's celebration of resourceful New Zealand industry, with defined local craft and efficient service industries, has even drawn comparisons between New Zealanders and hobbits. Certainly the myths of New Zealand identity are foregrounded and enhanced in the marketing and publicity surrounding *The Lord of the Rings*, to the point where there is almost an obsessive 'belief' in New Zealand being Middle Earth.⁹¹⁴

This is not without its complications, however. New Zealand's association with *The Lord of the Rings* now makes it problematic to use the landscape as the backdrop for other epic films; one of the more constant criticisms of *The Lion, the Witch and the Wardrobe* was how much it resembled *The Lord the Rings*. There are many thematic links to be made between C.S. Lewis's *Narnia* and Tolkien's Middle-earth, but this serves to illustrate how New Zealand is as familiar and important a part of the films as the actors. Jackson used the colonial gaze on the landscape of New Zealand to (re)make it as Middle-earth and (re)colonise it. 'Imperialism produces a fictional reality as it creates borders by drawing maps, creates countries by assigning names, creates identities with descriptive travel accounts', and much the same might be said of appropriation.⁹¹⁵ Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* films work to illuminate a contemporary 'articulation of power,

⁹¹³ Simmons, p. 226

⁹¹⁴ Conrich, p. 132

⁹¹⁵ Hoicm, p. 84

possession and imperialism, interpreting them as allegories of the state of power relations understood by their makers'.⁹¹⁶

Through close analysis of the use of landscape in each of the three films and an investigation into those factors which are likely to affect the reception and presentation of the New Zealand landscape, the unstable nature of the concept 'post-colonial' as it relates to members of former white settler colonies has been interrogated. Although the film landscape has been analysed in response to specific genres – such as film noir and the western, for example – little interdisciplinary research has yet been conducted in the area. This seems to be a critical area, as the apparent adoption by Western filmmakers of what is originally a colonial form of viewing the landscape has led to post-colonial representations of landscape in film to have a curious colonial dualism. This further complicates the accepted colonial/post-colonial binary in current criticism.

My approach to fanfiction is not, as those of Jenkins and Penley are, to do with ethnographic research from media studies or gender studies base. Nor have I solely evaluated fanfiction as a distinct literary genre as Sheenaugh Pugh does in *The Democratic Genre*. My rejection of these approaches does not indicate that all work on fandom follows an anthropological or strictly literary approach to fanfiction studies. Susan Booker, for example, does not attempt to categorise fanfiction either sociologically or as a literary genre, simply stating that it 'is what it is,'⁹¹⁷ but she does go on to argue that: 'Fan fiction authors are taking Tolkien's stories and back stories, or Jackson's slightly reworked characters, a little further in the timeless storytelling model, sharing this progress via countless Internet fan

⁹¹⁶ Ian Christie, 'Landscape and 'Location': Reading Filmic Space Historically', *Rethinking History*, 4:2 (2000), pp. 165–174 (p. 172)

⁹¹⁷ Susan Booker, p. 265

fiction sites.’⁹¹⁸ Rather, I am interested in the multiple relationships between fanfiction and its inspiring narrative or narratives, and how fanfiction writers are using ancient models of cultural processing – appropriation – to rework and respond to modern cultural artefacts or texts.

The appropriation and subsequent remaking of cultural products is not a fandom phenomenon, nor is it merely contained to the twentieth and twenty-first centuries; as Craig Latrell points out, ‘the phenomenon of borrowing itself is at the root of artistic change and growth.’⁹¹⁹ It may also have significant implications for the way we, as a species, approach not only language and history, but also the way we perceive the world around us. Fanfiction and fanfiction writers are not a recently developed media fan sub-set, but are employing techniques and skills which are at least as old as written language. More than this, appropriation is not a literary or cinematic practice that happens in isolation; it is a vital part of the postmodern world. Andrew S. Jacobs refers to a ‘continuous process of appropriation’ and this is exactly what can be seen throughout modern culture.⁹²⁰

Narratives are in a constant state of (re)creation and, as Barthes argued:

a text is made of multiple writings, drawn from many cultures and entering into mutual relations of dialogue, parody, contestation, but there is one place where this multiplicity is focused and that place is the reader, not, as was hitherto said, the author. The reader is the space on which all the quotations that make up a writing are inscribed without any of them being lost; a text’s unity lies not in its origin but in its destination.⁹²¹

⁹¹⁸ Susan Booker, p. 266

⁹¹⁹ Latrell, p. 49

⁹²⁰ Andrew S. Jacobs, ‘The Remains of the Jew: Imperial Christian Identity in the Late Ancient Holy Land’, *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 33.1 (2003), 23–45 (p. 36). Jacob’s subject is the cultural ‘colonising’ of Jerusalem by early Christians but his point about continuous appropriation is well made and widely applicable.

⁹²¹ Barthes, ‘The Death of the Author’, p. 7

The point about appropriation is that the constant rewriting and reinvention of core narratives means that there is never a 'post-narrative' state. While writers and filmmakers continue to draw on fairy stories, for example, we can never enter a 'post-fairy story' state. The same is true of narratives such as *The Lord of the Rings*. In the year 2008, we are, obviously, post-Tolkien's original publication of *The Lord of the Rings* and equally post-Jackson's film adaptations being released at the cinema, but while Tolkienian and Jacksonian appropriations continue to flourish and develop, it is difficult to argue convincingly for a post-*The Lord of the Rings* condition. Fanfiction is often characterised as keeping narratives popular or sustaining interest in them, but it is the wider literary world which has helped to maintain *The Lord of the Rings* as a framework for future narratives. It rests, not always easily, as the bedrock for modern understandings of the genre.

It is perhaps most accurate to suggest that it is too soon to fully quantify the influence of *The Lord of the Rings* on western literature. Appropriations of Tolkien throughout the genre of fantasy fiction can be seen, for example in the great battle sequences of David Eddings's *Enchanter's End Game*, where Princess Ce'Nedra leads the forces of the West to war as a diversion to allow Garion (the hero), Belgarath (the wizard) and Silk (the guide) to slip past unnoticed into the territory of the enemy. Tolkienian appropriations feature in the poetry which underpins the violent and bloody course of Lorn in L.E. Modesitt Jr's *Magi't of Cyador* and *Scion of Cyador*:

Like a dusk without a cloud,
a leaf without a tree...
... to hold the sun-hazed days,
and wait for pears and praise

... and wait for pears and praise.⁹²²

It is echoed in the prophetic poetry of the *Servants of Ark* trilogy by Jonathan Wylie – ‘A child, mage-born, and marked for flight,’⁹²³ – and the simple verses which hide a powerful secret in Diana Wynne Jones’s *Deep Secret*: ‘Babylon is one of the deep secrets of the Magrids. But it was, for this reason, also a nursery rhyme’.⁹²⁴ The impact of Tolkien’s vision of Middle-earth is reworked in the stunningly realised world of Jacqueline Grey’s *Kushiel’s Dart* and Ursula K. Le Guin’s varied archipelago in the *Earthsea* novels. Or, more simply, appropriations of Tolkien take their form in plot, form or thematic appropriations.

The astonishing proliferation of Tolkienian appropriations extends beyond literature, film or the visual arts. The UK Climbing database, for example, records climbs called Gollum, Gandalf, Beorn and Mordor on the Dinas Mot cliff in Gwynedd.⁹²⁵ Kristen Larsen describes many examples of scientists using names from Tolkien’s works to identify new species:

Not surprisingly, scientists from such varied disciplines as paleontology and astronomy began honoring their favorite author through the naming of discoveries after Tolkien himself and various characters of Middle-earth. Nowhere has this been more evident and widespread than in the taxonomy of living and extinct species.⁹²⁶

Larsen concludes that: ‘From spectrographs to sea slugs, sunspots to spiders, scientists from varied disciplines have, in their own small way, gladly taken

⁹²² L.E. Modesitt Jr, *Scion of Cyador* (London: Orbit, 2002), p. 35

⁹²³ Jonathan Wylie, *Servants of Ark: The Mage-Born Child* (London: Corgi Books, 1989), p. 344

⁹²⁴ Diana Wynne Jones, *Deep Secret*, p. 49

⁹²⁵ UK Climbing Database. <<http://www.ukclimbing.com/logbook/showcrag.html?climb2=699>> [accessed 21 February 2008]. At least two of these names predate the films by some thirty years. They were new climbing routes in the Llanberis Pass on Dinas Mot in the 1960s when my father regularly climbed in North Wales.

⁹²⁶ Kristine Larsen, ‘Sauron, Mount Doom, and Elvish Moths: The Influence of Tolkien on Modern Science’, *Tolkien Studies* 4 (2007), 223-234 (p. 223), <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/tolkien_studies/v00-4/4.larsen.html> [accessed 4 January 2008]

ownership of Middle-earth and brought it a little closer to reality.’⁹²⁷ This was brought to widespread global attention in 2004 when archaeologists discovered remains of what seemed to be a new species of hominid which was only three foot tall – Homo Floresiensis – on the Indonesian island of Flores and dubbed them ‘hobbits’.⁹²⁸ It is clear that while examinations of Tolkienian appropriations have concentrated on literature and film, the impact of his work stretches far beyond the genre and into common cultural ownership where Tolkien’s minute details of the flora and fauna of Middle-earth are being constantly evoked and reworked.

Tolkien disliked the pejorative amalgamation of fantasy literature with escapist literature, not least because of the philological inaccuracy involved. He believed that narratives which provided an honourable escape should be celebrated rather than condemned for an apparent alliance with idle day-dreams:

But there are also other and more profound “escapisms” that have appeared in fairy-tale and legend. There are other things more grim and terrible to fly from than the noise, stench, ruthlessness, and extravagance of the internal-combustion engine. There are hunger, thirst, poverty, pain, sorrow, injustice, death.⁹²⁹

Northrup draws attention to the etymology of the word ‘escape’ which Tolkien uses extensively in his critical writings to describe fairy-stories, noting that it derives from both the Latin ‘*excappāre*’ and the Greek ‘*εκδύεσθαι*’ which both have connotations of removing clothes.⁹³⁰ Although Northrup concludes that ‘escape’ used in conjunction with fantasy is not a literal escape in the pejorative way that

⁹²⁷ Larsen, p. 230

⁹²⁸ “[Hobbit] Joins Human Family Tree”, BBC website

<<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/sci/tech/3948165.stm>> Wednesday, 27 October 2004. [Accessed 24 February 2008]

⁹²⁹ Tolkien, ‘On Fairy-Stories’, p. 65

⁹³⁰ Northrup defines ‘*excappāre*’ as ‘to get away from’ but literally as ‘to get out of one’s cape’ and ‘*εκδύεσθαι*’ as ‘to take off’ or ‘to put off one’s clothes’. Clyde B. Northrup, p. 828

fantasy literature is sometimes described, but a 'simple movement from outer to inner, from the ordinary world into the wondrous or enchanted world',⁹³¹ he suggests that Tolkien's use of escape in this way includes not only explicitly Secondary World narratives such as *The Lord of the Rings* or *Star Wars*, for example, but also narratives where 'truth, justice, and similar ideas, actually work'.⁹³² These latter narratives would include nearly all the popular procedural television programmes and feature dramas such as *The West Wing* which are, in essence, fantasy narratives masquerading as non-escapist narratives.⁹³³ Kathryn Hume argues that fantasy 'is any departure from consensus reality' and the improbable conviction rate attained by the characters in texts such as the *CSI* franchise, for example, suggest that there is an element of suspension of disbelief involved in reading narratives which would not usually be described as 'fantasy', but which clearly follow the same definition.⁹³⁴

Self-referential discussion on the essential nature of fantasy or escape narratives does not end with *The Lord of the Rings*. Stories and dreams are central themes in Neil Gaiman's *Sandman* series of graphic novels and Terry Pratchett, for example, has revisited the theme in several Discworld novels,⁹³⁵ elucidating Tolkien's argument most clearly in *Hogfather*, typified in an exchange between Death and his granddaughter Susan:

⁹³¹ Northrup, p. 828

⁹³² Ibid., p. 829

⁹³³ Laura Lippman describes *The West Wing* as a 'fantasy of a Democratic president who never abandons his principles' in 'The Loveable Liberal Behind Bush's Victory', *New York Times*, 31st December 2000.

⁹³⁴ Kathryn Hume quoted in John Pennington, 'From Elfland to Hogwarts, or the Aesthetic Trouble with Harry Potter', *The Lion and The Unicorn*, 26 (2002), 78-97 (p. 79)

⁹³⁵ For example: *Wyrd Sisters* and *Witches Abroad*. Terry Pratchett, Ian Stewart and Jack Cohen, *The Science of the Discworld 2: The Globe* also devote two (non fiction) chapters to the importance of stories to human culture: 'Lies To Humans' and 'May Contain Nuts'.

'All right,' said Susan, 'I'm not stupid. You're saying humans need... fantasies to make life bearable.'

REALLY? AS IF IT WAS SOME KIND OF PINK PILL? NO. HUMANS NEED FANTASY TO BE HUMAN. TO BE THE PLACE WHERE THE FALLING ANGEL MEETS THE RISING APE.

'Tooth fairies? Hogfathers? Little – '

YES. AS PRACTICE. YOU HAVE TO START OUT LEARNING TO BELIEVE THE LITTLE LIES.

'So we can believe the big ones?'

YES. JUSTICE. MERCY. DUTY. THAT SORT OF THING.⁹³⁶

Pratchett's appropriation of the literary canon and western dominant cultural texts including *The Lord of the Rings* becomes more sophisticated throughout the Discworld series until the power of narrative begins to impact explicitly on characters who are not anthropomorphic personifications such as Death, wizards or witches who Pratchett demonstrates have the ability to manipulate or alter narrative causality:

'You're offering to change history?' he said. 'Is that it? Rewrite the –'
'Oh, my dear Vimes, history changes all the time. It is constantly being re-examined and re-evaluated [...] the pivotal role of your ancestor in the city's history is ripe for fresh... analysis.'⁹³⁷

The rewriting of Vimes's regicide ancestor 'Old Stoneface Vimes' from a villain into a Morporkian hero is the culmination of *Jingo* which, although more closely allied to the cultural myth of Lawrence of Arabia, dismantles the narrative of empire, stressing the artificiality of the rhetoric that characters such as Lord Rust use in order to go to war. The constant intertextual appropriation within the Discworld novels suggests that Pratchett is a writer of metafictional texts which 'self-consciously and systematically draws attention to [their] status as an artefact

⁹³⁶ Terry Pratchett, *Hogfather* (London: Victor Gollancz, 1996), p. 270.

⁹³⁷ Terry Pratchett, *Jingo* (London: Corgi Books, 1998), p. 404

in order to pose questions about the relationship between fiction and reality'.⁹³⁸

The Discworld itself is, as Pratchett continually stresses, a planet on the border between reality and fiction: 'the Discworld is as unreal as it is possible to be while still being just real enough to exist',⁹³⁹ and is itself an ideologically hybrid creation, continually drawing attention to the artificial nature of the grand narratives – 'JUSTICE. MERCY. DUTY. THAT SORT OF THING' – which mask essential truths about how the universe works, how humanity functions within the universe and the importance of narrative beyond escapism. It can even be argued that by constantly referencing the artificiality of these concepts, Discworld is less escapist – by Northrup and Hume's definitions – than procedural narratives such as *CSI*, *Midsomer Murders*, *Morse* and so on. The conventions of the Discworld universe mask or disguise Pratchett's commentary on narrative.

Terry Pratchett has made no secret of the fact that he finds *The Lord of the Rings* overrated and frequently parodies Tolkien's ideas. *Witches Abroad* takes the titular characters on a journey across the Discworld and, coincidentally, via some well-known classics. After leaving the dwarf mine, Magrat, Granny Weatherwax and Nanny Ogg travel by water:

'Someone's following us!' hissed Magrat.

Two pale glows appeared at the edge of the lamplight. Eventually they turned out to be the eyes of a small grey creature, vaguely froglike, paddling towards them on a log. It reached the boat. Long clammy fingers grabbed the side, and a lugubrious face rose level with Nanny Ogg's.

'ullo,' it said. 'It'sss my birthday.'

All three of them stared at it for a while. Then Granny Weatherwax picked up an oar and hit it firmly over the head. There was a splash, and a distant cursing.⁹⁴⁰

⁹³⁸ Patricia Waugh quoted in Jessica Tiffin, 'Ice, Glass, Snow: Fairytale as Art and Metafiction in the Writing of A.S. Byatt', *Marvels and Tales*, 20.1 (2006), 47-66 (p. 48)

⁹³⁹ Pratchett, *Moving Pictures*, p. 9

⁹⁴⁰ Pratchett, *Witches Abroad*, pp. 59-60

It says much about how entrenched Tolkien's creations have become in the great literary unconscious of the Western world in that this homage to Gollum needs no further elaboration from Pratchett. The Gollum-creature's part in *Witches Abroad* is over; like the appearance of a singularly unfortunate Count Dracula-alike, his presence in Pratchett's novel is only to remind the reader that as the three witches try to prevent the evil fairy godmother Lily Weatherwax's manipulation of fairy stories from coming true, they themselves are enmeshed in a genre which has its own stringent codes of character behaviour and plot. In a similar way, the inverted fantasy conventions in *The Dark Lord of Derkholm*, features a casual reference to a dwarf called Galadriel: 'the surly one, whose name was Galadriel. Derk had been wondering, ever since, what Galadriel's parents had been thinking of.'⁹⁴¹ Pratchett and Gaiman's *Good Omens* has a young female character whose 'given first names were Pippin Galadriel Moonchild'.⁹⁴²

The significance of Pratchett and other fantasy writers who consciously write against *The Lord of the Rings* and Tolkien is that their appropriation and rewriting of *The Lord of the Rings* can be discussed through postcolonial theory. Fantasy, according to Elizabeth Massa Hoiem provides the perfect Other as 'the elves are unlikely to protest their depiction as sexualized Other [...] the margin cannot write back'.⁹⁴³ The elves in *Lords and Ladies* are both savage Other and colonial invaders. They are the original inhabitants of the country of Lancre and also an invasion force who have kidnapped the king and plan to marry him to the Queen in a symbolic marriage which will solidify their claims to Lancre. Pratchett resists the idea that fantasy worlds can only be concerned with fantasy issues; his

⁹⁴¹ Diana Wynne Jones, *The Dark Lord of Derkholm* (London: Victor Gollancz, 2003), p. 216

⁹⁴² Terry Pratchett and Neil Gaiman, *Good Omens* (London: Corgi, 1991), p. 129

⁹⁴³ Hoiem, p. 85

dispossessed king actively refuses to accept his destiny – to the point of destroying evidence which points to his heritage; his fantasy city is a working metropolis; and his quiet rural kingdoms are self-sufficient but not wholly insular. Tom Shippey's consideration of *The Colour of Magic* leads him to suggest that 'a debt to Tolkien may be mingled with a debt to fantasy in general'.⁹⁴⁴

The Lord of the Rings is a remarkable text, combining action and adventure with a subtle and sophisticated reflection on the nature of evil and the fact that Tolkien drew from both his esoteric academic interests and his boyhood juvenilia should not detract from his achievement. In fact, Tolkien's blend of myth and adventure should be commended – not the least for the success of the genre he helped to develop. Brian Attebery writes scathingly of American writer Terry Brooks's *Shannara* series of novels that:

One finds in them nothing that was not in their model – *Shannara* is especially blatant in its point-for-point correspondence – but one most certainly does not find everything that was in the original [...] they were rooted in Tolkien's own life and philosophy. His gold, like the fairies', turns to trash when it is stolen away.⁹⁴⁵

Attebery is being unduly harsh; it is almost certainly true that Brooks is read for many of the same reasons that Tolkien is read, but to compare them 'point-for-point', while interesting, places unfair restrictions on fantasy criticism and does not, for epic fantasy like the *Shannara* series, reveal much about them. The *Shannara* novels are highly derivative of Tolkien but, arguably, much – if not all – of the genre is similarly derivative to a greater or lesser extent. It could certainly be argued convincingly that Tolkien has had such an impact on the development of

⁹⁴⁴ Shippey, 'Literature, Twentieth Century: Influence of Tolkien', p. 380

⁹⁴⁵ Brian Attebery, *The Fantasy Tradition in American Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980), p. 155

the modern genre of fantasy that an engagement with his work is almost mandatory. Brooks is also a late twentieth and early twenty-first century writer and examination of his work reveals not only similarities to *The Lord of the Rings* but also differences. The most crucial of these, and key to Brooks's evolution of the *Shannara* novels as a substantial series aside from Tolkien, is the conception of the world of *Shannara* as being a mythic future rather than a mythic prehistory. As the *Shannara* series develops it becomes clear that the deeply altered world is in fact Earth after a terrible apocalypse. This becomes the basis of Brooks's latest series, *Armageddon's Children*, which works to draw together his modern fantasy series *Word and Void* and *Shannara*.⁹⁴⁶ This 'spin in' or drawing together of two disparate series serves to legitimise the *Shannara* books by distancing them from Tolkien, and also consolidates the legitimacy of *Armageddon's Children* by tying it to his other series.⁹⁴⁷

Critical evaluation of Brooks should go beyond the fact of his appropriation of Tolkien to question why some elements were selected but not others and how his interpretation of Tolkien works to reflect late twentieth century cultural concerns. If 'every text inevitably represents its own age' then Brooks's reworking of Tolkien – who adapted and reworked Haggard, who drew upon the work of older writers – must represent something significant in Western responses to certain texts and their continued relevance.⁹⁴⁸ Attebery argues that to 'attempt to copy Tolkien is necessarily to misread', but the multiplicity of texts suggests that

⁹⁴⁶ Criticism of Brooks tends to concentrate dismissively on his *Shannara* sequence. It seems unfair for critics to single out Brooks continually; Guy Gavriel Kay – who worked on *The Silmarillion* with Christopher Tolkien – shows a similar amount of Tolkienian appropriation in his *Flanvar Tapastry* novels.

⁹⁴⁷ Isaac Asimov did much the same thing with his *Robot* and *Foundation* novels.

⁹⁴⁸ Attebery, *Strategies of Fantasy*, p. 22

there is no such thing as a 'misreading'.⁹⁴⁹ Each text is open to as many readings as there are readers; Brooks's *The Lord of the Rings* as inferred from *The Sword of Shannara* will of necessity be different from, for example, Pratchett's *The Lord of the Rings* as inferred from *The Fifth Elephant*. Attebery argues that Brooks, and, although his criticism predates the earliest work on fandom, it is reasonable to assume that he would include fanfiction writers when he states that: 'attempt to evoke wonder without engaging the mind or emotions, and [...] threaten to reduce Tolkien's artistic accomplishment to a bare formula.'⁹⁵⁰ Attebery makes an interesting point here and it would be foolish to suggest that fantasy does not have a large number of texts which might be described as fantasy-by-numbers. The assumption that Brooks's novels do not engage the mind or emotions of their readers is difficult to prove; while they are clearly derivative of *The Lord of the Rings*, they are also fast-paced adventures with engrossing environments and engaging characters.⁹⁵¹ Unlike the majority of epic fantasy which owes an easily observable debt to Tolkien (in plot, linguistic style or environment, although all of these do link Tolkien's successors to his predecessors), the early *Shannara* novels are all stand-alone narratives which involve various (but not successive) generations of the Ormsford family. In this way, Brooks has created an epic continuity for the United States which draws upon images of isolated, tight-knit communities which is more reminiscent of early American settlement and claim-holding than Tolkien's Shire.

Tolkien described his vision for the collective narratives of Middle-earth, to be dedicated to England, where he would write some of the stories and leave

⁹⁴⁹ Attebery, *The Fantasy Tradition in American Literature*, p. 155

⁹⁵⁰ Ibid.

⁹⁵¹ Apart from university students, of course.

others briefly illustrated: 'The cycle should be linked to a majestic whole, and yet leave scope for other minds and hands, wielding paint and music and drama.'⁹⁵² He himself characterized this ambition as 'Absurd', and while it is likely that he would not have been in favour of many of the appropriations which have been produced in the last fifty years since *The Lord of the Rings* was first published, in those same appropriations across the arts and sciences, among fans and academics, in popular and high culture, produced by readers of *The Lord of the Rings* all over the world, Tolkien's 'Absurd' ambition has been achieved.⁹⁵³ *The Lord of the Rings* is one of the core cultural narratives – one of the great myths of the twentieth century – and it is loved and recreated and rewritten and reread because:

Although the story is a blend of many morsels, certain elements, certain flavours stand out and evoke immediate response. These are the basics, the raw stuff of myth out of which folktale, fairy tale, epic, and romance are fashioned. They are the motifs which recur in all mythologies and which tale-tellers have used time out of mind – the hero, the quest, the struggle with monstrous forces of evil, the ordeal and its outcome. They recur because they work, because they move the reader and put him in touch with what is timeless.⁹⁵⁴

C.S. Lewis wrote of Rider Haggard that: 'Haggard's best work will survive because it is based on an appeal well above the high-water mark. The fullest tide of fashion cannot demolish it. A great myth is relevant as long as the predicament of humanity lasts.'⁹⁵⁵ This might be appropriated as an epigraph for *The Lord of the Rings*.

⁹⁵² *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*, p. 145

⁹⁵³ *Ibid.*

⁹⁵⁴ Flieger, 'Frodo and Aragorn: The Concept of the Hero', p. 123

⁹⁵⁵ C.S. Lewis in Tom Pocock, *Rider Haggard and the Lost Empire* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1993), p. 245

Appendix A

Glossary of 'Fannish' Terms

Term	Definition
A/Ns	Author's Notes. Any additional information that the writer feels is pertinent.
Angst	Fan fiction where one or more characters suffer psychologically.
AU	Alternate Universe. Taking the characters and placing them in a different time or place.
Author insert	This is either where the author has written his or herself into the story as a Mary-Sue or where the author breaks the fourth wall and addresses the reader directly.
Badfic	Badfic is fic which includes many fan fiction clichés and is written intentionally as a parody.
Beta	A beta or beta reader is someone who edits fanfiction. Many writers use a beta to correct spelling and grammatical errors or to check canon references.
BNF	Big Name Fan. A writer whose work is known to everyone in the fandom.
C&D	A Cease and Desist order usually comes from a lawyer representing the copyrighted material.
Canon	The actual events/history as given by the source text. <i>The Lord of the Rings</i> canon would include; Sauron forging the Ring, Aragorn being Isildur's heir, Merry and Pippin being cousins. A text which has one or more incarnations (book to film adaptations, for example) has more than one canon. <i>The Lord of the Rings</i> , therefore, has both film and book canon. Writers who are adhering strictly to canon will usually indicate which canon they are going with when there is a diversion between them.
Crossover	Taking characters from one text and placing them in another. Ford Prefect and Doctor Who meeting up in a pub in Islington would be a good example.
Delurk	What happens when a lurker decides to participate.
Disclaimer	An acknowledgement that the characters do not belong to the writer and that the writer is not profiting from fan fiction.
Drabble	A drabble is a piece of fan fiction of exactly 100 words as set down by the Birmingham Science Fiction club.
Extra-Textual	Material which supports the original text and is produced by the creators of the original text. For example, deleted scenes, spin off novels, websites.
Fan Art	Artwork inspired by a novel, film, video game, comic, manga or television series.
Fan Fiction	Stories written about or inspired by characters or narratives from a novel, film, video game, comic, manga or television series which is posted on the internet or available from fanzines.
Fanon	Widely held beliefs by fans which have no canon basis which may have originated in early fanfiction within the fandom.
Fen	Alternative plural of fan.

Fluff	Fan fiction which is predominately sweet with little character development. The fanfiction equivalent of a second-rate romantic comedy.
Gen	Fan fiction where there are no or very circumspect pairings.
H/C	Hurt/Comfort. A fic where one or more main characters are injured (usually physically) and another character comforts them.
Header	Found at the beginning of a fan fiction post and usually containing important information such as author name, contact details, the title and genre of the story, author's notes and a disclaimer.
Het	Fiction where the main pairing is heterosexual.
IC/OOC	In Character/Out Of Character. Either may be levelled at a fan fiction writer about the way they have written the characters.
Jossed	This comes from the Buffy the Vampire Slayer creator Joss Whedon and refers to situations where fan fiction inadvertently diverges from canon due to an unexpected plot development in the canon. 'Jossed' is distinct from an AU or Alternate Universe in that there was no intent to diverge from canon.
Lurker	Someone who reads fanfiction, message boards and weblogs but does not actually participate in fandom.
Manip	Digital images (often screen caps) 'manipulated' to present characters in a different relationship to the canon one.
Mary-Sue/Gary-Sue	Mary-Sues can be identified by possessing superlative beauty, awesome intelligence and the ability to out-hero the hero. A Gary-Sue is the male version.
Newbie	A novice to fandom.
OTP	Stands for One True Pairing. This is the primary relationship interest for the fan fiction writer. OT3 is an offshoot and stands for One True Threesome.
Pre-quest/ Post-quest	Most commonly used to indicate whether <i>The Lord of the Rings</i> fanfiction is set before the events of the text (pre-quest) or after (post-quest). The pre-quest fan fiction is usually set after <i>The Hobbit</i> and generally (but not exclusively) deals with Frodo, Merry, Pippin and Sam.
PWP	Stands for either Porn Without Plot or Plot What Plot? Usually a short piece of fan fiction where explicit erotica takes the place of a storyline.
R&R	Read and Review. A request for feedback most commonly seen at fanfiction.net
Ratings	Similar to cinema ratings for films. Some variance on the American system (PG, PG-13, R, NC-17) is used.
Rec	Short for recommendation.
Screen cap	Screen captures or frames from a television series or film available on the internet.
'Ship	This is an abbreviation of 'relationship' and is related to 'shipper'. It stands for the pairing that the 'shipper supports.
'Shipper	It is short for 'relationshipipper' and means a fan who wants two characters to become romantically involved.
Slash	Fan fiction with homosexual content. Slash fiction is not always explicitly sexual, nor is the slash pairing always the focus of the story.

Songfic	A fan fiction writer takes a song and writes a story based on it so the lyrics of the song fit the narrative. This usually amounts to writers posting song lyrics with a few sentences scattered between them.
Textual Poachers	Term coined by Henry Jenkins in his book of the same name. It refers to the appropriative processes that fans engage with in fandom.
Vid	Scenes from a television series or film set to music – usually 'ship based.
WIP	Work In Progress.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Note: Authors who have employed pseudonyms are shown with their names enclosed in single quotation marks.

- 'Baylor', *'Cool Sunlight and Green Grass', Fate and the High King's Falcon.*
<http://henneth-annun.net/stories/chapter_view.cfm?stid=1811&SPOrdinal=1> [accessed 20 January 2004]
- 'Baylor', *Handkerchiefs and Mushroom Soup.*
<<http://home.comcast.net/~baylorsr/handkerchiefs.html>>
[accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Baylor', *'Lesson Seven: Guiding Your Hobbit Over Difficult Terrain', The Care and Feeding of Hobbits,*
<<http://www.geocities.com/baylorsr/lessonseven.html>>
[accessed 10 September 2007]
- Claire, Cassandra, *'The Very Secret Diary of Boromir'.*
<<http://www.livejournal.com/talkread.bml?itemid=19399211>>
[accessed 18 December 2007]
- Claire, Cassandra, *'The Very Secret Diary of Gollum'.*
<<http://www.calasaid.com/misc/vsd/gollum.html>>
[accessed 18 December 2007]
- Claire, Cassandra, *'The Very Secret Diary of Legolas, Part One'.*
<<http://www.calasaid.com/misc/vsd/legolas.html>>
[accessed 18 December 2007]
- 'EdorasLass', EdorasLass, *'Love Me and Despair'.*
<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/2232043/1/Love_Me_and_Despair>
[accessed 28 September 2007]
- 'Inwai' and 'Ololay', *The New Bagenders,* <<http://bagenders.tripod.com/>>
[accessed 20 January 2008]
- Jackson, Peter, *The Fellowship of the Ring.* Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2002. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9171
- Jackson, Peter, *The Two Towers,* Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2003. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9188
- Jackson, Peter, *The Return of the King* Dir. Peter Jackson. New Line Cinema. 2004. Extended DVD Edition. EDV9248

- 'Jenwyn', 'Such A Little Thing', <http://www.squidge.org/fellowship/fic/jenwyn_suchalittlething.htm> [accessed 3 January 2008]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: And the Sign Said: Center Parcs*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/story/ep9.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: A Shortcut to Whitby*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/story/ep4.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: At Home with Boromir*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/story/ep7.html>> [accessed 7 August 2008]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: Strider Scout Master*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/ep10.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: The Dream-Fridge*, <<http://www.stormpages.com/bagenders/episodes/2ep3.html>> [not online at the main *Bagenders* website on 10 September 2007, 22 January 2008 or 23 February 2008]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: The Mirror of Modernity*, <<http://www.stormpages.com/bagenders/episodes/2ep4.html>> [not online at the main *Bagenders* website on 10 September 2007 or on 22 January 2008]
- 'Lady Alyssa' and 'Random Dent', *The Bagenders: The Shadow of the Past*, <<http://bagenders.stormpages.com/ep2.html>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Lady Arabella Sedai', 'Undomiel', *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12*, <<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/4/>> *The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12* [accessed 3 January 2008]
- 'Lady Arabella Sedai', 'Omentien', *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12*, <<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/4/>> *The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12* [accessed 3 January 2008]
- 'Lady Arabella Sedai', 'Mornie alanta', *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12*, <<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/4/>> *The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12* [accessed 3 January 2008]

- 'Lady Arabella Sedai', 'Namaarica', *The Fellowship of the Ring: A Fellowship of 12*, <<http://www.fanfiction.net/s/1216735/4/>> *The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring_A_Fellowship_of_12* [accessed 3 January 2008]
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The Hobbit*, 4th edn (London: Unwin Hyman Ltd, 1981)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The Lord of the Rings* (London: HarperCollins, 2005)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien* ed. by Humphrey Carpenter and Christopher Tolkien (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1981)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, Pearl and Sir Orfeo*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins, 1995)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The Silmarillion*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1979)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *Tree and Leaf* (London: Harper Collins, 2001)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The History of the Hobbit, Part One: Mr Baggins*, ed. by John D. Rateliff (London: HarperCollins, 2007)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The Treason of Isengard: The History of The Lord of the Rings Part 2*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins, 2002)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *The Return of the Shadow: The History of Middle-earth Volume 6*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins, 1994)
- Tolkien, J.R.R., *Unfinished Tales: of Numenor and Middle-earth*, ed. by Christopher Tolkien (London: HarperCollins, 1998)
- 'Willow Wode', *Rites of Passage*. <<http://willow-wode.net/AdultFanfic/Rites%20of%20Passage%20-%20The%20Hall.pdf>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- 'Zarah', 'Contrasts', <<http://www.fcmgeeks.net/zarah/index-pop.htm>> [accessed 3 January 2007]

Secondary Sources
Paintings, Film and Television Productions

- Adamson, Andrew, *Shrek 2*. Dir. Andrew Adamson. Dreamworks. 2004.
- BBC Productions *EastEnders*. BBC. 1985 to the present.
- Campbell, Michael, *Goldeneye*. Dir. Michael Campbell. United International Pictures. (UIP) 1995.
- Clements, Ron and John Musker, *The Little Mermaid*. Dir. Ron Clements and John Musker. Buena Vista Distribution Company 1989
- Davies, Russell T., *Doctor Who*. Dir. Russell T Davies. BBC. 2005.
- Fangmeier, Stefen, *Eragon*. Dir. Stefen Fangmeier. Twentieth Century-Fox Film Corporation 2006
- Ford, John, *The Searchers*. Dir. John Ford. Warner Bros. Pictures. 1956
- Gilliam, Terry and Terry Jones, *Monty Python and the Holy Grail*. Dir. Terry Gilliam and Terry Jones. Python (Monty) Pictures Ltd. 1975.
- Granada Productions *University Challenge*. Granada productions. 1962 – to the present.
- Henson, Jim, *Dark Crystal*. Dir. Jim Henson. Jim Henson Productions. 1982.
- Henson, Jim, *Labyrinth*. Dir. Jim Henson. TriStar Pictures 1986
- Kershner, Irvin, *Star Wars: Episode V – The Empire Strikes Back*. Dir. Irvin Kershner. Lucasfilm. 1980
- Lorenzetti, Ambrogio, *'La Vita In Campagna'* (fresco), on the wall of Palazzo Pubblico in Siena, [n.d.]
- Lowney, Declan, *Father Ted*. Dir. Declan Lowney. Channel 4 Television. 1995-1998.
- Lucas, George, *Willow*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm Ltd. 1988.
- Lucas, George, *Star Wars: Return of the Jedi*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm. 1977

-
- Lucas, George, *Star Wars: The Phantom Menace*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm. 1999
- Lucas, George, *Star Wars: Attack of the Clones*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm 2002
- Lucas, George, *Star Wars: Revenge of the Sith*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm. 2004
- Lucas, George, *Star Wars: A New Hope*. Dir. George Lucas. Lucasfilm. 1977
- Roddenberry, Gene, *Star Trek*. Dir. Gene Roddenberry. CBS Paramount Television. 1966-68
- Scott, Ridley, *Legend*. Dir. Ridley Scott. Twentieth Century Fox. 1985.
- Solomon, Courteney, *Dungeons and Dragons*. Dir. Courteney Solomon. New Line Cinema. 2000
- Sorkin, Aaron, *The West Wing*. Dir. Aaron Sorkin. Episode 4:01 *Twenty Hours In America*. NBC. 2002
- Spielberg, Steven, *Indiana Jones and the Last Crusade*. Dir. Steven Spielberg. Lucasfilm. 1989
- theonering.net <<http://fan.theonering.net/middleearthtours/lcc.html>> [accessed 26 February 2008]
- Whedon, Joss, *Buffy the Vampire Slayer*. 5:02 'Real Me'. Dir. Joss Whedon, 20th Century Fox Television. 1997 to 2003
- Yates, Peter, *Krull*. Dir. Peter Yates. Columbia Pictures. 1983

Literature

- Author unknown *The High History of the Grail: A continuation of the narrative of Chretien de Troyes thirteenth century France* [n.p.] [n. pub.] [n.d.]
- de Boron, Robert, *Joseph d'Armathie* [n.p.] [n. pub.] [n.d.] Project Gutenberg
- de Boron, Robert, *Merlin and Perceval* [n.p.] [n. pub. 1190] Project Gutenberg
- Brooks, Terry, *A Knight of the Word*, New Edition (London: Orbit, 2006)
- Brooks, Terry, *The Sword of Shannara* (London: Futura Publications, 1989)
- Brown, Dan, *The Da Vinci Code* (London: Corgi Adult, 2004)
- Brooke, Rupert, 'The Soldier' in *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, 7th edn, 6 vols (London: W.W Norton & Company, 2000), II, p. 2050
- Eddings, David, *Pawn of Prophecy* (London: Corgi Books, 1983)
- Eddings, David, *Castle of Wizardry* (London: Corgi Books, 1986)
- von Eschenbach, Wolfram, *Parzival: and Titurel* trans. by Cyril Edwards (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)
- Fforde, Jasper, *First Among Sequels* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 2007)
- Gaiman, Neil, *The Sandman: The Wake* (New York: DC Comics, 1997)
- Gaiman, Neil, *American Gods* (London: Harper-Collins 2002)
- Goodking, Terry, *Wizard's First Rule* (New York: Tor Books, 2001)
- Haggard, H. Rider, *She: A History of Adventure* (New York: Ballantine, 1978)
- Haggard, H. Rider, *King Solomon's Mines*, ed. by Denis Butts (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)

-
- Jerome, Jerome K., *Three Men in a Boat*, ed. by Geoffrey Harvey (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998)
- Jones, Diana Wynne, *The Tough Guide To Fantasyland* (London: Vista, 1996)
- Jones, Diana Wynne, *The Dark Lord of Derkholm* (London: Gollancz, 1998)
- Jones, Diana Wynne, *Deep Secret* (London: Gollancz, 2003)
- Jones, Diana Wynne, *Hexwood* (London: Collins, 2000)
- Kilworth, Garry, *Attica* (London: Atom, 2007)
- Lampoon, Harvard, *Bored of the Rings* (London: Gollancz, 2003)
- Le Guin, Ursula, K., *A Wizard of Earthsea* (London: Puffin, 1973)
- Le Guin, Ursula, K., *Tombs of Atuan* (London: Puffin, 1974)
- Lewis, C.S., *Perelandra* (London: Harpercollins 2000)
- Lewis, C.S., *That Hideous Strength* (London: Harpercollins 2000)
- Lewis, C.S., *Out of the Silent Planet* (London: Harpercollins 2005)
- McNish, Cliff, *The Doomspell Trilogy* (London: Orion Children's Books, 2004)
- Modesitt, L. E., *Scion of Cyador* (London: Orbit, 2002)
- Moers, Walter, *The City of Dreaming Books* (London: Vintage Books, 2007)
- Pratchett, Terry, *Witches Abroad* (London: Corgi Books, 1992)
- Pratchett, Terry, *Equal Rites* (London: Corgi Books, 1993)
- Pratchett, Terry, *Lords and Ladies* (London: Corgi Books, 1993)

-
- Pratchett,
Terry, *Sourcery* (London: Corgi Books, 1993)
- Pratchett,
Terry, *Wyrd Sisters* (London: Corgi Books, 1993)
- Pratchett,
Terry, *Moving Pictures* (London: Corgi Books, 1995)
- Pratchett,
Terry, *Hogfather* (London: Victor Gollancz, 1996)
- Pratchett,
Terry, *Jingo* (London: Corgi Books, 1998)
- Pratchett,
Terry, *The Last Continent* (London: Doubleday, 1998)
- Pratchett,
Terry, *Wintersmith* (London: Doubleday, 2006)
- Pratchett,
Terry, and Neil
Gaiman, *Good Omens: The nice and accurate prophecies of Agnes Nutter
Witch* (London: Corgi Books, 1991)
- Shakespeare,
William, *William Shakespeare: The Complete Works*, ed. by
Stanley Wells and Gary Taylor (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998)
- Thompson,
Flora, *Lark Rise to Candleford* (London: Penguin Classics, 2000)
- Wylie,
Jonathan, *Servants of Ark: Book Three, The Mage-Born Child*
(London: Corgi Books, 1989)

Critical Works

- Aarseth,
Espen J., *Cybertext* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997)
- Abramson,
Allen, 'Mythical Land, Legal Boundaries: Wonderings About Landscape and
Other Tracts', in *Land, Law and Environment: Mythical Land, Legal
Boundaries* eds. Allen Abramson and Dimitrios Theodossopoulos
(London: Pluto Press, 2000), pp 1-30
- Abrams, M.H.
and Stephen
Greenblatt,
eds., *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, 7th edn, 6 vols (London:
W.W Norton & Company, 2000), II

- Aichele, George, 'Reading Beyond Meaning', *Postmodern Culture*, 3:3 (1993), <https://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/postmodern_culture/v003/3.3aichele.html> [accessed 5 January 2008]
- Aitken, Stuart C., 'A Transactional Geography of the Image-Event: the Films of Scottish Director, Bill Forsyth', *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, New Series, 16:1 (1991) 105-118 <<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0020-2754%281991%292%3a16%3a1%3c105%3aagoti%3e2.0.co%3b2-%23>> [accessed 18 July 2006]
- Akers-Jordan, Cathy, 'Fairy Princess or Tragic Heroine? The Metamorphosis of Arwen Undómiel in Peter Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* Films', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press), pp. 195-213
- Allington, Daniel, "'How Come Most People Don't See It?': Slashing *The Lord of the Rings*", *Social Semiotics*, 17:1 (March 2007), 43-63
- Anderton, Hon. Jim, *EDANZ Conference Keynote Speech*, <<http://www.beehive.govt.nz/speech/edanz+conference+keynote+address>> [accessed 1 August 2006]
- Andrews, Malcolm, *Landscape and Western Art* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999)
- Archer, Lynn, 'The Ends of Enchantment: Colonialism and *Sir Gawain and the Green Knight*', *Texas Studies in Literature and Language*, 48:2 (Summer, 2006), 79-101
- Armitt, Lucy, *Fantasy Fiction: An Introduction* (New York and London: Continuum, 2005)
- Arnold, Guy, *Held Fast For England: G.A. Henty Imperialist Boys' Writer* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1980)
- Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin, eds., *The Postcolonial Studies Reader* (New York: Routledge, 1995)
- Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, eds., *The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Post-Colonial Literatures* (London: Routledge, 2002)

- Attebery, Brian, *The Fantasy Tradition in American Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1980)
- Attebery, Brian, *Strategies of Fantasy* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1992)
- Auerbach, Jeffrey, 'Art, Advertising and the Legacy of Empire', *The Journal of Popular Culture*, 35:4 (Spring, 2002), 1-23
- Aycock, Wendell and Michael Schoenecke, eds., *Film and Literature: A Comparative Approach to Adaptation* (Studies in Comparative Literature: No. 1) (Lubbock, Texas: Texas University Press 1988)
- Bacon-Smith, Camille, *Enterprising Women: Television Fandom and the Creation of the Popular Myth* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1992)
- Baigent, Michael, Leigh, Richard and Lincoln, Henry, *The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail* (New York: Bantam Dell, 1982)
- Ballantyne, Tony, 'Race and the webs of empire: Aryanism from India to the Pacific', *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History*, 2:3 (2001)
<http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/journal_of_colonialism_and_colonial_history/v002/2.3ballantyne.html>
[accessed 18 June 2007]
- Barber, Richard, 'Introduction' in Wolfram von Eschenbach, *Parzival: and Titurel*, trans. by Cyril Edwards (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)
- Barthes, Roland, *Mythologies*, trans. by Annette Lavers (London: Vintage, 1993)
- Barthes, Roland, 'The Death of the Author' in *The Death and Resurrection of the Author?* ed. by William Irwin (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2002), pp 3-7
- Battis, Jes, 'Gazing Upon Sauron: Hobbits, Elves, and the Queering of the Postcolonial Optic', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (Winter 2004), 908-926
<http://z3950.muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/modern_fiction_studies/v050/50.4battis.pdf> [accessed 23 April 2007]
- Beasley, Chris, *What Is Feminism?* (London: Sage Publications, 1999)

- Bedell, Rebecca, *The Anatomy of Nature: Geology and American Landscape Painting 1825-1875* (Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001)
- Behlman, Lee, 'The Escapist: Fantasy, Folklore, and the Pleasures of the Comic Book in Recent Jewish American Holocaust Fiction', *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies*, 22:3 (2004), 56-71 <<http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/shofar/v022/22.3behlman.html>> [accessed 23 April 2007]
- Bell, Leonard, 'The Representation of the Maori by European Artists in New Zealand, ca. 1890-1914' *Art Journal*, 49:2, *Depictions of the Dispossessed* (Summer, 1990) pp. 142-149 <<http://www.jstor.org/stable/777194>> [accessed 18 December 2006]
- Beller, Jonathan, 'Cinema, Capital of the Twentieth Century', *Postmodern Culture*, 4:3, (1994), <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/postmodern_culture/v004/4.3beller.html> [accessed 30 January 2007]
- Bennett, Tony, *Pasts Beyond Memory: Evolution, Museums, Colonialism* (London and New York: Routledge 2004)
- Bernstein, Alina and Neil Blain, eds, *Sport, Media, Culture: Global and Local Dimensions* (London: Frank Cass Publishers, 2003), pp.95-114,
- Bhabha, Homi K., ed., *Nation and Narration* (London: Routledge, 1990)
- Bhabha, Homi K., *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 2004)
- Blake, William, 'And Did Those Feet' in *The Norton Anthology of English Literature*, 7th edn, 2 vols, ed. by M.H. Abrams and Stephen Greenblatt (London: W.W Norton & Company, 2000)
- Bloom, Harold, ed., *J.R.R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings* (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2000)
- Blunt, Akison, *Travel, Gender and Imperialism* (New York: Guilford Press, 1994)
- Boehmer, Elleke, 'Transfiguring: Colonial Body into Postcolonial Narrative' *NOVEL: A Forum on Fiction*, 26.3, African Literature Issue (Spring, 1993), 268-277
- Booker, Christopher, *The Seven Basic Plots: Why We Tell Stories* (London: Continuum, 2004)

- Boyer, Pascal, 'Evolution of the Modern Mind and the Origins of Culture: Religious Concepts as a Limiting-case' in *Evolution and the Human Mind: Modularity, Language and Meta-cognition*, ed. by Peter Carruthers and Andrew Chamberlain (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), pp. 93-112
- Booker, Susan, 'Tales Around the Internet Campfire: Fan Fiction in Tolkien's Universe', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press, 2004), pp. 259-282
- Boyer, Pascal, 'Evolutionary Psychology and Cultural Transmission', *American Behavioural Scientist*, Vol. 43 No. 6 (2000), pp 987-1000, <<http://abs.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/43/6/987>> [accessed 10 September 2007]
- Boyle Raymond, and Richard Haynes, 'New Media Sport', in *Sport, Media, Culture: Global and Local Dimensions*, ed. by Alina Bernstein and Neil Blain (London: Frank Cass Publishers, 2003) pp.95-114,
- Brantlinger, Patrick, 'Imperial Gothic: Atavism and the Occult in the British Adventure Novel, 1880-1914' in *Reading Fin de Siècle Fictions*, ed. by Lyn Pykett (London: Longman, 1996)
- Bratman, David, 'Summa Jacksonica: A Reply to Defenses of Peter Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings* films, After St. Thomas Aquinas', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press, 2004) pp. 27-62
- Brayton, Jennifer, 'Fic Frodo Slash Frodo', in *From Hobbits to Hollywood: Essays on Peter Jackson's Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Ernest Mathijs and Murray Pomerance (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 137-153
- Bredeson, Robert G. 'Landscape Description in Nineteenth-Century American Travel Literature', *American Quarterly*, 20:1 (1968), pp 86-94 <<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0003-0678%28196821%2920%3A1%3C86%3ALDINAT%3E2.0.CO%3B2-I>> [accessed 18 December 2006]
- Brisbois, Michael J., 'Tolkien's Imaginary Nature: An Analysis of the Structure of Middle-earth', *Tolkien Studies*, 2:1 (2005),197-216
- Bristow, Joseph, *Empire Boys: Adventures in a Man's World* (London: HarperCollins Academic, 1991)
- Brodie, Ian, *The Lord of the Rings Location Guidebook*, revised edition (London: Harper Collins, 2003)

- Brooks, Terry, 'An Interview with Terry Brooks' in *rofmagazine.com* <http://www.rofmagazine.com/pages/books_feature_author> [accessed 10 April 2007]
- Broom, Sarah, *Contemporary British and Irish Poetry: An Introduction* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006)
- Brown, Judith M. and Louis, Wm. Roger, eds. *The Oxford History of the British Empire Volume IV: The Twentieth Century*, 8 vols (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), IV
- Buck, Claire, 'Literary Context, Twentieth Century' in *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopaedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London and New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 363-366
- Burdge, Anthony, and Jessica Burke, 'Fandom', in *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London and New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 191-196
- Bush, Barbara, *Imperialism and Postcolonialism* (Harlow: Pearson Education Ltd, 2006)
- Cahn, Iris, 'The Changing Landscape of Modernity: Early Film and America's "Great Picture" Tradition', *Wide Angle*, 18:3 (1996), 85-100, <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/wide_angle/v018/18.3cahn.html> [accessed 30 January 2007]
- Cardwell, Sarah, *Adaptation Revisited: Television and the Classic Novel* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2002)
- Carruthers, Peter and Andrew Chamberlain, *Preserving the Treasure of Middle Earth* <<http://www.beehive.govt.nz/speech/preserving+treasure+middle+earth>> [accessed 1 August 2006]
- Carter, Hon. Chris, *Evolution and the Human Mind: Modularity, Language and Meta-cognition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000)
- Deborah Cartmell and Imelda Whelehan, 'Harry Potter and the Fidelity Debate', in *Books In Motion: Adaptation, Intertextuality, Authorship*, ed. Mircia Aragay (Amsterdam, NY: Rodopi B.V, 2005), pp. 37-49
- Castaldo, Annalisa, 'No more yielding than a dream": The Construction of Shakespeare in *The Sandman*', *College Literature*, 31:4 (2004), 94-110, <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/college_literature/v031/31.4castaldo.html> [accessed 30 January 2007]

- de Castell, Suzanne, Allan Luke and Carmen Luke, eds *Language, Authority and Criticism: Readings on the School Textbook* (London: Falmer Press, 1989)
- Chafe, Paul, 'Hey Buddy, Wanna Buy A Culture?' <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/chafe.pdf>> pp 68-76 [accessed 6 January 2008]
- Chance, Jane, *Mythology of Power*, 2nd edn (Kentucky: The University Press of Kentucky, 2001)
- Chance, Jane, ed., *Tolkien the Medievalist: Routledge Studies in Medieval Religion and Culture* (London: Routledge, 2003);
- Chance, Jane, 'The Lord of the Rings: Tolkien's Epic', in *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism*, ed. by Rose A. Zimbardo and Neil D. Isaacs (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2004), pp. 195-232
- Cheung, Floyd D., 'Imagining Danger, Imagining Nation: Postcolonial Discourse in *Rising Sun* and *Stargate*', *Jouvert*, <<http://social.chass.ncsu.edu/Jouvert/v2i2/cheung.htm>> [accessed 14 September 2006]
- Childs, Peter, *Modernism and the Post-Colonial: Literature and Empire 1885-1930* (London: Continuum International Publishing, 2007)
- Chrisman, Laura *Rereading the Imperial Romance: British Imperialism and South African Resistance in Haggard, Schreiner and Plaatzje* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000)
- Christopher, John Chambers, and Mark H. Bickhard, 'Culture, Self and Identity: Interactivist Contributions to a Metatheory for Cultural Psychology', *Culture Psychology*, 13:3 (2007), 259-295
- Christie, Ian, 'Landscape and 'Location': Reading Filmic Space Historically', *Rethinking History*, 4:2 (2000), 165-174
- Chua, Ernest, 'Fan Fiction and Copyright: Mutually Exclusive, Coexistable or Something Else? Considering Fan Fiction in Relation to the Economic/Utilitarian Theory of Copyright', *Murdoch University E Law Journal*, 14: 2 (2007), 215-232
- Cockburn, David, ed., *Human Beings* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991)

- Cook, David A., *A History Of Narrative Film*, 3rd edn (New York: W.W. Norton, 1996)
- Cole, Sarah, 'Conradian Alienation and Imperial Intimacy', *Modern Fiction Studies*, 44:2 (1998), 251-258
- Consolmagno Guy J., 'Astronomy, Science Fiction and Popular Culture: 1277 to 2001 (and beyond)', *Leonardo*, V29:2 (1996), 127-132
<[http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0024-094X\(1996\)29%3A2%3C127%3AASFAPC%3E2.0.CO%3B2-8](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0024-094X(1996)29%3A2%3C127%3AASFAPC%3E2.0.CO%3B2-8)> [accessed 19 December 2006]
- Collins, Jim, *Architectures of Excess: Cultural Life in the Information Age* (New York and (London: Routledge, 1995)
- Conrich, Ian, 'A Land of Make Believe: Merchandising and Consumption of *The Lord of the Rings*' in *From Hobbits to Hollywood: Essays on Peter Jackson's Lord of the Rings*, ed. Ernest Mathijs and Murray Pomerance (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 119-136
- Collins, Jim, *Uncommon Cultures: Popular Culture and Post-Modernism* (London and NY: Routledge, 1989)
- Coombe, Rosemary J., and Andrew Herman, 'Culture Wars on the Net: Intellectual Property and Corporate Propriety in Digital Environments.' *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 100:4 (2001), 919-947
- Cosgrove, Denis, and Stephen Daniels, eds *The Iconography of Landscape* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988)
- Covec, Hale & Twomey, and Exergi Consulting <http://www.mcd.govt.nz/templates/MultipageDocumentTOC_21873.aspx> [accessed 18 February 2008]
- Crabbe, Kathryn W., 'The Quest As Legend': *The Lord of the Rings*', in *J.R.R Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2000), pp. 141-170
- Crowe, Edith L., 'Power in Arda: Sources, Uses, and Misuses' in *Proceedings of the J.R.R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*, ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodknight (Milton Keynes and Altadena: Mythopoeic Press, 1995), pp. 272-277
- Cubitt, Sean, 'The Fading of the Elves: Eco-Catastrophe, Technopoly, and Bio-Security' in *From Hobbits to Hollywood: Essays on Peter Jackson's Lord of the Rings*, ed. Ernest Mathijs and Murray Pomerance (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 65-80

- Culler,
Jonathan, *The Pursuit of Signs* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1981)
- Curnow,
Allan, 'Anthology and New Zealand Literary History' *Modern Language Quarterly*, 64:2 (2003), 219-237
- Curry,
Patrick, *Defending Middle-earth: Tolkien Myth and Modernity* (London: Harper-Collins, 1998)
- Curti, Lidia, *Female Stories, Female Bodies: Narrative, Identity and Representation* (Basingstoke: Macmillan Press, 1998)
- Curtis,
Georgina Pell, *The Interdependence of Literature*
<<http://www.gutenberg.org/etext/3778>> [accessed 5 February 2006]
- Daeschner,
J.R., *True Brits: A Tour of 21st Century Britain in all its Bog-Snorkelling, Gurning and Cheese-Rolling Glory* (London: Arrow Books Ltd, 2004)
- David,
Deirdre, *Rule Britannia: Women, Empire, and Victorian Writing* (Cornell University Press: Ithaca, N. Y., 1995)
- David,
Deirdre, 'Empire, Race, and the Victorian Novel', in *A Companion to the Victorian Novel*, ed. by Patrick Brantlinger and William B. Thesing (Malden, Mass: Blackwell Publishing, 2002), pp 84-100
- Davis,
Jennifer, *Intellectual Property Law*, 3rd edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008)
- Dean, Carolyn
and Dana
Leibson, 'Hybridity and Its Discontents: Considering Visual Culture in Colonial Spanish America', *Colonial Latin American Review*, 12:1 (2003), 5-35
- Dick, Bernard
F., *Anatomy of Film* 3rd edn (New York; St. Martin's Press, 1998)
- Donovan,
Leslie A., 'The Valkyrie Reflex in J.R.R Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings*: Galadriel, Shelob, Éowyn and Arwen', in *Tolkien the Medievalist*, ed. by Jane Chance, Routledge Studies in Medieval Religion and Culture 3 (London: Routledge, 2003), pp. 106-130
- Donington,
Robert, *Wagner's 'Ring' and Its Symbols*, 3rd edn (London: Faber and Faber, 1974)
- Drout,
Michael D.C., 'J.R.R. Tolkien's Medieval Scholarship and its Significance', *Tolkien Studies*, 4 (2007), 113-176
- Duerden,
Dennis, 'The "Discovery" of the African Mask', *Research in African Literatures*, 31: 4 (2000), 29-47

- Dworkin, Gerald, and Richard D. Taylor, *Blackstone's Guide to the Copyright, Designs & Patents Act 1988* (London: Blackstone Press, 1989)
- Eldridge, C.C., *The Imperial Experience: From Carlyle to Forster* (London: Macmillan Press, 1996)
- Eliot, T.S., 'Tradition and the Individual Talent', <<http://www.bartleby.com/200/sw4.html>> [accessed 15 October 2008]
- Emigh, John, *Masked Performance: The Play of Self and Other in Ritual and Theatre* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996)
- Eysenck, Michael, *Psychology: A Student's Handbook* (Hove: Psychology Press, 2000)
- Farrell, William K., *Literature and Film As Modern Mythology* (London: Praeger, 2000)
- Fimi, Dimitra, 'Tolkien's "Celtic" Type of Legends': Merging Traditions', *Tolkien Studies* 4 (2007), 51-71
- Finnegan, Ruth, 'The How of Literature', *Oral Tradition*, 20:2 (2005), 164-187
- Fischlin, Daniel and Mark Fortier, eds., *Adaptations of Shakespeare: A Critical Anthology of Plays from the Seventeenth Century to the Present* (London and New York: Routledge, 2000)
- Fish, Stanley, *Is There A Text In This Class?* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1980)
- Fiske, John, and John Hartley, *Reading Television* (London: Methuen, 1978)
- Flieger, Verlyn, 'Frodo and Aragorn: The Concept of the Hero', in *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism*, ed. by Rose A. Zimbardo and Neil D. Isaacs (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 2004), pp. 122-145
- Flieger, Verlyn, 'A Postmodern Medievalist?', in *Tolkien's Modern Middle Ages*, ed. by Jane Chance and Alfred K. Siewers (Palgrave Macmillan, 2005), pp. 17-28
- Flieger, Verlyn, 'The Curious Incident of the Dream in the Barrow: Memory and Reincarnation in Middle-Earth', *Tolkien Studies* 4 (2007), 99-112

- Foerst, Anne, 'In the Beginning is the Brain (and then Come the Questions)' *Spirituality & Health: The Soul/Body Connection*. (Spring 2000) <http://www.spiritualityhealth.com/newsh/items/article/item_55.html> [accessed 3 May 2006]
- Foucault, Michel, 'What Is An Author?', in *The Death and Resurrection of the Author?* ed. by William Irwin (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2002), pp. 9-22
- Friedman, Ted, 'Fandom as a Materialist Aesthetic: Debbie Gibson and Pierre Bourdieu'. Presented to Duke University, April 1995. <http://www.tedfriedman.com/essays/2005/03/fandom_as_a_mat.html> [accessed 6 January 2008]
- van Gameraen, Sophie, "'That Boy Is Our Last Hope": Andrew, Star Wars and the Figure of the Jedi in Buffy the Vampire Slayer.' *The Slayage Conference on Buffy the Vampire Slayer Paper Archive* <http://slayageonline.com/SCBtVS_Archive/index.htm> [accessed 26 February 2008]
- Garbowski, Christopher, *Recovery and Transcendence for the Contemporary Mythmaker: The Spiritual Dimension in the Works of J.R.R Tolkien, 2nd edn* (Zurich: Walking Tree Publications, 2004)
- Garcia, Jorge J.E., 'A Theory of the Author', in *The Death and Resurrection of the Author?* ed. by William Irwin (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2002), pp 161-189
- Gardner, Jared, 'Covered Wagons and Decalogues: Paramount's Myths of Origins', *Yale Journal of Criticism*, 13:2 (2000), 361-389 <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/yale_journal_of_criticism/v013/13.2gardner.html> [accessed 18 September 2006]
- Gardner, Laurence, *Bloodline of the Holy Grail* (London: Element Books, 1997)
- Garth, John, *Tolkien and the Great War: The Threshold of Middle-earth* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2004)
- Gaydose, Victoria, "'Crimes Against the Book?" The Transformation of Tolkien's Arwen from Page to Screen and the Abandonment of the Psyche Archetype', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press, 2004), pp. 215-230

- Gelder, Ken, 'Epic Fantasy and Global Terrorism' in *From Hobbits to Hollywood: Essays on Peter Jackson's Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Ernest Mathijs and Murray Pomerance (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 101-118
- Gibson, Ross, 'Formative Landscapes' in *Australian Cinema*, ed. by Scott Murray (St. Leonards, New South Wales: Allen & Unwin, 1994)
- Giddings, Robert, ed. *Literature and Imperialism* (London: Macmillan Press, 1991)
- Giddings, Robert, Keith Selby and Chris Wensley, *Screening the Novel: The Theory and Practice of Literary Dramatization* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 1990)
- Gifford, James, *Corfu Landscapes, Real and Imaginary*, <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/gifford1.pdf>> [accessed 20 May 2007]
- Green, Roger Lancelyn, *Tales of Ancient Egypt* (London: Puffin Books, 1967)
- Green, William H., 'King Thorin's Mines: *The Hobbit* As Victorian Adventure Novel', *Extrapolation: A Journal of Science Fiction and Fantasy*, 42:1 (2001), 53-64
- Green, William H., "'Where's Mama?" The Construction of the Feminine in *The Hobbit*', *The Lion and the Unicorn*, 22:2 (1998), 188-195
- Gray, Jonathan, *Watching With the Simpsons* (New York and London: Routledge, 2006)
- Godfrey, Brian J., 'Regional Depiction in Contemporary Film', *Geographical Review*, 83:4 (1993), 428-440 <[http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0016-7428\(199310\)83%3a4%3c428%3ardicf%3e2.0.co%3b2-o](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0016-7428(199310)83%3a4%3c428%3ardicf%3e2.0.co%3b2-o)> [accessed 18 December 2006]
- Gross, Roslyn Kopel, 'Diana Wynne Jones: An Overview', <<http://www.leemac.freemove.co.uk/rosgross.htm>> [accessed 12 September 2006]
- Gunew, Snesa, 'Denaturalising Cultural Nationalisms: Multicultural Readings of "Australia"' in *Nation and Narration*, ed. by Homi K. Bhabha (London: Routledge, 1990), pp. 99-121

- d'Haen, Theo, 'Shades of Empire in Colonial and Post-Colonial Literatures' in *Shadows of Empire In Colonial and Post-Colonial Literatures*, ed. by C.C. Barfoot and Theo D'Haen (Amsterdam, Atlanta, GA: Rodopi B.V, 1993)
- Hall, Catherine ed., *Cultures of Empire - A reader: Colonisers in Britain and the Empire in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (Manchester: Manchester University Press 2000)
- Halperin, David, *One Hundred Years of Homosexuality* (New York: Routledge, 1990)
- Harries, Elizabeth Wanning, *Twice Upon a Time* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001)
- Harris, Lesley Ellen, *Digital Property: Currency of the 21st Century* (Ontario: McGraw Hill Ryerson Ltd, 1998)
- Hart, Carol, 'Portraits of Settler History in *The Proposition*', in *Senses of Cinema* (2005)
<<http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/06/38/proposition.html>>
[accessed 6 February 2007]
- Helsingner, Elizabeth, 'Turner and the Representation of England', in *Landscape and Power* ed. by W.J.T. Mitchell 2nd edn (Chicago: University of Chicago, 2002), pp.103-126
- Helms, Randel, *Tolkien's World* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1975)
- Hempstead, Geoffrey, 'George Smiley and the Post-Imperial Nostalgia' in *Patriotism: The Making and Unmaking of British National Identity: Volume Three National Fictions*, ed. by Raphael Samuel (London: Routledge, 1989)
- Herman, David, 'Storytelling and the Sciences of Mind: Cognitive Narratology, Discursive Psychology, and Narratives in Face-to-Face Interaction', *Narrative* 15:3 (2007) 306-334
- Higgins, D. S., *Rider Haggard: A Biography* (London: Cassell, 1981)
- Higham, N.J., *King Arthur: Myth-making and History* (London: Routledge, 2002)
- Hight, Craig, 'Making-of Documentaries on DVD: *The Lord of the Rings* Trilogy and Special Editions', *The Velvet Light Trap* 56 (Fall 2005), 4-17

- Hight, Eleanor M., and Gary D. Sampson, 'Introduction: Photography, "Race", and Postcolonial Theory', in *Colonialist Photography: Imag(in)ing Race and Place*, ed. Eleanor M. Hight and Gary D. Sampson (London and New York: Routledge, 2002), pp. 1-19
- Hiley, Margaret, 'Stolen Language, Cosmic Models: Myth and Mythology in Tolkien', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (Winter, 2004), 838-860
- Hill, John and Pamela C. Gibson, eds. *World Cinema: Critical Approaches* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000)
- Hills, Matt, *Fan Cultures* (London: Routledge, 2002)
- Hills, Matt, A report on the AHRB funded research project given at the Audiences Conference held at Liverpool John Moores University on 22nd November, 2004.
- Hoiem, Elizabeth Massa, 'World Creation as Colonization: British Imperialism in "Aldarion and Erendis"', *Tolkien Studies*, 2 (2005), 75-92
- Honaker, Lisa, '"One Man to Rely On": Long John Silver and the Shifting Character of Victorian Boys' Fiction', *JNT: Journal of Narrative Theory* 34: 1 (2004), 27-53 <http://muse.jhu.edu/demo/journal_of_narrative_theory/v034/34.1honaker.html> [accessed 18 September 2006]
- Honigmann, John J., 'The Masked Face', *Ethos*, 5:3 (Autumn, 1977), 263-280
- Hopkins, Lisa, *Screening the Gothic* (Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2005)
- Hopkins, Lisa, 'Female Authority Figures in the Works of Tolkien, C.S. Lewis and Charles Williams' in *Proceedings of the J.R.R. Tolkien Centenary Conference 1992*, ed. Patricia Reynolds and Glen Goodknight (Milton Keynes and Altadena: Mythopoeic Press, 1995), pp. 364-6.
- Hooper, Glenn, ed. *Landscape and Empire 1770-2000* (London: Ashgate, 2005)
- Hooper, Glenn, 'Planning Control: Cartouches, Maps and the Irish Landscape', in *Landscape and Empire 1770-2000* (London: Ashgate, 2005) pp. 17-43
- Horrocks, Roger, 'The Invention of New Zealand' in *new zealand electronic poetry centre* (1983) <<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0016-7428%28194601%2936%3a1%3c135%3atsotmi%3e2.0.co%3b2-v>> [accessed 5 September 2006]

- Houghton, John W., and Neal K. Keese, 'Tolkien, King Alfred, and Boethius: Platonist Views of Evil in *The Lord Of The Rings*', *Tolkien Studies*, 2: 1 (2005), 131-159
- Howarth, William, 'Imagined Territory: The Writing of Wetlands', *New Literary History*, 30:3 (1999), 509-539
- Hughes, Shaun F. D., 'Tolkien Worldwide', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50: 4 (2004), 980-1014 <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/modern_fiction_studies/v050/50.4hughes02.html> [accessed 18 September 2006]
- Hunter, John C., 'The Evidence of Things Not Seen: Critical Mythology and *The Lord of the Rings*', *Journal of Modern Literature*, 29:2 (2006), 129-147
- Hutcheon, Linda, *The Politics of Postmodernism*, 2nd edn (London: Routledge, 2002)
- Hutcheon, Linda, *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction* (London: Routledge, 1996)
- Hutcheon, Linda, 'The Politics of Postmodernism: Parody and History', *Cultural Critique*, No. 5 (Winter, 1986-1987), pp. 179-207
- Ingemark, Camilla Asplund, 'The Chronotope of Enchantment', *Journal of Folklore Research*, 43.1, 1-30
- Irwin, William, ed., *The Death and Resurrection of the Author?* (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2002)
- Irwin, William, 'Against Intertextuality', *Philosophy and Literature*, 28:2 (2004), 227-242
- Jacka, Elizabeth, 'Australian Cinema' in *World Cinema* ed. by John Hill and Pamela Church (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000) pp. 132-138
- Jackson, Peter, 'Introduction' in Ian Brodie, *The Lord of the Rings Location Guidebook*, revised edition (London: Harper Collins, 2003),
- Jackson, Peter, and Jan Penrose, eds., *Constructions of Race, Place and Nation* (London: University College London Press, 1993)
- Jacobs, Andrew S., 'The Remains of the Jew: Imperial Christian Identity in the Late Ancient Holy Land', *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 33:1 (2003), 23-45

- Jacobs, Jane, M., "Snake 'im this country": The Mapping of the Aboriginal Sacred in Australia – The Case of Coronation Hill' in *Constructions of Race, Place and Nation* ed. by Peter Jackson and Jan Penrose (London: University College London Press, 1993), pp. 100-118
- James, Lawrence, *The Rise and Fall of the British Empire* (London: Abacus, 2004)
- Jameson, Fredric, *The Cultural Turn: Selected Writings on the Postmodern, 1983-1998* (London, New York: Verso, 1998)
- Jech, Thomas, 'Set Theory', *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, <<http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/set-theory/#1>> [accessed 17 August 08]
- Jenkins, Henry, *Textual Poachers: Television Fans and Participatory Culture* (London and New York: Routledge, 1992)
- Jenkins, Henry, 'From Barbie to Mortal Kombat: Further Reflections' <<http://culturalpolicy.uchicago.edu/conf2001/papers/jenkins.html>> [accessed 12 February 2008]
- Jenkins, Henry, 'Intensities interviews Henry Jenkins @Console-ing Passions, University of Bristol, July 7th, 2001', *Intensities: The Journal of Cult Media*, <<http://intensities.org/Essays/Jenkins.pdf>> [accessed 9 May 2005]
- Jenkins, Henry, 'Interactive Audiences: The "Collective Intelligence" of Media Fans, <<http://web.mit.edu/cms/People/henry3/collective%20intelligence.html>> [accessed 13 May 2005]
- Jenkins, Henry, *Quentin Tarantino's Star Wars?: Digital Cinema, Media Convergence, and Participatory Culture* <<http://web.mit.edu/cms/People/henry3/starwars.htm>> [accessed 5 February 2006]
- Jenkins, Henry, 'Reception Theory And Audience Research: The Mystery Of The Vampire's Kiss' <<http://web.mit.edu/cms/People/henry3/vampkiss.html>> [accessed 7 February 2006]
- Johnson, Derek, 'Star Wars Fans, DVD, and Cultural Ownership: An Interview with Will Brooker', *The Velvet Light Trap* 56.1 (2005) 36 to 44
- Jones, Deborah and Karen Smith, 'Middle-earth Meets New Zealand: Authenticity and Location in the Making of *The Lord of the Rings*' *Journal of Management Studies*, 42: 5 (July 2005), 923-945
- Jones, Diana Wynne, 'Heroes' (a lecture originally delivered in Australia in 1992) <<http://www.lccmac.freemove.co.uk/heroes.htm>> [accessed 12 September 2006]

- Jones, Diana Wynne, 'Article from *The Medusa*', *Chrestomanci Castle* <<http://www.suberic.net/dwj/medusa.html>> [accessed 14 January 2008]
- Jones, Diana Wynne, 'Inventing the Middle Ages' <<http://www.lecmac.freemove.co.uk/medieval.htm>> [accessed 14 January 2008]
- Jones, Steven Swann, *The Fairy Tale: The Magic Mirror of the Imagination* (New York: Routledge, 2002)
- Kapadia, Kamal and D. Asher Ghertner, 'Transforming Place, Placing Transformation', *Interventions*, 7:1, 118-130
- Karczmarz, Louise, 'Review of *Bored of the Rings*', <http://www.allscifi.com/topics/info_403.asp> [accessed 6 January 2008]
- Kaveney, Roz, ed., *Reading the Vampire Slayer: An Unofficial Critical Companion to Buffy and Angel* (London: Tauris Parke Paperbacks, 2002)
- Kaveney, Roz 'Webs'. <http://www.henneth-annun.net/stories/chapter_view.cfm?stid=476&SPOrdinal=1> [accessed 28 September 2007]
- Katyal, Sonia K., 'Performance, Property, and the Slashing of Gender in Fan Fiction' in *Journal of Gender, Social Policy and the Law*, 14:3 (2006), 461-518
- Katz, Wendy, *Rider Haggard and the Fiction of Empire: A Critical Study of British Imperial Fiction* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988)
- Keenan, Hugh T., 'The Appeal of *The Lord of the Rings*: A Struggle for Life', in *Tolkien and the Critics: Essays on J.R.R. Tolkien's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2000), pp. 3-16,
- Kelly-Holmes, Helen, "'Strong Words Softly Spoken": Advertising and the Intertextual Construction of "Irishness"', in *Intertextuality and the Media: From Genre to Everyday Life*, ed. by Ulrike H. Meinhof and Jonathan Smith (Manchester: Manchester University, 2000), pp. 18-42
- Kennedy, A.L., 'Belittled Women', *Guardian*, 24 March 2003, section G2, pp. 2-3
- Kennedy, Alan, *The Psychology of Reading* (London: Methuen, 1984)

- Kim, Sue, 'Beyond Black and White: Race and Postmodernism in *The Lord of the Rings* Films', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (Winter 2003), 875-907
- King, Geoff, *New Hollywood Cinema: An Introduction* (London: Tauris, 2005)
- Kitses, Jim, *Horizons West: Directing the Western from John Ford to Clint Eastwood* (London: BFI, 2004)
- Kitzen, Laurence, *Victorian Writers and the Image of Empire* (Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press, 2001)
- Knowles, Elizabeth ed., *The Oxford Dictionary of Quotations*, 5th edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001)
- Kocher, Paul, *Master of Middle-earth: The Achievement of J.R.R. Tolkien* (London: Pimlico, 2002)
- Kocher, Paul 'Middle-earth: An Imaginary World?' in *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism*, ed. by Rose A. Zimbardo and Neil D. Isaacs (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 2004), pp. 146-162
- Kroger, Jane, *Identity in Adolescence: The Balance Between the Self and Other* (New York: Routledge, 1993)
- Kristeva, Julia, 'Word, Dialogue and Novel', *The Kristeva Reader*, ed. by Toril Moi (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993), pp. 34-61
- Kumar, Krishan, 'Nation and Empire: English and British National Identity in Comparative Perspective', *Theory and Society*, 29 (2000), 575-608
- Kutzer, M. Daphne, *Empire's Children: Empire and Imperialism in Classic British Children's Books* (New York: Garland Publishing, 2000)
- Lane, Cara, 'The Ring Returns: Adaptation and the Trilogy', *Film & History: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Film and Television Studies*, 35:1 (2005), 67-69
- Larson, Kristine, 'Sauron, Mount Doom, and Elvish Moths: The Influence of Tolkien on Modern Science', *Tolkien Studies*, 4 (2007), 223-234
<http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/tolkien_studies/v004/4.1larsen.html> [accessed 4 January 2008]
- Latrell, Craig, 'After Appropriation', *The Drama Review*, 44:4 (Winter, 2000), 44-55
- Lee, Alan, *The Lord of the Rings: The Making of the Movie Trilogy*, ed. by Brian Sibley (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2002)

- Le Guin, Ursula, K., *Dancing At the Edge of the World: Thoughts on Words, Women, Places* (London: Paladin, 1992), pp. 37-45
- Levi-Strauss, Claude, *Structural Anthropology*, translated by Claire Jacobson and Brooke Grundfest Schoepf (London: Penguin books, 1963)
- Lessig, Lawrence, *The Future of Ideas: The Fate of the Commons in a Connected World* (London: Vintage Books, 2001)
- Levi-Strauss, Claude, *Myth and Meaning* (London: Routledge, 1980)
- Levi-Strauss, Claude, 'Structure and Form: Reflections on a Work by Vladimir Propp' in Vladimir Propp, *Theory and History of Folklore*, trans. by Ariadna Y. Martin and Richard P. Martin ed. by Anatoly Liberman (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984)
- Lippman, Laura, 'The Loveable Liberal Behind Bush's Victory', *New York Times*, 31 December 2000
- Lobdell, Jared *England and Always : Tolkien's World of the Rings* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1981)
- Lobdell, Jared 'Defining *The Lord of The Rings*: An Adventure Story in the Edwardian Mode' in *J.R.R. Tolkien's 'The Lord of the Rings'*, ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2000), pp 107-124
- Lukas, Karli, '*The Far Country*' in *Senses of Cinema* (2000) <<http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/cteq/00/9/far.html>> [accessed 6 February 2007]
- Mahar, Cheleen Ann-Catherine, 'Landscape, Empire and the Creation of Modern New Zealand' in *Landscape and Empire, 1770-2000*, ed. by Glenn Hooper (London: Ashgate, 2005), pp. 65-78
- Manlove, Colin *The Fantasy Literature of England* (Hampshire: Macmillan Press, 1999)
- Marsden, Jean I., 'Introduction', *The Appropriation of Shakespeare: Post Renaissance Reconstructions of the Works and the Myth*, ed. by Jean I. Marsden (Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1991)
- Marzec, Robert P., 'Enclosures, Colonization and the Robinson Crusoe Syndrome: A Genealogy of Land in a Global Context', *boundary*, 29:2 (2002), 129-156

- Mason, Matt, *The Pirate's Dilemma: How Hackers, Punk Capitalists, Graffiti Millionaires and Other Youth Movements Are Remixing Our Culture and Changing Our World* (London: Penguin Books, 2008)
- Mason, Bruce
Lionel, 'E-Texts: The Orality and Literacy Issue Revealed', *Oral Tradition*, 13:2 (1998), 306-329
- Mathews,
Richard *Fantasy: The Liberation of the Imagination* (London: Routledge, 2002)
- Matthews,
Philip, 'Fast, Cheap and Out of Control: Three Films from New Zealand's Digital Video "Revolution"', in *Senses of Cinema* (2004)
<http://www.sensesofcinema.com/contents/04/31/nz_digital_revolution.html> [accessed 14 January 2008]
- May, Jill P., *Children's Literature and Critical Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995)
- Mason, Bruce
Lionel, 'E-Texts: The Orality and Literacy Issue Revealed', *Oral Tradition*, 13:2 (1998), 306-329
- McCarthy,
Christine, 'A Summer Place: postcolonial retellings of the New Zealand bach', *Jouvert*, 2:2 (August 1998)
<<http://152.1.96.5/jouvert/v2i2/confour.htm>> [accessed 16 January 2008]
- McFarlane,
Brian, *Novel to Film* (London: Clarendon Press, 1996)
- McLellan,
David, *Ideology* (Buckingham: Open University Press, 1996)
- McNaughton,
Howard, 'The Speaking Abject: The Impossible Possible World of Realized Empire' in *De-Scribing Empire*, ed. By Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 218-229
- Meinhof,
Ulrike H., and
Jonathan
Smith, 'Spitting Image: TV Genre and Intertextuality', in *Intertextuality and the Media From Genre to Everyday Life*, ed. Ulrike H. Meinhof and Jonathan Smith (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000), pp. 43-60
- Mercurio,
Franco, 'Virtual Territories, Real Landscapes: Notes of a Journey Around an Interpretation' <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/mercurio.pdf>> [accessed 16 January 2008]
- Miller,
Angela, 'Review: Magisterial Visions: Recent Anglo-American Scholarship on the Represented Landscape', *American Quarterly*, 47: 1 (1995), 140-151
<<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0003-0678%28199503%2947%3a1%3c140%3amvraso%3e2.0.co%3b2-o>> [accessed 18 December 2006]

- Mills, Sara, *Gender and Colonial Space* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 2005)
- Mitchell, W.J.T., 'Holy Landscape: Israel, Palestine, and the American Wilderness', *Critical Inquiry*, 26: 2 (2000), 193-223
<<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0093-1896%28200024%2926%3A2%193%3AHLIPAT%3E2.0.O%32-6>> [accessed 18 May 2006]
- Mitchell, W.J.T., 'Imperial Landscape' in *Landscape and Power*, ed. By W.J.T. Mitchell 2nd edn (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002), pp. 5-34
- Mitchell, W.J.T., ed. *Landscape and Power*, 2nd edn (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2002)
- 'Mooncalf', 'Every Fanfic Ever Written!' <<http://mooncalf.org/library/misc/everyfic.html>> [accessed 30 December 2007]
- Moynihan, Leo, *The Liverpool Miscellany* (London: Vision Sports Publishing, 2007)
- Muehrcke, Phillip C., and Juliana, Muehrcke, 'Maps in Literature', *Geographical Review* 64, 3 (1974), 317-338
<<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0016-7428%28197407%2964%3a3%3c317%3amil%3c2.0.co%bb2-1>> [accessed 19 December 2006]
- Murphy, Bruce, 'The Exile of Literature: Poetry and the Politics of the Other(s)', *Critical Inquiry*, 17:1 (1990), 162-173
- Murphy, David, 'Africans Filming Africa: Questioning Theories of an Authentic African Cinema', *Journal of African Cultural Studies*, 13:2 (2000), 239-249
<<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=1369-6815%28200012%2913%3a2%3c239%3aafaoto%3c2.0.co%3b2-4>> [accessed 18 September 2007]
- Murray, Scott, ed., *Australian Cinema* (St. Leonards, New South Wales: Allen & Unwin, 1994)
- Myers, Brad A., "A Brief History of Human Computer Interaction Technology." *ACM Interactions*. 5:2 (1998), 44-54. <<http://www.cs.cmu.edu/~amulet/papers/uihistory.tr.html>> [accessed 17 December 2007]
- Nelmes, Jill, ed. *An Introduction to Film Studies* (London: Routledge, 1996)
- Nelson, Dale, 'Literary Influences, Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries', *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopaedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (London and New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 367-378

- Nisbett
Richard E.
and Ara
Norenzayan, 'Culture and Cognition' in *Stevens' Handbook of Experimental Psychology: Volume 2: Memory and Cognitive Processes*, 3rd edn, ed. by Hal Pashler and Douglas Medin (London and New York: John Wiley & Sons, 2002), pp. 561-597
- Northrup,
Clyde B., 'The Qualities of a Tolkienian Fairy-Story', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50: 4 (2004), 814-837 <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/modern_fiction_studies/v050/50.4northrup.pdf> [accessed 18 September 2006]
- New Zealand
Institute of
Economic
Research *Scoping the Lasting Effects of 'The Lord of the Rings': Report to the New Zealand Film Commission* (Auckland and Wellington: New Zealand Institute of Economic Research, 2002)
- Obertino,
James, 'Barbarians and Imperialism in Tacitus and *The Lord of the Rings*' *Tolkien Studies*, 3 (2006), 117-131
- Olsen, David
R., 'On the Language and Authority of Textbooks' in *Language, Authority and Criticism: Readings on the School Textbook*, ed. by Suzanne de Castell, Allan Luke and Carmen Luke (London: Falmer Press, 1989)
- Osbourne,
Brian S., 'The Iconography of Nationhood in Canadian Art', in *The Iconography of Landscape*, ed. Denis Cosgrove and Stephen Daniels (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), pp. 162-178
- Paxson,
Diana, 'Re-vision: *The Lord of the Rings* in Print and On Screen', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press), pp. 81-99
- Penley,
Constance, 'Feminism, Psychoanalysis, and the Study of Popular Culture', in *Cultural Studies*, ed. by Lawrence Grossberg, Cory Nelson and Paula A. Treichler (New York and London: Routledge, 1992), pp. 479-500,
- Penley,
Constance, *NASA Trek: Popular Science and Sex in America* (London: Verso, 1997)
- Pennington,
John, 'From Elfland to Hogwarts, or the Aesthetic Trouble with Harry Potter', *The Lion and The Unicorn*, 26 (2002), 78-97
- Perera,
Suvendrini, *The Reaches of Empire: The English Novel from Edgeworth to Dickens* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1991)

- Perret, Marion, 'Not Just Condensation: How Comic Books Interpret Shakespeare' *College Literature*, 31:4 (2004), 72-93, <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/college_literature/v031/31.4perret.html> [accessed 30 January 2006]
- Petit, C. E., 'Fan Fiction' <<http://www.authorslawyer.com/web/fanfic.shtml>> [accessed 17 August 2008]
- Phiddian, Robert, 'Are Parody and Deconstruction Secretly the Same Thing?' *New Literary History*, 28: 4 (1997), 673-696
- Phillips, Jeremy and Alison Firth, *Introduction to Intellectual Property Law*, 4th edn (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006)
- Picton, John, 'What's In A Mask' in *African Languages and Cultures*, 3:2 (1990), 181-202
- Piot, Charles, 'Of Hybridity, Modernity, and their malcontents' *Interventions*, 3:1 (2001), 85-91
- Plank, Robert, 'The Scouring of the Shire: Tolkien's View of Fascism', in *A Tolkien Compass*, ed. by Jared Lobdell (Chicago: Open Court, 2003), pp. 105-113
- Playden, Zoe-Jane, '"What You Are, What's To Come": Feminism, Citizenship and the Divine' in *Reading the Vampire Slayer: An Unofficial Critical Companion to Buffy and Angel*, ed. by Roz Kaveney (London: Tauris Parke Paperbacks, 2002), pp. 120-147
- Pocock, Tom, *Rider Haggard and the Lost Empire* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1993)
- Pollock, Donald, 'Masks and the Semiotics of Identity', *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 1:3 (1995), 581-597
- Pound, Francis, *Frames on the Land: Early Landscape Painting in New Zealand* (Auckland: Collins, 1983)
- Pound, Francis, *Forty Modern New Zealand Paintings* (Auckland: Penguin, 1985)
- Pound, Francis, *The Space Between – Pakeha Use of Maori Motifs in Modernist New Zealand Art*, 2nd edn (Auckland: Workshop Press, 1994)
- Pratchett, Terry, 'Post-Fantasy Fantasy' (an interview with Terry Pratchett) in *The L-Space Web* <<http://www.lspace.org/about-terry/interviews/amazon3.html>> [accessed 23 September 2006]

-
- Pratchett, Terry, Ian Stewart, and Jack Cohen, *The Science of the Discworld 2: The Globe* (London: Ebury Press, 2003)
- Prentice, Chris, 'Some Problems of Response to Empire in Settler Post-Colonial Societies' in *De-Scribing Empire*, ed. by Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 45-58
- Prickett, Stephen, *Victorian Fantasy*, 2nd edn (Waco, Texas: Baylor University Press, 2005)
- Propp, Vladimir, *Morphology of the Folktale*, trans. by Laurence Scott, 2nd edn, rev. by Louis A. Wagner (Texas: University of Texas Press, 1998)
- Propp, Vladimir, *Theory and History of Folklore*, trans. by Ariadna Y Martin and Richard P Martin ed. by Anatoly Liberman (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1984),
- Pugh, Sheenaugh, *The Democratic Genre: Fan Fiction In A Literary Context* (Bridgend: Seren, 2005)
- Rateliff, John D., 'She and Tolkien', *Mythlore*, 8 (1981), 6-8
- Rearick, Anderson, 'Why is the Only Good Orc a Dead Orc? The Dark Face of Racism Examined in Tolkien's World', *MFS Modern Fiction Stories*, 50:4 (2004), 861-874
- Ricci, Roberta 'Morphologies and Functions of Self-Criticism in Modern Times: Has the Author Come Back?', *MLN*, 118.1 (2003) 116-146
- Rich, Adrienne, *Poetry and Prose* (New York: Norton, 1993)
- Richards, Jeffrey, 'Boy's Own Empire: Feature Films and Imperialism in the 1930s', in *Imperialism and Popular Culture*, ed. by John Mackenzie (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1986) pp. 140-164
- Richards, Jeffrey, 'With Henty To Africa' in *Imperialism and Juvenile Literature*, ed. by Jeffrey Richards (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1989), pp 72-106
- Richards, Jeffrey, *Films and British National Identity from Dickens to Dad's Army* (Manchester: Manchester University Press 1997)
- Rickett, Joel, '10 Ways to Get You to Read a Book' <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/magazine/7046677.stml>> [accessed 18 October 2007]

- Righter, William, *Myth and Literature* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1975)
- Roberts, Hugh, 'The Same People Living in Different Places: Allen Curnow's Anthology and New Zealand Literary History', *Modern Language Quarterly*, 64:2 (2003), 219-237, <http://ezproxy.liv.ac.uk:2428/journals/modern_language_quarterly/v064/64.2robertsh...> [accessed 29 January 2007]
- Robinson, Gabrielle, 'Nothing Left but Parody: Friedrich Dürrenmatt and Tom Stoppard', *Theatre Journal*, 32: 1 (1980), 85-94
- Rogers, Shef, 'Crusoe Among the Maori: Translation and Colonial Acculturation in Victorian New Zealand', *Book History*, 1:1 (1998), 182-195
- Rogers, William N. II and Michael R. Underwood, 'Gagool and Gollum: Exemplars of Degeneration in *King Solomon's Mines* and *The Hobbit*', in *J.R.R. Tolkien and His Literary Resonances: Views of Middle-earth*, ed. George Clark and Daniel Timmons, (Portsmouth, New Hampshire: Greenwood Press, 2000), pp. 121-131
- Romaine, Suzanne, 'Contested Histories in Aotearoa New Zealand Literature: Witi Ihimacra's *The Matriarch*', *The Contemporary Pacific*, 16:1 (2004), 31-57
- Rose, Margaret, *Parody: Ancient, Modern, and Post-Modern* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993)
- Rosebury, Brian, *Tolkien: A Cultural Phenomenon* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003)
- Rushton, Richard, 'What Can A Face Do? On Deleuze and Faces', *Cultural Critique*, 51 (2002), 219-237
- Ryan, Marie-Laure, 'Beyond Myth and Metaphor: Narrative in Digital Media', *Poetics Today*, 23:4 (2002), 581-609, <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/poetics_today/v023/23.4ryan.html> [accessed 19 May 2006]
- Ryan, Simon, 'Inscribing the Emptiness: Cartography, Exploration and the Construction of Australia' in *De-Scribing Empire*, ed. by Chris Tiffin and Alan Lawson (London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 115-130
- Said, Edward, *Culture and Imperialism* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1993)
- Said, Edward, 'Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* and the Histories of Empire' in *Reading Fin De Siècle Fictions*, ed. Lyn Pykett (London: Longman, 1996)

- Saint-Amour, Paul K., and others, 'James Joyce: Copyright, Fair Use, and Permissions, Frequently Asked Questions', *James Joyce Quarterly*, 44:4 (2007), 753-784
- Sales, Roger, *English Literature in History 1780-1830: Pastoral and Politics* (London: Hutchinson, 1983)
- Salmon, Catherine, Speaking about her book *Warrior Lovers* with Donald Symens on Women's Hour, 18 June 2001 <<http://www.hermit.org/Blakes7/Merchant/Books.WarLov4.htm>> [accessed 3 May 2007]
- Sanders, Julie, *Novel Shakespeares: Twentieth Century Women Novelists and Appropriation* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001)
- Sanders, Julie, *Adaptation and Appropriation* (Oxon: Routledge, 2006)
- Sawin, Patricia E., 'Transparent Masks: The Ideology and Practice of Disguise in Contemporary Cajun Mardi Gras', *Journal of American Folklore*, 114 (452) 175-203
- Saxey, Esther, 'Homocroticism' in *Reading The Lord of the Rings: New Writings on Tolkien's Classic*, ed. by Robert Eaglestone (London: Continuum, 2005)
- Saxey, Esther, 'Staking a Claim: The Series and its Slash Fan-Fiction', in *Reading the Vampire Slayer: An Unofficial Critical Companion to Buffy and Angel*, ed. Roz Kaveney (London and New York: Tauris Parke Paperbacks, 2002), pp. 187-210
- Schlucter, Nathen W., 'The Virtue of "Lying": Recovering the "Saving Beauty" of Plato's Poetic Vision', *Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought and Culture*, 9:1 (2006), 72-107
- Schwartz, Joseph, *Einstein For Beginners* (London: Writers and Readers Public Cooperative, 1979)
- Seifert, Lewis C., 'Orality, History, and "Creoleness" in Patrick Chamoiseau's *Creole Folktales*' *Marvels and Tales: Journal of Fairy-Tale Studies*, 16:2 (2002), 214-230
- Sen, Satadru 'A Juvenile Periphery: The Geographies of Literary Childhood In Colonial Bengal', *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History*, 5: 1 (2004) <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/journal_of_colonialism_and_colonial_history/v005/5.1sen.html> [accessed 30 January 2006]
- Shippey, Tom, *The Road to Middle-earth: How J.R.R. Tolkien Created a New Mythology* (London: Grafton, 1992)

- Shippey, Tom, *J.R.R. Tolkien: Author of the Century* (London: HarperCollins, 2001)
- Shippey, Tom, *Roots and Branches: Selected Works on Tolkien* (Switzerland: Walking Tree Publishers, 2007)
- Shippey, Tom, 'Literature, Twentieth Century: Influence of Tolkien', *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*, ed. by Michael D.C. Drout (New York and London: Routledge, 2007), pp. 378-382
- Sibley, Brian, *The Lord of the Rings: The Making of the Movie Trilogy* (London: HarperCollins Publishers, 2002)
- Simmons, Laurence, 'The Lord of the Rings: The Fellowship of the Ring', in *The Cinema of Australia and New Zealand*, ed. Geoff Mayer and Keith Beattie (London and New York: Wallflower Press, 2007), pp. 223-231
- Simonson, Martin, 'Three Is Company: Novel, Fairy Tale and Romance on the Journey Through the Shire', *Tolkien Studies*, 3 (2006), 81-100
- Smith, Anthony D., *National Identity* (London: Penguin Books, 1991)
- Smith, Ian, 'Misusing Canonical Intertexts: Jamaica Kincaid, Wordsworth and Colonialism's "absent things"', *Callalou*, 25:3 (2002), 801-820
- Smith, Jim and J. Clive Matthews, *The Lord of the Rings: The Films, the Books, the Radio Series* (London: Virgin Books, 2004)
- Mr. Justice Smith, Peter, *Baigent & Anor v The Random House Group Ltd (The Da Vinci Code)*. EWHC 719 (Ch). 7 April 2006
- Smith, Phillipa Mein, *A Concise History of New Zealand* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005)
- Smith, Ross, 'Timeless Tolkien Part 2: The Enduring Popularity of a Philological Fantasist', *English Today*, 21 (2005), 13-20
- Smol, Anna, '"Oh . . . Oh . . . Frodo!": Readings Of Male Intimacy In *The Lord Of The Rings*', *MFS Modern Fiction Studies*, 50:4 (2004), 949-979
- Smyth, J.E., 'The Three Ages of Imperial Cinema from the Death of Gordon to *The Lord of the Rings*', in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press), pp. 3-23

- Spicer, Arwen "It's Bloody Brilliant!" The Undermining of Meta Narrative Feminism in the Season Seven Arc of *Buffy* in *Slayage*, 15 (2004), <<http://slayageonline.com/essays/slayage15/Spicer.htm>> [accessed 6 January 2008]
- Spivey, Nancy Nelson, *The Constructivist Metaphor* (Burlington, MA: Academic Press, 1997)
- Sponsler, Claire, 'In Transit: Theorizing Cultural Appropriation in Medieval Europe', *Journal of Medieval and Early Modern Studies*, 32:1 (2002), 17-39
- Stimpson, Catherine, *J.R.R. Tolkien* (New York and London: Columbia University Press, 1969),
- Stray, Chris, 'Paradigms Regained: Towards a Historical Sociology of the Textbook' *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 26:1 (1994), 1-29
- Stugis, Amy H., 'Make Mine "Movieverse": How the Tolkien Fan Fiction Community Learned to Stop Worrying and Love Peter Jackson' in *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press, 2004), pp. 283-305
- Sullivan, C.W., 'Folklore and Fantastic Literature' in *Western Folklore*, 60:4 (2001), 279-296 <[http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0043-373X\(200123\)60%3A4%3C279%3AF AFL%3E2.0.CO%3B2-O](http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0043-373X(200123)60%3A4%3C279%3AF AFL%3E2.0.CO%3B2-O)> [accessed 22 January 2007]
- Synott, Anthony, 'Tomb, Temple, Machine and Self: The Social Construction of the Body', *The British Journal of Sociology*, 43:1 (1992), 79-110
- Taxel, Joel, 'Children's Literature: A Research Proposal from the Perspective of the Sociology of School Knowledge' in *Language, Authority and Criticism: Readings on the School Textbook*, ed. by Suzanne de Castell, Allan Luke and Carmen Luke (London: Falmer Press, 1989)
- Tebbetts, John C., and James M. Welsh 'Introduction: Why Study Film Adaptations of Novels?', *Novel into Film: The Encyclopedia of Movies Adapted from Books*, ed. by John C. Tebbetts and James M. Welsh (New York: Checkmark Books, 1997), pp. xiii-xx
- Thompson, Kristin, 'Review: *Tolkien on Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's "The Lord of the Rings"*, ed. by Janet Brennan Croft. (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press, 2004), *Tolkien Studies*, 3 (2006), 222-228

- Thum, Margaret, 'The "Sub-Subcreation" of Galadriel, Arwen, and Éowyn: Women of Power in Tolkien's and Jackson's *The Lord of the Rings*', *Tolkien On Film: Essays on Peter Jackson's The Lord of the Rings*, ed. Janet Brennan Croft (Altadena, CA: The Mythopoeic Press), pp. 231-256
- Tiffin, Chris and Alan Lawson, eds, *De-Scribing Empire* (London: Routledge, 1994)
- Tiffin, Helen, 'Post-colonial literatures and Counter Discourse' in *The Postcolonial Studies Reader* ed. by Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin (New York: Routledge, 1995), pp. 95-98
- Tiffin, Jessica, 'Ice, Glass, Snow: Fairytale as Art and Metafiction in the Writing of A.S. Byatt', *Marvels and Tales*, 20 (2006), 47-66
- Tosenberger, Catherine, 'Homosexuality at the Online Hogwarts: Harry Potter Slash Fanfiction', *Children's Literature*, 36:1 (2007), 185-207
- Tushnet, Rebecca, 'Legal Fictions: Copyright, Fan Fiction, and a New Common Law', *Loyola of Los Angeles Entertainment Law Journal*, 17:3 (1997), 651-686
- Tyler, Louise, 'Landscape in Film Noir and Westerns 1940s-1950s', <<http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/cms/tyler.pdf>> [accessed 20 May 2007]
- UKClimbing, UK Climbing Database. <<http://www.ukclimbing.com/logbook/showcrag.html?climb2=699>> [accessed 21 February 2008].
- Vaz, Mark Cotta and Shinji Hata, *The Star Wars Archives: Props, Costumes, Models and Artwork from Star Wars* (London: Virgin, 1995)
- Verevis, Constantine, *Film Remakes* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006)
- Vice, Sue, *Introducing Bakhtin* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1997)
- Walsh, Richard, 'The Narrative Imagination', *Modern Fiction Studies*, 52:4 (2006), 855-868, <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/modern_fiction_studies/v052/52.4walsh.html> [accessed 30 January 2007]
- West, Richard C., "'And She Named Her Own Name": Being True To One's Word In Tolkien's Middle-earth', *Tolkien Studies*, 2:1 (2005), 1-10
- Weston, Jessie L., *From Ritual To Romance* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993)

- Whelehan, Imelda, 'Adaptations: The Contemporary Dilemmas', in *Adaptations: From Text to Screen, Screen to Text*, ed. by Deborah Cartmell and Imelda Whelehan (London: Routledge, 1999), pp. 3-19
- Williams, Gwyn A., *Excalibur: The Search for Arthur* (London: BBC Books, 1994)
- Wilson, Steve, 'Laugh, Spawn of Hell, Laugh', in *Reading the Vampire Slayer: An Unofficial Critical Companion to Buffy and Angel*, ed. by Roz Kaveney (London and New York: Tauris Park Paperbacks, 2002), pp. 78-97
- Windholz, Anne M., 'An Emigrant and a Gentleman: Imperial Masculinity, British Magazines, and the Colony That Got Away', *Victorian Studies*, (Summer, 1999/2000), 631-658
- Wittenberg, Herman, 'Occult, Empire and Landscape: The Colonial Uncanny in John Buchan's African Writing', *Journal of Colonialism and Colonial History*, 7: 2 (2006), <http://muse.jhu.edu/login?uri=/journals/journal_of_colonialism_and_colonial_history/v007/7.2wittenberg.html> [accessed 24 April 2007]
- Woo, Celestine, 'Towards a Poetics of Asian American Fantasy: Laurence Yep's Construction of a Bicultural Mythology', *The Lion and the Unicorn*, 30 (2006), 250-264
- Woodward, Steven, and Kostis Kourelis, 'Urban Legend: Architecture in *The Lord of the Rings*', in *From Hobbits to Hollywood: Essays on Peter Jackson's Lord of the Rings*, ed. by Ernest Mathijs and Murray Pomerance (Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2006), pp. 189-214
- Yarwood, Doreen, *English Costume: From the Second Century B.C to 1960*, 2nd edn (London: Batsford, 1964)
- Zimbardo, Rose A. and Neil D. Isaacs, eds, *Understanding The Lord of the Rings: The Best of Tolkien Criticism* (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 2004)